REVISITING THE LAW AND GOVERNANCE OF TRAFFICKING, FORCED LABOR AND MODERN SLAVERY

In the decades following the globalization of the world economy, trafficking, forced labor and modern slavery have emerged as significant global problems. States negotiated the Palermo Protocol in 2000 under which they agreed to criminalize trafficking, primarily understood as an issue of serious organized crime. Sixteen years later, leading academics, activists and policy makers from international organizations come together in this edited volume and adopt an inter-disciplinary, multi-stakeholder approach to revisit trafficking through the lens of labor migration and extreme exploitation and, in the process, rethink the law and governance of trafficking. This volume considers many key factors, including the evolving international law on trafficking, the relationship between trafficking, slavery, indenture and domestic migration law and policy as well as newly emergent techniques of governance, including indicators, all with a view to furthering prospects for lasting economic justice in a globalized world.

Prabha Kotiswaran is Reader in Law and Social Justice at the Dickson Poon School of Law, King’s College London. In 2014, she was awarded the Leverhulme Prize for Law. She co-edits the Open Democracy blog, Beyond Trafficking and Slavery, and is on the advisory board of the ILO-DFID project Work in Freedom (2013–2018) on the prevention of the trafficking of women in South Asia. Her main areas of research include criminal law, transnational criminal law, sociology of law, postcolonial theory and feminist legal theory.
CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN LAW AND SOCIETY

Cambridge Studies in Law and Society aims to publish the best scholarly work on legal discourse and practice in its social and institutional contexts, combining theoretical insights and empirical research.

The fields that it covers are: studies of law in action; the sociology of law; the anthropology of law; cultural studies of law, including the role of legal discourses in social formations; law and economics; law and politics; and studies of governance. The books consider all forms of legal discourse across societies, rather than being limited to lawyers’ discourses alone.

The series editors come from a range of disciplines: academic law; socio-legal studies; sociology; and anthropology. All have been actively involved in teaching and writing about law in context.

Series Editors

Chris Arup Monash University, Victoria
Sally Engle Merry New York University
Susan Silbey Massachusetts Institute of Technology

A list of books in the series can be found at the back of this book.
REVISITING THE LAW AND
GOVERNANCE OF TRAFFICKING,
FORCED LABOR AND MODERN
SLAVERY

Prabha Kotiswaran

King’s College London
CONTENTS

List of Contributors viii
Acknowledgements xvii

From Sex Panic to Extreme Exploitation: Revisiting the Law and Governance of Human Trafficking 1
Prabha Kotiswaran

PART I REVISITING THE TEXT AND CONTEXT OF ARTICLE 3

1 Trafficked and Exploited: The Urgent Need for Coherence in International Law 59
Michael Dottridge

2 The International Legal Definition of “Trafficking in Persons”: Scope and Application 83
Anne T. Gallagher

3 Contemporary Debt Bondage, “Self-Exploitation,” and the Limits of the Trafficking Definition 112
Janie A. Chuang

4 Subjectivity of Coercion: Workers’ Experiences with Trafficking in the United States 134
Denise Brennan

PART II ANTI-TRAFFICKING LAW: A LEGAL REALIST CRITIQUE

5 The Right to Locomotion? Trafficking, Slavery and the State 157
Julia O’Connell Davidson
CONTENTS

6 Anti-Trafficking and the New Indenture
   Janet Halley 179

7 Immigration Controls and “Modern-Day Slavery”
   Chantal Thomas 212

8 Representing, Counting, Valuing: Managing Definitional
   Uncertainty in the Law of Trafficking
   Kerry Rittich 238

PART III TRAFFICKING AND NEW FORMS OF GOVERNANCE

9 Counting the Uncountable: Constructing Trafficking
   through Measurement
   Sally Engle Merry 273

10 Addressing HIV/AIDS at the Intersection of
    Anti-Trafficking and Health Law and Policy
    Aziza Ahmed 305

11 Brokered Subjects and Sexual Investability
    Elizabeth Bernstein 329

PART IV NEW DIRECTIONS IN ANTI-TRAFFICKING LAW
    AND POLICY: THE ROLE OF THE ILO

12 Raising the Bar: The Adoption of New ILO Standards
    against Forced Labour
    Beate Andrees and Amanda Aikman 359

13 Trafficking and Forced Labour: Filling in the Gaps
    with the Adoption of the Supplementary ILO
    Standards, 2014
    Lee Swepston 395

14 Combating Trafficking for Labour Exploitation in the
    Global Economy: The Need for a Differentiated
    Approach
    Roger Plant 422

15 Human Trafficking and Forced Labour: Mapping
    Corporate Liability
    Zuzanna Muskat-Gorska 443

vi
## CONTENTS

**PART V RETHINKING TRAFFICKING THROUGH MIGRATION POLICY**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>The Paradox of “Legality”: Temporary Migrant Worker Programs and Vulnerability to Trafficking</td>
<td>Hila Shamir</td>
<td>471</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>The Indentured Mobility of Migrant Domestic Workers: The Case of Dubai</td>
<td>Rhacel Salazar Parreñas and Rachel Silvey</td>
<td>503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Migrants, Unfree Labour, and the Legal Construction of Domestic Servitude: Migrant Domestic Workers in the United Kingdom</td>
<td>Judy Fudge and Kendra Strauss</td>
<td>524</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Index  

567
LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS


Amanda Aikman is an attorney at Morrison & Foerster LLP, where she represents individuals and companies in global anti-corruption and complex litigation matters, including compliance counseling, internal corporate investigations, and government enforcement actions. She previously served as legal officer for the Special Action Programme to Combat Forced Labour at the International Labour Organization, where she was closely involved in the development and adoption of the Forced Labour Protocol. Amanda also previously served as a prosecutor for the US Department of Justice, where she investigated and prosecuted those paying bribes to foreign officials in international business transactions under the Foreign Corrupt Practices Act. Amanda earned her undergraduate degree from Stanford University and her law degree from Yale Law School, where she served as Notes Editor for the *Yale Law Journal* and was awarded a Robina Foundation Human Rights Fellowship.

Beate Andrees is the Chief of the Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work Branch of the ILO Governance and Tripartism Department. The Branch promotes policy development, carries out research and provides technical advisory services on child labor, forced labor, non-discrimination and freedom of association and collective bargaining. Previously, Beate Andrees acted as the head of the ILO Special Action Programme to Combat Forced Labour.
this role, she coordinated the ILO’s efforts toward the adoption of a new Protocol and Recommendation on contemporary forms of forced labor in June 2014 and managed technical cooperation programs in various countries. Before joining the ILO, she worked for the German Parliament and as a lecturer at the Free University of Berlin, Germany. She has published widely on issues related to fundamental labor rights, migration and human trafficking.

Elizabeth Bernstein is Associate Professor of Women’s Studies and Sociology at Barnard College, Columbia University. She is the author of Temporarily Yours: Intimacy, Authenticity, and the Commerce of Sex (University of Chicago Press, 2007), which received two distinguished book awards from the American Sociological Association as well as the 2009 Norbert Elias Prize. Her current book project is Brokered Subjects: Sex, Trafficking, and the Politics of Freedom, also forthcoming from the University of Chicago Press, which explores the convergence of feminist, neoliberal and evangelical Christian interests in the shaping of contemporary global policies surrounding the traffic in women. Her research has received support from the Institute for Advanced Study in Princeton, New Jersey, the Mellon Foundation, the Social Science Research Council, the National Science Foundation, the American Association of University Women and the Institute for Social and Economic Research and Policy at Columbia University.

Denise Brennan is Professor and Chair of the Department of Anthropology at Georgetown University. Her most recent book, Life Interrupted: Trafficking into Forced Labor in the United States (Duke University Press, 2014), follows the lives of the first trafficking survivors in the United States. Professor Brennan is also the author of What’s Love Got to Do with It? Transnational Desires and Sex Tourism in the Dominican Republic (Duke University Press, 2004). She is currently writing a book on life without documentation in the United States, Love and Heartache across Borders. As part of the research, she drove coast to coast along the US border inside the “100-mile zone” (an enhanced immigration enforcement zone) to speak with undocumented people about their everyday strategies, struggles and improvisations. Professor Brennan founded the Trafficking Survivor Leadership Training Fund to which all royalties from Life Interrupted are donated.
LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS


Michael Dottridge spent twenty-five years working in human rights organizations, Amnesty International and Anti-Slavery International (where he was director for six years). Since 1995 Michael’s work has focused on forms of exploitation, how to protect the people involved and how to prevent the exploitation from occurring in the first place, whether it concerns child labor, the commercial sexual exploitation of children, forced labor or trafficking in human beings. He has given particular attention to issues surrounding exploitation and trafficking that involve children. Since 2002 he has worked independently as a consultant on human rights and child rights issues, and from 2011 to 2016 he was a trustee of the United Nations Fund on Contemporary Forms of Slavery. He works in English, French, Portuguese and Spanish and is the author of numerous reports and publications about cases of exploitation.
LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Judy Fudge is Professor at the University of Kent (UK). She established her academic career in Canada, where she was a professor at Osgoode Hall Law School and Lansdowne Chair in Law at the University of Victoria. In 2012, she was a Braudel Fellow at the European University Institute and in 2014–2015 she was the France-ILO Chair/Fellow at the Institute of Advanced Legal Studies in Nantes. She was elected as a Fellow of the Royal Society of Canada (2013), and in 2014 she received an honorary doctorate from the Faculty of Law of the University of Lund. Recent publications include “Constitutionalizing Labor Rights in Canada and Europe: Freedom of Association, Collective Bargaining, and Strikes,” Current Legal Problems (2015); “Feminist Reflections on the Scope of Labor Law: Domestic Work, Social Reproduction, and Jurisdiction,” Feminist Legal Studies (2014); and “Making Claims for Migrant Workers: Human Rights and Citizenship,” Citizenship Studies (2014).

Anne T. Gallagher AO (BA LLB, MIntL, PhD) is a lawyer, practitioner, teacher and scholar with an established international reputation in human rights and the administration of criminal justice. She served as a UN human rights official from 1992 to 2003, the last four years as Special Adviser on Human Trafficking to the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights. In that capacity she participated in the development of the international legal framework around human trafficking, leading the UN Inter-Agency Group in the negotiation process and subsequent drafting of the UN Principles and Guidelines on Human Rights and Human Trafficking. Since resigning from the UN in 2003, Anne has held various leadership and technical roles in an intergovernmental program that aims to strengthen legislative and criminal justice responses to human trafficking and related exploitation in South East Asia. Other current positions include Co-Chair of the International Bar Association’s Presidential Task Force on Trafficking; member of the IOM Director-General’s Advisory Board on Migration; and Academic Adviser at Doughty Street Chambers, the UK’s largest civil rights practice. An independent and award-winning scholar, she is widely recognized as a leading global authority on the international law of human trafficking.

Janet Halley is the Royall Professor of Law at Harvard Law School. She has a PhD in English Literature from UCLA and a JD from Yale.
Law School. She has taught English literature at Hamilton College and law at Stanford Law School, Tel Aviv Buchmann School of Law and in the Law Department of the American University in Cairo. She is the author of *Split Decisions: How and Why to Take a Break from Feminism* (Princeton, 2006) and *Don’t: A Reader’s Guide to the Military’s Anti-Gay Policy* (Duke, 1999). With Wendy Brown, she coedited *Left Legalism/Left Critique* (Duke, 2002); with Andrew Parker she coedited *After Sex? New Writing Since Queer Theory* (Duke, 2011). With Prabha Kotiswaran, Hila Shamir and Rachel Rebouché, she is producing two volumes on Governance Feminism forthcoming from the University of Minnesota Press.

**Prabha Kotiswaran** is Reader in Law and Social Justice at King's College London. Dr. Kotiswaran's areas of interest include criminal law, transnational criminal law, sociology of law, postcolonial theory and feminist legal theory. Her 2011 book *Dangerous Sex, Invisible Labor: Sex Work and the Law in India* (Princeton) won the 2012 SLSA-Hart Prize for Early Career Academics. Dr. Kotiswaran has also edited *Sex Work* for a series on Issues in Contemporary Indian Feminism; and coedited special issues of the *Journal of Law and Society* (2013) and the *Northern Ireland Legal Quarterly* (2014) with Amanda Perry-Kessaris and Diamond Ashiagbor on an economic sociology of law. Her current book projects are *Governance Feminism: An Introduction* and a coedited volume *Governance Feminism: Notes from the Field* both with Janet Halley, Rachel Rebouché and Hila Shamir (forthcoming from the University of Minnesota Press). Dr. Kotiswaran received the Philip Leverhulme Prize in 2014. Her research has been funded by the Arts and Humanities Research Council, the Leverhulme Trust, the Economic and Social Research Council and the Journal of Law & Society.

**Sally Engle Merry** is Silver Professor of Anthropology at New York University. She is also a Faculty Director of the Center for Human Rights and Global Justice at the New York University School of Law. Her recent books include *Colonizing Hawai'i* (Princeton, 2000); *Human Rights and Gender Violence* (Chicago, 2006); *Gender Violence: A Cultural Perspective* (Blackwell, 2009) and *The Practice of Human Rights* (coedited with Mark Goodale; Cambridge, 2007). Her most recent book, *The Seductions of Quantification: Measuring Human Rights, Gender Violence, and Sex Trafficking* (Chicago:
University of Chicago Press, 2016) examines indicators as a technology of knowledge used for human rights monitoring and global governance. She received the Hurst Prize for Colonizing Hawai’i in 2002, the Kalven Prize for scholarly contributions to socio-legal scholarship in 2007 and the J. I. Staley Prize for Human Rights and Gender Violence in 2010. In 2013 she received an honorary degree from McGill School of Law.

Zuzanna Muskat-Gorska works in the Legal Department of the International Trade Union Confederation. Since 2009 she has been working in the area of international labor standards, protection against discrimination, rights of migrants and contemporary forms of slavery. She was a member of the EU Commission’s Expert Group on Economic Migration, OSCE Anti-Trafficking Alliance’s Expert Coordination Team, FRA’s Fundamental Rights Platform and EU Commission’s Civil Society Platform Against Trafficking in Human Beings. She served as technical advisor to the Delegation of Poland to the International Labour Conference between 2004 and 2008. She holds an LLM in international and EU law from the Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium; an MA in sociology of law from the Oñati International Institute for Sociology of Law, Spain; an MA in industrial sociology from the University of the Witwatersrand, South Africa and a Master of Laws from the UAM University of Poznan, Poland.

Julia O’Connell Davidson is Professor of Social Research at the University of Bristol. She has researched and written extensively on “human trafficking” and “modern slavery,” including the books Prostitution, Power and Freedom (Polity, 1998) and Children in the Global Sex Trade (Polity, 2005). She has recently explored the challenge of reconciling liberal notions such as contract, human rights and freedom with the realities of slavery in Modern Slavery: the Margins of Freedom (Palgrave Macmillan, 2015). She has conducted ESRC-funded research on sex tourism in the Caribbean and markets for migrant domestic and sex workers in the UK and Spain.

Rhacel Salazar Parreñas is a Professor of Sociology and Gender Studies at the University of Southern California. Her work on the role of gender in migration, transnational feminism and forced
labor has been translated into over five different languages. She has written four monographs: *Illicit Flirtations: Labor, Migration and Sex Trafficking in Tokyo* (Stanford, 2011); *The Force of Domesticity: Filipina Migrants and Globalization* (NYU Press, 2008); *Children of Global Migration: Transnational Families and Gendered Woes* (Stanford, 2005); and *Servants of Globalization: Women, Migration and Domestic Work* (Stanford, 2001). She has edited *Technologies of Intimate Labour* (Special Issue of Sexualities, 2015), *Human Trafficking Reconsidered* (International Debate Education Association, 2015); *Intimate Labors: Cultures, Technologies and the Politics of Care* (with Eileen Boris, Stanford, 2010); and *Asian Diasporas: New Conceptions, New Formations* (with Lok Siu, Stanford, 2007). Professor Parreñas has been awarded funding from the Ford Foundation, Rockefeller Foundation and National Science Foundation.

Roger Plant, from the United Kingdom, is an independent writer, trainer and consultant. Between 2002 and 2009 he was the Head of the ILO's Special Action Programme to Combat Forced Labour. With degrees from Oxford University, and visiting academic positions at universities including Columbia and Notre Dame, he has written several books and other publications. His book *Sugar and Modern Slavery*, published in the mid 1980s, was one of the first to draw attention to new forms of forced labor and trafficking in today’s global economy. He currently acts as Chair of the Bangkok-based Issara Institute and as a Board member of the NGO FLEX (Focus on Labour Exploitation). In November 2010 he received the William Wilberforce Freedom Award in Los Angeles, in recognition of global work against modern slavery.

Kerry Rittich is Associate Dean and Professor at the Faculty of Law and Professor of Women and Gender Studies and Public Policy and Governance at the University of Toronto. She writes in the areas of labor law, international institutions and global governance, law and development and gender and critical theory. Publications include *Recharacterizing Restructuring: Law, Distribution, and Gender in Market Reform* (Kluwer Law International, 2002); (with Joanne Conaghan) *Labour Law, Work and Family: Critical and Comparative Perspectives* (OUP, 2005); “The Future of Law and Development: Second Generation Reforms and the Incorporation of the Social” in David M. Trubek and Alvaro Santos eds.,
LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS


Hila Shamir is an Associate Professor at Tel Aviv University Faculty of Law. She earned her SJD and LLM from Harvard Law School and LLB from Tel Aviv University. Shamir teaches and researches in the fields of employment, labor, immigration and welfare law with a focus on issues of gender equality and informal work. Shamir has taught at Cornell Law School, UC Berkeley and Harvard University. She is a recipient of a Fulbright Scholarship, the EU Marie Curie Reintegration Grant and research grants from the Israeli Science Foundation and the Israeli Ministry of Science and Technology. Her recent publications include: “A Labor Paradigm for Human Trafficking,” UCLA Law Review, 60 (2012), 76. The book Governance Feminism: An Introduction, which she is coauthoring with Janet Halley, Prabha Kotiswaran and Rachel Rebouché, is forthcoming in 2018 from the University of Minnesota Press.

Rachel Silvey is Associate Professor at the Department of Geography and Urban Planning at the University of Toronto. Her research focuses on gender, migration and development with a specialization in Indonesia. She has received fellowships from Fulbright, the National Science Foundation and the Social Science and Humanities Research Council of Canada. She has published widely in the fields of critical development studies, cultural geography, feminist geography and diaspora/transnational studies. Her current work with collaborator Rhacel Parreñas in Singapore and the UAE has drawn her increasingly into public forums and debates about the global politics of gender, immigration and human trafficking in Southeast Asia and North America.
Kendra Strauss is an Assistant Professor of Labour Studies and an Associate Member of the Geography Department at Simon Fraser University. She is a feminist political economist and labor geographer with research interests in the areas of occupational welfare, labor market change, migration and unfree labor. Her published work has appeared in a range of journals including American Behavioral Scientist, Antipode, The Journal of Economic Geography, Progress in Human Geography and the International Journal of Law in Context. Her most recent book, coedited with Dr. Katie Meehan, is entitled Precarious Lives: Contested Geographies of Social Reproduction.

Lee Swepston is the former Senior Adviser for Human Rights at the International Labour Office, where he worked for thirty-five years. After retiring in 2007, he founded a Masters Degree in International Human Rights and International Labour Law at the Raoul Wallenberg Institute, University of Lund. He now works as a consultant in human rights and teaches international labor law and human rights in Lund, Sweden, and several universities in the United States, Germany, France and the Netherlands. A graduate of Columbia Law School, he has published extensively on human rights, labor rights, indigenous and tribal people’s rights, child labor, non-discrimination and freedom of association.

Chantal Thomas is Professor of Law at Cornell Law School, where she teaches in the areas of Law and Development, International Economic Law and International Migration. Professor Thomas has been a Visiting Professor at Harvard Law School, Stanford Law School, University of Texas, the Center for Transnational Legal Studies in London, the American University in Cairo and Soochow University in China. She has served as a Vice President of the American Society of International Law and currently serves on the US State Department’s Advisory Committee on International Law. Professor Thomas has authored numerous articles on the relationship between international law, political economy and global social justice in a variety of contexts. She is currently at work on a monograph addressing the problematic of irregular migration in international law, and is the author of Makers of Modernity: Knowledge Production, Politics and Law in Economic Development (in press Cambridge University Press).