The Peaceful Settlement of International Disputes

Addressing not only inter-State dispute settlement but also the settlement of disputes involving non-State actors, *The Peaceful Settlement of International Disputes* offers a clear and systematic overview of the procedures for dispute settlement in international law.

In light of the diversification of dispute settlement procedures, traditional means of international dispute settlement are discussed alongside newly developing fields such as the dispute settlement system under the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea, the WTO dispute settlement systems, the peaceful settlement of international environmental disputes, intra-State disputes, mixed arbitration, the United Nations Compensation Commission and the World Bank Inspection Panel. Figures are used throughout the book to help the reader to better understand the procedures and institutions of international dispute settlement, and suggestions for further reading support exploration of relevant issues.

Suitable for postgraduate law and international relations students studying dispute settlement in international law and conflict resolution, this book helps students to easily grasp key concepts and issues.

*Yoshifumi Tanaka* is Professor of International Law at the Faculty of Law, University of Copenhagen. He has taught at several different universities and has published widely in the fields of peaceful settlement of international disputes, the law of the sea and international environmental law.
The Peaceful Settlement of International Disputes

Yoshifumi Tanaka

University of Copenhagen
Dedicated to my teachers,
Lucius Caflisch, Hugh Thirlway and Tetsuo Sato.

Nation will not take up sword against nation,
nor will they train for war any more.

Isaiah 2:4
Contents

List of Figures page xiii
List of Tables xiv
Preface xv
Acknowledgements xvii
List of Abbreviations xviii
Table of Cases xxi
Table of Treaties and Instruments xxxiv

PART I FOUNDATION OF INTERNATIONAL DISPUTE SETTLEMENT 1

1 International Dispute Settlement in Perspective 3
   1 Introduction 3

2 Obligation of Peaceful Settlement of International Disputes 5
   3 The Concept of International Disputes in International Law 8
      3.1 Definition of International Disputes 8
      3.2 Identification of International Disputes 9
      3.3 The Distinction between Legal (Static) and Non-Legal (Dynamic) Disputes 14
      3.4 The Diversification of ‘Disputes’ in International Relations 17

4 Classification of Means of International Dispute Settlement 19
   4.1 Classification of Means of the Settlement of Inter-State Disputes 19
   4.2 Classification of Dispute Settlement Means in a Contemporary Context 23

5 Principal Features of the Dispute Settlement System in International Law 24
   6 Conclusions 25

2 Negotiation, Good Offices and Mediation 28
   1 Introduction 28

2 Negotiation and International Law 29
   2.1 The Relationship between Negotiation and International Law 29
   2.2 The Concept of Negotiation 30
## Contents

3 Interaction between Negotiation and International Adjudication 31
   3.1 Pre-Adjudicative Stage 32
   3.2 During Adjudication 32
   3.3 Post-Adjudicative Stage 33
4 Obligation to Negotiate 37
5 Timeframe for Negotiations 40
6 Outcome of Negotiations 41
7 Good Offices 43
   7.1 General Considerations 43
   7.2 Process of Good Offices 43
   7.3 Functions and Practice of Good Offices 44
8 Mediation 45
   8.1 General Considerations 45
   8.2 Process of Mediation 46
   8.3 Practice of Mediation 47
   8.4 Limitations of Mediation and Good Offices 49
9 Conclusions 50

3 Inquiry and Conciliation 52
1 Introduction 52
2 Inquiry 53
   2.1 Functions of Inquiry 53
   2.2 Institution of Inquiry 54
   2.3 Case Study (1): Inquiry by Inquiry Commissions 56
   2.4 Case Study (2): Inquiry under the Auspices of International Organisations 62
3 Conciliation 65
   3.1 Typology of Conciliation 65
   3.2 Function of Conciliation 65
   3.3 Institutional Aspects of Conciliation 67
   3.4 Limits of Conciliation 69
4 Conclusions 71

4 International Dispute Settlement through the United Nations 73
1 Introduction 73
2 The Role of the Security Council in International Dispute Settlement 74
   2.1 Procedure of Dispute Settlement 74
   2.2 Activities of the UN Security Council 77
   2.3 Questions Associated with Veto 80
   2.4 Disqualification from Voting 82
   2.5 The Relationship between the Security Council and the International Court of Justice 84
3 The Role of the General Assembly in International Dispute Settlement 85
   3.1 Functions of the General Assembly 85
   3.2 Predominance of the Security Council over the General Assembly 87
4 The Role of the UN Secretary-General in International Dispute Settlement 88
   4.1 Activities of the UN Secretary-General 88
   4.2 Independence of the UN Secretary-General 95
5 The United Nations and Regional Arrangements 98
   5.1 Cooperation between the United Nations and Regional Arrangements 98
   5.2 Concurrence of Jurisdiction between the UN Security Council and Regional Organisations 99
## Contents

5.3 Interaction between Regional Institutions and International Adjudication 100

5.4 Limits with Regional Organisations and Arrangements 101

6 Conclusions 102

5 Inter-State Arbitration 105

1 Introduction 105

2 Development of Inter-State Arbitration 107

3 The Selection of Arbitrators 109

3.1 Disagreement with Regard to the Appointment of Arbitrators 109

3.2 Independence and Impartiality of Arbitrators 111

4 Process of Arbitration 114

4.1 Initiation of the Arbitration Process 114

4.2 Scope of the Jurisdiction of an Arbitral Tribunal 116

4.3 Applicable Law 117

5 Intervention by Third States 118

6 Effect of the Arbitral Award 119

6.1 Implementation of the Arbitral Award 119

6.2 Nullity of the Arbitral Award 121

7 Interpretation of the Arbitral Award 125

8 Conclusions 126

6 International Court of Justice (I): Organisation and Jurisdiction of the Court 128

1 Introduction 129

1.1 The ICJ as a Principal Judicial Organ of the United Nations 129

1.2 Importance of the ICJ in International Dispute Settlement 129

1.3 Instruments Governing the ICJ 130

2 Parties before the ICJ 131

3 Organisation of the ICJ 132

3.1 Election of Judges 132

3.2 Independence and Impartiality of Judges 134

3.3 A National Judge and Judge Ad Hoc 137

3.4 Chambers of the ICJ 139

3.5 The Registry 141

4 Contentious Jurisdiction of the ICJ 141

4.1 General Considerations 141

4.2 Special Agreement 142

4.3 Compromissory Clause 144

4.4 *Forum Prorogatum* 144

4.5 Optional Clause 147

5 Reservations to the Optional Clause 149

5.1 Principle of Reciprocity Concerning Reservations to the Optional Clause 149

5.2 Reservations *Ratione Personae* 151

5.3 Reservations *Ratione Temporis* 152

5.4 Reservations *Ratione Materiae* 154

5.5 The Validity of Automatic Reservation 157

5.6 The Validity of Instantly Amendable Reservations 160

5.7 Termination of Declarations 161
x

Contents

6 Advisory Jurisdiction 163
   6.1 Basics of an Advisory Opinion 163
   6.2 Procedure of Advisory Proceedings 166
   6.3 Admissibility of Request 167
   6.4 Effect of Advisory Opinion 170

7 Conclusions 171

7 International Court of Justice (II): Law and Procedure of the Court 175
   1 Applicable Law 175
      1.1 General Considerations 175
      1.2 Lex Lata and Lex Ferenda 176
   2 The Proceedings in Contentious Cases 178
      2.1 The Procedure in a Contentious Case 178
      2.2 The Principle Ne Exeat Index Ultra Petita Partium 185
      2.3 Non-Appearance 187
   3 Provisional Measures 190
      3.1 Purpose of Provisional Measures 190
      3.2 Requirements to Indicate Provisional Measures 191
      3.3 Provisional Measures and the Ceasing of Execution of Individuals 197
      3.4 Implementation of Provisional Measures 199
   4 Preliminary Objections 200
      4.1 Procedural Issues 200
      4.2 The Monetary Gold Rule 202
      4.3 Admissibility of Disputes Involving Highly Political Issues 204
   5 Intervention under Article 62 of the Court’s Statute 205
      5.1 General Considerations 205
      5.2 The Concept of an Interest of a Legal Nature 206
      5.3 Jurisdictional Link 209
      5.4 Legal Effect of Judgments on an Intervener 210
   6 Third State Intervention under Article 63 of the Court’s Statute 211
   7 Judgment of the ICJ 213
      7.1 Res Judicata 213
      7.2 Effect of Article 59 of the ICJ Statute 215
      7.3 Interpretation of Judgments 215
      7.4 Revision of Judgments 218
      7.5 Implementation of Judgments 221
   8 Conclusions 222

PART II INTERNATIONAL DISPUTE SETTLEMENT IN PARTICULAR FIELDS 227

8 International Dispute Settlement in the UN Convention on the Law of the Sea 229
   1 Introduction 229
   2 Interlinkage between Voluntary and Compulsory Procedures of International Dispute Settlement 230
      2.1 The Interlinkage between Voluntary and Compulsory Procedures 230
      2.2 Conciliation 235
Contents

3 Compulsory Procedures of International Dispute Settlement 236
  3.1 Multiplicity of Forums: Montreux Formula 236
  3.2 Limitations and Exceptions to the Compulsory Procedures 237

4 International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea 243
  4.1 The Structure of ITLOS 243
  4.2 Jurisdiction of ITLOS 248
  4.3 Applicable Law 250
  4.4 Proceedings before ITLOS 251
  4.5 Preliminary Objections 252
  4.6 Provisional Measures 254
  4.7 Intervention 260
  4.8 Prompt Release Procedure 260
  4.9 Judgment 263
  4.10 Advisory Proceedings 264

5 Arbitration under the LOSC 268
  5.1 Annex VII Arbitral Tribunal under the LOSC 268
  5.2 Annex VIII Special Arbitral Tribunal 268

6 Fragmentation of International Law 269

7 Conclusions 271

9 The WTO Dispute Settlement System 275
  1 Introduction 275
  1.1 International Dispute Settlement in GATT 275
  1.2 Principal Features of the WTO Dispute Settlement System 277

2 Basic Elements of the WTO Dispute Settlement System 279
  2.1 General Considerations 279
  2.2 The Dispute Settlement Body 280
  2.3 Access to the Dispute Settlement System of the WTO 281
  2.4 Causes of Action 282
  2.5 Applicable Law 284

3 Consultation 286

4 Good offices, Conciliation and Mediation 288

5 Panel Proceedings 289
  5.1 The Establishment of a Panel 289
  5.2 Composition and Terms of Reference of Panels 290
  5.3 Scope of Jurisdiction of WTO panels 291
  5.4 Panel Procedure 292

6 Appellate Review 295

7 Legal Effect of Reports of WTO Panels and the Appellate Body 296

8 Implementation of Rulings and Recommendations 298
  8.1 Remedies for Breach of WTO Law 298
  8.2 Compensation and Retaliation 299

9 Legal Nature of the WTO Panel Procedure 303

10 Arbitration 304

11 The WTO Dispute Settlement System and Developing States 305
  11.1 Consideration of Developing States in the DSU 305
  11.2 Practice of Developing States 307

12 Conclusions 308
Contents

10 Peaceful Settlement of International Environmental Disputes 311
  1 Introduction 311
  2 International Adjudication and the Settlement of International Environmental Disputes 312
    2.1 General Considerations 312
    2.2 The Role of Arbitration in the Settlement of International Environmental Disputes 314
    2.3 The Role Provisional Measures in Environmental Protection 318
    2.4 *Locus Standi* on the Basis of the Breach of Obligations *Erga Omnes Partes* 320
  3 Fact-Finding by Treaty Commission 321
  4 Non-Compliance Procedures 323
    4.1 General Considerations 323
    4.2 Triggering Non-Compliance Procedures 325
    4.3 Composition of Organs of Non-Compliance Procedures 327
    4.4 Functions of the Compliance/Implementation Committee 328
    4.5 Relationship between Non-Compliance Procedures and Dispute Settlement Procedures 329
  5 Conclusions 332

11 Peaceful Settlement of Disputes Involving Non-State Actors 334
  1 Introduction 334
  2 Peaceful Settlement of Intra-State Disputes 335
    2.1 The Role of the United Nations in the Settlement of Intra-State Disputes 335
    2.2 Intra-State Arbitration: The Abyei Arbitration 343
  3 Mixed Arbitration 346
    3.1 The International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes (ICSID) 346
    3.2 The Iran-United States Claims Tribunal 352
  4 United Nations Compensation Commission 355
    4.1 Outline of the UNCC 355
    4.2 The UNCC and Claims for Environmental Damage 358
  5 Settlement of Disputes between an International Organisation and its Member States: Judicial Review 362
    5.1 General Considerations 362
    5.2 The *Lockerbie* Case 363
    5.3 Discussion 364
  6 International Organisations and Individuals 367
    6.1 UN Internal Justice System 367
    6.2 Inspection Panel of the World Bank 368
  7 Conclusions 376

12 The Quest for Peace in International Law 382
  1 Introduction 382
  2 Interlinkage between International Dispute Settlement and the Prohibition of the Threat or Use of Force 384
    2.1 The League of Nations 384
    2.2 The United Nations 387
  3 Interlinkage between Disarmament and Peaceful Settlement of International Disputes 390
  4 Looking Ahead 392

Index 396