Experiments in Public Management Research

Interest in experimental research in public management is on the rise, yet the field still lacks a broad understanding of its role in producing substantive findings and theoretical advances. Written by a team of leading international researchers, this book sets out the advantages of experiments in public management and showcases their rapidly developing contribution to research and practice. This book offers a comprehensive overview of the relationship between experiments and public management theory and the benefits for examining causal effects. It will appeal to researchers and graduate-level students in public administration, public management, government, politics, and policy studies.

The key topics addressed are: the distinct logic of experimental methods in the laboratory, in the field, and in survey experiments; how leading researchers are using different kinds of experiments to build knowledge about theory and practice across many areas of public management; and the research agendas for experimental work in public management.

Oliver James, PhD, is Professor of Political Science at the University of Exeter. His research is widely published with recent work focusing on: citizen and users’ responses to public service performance (and performance information), political and managerial leadership change and organisational performance, and the comparative politics of government structural reform (an Open Research Area project of the United Kingdom, France, Germany, and the Netherlands). He serves on the board of the Public Management Research Association and is a member of the Evidence in Governance and Politics network focused on experimental research. He is director of the Master in Public Administration programme at Exeter and has acted as a consultant to bodies including the World Bank, OECD, UK Treasury, and UK National Audit Office.

Sebastian R. Jilke, PhD, is an assistant professor in the School of Public Affairs and Administration at Rutgers University-Newark, where he co-directs the Center for Experimental and Behavioral Public Administration. He has
published articles in journals such as the *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, *European Journal of Political Research*, *Public Administration Review*, and *Regulation & Governance*. He is currently co-chairing the EGPA Permanent Study Group on “Behavioral Public Administration.” His interests include citizen–state interactions and equality in service provision, and his recent work examines how citizens and public officials respond to market-type mechanisms in public service delivery.

**Gregg G. Van Ryzin, PhD,** is an professor in the School of Public Affairs and Administration at Rutgers University-Newark, where he directs the PhD program and co-directs the Center for Experimental and Behavioral Public Administration. He has interests in both survey research and experimental methods and conducts empirical studies on a range of topics, including citizen satisfaction with urban services, coproduction, performance measurement, nonprofit organisations, housing and neighbourhood issues, and comparative public opinion about government policy and institutions. Prof. Van Ryzin is widely published in scholarly journals in public administration, policy analysis, and urban affairs and is author (with Dahlia K. Remler) of *Research Methods in Practice* (2011/2014).
Experiments in Public Management Research

Challenges and Contributions

Edited by

OLIVER JAMES
University of Exeter

SEBASTIAN R. JILKE
Rutgers University, New Jersey

gregg g. van ryzin
Rutgers University, New Jersey
## Contents

**List of Figures**

page viii

**List of Tables**

ix

**List of Contributors**

xi

**Preface and Acknowledgements**

xvii

### Part I  Context

1  Introduction: Experiments in Public Management Research


2  A Systematic Review of Experimental Studies in Public Management Journals

H U A F A N G L I A N D G R E G G G . V A N R Y Z I N

3  Experiments and the Classical Roots of Public Administration: Comments on the Potential Utility of Experiments for Contemporary Public Management


### Part II  Methods

4  Causal Inference and the Design and Analysis of Experiments


5  Field Experiments in Public Management


6  Survey Experiments for Public Management Research

Contents

7 Laboratory Experiments: Their Potential for Public Management Research
MARKUS TEPE AND CHRISTINE PROKOP

Part III Substantive Contributions

8 Work Motivation
NICOLA BELLE AND PAOLA CANTARELLI

9 Experimenting with Leadership in Public Organisations
LOTTE BOGH ANDERSEN, LOUISE LADEGAARD BRO, ANNE BØLLINGTOFT, AND JACOB LADENBURG

10 Prospects for Experimental Approaches to Research on Bureaucratic Red Tape
SANJAY K. PANDEY, SHEELA PANDEY, AND GREGG G. VAN RYZIN

11 Managerial Use of Performance Data by Bureaucrats and Politicians
DONALD P. MOYNIHAN, POUL A. NIELSEN, AND ALEXANDER KROLL

12 Citizens and Public Performance Measures: Making Sense of Performance Information
OLIVER JAMES AND ASMUS LETH OLSEN

13 Public Sector Transparency
STEPHAN GRIMMELIJKHUIJSEN, ULRIKE WESKE, ROBIN BOUWMAN, AND LARS TUMMERS

14 Representative Bureaucracy: An Experimental Approach
GREGG G. VAN RYZIN AND NORMA M. RICCUCI

15 Coproduction of Public Services
SIMON CALMAR ANDERSEN, MORTEN JAKOBSN, SOREN SERRITZLEW, AND METTE KJÆRGAARD THOMSEN

16 Expectations of and Satisfaction with Public Services
JUE YOUNG MOK, OLIVER JAMES, AND GREGG G. VAN RYZIN
Contents

17 Citizen and Users’ Responses to Public Service Failure: Experimentation about Blame, Exit, and Voice
   OLIVER JAMES AND SEBASTIAN JILKE 361

18 Assessing Public Support for Government Policy: Comparing Experimental and Attitudinal Approaches
   SCOTT E. ROBINSON, JAMES W. STOUTENBOROUGH AND ARNOLD VEDLITZ 376

19 Legislative Oversight of the Bureaucracy: Insights from Formal Modelling and Experimental Testing
   SUSUMU SHIKANO, MICHAEL F. STOFFEL, AND MARKUS TEPE 394

20 Experimental Research for Nonprofit Management: Charitable Giving and Fundraising
   MIRAE KIM, DYANA MASON, AND HUAFAANG LI 415

Part IV Issues and Implications 437

21 Replication of Experimental Research: Implications for the Study of Public Management
   RICHARD M. WALKER, M. JIN LEE, AND OLIVER JAMES 439

22 The Experimental Turn in Public Management: How Methodological Preferences Drive Substantive Choices
   STEVEN VAN DE WALLE 461

   PETER JOHN 476

24 Conclusions – Towards an Experimental Public Management
   OLIVER JAMES, SEBASTIAN JILKE, AND GREGG G. VAN RYZIN 495

Appendix 509

Index 512
Figures

2.1 Trend in published experiments in the 20 top public policy and administration journals, 1990–2015  page 23
2.2 Number of experiments published by journal, in rank order 24
2.3 Published experiments by country (of first author) 25
2.4 Setting and type of experiments 26
2.5 Types of participants 28
2.6 Main topics of research 29
2.7 Word clouds of experimental studies’ abstracts 30
2.8 Word clustering of experimental studies’ abstracts 31
4.1 Independent variable X as a cause of dependent variable Y 61
4.2 Experimental intervention on independent variable X that is a cause of dependent variable Y 65
4.3 Experiment with a treatment and control group 67
7.1 Process of accomplishing a laboratory session 149
12.1 Mean school evaluations 275
12.2 Citizens’ responses and information cues about relatively good performance 278
12.3 Effect of satisfied percentage label and dissatisfied percentage label 281
14.1 Main effects of gender representativeness on women in experiment 1 318
14.2 Effects of gender representation on willingness to recycle 321
16.1 Expectancy disconfirmation (with performance) model 346
19.1 Game structure 400
20.1 Experimental design and results 422
21.1 Experimental red tape perception from original study and replication study 449
21.2 Red tape perception of the groups who support/do not support Robin’s registration 454
Tables

1.1 Methods containing the term *experiment* ........................... page 7
2.1 Top 20 journals in public policy and administration .......... 21
4.1 Potential outcomes and differing actual exposure to treatment: implications for what researchers can see ...... 69
4.2 Measurement designs (where X is the treatment and O an observation of the outcome) ............... 73
4.3 Factorial design (2 × 2) ................................................. 74
5.1 Types of field experiment defined by subjects participating in the experiment and the nature of the experimental treatment ............................................ 93
7.1 Laboratory experiment published in public administration and management .................................. 154
8.1 Studies on external regulation ......................................... 170
8.2 Studies on introjected, identified and integrated motivation ......................................................... 177
8.3 Studies on intrinsic motivation ........................................ 187
9.1 Combinations of experimental designs and types of leadership experiments ............................... 198
9.2 Overview of leadership training studies ......................... 200
10.1 Experimental studies on red tape .................................... 226
10.2 Mean ratings of red tape .............................................. 233
11.1 Overview of experimental studies .................................. 251
13.1 Overview of experiments of transparency .................... 303
15.1 Types of coproduction .................................................. 331
18.1 Descriptive results of attitudes toward water policy options ...................................................... 380
18.2 Multivariate analysis of support for water policy options ...................................................... 382
18.3 Raw toward water policy results .................................. 387
18.4 The subpopulation analysis of Democrats in the willingness to pay experiment ..................... 389
19.1 Pay-off structure of the inspection game ....................... 397
List of Tables

19.2 Parameterisation and mixed strategy solutions .................................................. 402
19.3 Aggregate-level results of different cost-fee treatments .................................... 405
19.4 Aggregate-level results over periods ..................................................................... 406
19.5 Aggregate-level results of different information accuracy treatments .................... 407
19.6 Information content and punishment decision ....................................................... 408
20.1 Image motivation response rates .......................................................................... 427
21.1 Six types of replication ......................................................................................... 443
21.2 Descriptive statistics from original study and replication study ......................... 448
21.3 ANOVA analysis of experimental red tape perception across scenarios .............. 450
21.4 Standardised OLS regression predicting red tape perceptions ............................. 451
21.5 Agree to Ms. Jones’s decision ............................................................................... 452
21.6 ANOVA analysis of the groups who support/do not support Robin’s registration ... 453
Contributors

Lotte Bøgh Andersen – Professor
Department of Political Science
Aarhus University

Simon Calmar Andersen – Professor
Department of Political Science
Aarhus University

Nicola Belle – Assistant Professor
Policy Analysis and Public Management
Bocconi University

Anne Bøllingtoft – Associate Professor
Department of Management
Aarhus University

Robin Bouwman – PhD Student
Department of Public Administration
Institute for Management Research
Radboud University Nijmegen

Louise Ladegaard Bro – PhD Student
Department of Political Science
Aarhus University

Paola Cantarelli – PhD Candidate
Public and Nonprofit Management
School of Economics, Political and Policy Sciences
University of Texas at Dallas

Kendall D. Funk – PhD Candidate
Department of Political Science
Texas A&M University
List of Contributors

Stephan Grimmelikhuijsen – Assistant Professor
Utrecht University School of Governance
Utrecht University

Morten Jakobsen – Associate Professor
Department of Political Science
Aarhus University

Oliver James – Professor
Department of Politics
University of Exeter

Sebastian Jilke – Assistant Professor
School of Public Affairs and Administration (SPAA)
Rutgers University-Newark

Peter John – Professor
Department of Political Science
University College London

Mirae Kim – Assistant Professor
Harry S Truman School of Public Affairs
University of Missouri

Alexander Kroll – Assistant Professor
Steven J. Green School of International and Public Affairs
Florida International University

Jacob Ladenburg – Professor (mso)
The Danish Institute for Local and Regional Government Research

M. Jin Lee – Research Fellow
Laboratory for Public Management and Policy,
Department of Public Policy
City University of Hong Kong

Huafang Li – PhD Candidate
School of Public Affairs and Administration
Rutgers University

Dyana Mason – Assistant Professor
Department of Planning, Public Policy & Management
University of Oregon
List of Contributors

Kenneth J. Meier – Distinguished Professor of Political Science
Charles H. Gregory Chair in Liberal Arts
Department of Political Science
Texas A&M University

Jue Young Mok – PhD Student
Martin School of Public Policy and Administration
University of Kentucky

Alice Moseley – Lecturer
Department of Politics
University of Exeter

Donald P. Moynihan – Epstein Professor of Public Affairs
Robert M. La Follette School of Public Affairs
University of Wisconsin – Madison

Poul A. Nielsen – Assistant Professor
Department of Political Science and Public Management
University of Southern Denmark

Asmus Leth Olsen – Associate Professor
Department of Political Science
University of Copenhagen

Sanjay K. Pandey – Shapiro Professor of Public Policy and Public Administration
Trachtenberg School of Public Policy and Public Administration
The George Washington University

Sheela Pandey – Assistant Professor
School of Business Administration
Pennsylvania State University at Harrisburg

Christine Prokop – Research Assistant
Department of Political Science/Political System of Germany
University of Oldenburg

Norma M. Riccucci – Distinguished Professor
School of Public Affairs and Administration
Rutgers University, Newark
List of Contributors

Scott E. Robinson – Professor
Bellmon Chair of Public Service, Department of Political Science
University of Oklahoma

Søren Serritzlew – Professor
Department of Political Science
Aarhus University

Susumu Shikano – Professor
Department of Politics and Public Administration
University of Konstanz

Michael F. Stoffel – Postdoctoral Researcher
Department of Politics and Public Administration
University of Konstanz

James W. Stoutenborough – Assistant Professor
Department of Political Science
Idaho State University

Markus Tepe – Professor
Department of Social Science/Political System of Germany
University of Oldenburg

Mette Kjærgaard Thomsen – Assistant Professor
Department of Political Science
Aarhus University

Lars Tummers – Associate Professor
Utrecht University School of Governance
Utrecht University

Gregg G. Van Ryzin – Professor
School of Public Affairs and Administration
Rutgers University

Steven Van de Walle – Professor
Public Governance Institute
KU Leuven

Arnold Vedlitz – Professor
Institute for Science, Technology and Public Policy
The Bush School of Government and Public Service
Texas A&M University
List of Contributors

Richard M. Walker – Professor
Laboratory for Public Management and Policy,
Department of Public Policy
City University of Hong Kong

Ulrike Weske – PhD Student
Utrecht University School of Governance
Utrecht University
Preface and Acknowledgements

The genesis of this project is in the editors’ shared interest in experiments and their collaborative research on substantive topics in public management using these methods. In the course of these activities we came to appreciate the benefits of a book to help set out the role of experimental public management in producing substantive empirical findings, advancing knowledge about theories, and informing policy and practice. This book examines the distinct logic of experimental research, especially for estimating causal effects, and shows how leading researchers are using different kinds of experiment to build knowledge about theory and practice across many areas of public management. A goal of this book is to help develop an agenda for experimental work that recognises both the strengths and limitations of the method for research on public management. This content is intended to be of interest both to those using experiments and to the broader community in public management interested in the contribution of experiments and how they relate to other, more established methods.

We identified a group of researchers currently using experimental methods in innovative ways across a range of topic areas in public management and were delighted when all those approached agreed to be involved. We thank them very much for participating and helping to make this project a reality. The use of the method is expanding rapidly, and we have not sought to include all experimental work but instead hope to show the breadth of the contribution. We are particularly pleased to draw on insights from the disciplines of psychology, political science, and economics and to discuss several different types of experimental method, notably laboratory experiments, survey experiments, and field experiments. However, this book is not only about the considerable opportunities for more use of experiments; it also actively engages with critiques of their use. In this way, it considers both their strengths and limitations and the implications of these characteristics for designing and deploying experiments appropriately.
The overall framework of this book and specific chapters were developed through a two-year process, including presenting ideas and draft chapters at international conferences and workshops. Many people provided valuable comments in this process. We are especially grateful to the Public Management Research Association for permission to run workshops at its 2015 (Minnesota) and 2016 (Aarhus) Public Management Research Conferences. In addition, the ideas were discussed at panels we ran in recent International Research Society for Public Management conferences (2015 in Birmingham, UK, and 2016 in Hong Kong). We are also grateful for the support of our universities, including the Center for Experimental and Behavioral Public Administration at Rutgers University, and grateful to the UK Economic and Social Research Council for supporting public management research using experiments at the University of Exeter. The European Union also funded some of the editors’ collaborative research on which this book draws, including as part of the project Coordinating for Cohesion in the Public Sector of the Future (COCOPS) funded under the European Commission’s 7th Framework Programme.