Index

abortion, Thomson’s Violinist case regarding, 34, 115–16
act-by-act assessment of culpability, 133
actus reus (voluntary act requirement), 158–59
aiding and abetting, conspiracy, and solicitation, 6, 20
Airedale NHS Trust v. Bland (UK, 1993), 128
“already punished enough” claims, 202
Alzheimer’s disease and identity, 153–54
amnesia, 147, 149, 156–57
Barber v. Superior Court (US, 1983), 127
Behnke, Stephen, n 33, 167, 170–71, 175
Berman, Mitch, 2
Boorse, Christopher, 34
brainwashing, 159–63
Brink, David, 98, 104
Brute Time view of distributing retributive desert, 195–96
camouflaging, 18, 50, 203
capacity/choice theory versus character theory on
excuses, 163–68
causation of harm, 17, 50
censure or stigma and retributive desert, 81
character theory versus choice/capacity theory on
excuses, 163–68
child pornography, de minimis contributions to, 56–57
choice/capacity theory versus character theory on
excuses, 163–68
circumstantial luck, 5
coeptive indoctrination, 161, 163
Cogdon, Mrs., 175–76, 178
compatibilism, 188
complicity, doctrine of, 20
conjoined twins, 173–74, 177n114
consent
falsehoods and, 63
mistakes about proxies for, 62
“other law” mistake, consent of victim cases as, 62–64
consequentialism, 58n94, 105, 106n33, 130, 166–67
conspiracy, solicitation, and aiding and abetting, 6, 20
constitutive luck, 5
Comford, Andrew, 25, 87–88
culpability, 1–21, 23–14
act-by-act assessment of, 133
affirmative defenses, justifications, and excuses
not regarded as, 8–9
basic thesis of, 1
causation of harm irrelevant to, 17
defendant’s perspective and estimates as key
determinant in, 2
determinants of, 2–3
duration of act affecting, 9–10
ignorance of law and, 11, 213 (See also ignorance
of law)
incomplete attempts, nonculpability of, 5–6
justifying, excusing, mitigating, or aggravating
facts affecting, 2, 8–9
moderate redistributivism and, 1
negligence, nonculpability of, 3–4, 45
persons who are culpable, 12–13 (See also
deontological constraints; moral ignorance;
multiple crimes)
culpability (cont.)
punishment issues, 14 (See also distributing retributive desert; identity; punishment issues)
recklessness and, 5 (See also recklessness results of acts, not affected by, 4–5, 133
risking and, 11–12 (See also omission liability; proxy crimes; risking; risking others’ risks)
single crime theory of, 7–8, 8n15, 83
solicitation, conspiracy, and aiding and abetting, 6, 20
vagueness of standard of, 83
for violation of deontological constraints, 128–32
cultural defense of moral ignorance, 105–7
dangerousness as determination of incarceration as punishment, 199
de minimis risk contributions, 56–59
defense justifications, 8
degraded decision making, 134
Delgado, Richard, 161
deontological constraints (means principle/permission of preventing optimistic wrongs), 13, 108–32, 213
agent-relative permissions, 112n18, 113–15
burden of proof and, 8n35
choice given to preventer, 123–24
consequentialism and, 106n33, 130
culpability for violations thereof, 128–32
distinguishing permissions, 124–25
impermissible prevention of preventer, 120–23 intentions of actors, significance of, 127–28
moral blackmail and, 29
preventing use as a means, 108–11, 115
property rights and, 125–27
reasons for permissibility of intervention, 111–15
restricting and nonrestricting claims approach to, 117–20
self-sacrifice, right to forgo, 32–38
third-party interventions, 117–18
threshold deontology, 105, 106n33
deprogramming, 161
desert See also distributing retributive desert as intrinsically good, 183–86
as noncomparative, 181
assumption of risk and, 206–7
self-defense and, 14, 21n6, 31, 37, 44, 201, 206
suffering and, 181–83
determinism, 188–89
detrimental reliance, 45
DID See dissociative identity disorder
Dillon v. Twin State Gas and Electric Company (US, 1932), 51
dissociative identity disorder (DID), 147, 169–78
conjoined twins compared, 174n103, 177n14
DSM-5 criteria, 193n79
etiology of, 170
existence(validity) of, 169
integration therapy for, 176–78
judicial approaches to, 170–71
“one body, multiple persons” view of, 171–74, 176–77
“one (mentally ill) person” view of, 171, 175–76, 178
distributing retributive desert, 14, 180–210, 214
See also suffering
administrative issues, 195–98
“already punished enough” claims, 202
balance, restoration of, 185, 187
creating or allowing crime in order to achieve intrinsic good of, 187–89
culpability as basis for, 186
dangerousness as determination of incarceration as punishment, 199
ex ante suffering, 183, 198
Existing Bad Person view of, 193n66
incarceration as main method of punishment, 199
intrinsic goodness of, 185–86
means principle and, 187–94
meshing with other distributions of benefits and harms, 198
mode of, 105–96
moral ledger approach to, 203n105
as noncomparative, 181
positive versus negative desert, 194n63, 196–98
207–9
prepunishment and determinism, 188–89
reactive attitudes toward, 182
resource constraints and choice among the deserving, 194n65, 196–98
stigma or censure and, 181
subjective experience of punishment and, 189
 taxa tion to support, 189–94
timing of, 105–96
unequal susceptibility to punishment, 198–99
Double Jeopardy Clause, 90
double prevention, 14, 113–14, 120
Dresser, Rebecca, 112–13, 164
Dressler, Joshua, 1913, 162
ducking, 14, 113–16
due care principles, 45
Duff, Antony, 2612
duration of act affecting culpability, 9–10
omission liability and, 10, 79–81
of punishment, 195–96
duress, 9, 160

Index

mass murderers and, 138
memory of event, absence of, 168–69, 178
moral responsibility and rational agency, 155–57
passage of time between crime and conviction, 149–49
philosophical accounts of personal identity, 149–55
psychological connectedness/continuity over time, 150–51, 153–55, 167
radical conversion, 156
situations calling continuing personal identity into question, 148–49
somnambulistic homicides, 175–76
voluntary act requirement (actus reus), 158–59
idiosyncratic beliefs, actions, or conditions of innocent actors, 47–48
ignorance, moral. See moral ignorance
ignorance of law, 11, 213
no mistake of law problems in culpability analysis, 10–11
omission liability and, 81–82
“other law” beliefs, 61–65
proxy crimes and, 86–88
In the End view of distributing retributive desert, 195–96
incarceration as main method of punishment, 199
incomplete attempts, nonculpability of, 6
incorrigibility, 140
indiscriminate evaluators, 156
innocent actors, culpability for riskings of, 43–48
integration therapy for DID, 176–79

Jekyll and Hyde, 162
Johnson, Eric, 39

Kadish, Sandy, 23
Kagan, Shelly, 56–57, 108n2, 183, 186
Kant, Immanuel,
Katz, Leo, 156
Kershman, Stephen, 99
Kingsley, Barry, 22
Kirkland v. State (US, 1985), 172
Klosko, George, 191
Kolber, Adam, 199
Kovarsky, Lee, 197

Lee, Youngjae, 142
legal duty to act, 66–71
lesser evils justification, 8, 78, 90
Levy, Neil, 99
lex talionis, 196
liberty interests and risking others’ riskings, 23–26, 43, 49, 75
“limits of the criminal law” questions, 213

euthanasia
mercy killings, and criminalization of causally upstream acts, 50–51
passive, 127–28
Ewing, Ben, 143
ex ante suffering, 189
excuses, character theory versus choice/capacity theory on, 163–68
Existing Bad Person view of distributing retributive desert, 195–66
falsehoods and consent, 63
family members, legal duty to aid, 67
Firth, Joanna, 201
FitzPatrick, William, 102
forcible medication of mentally ill patients to stand trial, 163–66
free will and risking others’ riskings, 23, 33n34
freeriding, 59
Frowe, Helen, 35–38, 129
fugue states, persons in, 171–72, 176
futile rescue, preventing, 55–56
Guerrero, Alex, 97
Harman, Elizabeth, 102–3
harms
causation of, 17, 51, 59
de minimis, 56
defined, 17, 51, 53
mediated, 35–38
risking (See risking; risking others’ riskings)
Hart, H. L. A., 39, 43, 183
Hearst, Patty (“Tania”), 160–63
Hensel, Abby and Brittany, 173
Hitler, Adolf, 137–38, 141, 183
honor killings and cultural defense of moral ignorance, 105–7
Honore, Tomy, 39, 43
Hordet, Jeremy, 166
Hurd, Heidi, 216, 2207, 41–42, 45
Husk, Douglas, 95–96, 99, 101, 107, 190, 202
Husserl, Edmund, 185
identity, 14, 147–79, 214. See also dissociative identity disorder; Relation R/R-relatedness
Alzheimer’s disease, 153–54
amnesia, 147, 149, 150–57
“blip” cases and brainwashing, 159–63
character change, 149, 156, 164, 168
children, 155–56
conjoined twins, 173–74, 177n14
excuses, character theory versus choice/capacity theory on, 163–68

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-15994-5 — Reflections on Crime and Culpability
Larry Alexander, Kimberly Kessler Ferzan
Index

More Information

© in this web service Cambridge University Press

www.cambridge.org
moral blackmail and, 31
peril, belief of actor in existence of, 74, 79
risks faced in attempting rescue, belief of actor
in, 75–79
status relationship to person in peril, 67
statutory commands to render aid, 68
triggering responsibility, belief of actor in
existence of, 73–74, 79
of voluntary undertakers of professional duties
(lifeguards, police, etc.), 67–68
optimistic wrongs, preventing. See deontological
constraints
“other law” beliefs, 10–11, 61–65
overall proportionality, 139h8
overdetermination, preemptive, 51–56
overinclusive crimes, 87–88
overlapping offenses, 137h6
Parfit, Derek, 56, 149–53, 168, 177, 179, 185
passive euthanasia, 127–28
Penn, Kevin, 163
People v. Kibbe (US, 1974), 27
People v. Newton (US, 1970), 158–59, 175, 178
personal identity. See identity
persons who are culpable, 12–13. See also
deontological constraints; moral ignorance;
multiple crimes
Pinkert, Felix, 58n94
Pol Pot, 117
preemptive crimes, 84n2
preemptive overdetermination, 51–56
prepunishment, 188–89
promises, 23, 45–46, 147
property interests
deontological constraints and, 125–27
“other law” mistakes and, 61–62
proportionality and mass murderers, 138
provocation, 9
proxies for consent, mistakes about, 62
proximate causation, 19
proxy crimes, 12, 83–89, 213
as both over- and underinclusive, 49
camouflaging, 18, 50, 203
conduct as conclusive presumption of
culpability, 88n9
consequentialism and, 131
 dangers of, 89–90
definition of and rationale for, 83–84
ignorance of law and, 86–88
information-providing function of, 87–88
lesser evils justification, 90
measuring culpability for, 131
merchant culpability and, 42
misinterpretation of violations, 18, 49–50
mismatch between culpability and punishment,
84–86
multiple punishments for single acts, risk of,
90–91
in nonretributive punishment frame, 91–92
overinclusive crimes as, 87–88
preemptive crimes versus, 84n2
scourfs, 85, 85h8, 86n6
single crime theory of culpability and, 7
psychological disconnection between culpable
actor and person to be punished.
See identity
psychopaths, 97–99
punishment issues, 14. See also distributing
retributive desert; identity; multiple crimes
memory of criminal event, punishment in
absence of, 168–69, 178
prepunishment, 188–89
proportionality and mass murderers, 138
of proxy crimes
measuring culpability for, 131
mismatch between culpability and
punishment for, 84–86
multiple punishments for single acts and,
90–91
in nonretributive punishment frame, 91–92
recidivism, increasing punishment for, 139–41
subjective versus objective experience of
punishment, 199
“three strikes” statutes, 140
quality-adjusted life years (QALYs), 181, 199
quality of will theory of moral responsibility/
ignorance, 96–97
Quong, Jonathan, 201
rational agency and identity, 155–57
reactive attitudes toward retributive desert, 182
reason-responsiveness theory of moral
responsibility/ignorance, 95–97
recidivism, 12, 139–42. See also multiple crimes
recklessness
actions toward but not amounting to, 6
culpability as matter of, 3
culpable riskings of causally downstream actors,
18, 25, 41
of merchants, 41
in moral responsibility, 100–1
proxy crimes, definition of and rationale for,
83–84
reliance of innocent actors on our (culpable)
conduct and, 45
single crime theory of culpability and, 83
redistributivism, moderate, 1
on moral ignorance, 96
on risking others’ riskings, 23n12, 33
Talbert, Matthew, 98
Taurek, John M., 135
taxation to support retributive desert, 189–94
Temkin, Larry, 209n104
terrorism
cultural defense of moral ignorance and, 107
risking others’ riskings and, 25, 51
Thomson, Judith Jarvis, 34, 115, 129
threats, as crimes, 7n28
“three strikes” statutes, 140
threshold deontology, 105, 106n133
timing
identity and passage of time between crime and conviction, 148–49
of retributive desert, 195–96
Tomlin, Patrick, 183, 185, 195–96
tort law, risking others’ riskings in, 2116, 52

United States v. Fountain (US, 1985), 20
unreasonable reliance, 44
vagueness of culpability standard, 83
volume discounts, 13, 153–59. See also multiple crimes
voluntary act requirement (actus reus), 158–59
von Hirsch, Andreas, 25n14
Wagon Mound case (UK AC, 1967), 47
Walen, Alec, 25n15, 32–33, 38, 114n27, 117–20
Wasserstrom, David, 32
Wellman, Christopher Heath, 189n36
Wieland, Jan Willem, 103
Wilkes, Kathleen, 170, 176–77
Williams, Bernard, 29
Zaibert, Leo, 183–86
Zimmerman, Michael, 99