

INDEX

Ackerman, Bruce 268, 280, 297 testimony to Chilcot Inquiry 51, 134, aggression. See crime of aggression aggressive moment conception of jus blame ad bellum 175, 188 blamer's standing to 126-28 armed unmanned vehicles. See blameworthiness and criminal remotely fought wars liability 32, 53-57, 98, 123, 126, 153, 223 associative duties and aggressive moment conception self-blame 48, 127-31 of jus ad bellum 175 blanket immunity. See immunity bloodless invasion concept of 169-71 in international law 171-74 illegality of 102 and invincible ignorance theory non-criminality of 86, 102-8 181 - 92Blum, Gabriella 2, 207, 232, 256 justifications for 170 Bush, George W. and administration moral duties conflicting with 192-94 22, 153, 160, 178, 301 and political obligation 8, 169 reparation in relation 198 Chilcot Inquiry 51, 134, 281, 300-5, 337 soldiers' obedience in relation 8, 169, civil liability for deaths of enemy soldiers 36-37, 328-29 victim status and 198 civilian control of military forces 195-98 associative ties Clinton, Bill 153, 327 absence of 194-95, 279 coercion culpability in relation 223, 265 absence of 278 blame and 126 normative prioritization of 192 culpability and 122-31 and responsibility to protect 169 to do right thing 307 varied strength of 194 Auden, W. H. 167-68 duress and 119 duty to resist 125 Blair, Tony limitation of 285, 292–99, 311, 320–22 calls for criminal accountability of moral effects 122-31 153, 269 private military contractors 132, historical legacy of 304 271 - 72Peter Goldsmith's memos to 19, 100, and risk borne by own troops 133, 144-45, 234 phone conversation with George wrong of being forced to do wrong. See wrong of being forced to do W. Bush 301 and 2003 report on Iraq 162



344 INDEX

combatant reparations. See reparation commission of inquiry and devil's advocate 286-91, 300, 303 findings of illegality 296, 301–3 legal standard applicable to 308 competence and role morality 250 institutional regarding the jus ad bellum 233, 273, 300, 319 conflicting obligations 192 crime against humanity aggression as 5, 77, 97 collective elements of 74 management of victim participation at trial 32, 75, 332 nationalist distortion of facts 258 by non-state actors 87 obedient participation in 53 severity of 94 by state agents 87 as universal wrong 21 crime of aggression aggression, criminality of 69, 106 author's approach to 4-5 conclusions as to legal status of soldiers 340 as crime against humanity. See crime against humanity, aggression as criminalization of aggression 5, 17 domestic law implications 280 as expression of wrongfulness 2, 54-56 human rights in relation 75, 88-89, 93-96 jurisdiction 17–20 as leadership crime 24, 180-81, 197, 222, 265 moral and physical effects 37 normative accounts and approaches 2-4, 52-60, 64, 70, 77, 79, 84, 93, 96, 98, 102. See normative accounts and approaches orthodox account of 70-76 risk of renewed conflict after perceived unjust judgment 256 risk to aggressor state 175-79 soldier's right to life 2, 4, 13, 77, 89, 102, 211–12, 227, 325, 328 sovereignty and 70-76, 79, 97-98

uncertainty as to criminality 136-37, 139, 181 wrongfulness 69, 77 criminal law. See domestic law; international criminal law criminal liability blame, blameworthiness, and 123 exclusion from 58, 123, 137, 147-48, 174, 222, 227 scope. See exclusion from and as leadership crime threshold of. See exclusion from and crime of aggression, as leadership crime uncertainly and 69, 147 and warrior's code 222 criminalization of doing the right thing culpability blame and 126-28 coercion and 122-31 and criminal liability 32, 58, 98, 122-23, 126, 153, 223 duress and 122-31 epistemic dimension 135 extent of 57 and invincible ignorance 136 level of 53-57, 122-23, 127-29, 150, 153, 222–24, 227, 265 mitigation of 122-31, 164, 192-95, 223-24, 227, 278 necessity of enforced culpability 256 and political obligation 187, 192-95 and warrior's code 9, 217 deference and devil's advocate 285 epistemic 155, 164, 182, 184 improvement of grounds for 11, 285–86, 300 and invincible ignorance 155

epistemic 155, 164, 182, 184 improvement of grounds for 11, 285–86, 300 and invincible ignorance 155 justified 155, 285, 305 to leaders 7, 155 political 166, 182, 184 and political obligation 166, 181–92 reasons for 185, 285 deserters protection 314, 322



INDEX 345

punishment 25, 228, 292 refugee status 314 right not to fight 25, 228, 292 vindication 298 devil's advocate and commissions of inquiry 286, 288, 291, 300, 303 creation of 12, 285, 310 Dill, Janina 137, 204-7, 212, 217-21, 250, 326 disobedience protection. See right not to fight domestic law associative duties. See associative duties author's approach to 11, 283, 305-8 commissions of inquiry. See commissions of inquiry criminal law 7, 26-28, 87-88, 141, 150, 164 deference and 166, 181-92 devil's advocate. See devil's advocate evaluation of reform 310 implications of crime of aggression 280 and international law norms 11, 283, 305 jus ad bellum and 11, 283, 305-8 political obligation. See political obligation reform 11, 280 and right not to fight 292 soldier's duties to protect 8, 169, 181 soldier's obligation to obey 7, 195, 228, 253 drones. See remotely fought wars duress about 119 coercion and 39, 119 culpability and 122-31, 138 necessity of 10, 253 soldiers on both sides 132 duty to disobey illegal orders 1, 3, 20, 24, 123-25, 235 Dworkin, Ronald 59-60

EECC. See Ethiopia—Eritrea Claims Commission enemy soldiers civil liability for deaths of 30, 215, crime of killing. See right to life immunity for killing of 217 reparation for killing of 328 enforced culpability, necessity of 256 enforced obedience. See duress epistemic deference 155, 164, 182, 184 epistemic dimension of culpability 135 epistemic imbalance between soldiers and leaders 156 Erdemović, Dražen, case of 123, 129, 135 Estlund, David 136, 183, 185 Ethiopia-Eritrea Claims Commission (EECC) attack on own territory in violation of jus ad bellum 85 reparation 36, 214 victim status 214 European Court of Human Rights 27, 62, 88, 141, 184, 319

Ferencz, Benjamin 77, 329

Garbe, Karl-Heinz, case of 27 Germany. See Nuremberg trials global human security 10, 225, 227, 242–44 Goodman, Ryan 63, 112, 308 Goldsmith, Peter, Lord 19, 100, 144, 234 Grotius, Hugo 136, 232

Haque, Adil 71, 88-89, 99, 121, 135,

148–50, 216
Hathaway, Oona 79–80, 112, 178, 242, 280, 297
high-risk wars 12, 269–71, 294
Hinzman, Jeremy, case of 28, 125, 320–21
human rights
criminalization of aggression in relation 49–51, 75, 93–96
extraterritorial application of 62
of human rights defenders 25, 322
international criminal justice in relation 35, 93–96, 141



346 INDEX

human rights (cont.) recognition of victims of wrongs 49-51, 329 rehabilitative reparation in relation responsibility to protect 93, 113, 152 right not to fight. See right not to right to life. See soldier's right to life and state's sacrifice of own troops 166, 199 Human Rights Committee 62 humanitarian interventions illegal 67, 72-73, 92, 102, 108 risk and 111 humanization and international criminal law 78, 94-95, 101, 312, 328 of international law 78, 93, 139, 247, 312 Hurka, Thomas 86, 206, 211 ICTY. See International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia ignorance author's approach to 6 implications of vincibility of 163, 181 invincible. See invincible ignorance and non-culpability 7, 139 normative vincibility of 140 illegal humanitarian interventions 67, 72-73, 92, 102, 108 illegal orders, duty to disobey. See duty to disobey illegal orders illegal wars aggression and 89-92, 106-15 interpretive authority as to illegality obedient participation in. See obedient participation in illegal right not to fight in. See right not to wrong of. See wrong of aggression immunity absence of 87

non-culpability distinguished 57-58, 217 provision of 58, 205-7, 217, 222 removal of 75, 209, 222 sovereign immunity 198 IMT (International Military Tribunal at Nuremberg). See Nuremberg trials IMTFE (International Military Tribunal for the Far East). See Tokyo War Crimes Trial informational asymmetry between soldiers and leaders 156 injured soldiers. See soldiers' wounds International Court of Justice (ICJ) humanization of international law 313 necessity and proportionality 155 Nuclear Weapons Opinion 179 uncertainty and the use of force 142 International Criminal Court (ICC) bloodless invasion, illegality of 106 civilian control of military forces 197 criminalization of aggression 17, 70, 83, 89-92, 106-9, 113-15 duress 124 duty to disobey illegal orders 23 humanization of criminal law 94, 101, 328 jurisdiction over aggression 17, 20 moral value of states 70 reparation 30, 328 victim status 30, 328 international criminal justice, human rights in relation 35, 95, 141 international criminal law culpability threshold 57–58 human rights in relation 95 humanization of 78, 94-95, 101, 312, 328 moral emphasis of 5, 53, 57 International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia (ICTY) duress 123, 129 humanization of criminal law 94, 312 impact on public opinion 258 international law dependence on strong states 10, 242 domestic law and 283, 305-8

justified 220, 222



INDEX 347

humanization of 78, 93, 139, 247, 312 interpretive authority 232 reform 12, 312 International Military Tribunal at Nuremberg (IMT). See Nuremberg trials International Military Tribunal for the Far East (IMTFE). See Tokyo War Crimes Trial interpretive authority as to legality of war 232 invincible ignorance about 136 culpability and 139 deference and 155 implications of vincibility of ignorance 163 normative vincibility of ignorance 140 and political obligation 181, 183 - 85spectrum of uncertainty 139 uncertainty and restraint in relation 140, 150 Iraq War 28-29, 44-45, 100, 134, 144-45, 153, 160-62, 190, 192, 267, 269-71, 281, 286, 292-93, 300-5, 341Jackson, Robert 20, 24, 55, 76, 98, 341 Japan. See Tokyo War Crimes Trial ius ad bellum aggression and 89-92, 106-15 aggressive moment conception of 175, 188 assessments by commissions of inquiry 296, 300 devil's advocate. See devil's advocate domestic law and 283 and invincible ignorance 6, 136, 154

uncertain justification for violence 7,

duty to disobey illegal orders 20

right to disobey illegal orders 6, 25,

presumption against excusing

dubious killing 150

142-47, 164

jus in bello

29

symmetrical application of 9, 203 and warrior's code 9, 203, 208, 222 just war theory 3, 42, 64, 70, 203 Kahn, Paul 67, 73-74, 79, 81, 93, 119, 167, 266, 270, 284 Kellogg-Briand Pact 1928 Nuremberg trials and 55-56, 98, 314 sovereignty, humanity, and criminal aggression 79-81, 96, 232 Kelsen, Hans 231, 276 killing, psychological effects of 38 killing, unjustified and crime of aggression 84 risk of 150-53, 188, 199 Koh, Harold 17, 63, 108, 115, 189, 268-69, 280, 284, 306 Kutz, Christopher 73-74, 83, 112, 136, 187, 192, 208, 223, 232, 253 Lauterpacht, Hersch 59, 112, 135, 151, 204-5, 232, 242, 314 lawful wars grounds for belief of lawfulness 164, 285, 300 military functioning in 9, 12, 238, 241-42, 265, 270, 272, 274, 276, 285, 292-94, 297, 320-22 soldiers' refusal to fight 237, 241, 273-74, 297 soldiers' personal burdens in 67, 285, 291, 300 soldiers' misperception as unlawful 237, 249 Lazar, Seth 137, 168, 170, 192 leaders aggression as leadership crime 23-24, 181, 197, 217, 245, 265 moral censuring of 153 deference to 7, 155 duty to disobey illegal orders 24, 197, superior level of information available to 156 wrongs inflicted by 126, 283, 302 legality of war, interpretive authority as to 232 Levinson, Salmon 55, 81, 96



348 INDEX

low-risk wars 12, 266, 294 Luban, David aggression's core wrong 75, 81, 95, 103, 110 on civilian control 196 on devil's advocate 286 on inclusion of aggression in Nuremberg prosecutions 75 on integrity 128 on invincible ignorance 136-37, 156-57, 159 on Milgram experiments 38-40, 238 soldiers' associative duties and role morality 188, 250 sovereignty and criminalization of aggression 75, 81, 95, 103, 110 trustworthiness of states and leaders on Walzer's normative account 73, Lubanga, Thomas, case of 31-34, 259, 261, 295, 329-31, 334-37, 339 MacArthur, Douglas 41, 67, 167, 171, 175, 244 McMahan, Jeff on "aggressive moments" 179 on blame 127 on deference to leaders 158, 238 on duress versus self-defence 119, on institutional functioning 224, 229, 242 on non-culpability or mitigated culpability 223-24 on political obligation and associative duty 168, 187, 238 on revisionist just war theory 78 on role morality 207, 209, 219, 245 on soldiers' susceptibility to false justifications 38–39, 238 on traditional just war theory 71, 103 on uncertainty and killing in war 140-41, 150, 154 on the warrior's code 207, 209, 219 on the wrong of aggressive war May, Larry 73, 122, 137, 224, 261

mercenaries. See private military contractors Meron, Theodor 93, 203, 314 Milgram, Stanley, experiments on psychology of obedience to authority 38-39, 238, 241 military breakdown, risk of 10, 188, 216, 237, 241, 297 military competence. See competence military duress. See duress military functioning in lawful wars 9, 12, 238, 241-42, 265, 270, 272, 274, 276, 285, 292-94, 297, 320, 322 obedience and 228, 266, 292, 320 and soldiers' evaluative decisionmaking 9, 235, 266, 292, 320 Minow, Martha 22, 50, 214, 228, 299, 332 moral blameworthiness. See blame moral choice paralysis, risk of 238, 250, 270, 275-76 moral expression of international criminal law 5, 53, 57 moral value of states 70, 242 Nagel, Thomas 107, 119, 130, 208, 254 necessity of enforced culpability 256 and exclusion from reparation 10, institutional implications 10, 266 non-culpability duress and 122-31, 138 ignorance and 7, 139, 155 immunity distinguished 217 permissibility distinguished 115, 119 - 22non-state actors, crimes against humanity by 87 non-use of force in conditions of uncertainty 142, 150 normative accounts and approaches author's approach to 52 bloodless invasion, illegality of 102 criminalization of aggression 77 humanization of international law

78, 93, 101



INDEX 349

obligation

moral value of states 70 realist response to 60 soldiers' status 115 sovereignty and crime of aggression 70 unauthorized humanitarian interventions 102, 108 unjustified killing 77, 84, 102 Nuremberg Military Tribunals (NMT). See Nuremberg trials Nuremberg trials International Military Tribunal (IMT) bloodless invasion 103 civilian control of military forces 197 criminalization of aggression 17, 54-56, 99, 114 duress 124 duty to disobey illegal orders 20, 168 invincible ignorance 182 and Kellogg-Briand Pact 1928 55, 98, 314 moral value of states 70 Nuremberg Military Tribunals (NMT) bloodless invasion 104, 108 criminalization of aggression 17, 99, 244-45 duress 120 duty to disobey illegal orders 20 Obama, Barack 108, 146, 294, 296, 306 obedience and military functioning 228, 266, 292, 320-22 obedience to authority, psychological experiments on 38-39, 238, 241 obedient participation in illegal wars associative duties and 8, 169 culpability of 243

legal status of soldiers' wounds 64

conflicting obligations 187, 192-95 political obligation. See political obligation permissibility non-culpability distinguished 115, 119 - 22political deference 166, 182, 184 political obligation and associative duties 169 culpability and 187, 192-95 deference and 166, 181 and invincible ignorance 181-92 particularism of 202 private military contractors 278 reparation and 198 victim status and 198 post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) 44 post-war commission of inquiry. See commissions of inquiry Postema, Gerald 48, 254-55 preventive war 180 private military contractors coercion and 271-72, 278 political obligation and 278 use of 11, 271, 276 victim status 278 psychological effects of killing 38 psychological effects of risk 45, 238 psychological experiments on obedience to authority 38-39, 238, 241

Rawls, John 66, 170
realism
normative accounts and 60
reform of law
domestic law 11, 280
international law 12, 312
refugee status
denial 28
eligibility 25, 29, 138–39, 314
normative account of the law and
127–29, 138–39, 237, 316
remotely fought wars 321
refusal to fight
associative duties and 192–95

enforced obedience. See duress

international law and 1, 23-24,

political obligation to obey 7, 166,

remotely fought wars 11, 266, 294-97

lawfulness of 3, 7, 23-24

26 - 28



350 INDEX

refusal to fight (cont.) crime of 1, 25 deserters. See deserters in lawful wars 237, 240-41, 273-74, protection of right of. See right not to punishment for 26, 227, 240, 249, 297 refugee status and 25, 28-29, 138-39, 314, 322 remotely fought wars 266, 294-97, 321 - 22Reisman, Michael 23, 80, 93, 111, 143, 168, 188, 242, 244, 255 remotely fought wars classification of 294-96 refugee status and 321 role morality and 252 soldiers fighting in 115, 266 reparation author's approach to 13 necessity of exclusion from 10, 256 and political obligation 198 and victim status 30 responsibility to protect associative ties and 169, 188 doctrine of 94, 152 human rights 93, 152, 313 restraint of force in conditions of uncertainty 142, 150 right not to fight absence of 1-2, 9, 25, 243, 246, 248, 252, 265 author's approach to 4, 265-66, 276, 280, 312 denial of 25, 241 and domestic law 25, 280, 292 effect on state military capacity 231, 266, 292, 320 limitation of 298, 305–8, 318–22 protection of 12, 292, 314, 322 recognition of 12, 27, 236, 276, 292, 310, 314, 318, 326 timing of protection 81, 272 warrior's code and 219 right to do right thing 192 right to life. See soldier's right to life

risk to aggressor state 177 of being criminally wronged 200 coercion and 133, 200 of failing to prevent wrong 150-53, 188, 199 high-risk wars 12, 294 and the legal status of humanitarian interventions 111 low-risk wars 12, 266, 294 of military breakdown 10, 188, 216, 237, 241, 297 of moral choice paralysis 250 psychological effects 45, 238 remotely fought wars 10, 266, 294 - 97of renewed conflict after perceived unjust judgment 257 wrongful exposure to 132, 165 Rodin, David 73, 102, 216 Scanlon, T. M. 127-28, 130 self-blame 48, 127 Shapiro, Scott 55, 57, 79, 112, 178 Shawcross, Hartley 98 shifting contingencies 265 Shue, Henry 137, 142, 204-7, 212, 215, 217-21, 238, 250 soldiers associative duties. See associative duties deference to leaders 7, 155 disobedience. See refusal to fight; right not to fight enemy. See enemy soldiers epistemic imbalance with leaders evaluative decision-making by 9, 235 injured. See soldiers' wounds and international law 1, 20, 217 killing of. See killing, lawful; killing, unjustified legal status in aggressive wars, conclusions as to 340 military functioning. See military functioning obedience. See duress; obedient participation in illegal wars



INDEX 351

political obligation. See political obligation psychological effects of killing 38 refugee status 12, 25, 28-29, 138-39, right not to fight. See right not to fight right to life. See soldier's right to life risk. See risk state's sacrifice of own troops 199 status in aggressive war 115, 340 "supporting our troops" 3-4 soldier's right to life and criminalization of aggression 4, 13, 77, 89, 102, 227, 325, 328 dispensability of 2 inalienability 210 state obligations as to 141 soldiers' wounds legal status 37, 64, 283 sovereign immunity 198 sovereignty and crime of aggression 70, 79, 97-98, 100 Special Court for Sierra Leone, amnesty 260 moral expressivism 54 states capability for lawful wars 10, 231, 266, 292, 320 as the core victims of aggression 70 exceeding of competence 168 international law's dependence on strong states 10, 242 moral value of 70 obligations as to soldier's right to life and private military contractors 271, 278 sacrifice of own troops 199 "supporting our troops" 3-4 Tokyo War Crimes Trial criminalization of aggression 17, 23,

Tokyo War Crimes Trial criminalization of aggression 17, 23, 61, 70, 99–100, 105, 181 duty to disobey illegal orders 20–21, 23 moral value of states 70 troops. *See* soldiers

UN Charter criminalization of aggression 89 unauthorized humanitarian interventions 102, 108 **UN Compensation Commission** (UNCC), reparation 35, 37, 200, 265, 330 UN Human Rights Committee. See **Human Rights Committee** unauthorized humanitarian interventions 102, 108 uncertainty as to criminality of wars 135-37, 139, deference and 155, 182 and political obligation 183, 187 and restraint of force 142, 150, 278 and soldiers' disobedience 275 spectrum of 139 unmanned armed vehicles. See

remotely fought wars

Vattel, Emer de 79 victim status and associative duties 198 author's approach to 4, 30 eligibility for 30, 328 exclusion from 6, 37, 50, 122, 132, 164, 329 extension of 331 group applications for 333 ignorance and 164 inclusion of soldiers 35, 328 necessity and 256, 277 and political obligation 198 private military contractors 278 recognition of 200, 328 reparation and 30 vincibility of ignorance. See ignorance Vitoria, Francisco de 136, 156, 171, 182,

waging aggressive war. See crime of aggression
Walzer, Michael
and aggressive moment 179
on coercion 120, 123, 132
on conflicting obligations 193



352 INDEX

Walzer, Michael (cont.) criticisms of 78 "domestic analogy" of international law 71, 76 on invincible ignorance 42, 137, 182 macro nature of crime of aggression 70, 74, 76 on non-culpability of soldiers 219 normative account of crime of aggression 72, 76 on political deference 137, 166, 168-69, 182 preventive war 180 soldiers' feelings of guilt 41, 193 on the need for unscrupulous soldiers 67 soldier's "moral investment in the state" 171 "triumph" of just war theory 67 "war is hell" 237 warrior's code 203-5, 209-10, 215-16, 219-20 "war is hell" 9, 132, 203, 237, 241, 249, 270-71, 298, 310 warrior's code about 202 author's approach to 9 concept of 203, 208

and criminal liability 208-9, 222 culpability and 9, 208-9, 217 and jus in bello rules 9, 203, 208, 222 limits of 209, 221-22 meaning of 203 reparation and 210 weaponized unmanned vehicles. See remotely fought wars Williams, Bernard 107, 129-30, 170, 245, 254 Wilmshurst, Elizabeth 19, 144 World War II 27, 85, 103-5, 177, 180-81, 218, 220, 257 (see Nuremberg Trials, Tokyo Trials) wrong of aggression. See crime of aggression wrong of being forced to do wrong 10-11, 64, 68, 131-32, 261, 283, 294, 298, 310, 325, 340 wrongful coercion 6, 132, 246, 261-62, 283, 299, 330-31, 337, 340 wrongful killing. See killing, unjustified wrongful war, law of being forced to kill in 25 wrongs inflicted by leaders 126, 132, 164, 283, 302, 331