

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-15994-5 — Reflections on Crime and Culpability
Larry Alexander, Kimberly Kessler Ferzan
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

REFLECTIONS ON CRIME AND CULPABILITY

In 2009, Larry Alexander and Kimberly Ferzan published *Crime and Culpability: A Theory of Criminal Law*. The book set out a theory that those who deserve punishment should receive punishment commensurate with, but no greater than, that which they deserve. *Reflections on Crime and Culpability: Problems and Puzzles* expands on their innovative ideas on the application of punishment in criminal law. Theorists working in criminal law theory presuppose or ignore puzzles that lurk beneath the surface. Now those who wish to examine these topics will have one monograph that combines the disparate puzzles in criminal law through a unified approach to culpability. Along with some suggestions as to how they might resolve the puzzles, Alexander and Ferzan lay out the arguments and analysis so that future scholars can engage with questions about our understanding of culpability that very few have addressed.

LARRY ALEXANDER is the Warren Distinguished Professor at the University of San Diego School of Law. He is the author or coauthor of five monographs, including *Demystifying Legal Reasoning* (Cambridge, 2008), with Emily Sherwin and *Crime and Culpability: A Theory of Criminal Law* (Cambridge, 2009) with Kimberly Ferzan. He is also the editor of four anthologies, and the author or coauthor of multiple articles, essays, and book chapters on topics of legal theory, constitutional law, and moral philosophy.

KIMBERLY KESSLER FERZAN is the Harrison Robertson Professor of Law and an affiliated member of the Philosophy Department at the University of Virginia. She is the coeditor of two anthologies, the author of numerous articles on criminal law theory, and the coauthor of *Crime and Culpability: A Theory of Criminal Law* (Cambridge, 2009) with Larry Alexander. Her paper “Beyond Crime and Commitment” was selected for the 2013 American Philosophical Association’s Berger Memorial Prize.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-15994-5 — Reflections on Crime and Culpability
Larry Alexander , Kimberly Kessler Ferzan
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-15994-5 — Reflections on Crime and Culpability
Larry Alexander , Kimberly Kessler Ferzan
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Reflections on Crime and Culpability

PROBLEMS AND PUZZLES

LARRY ALEXANDER

University of San Diego

KIMBERLY KESSLER FERZAN

University of Virginia



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-15994-5 — Reflections on Crime and Culpability
Larry Alexander, Kimberly Kessler Ferzan
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107159945
DOI: 10.1017/9781316672181

© Larry Alexander and Kimberly Kessler Ferzan 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Alexander, Larry, 1943- author. | Ferzan, Kimberly Kessler, 1971- author.
TITLE: Reflections on crime and culpability : problems and puzzles / Larry Alexander,
University of San Diego; Kimberly Kessler Ferzan, University of Virginia
DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY, USA : Cambridge
University Press, 2018. | Includes bibliographical references and index.
IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2018021297 | ISBN 9781107159945 (hardback) | ISBN 9781316612613 (paperback)
SUBJECTS: LCSH: Punishment–Philosophy. | Criminal law–Philosophy. |
BISAC: LAW / Criminal Law / General.
CLASSIFICATION: LCC K5103 .A443 2018 | DDC 345.001–dc23
LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2018021297>

ISBN 978-1-107-15994-5 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-316-61261-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy
of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication
and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,
accurate or appropriate

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-15994-5 — Reflections on Crime and Culpability
Larry Alexander , Kimberly Kessler Ferzan
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

To Elaine – LA
To Marc – KKF

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-15994-5 — Reflections on Crime and Culpability
Larry Alexander , Kimberly Kessler Ferzan
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page xi</i>
1 Crime and Culpability: Recounting the Basic Picture	1
I The Central Claim: The Determinants of Culpability	2
II Implications of the Central Claim	3
A Negligence – Inadvertence to Risks – Is Not Culpable	3
B Results Do Not Affect Culpability	4
C Acts Preparatory to Unleashing Risks Are Not Culpable	5
D There Is Only One Crime, Albeit One with Varying Magnitudes of Culpability	7
E Justifications and Some Excuses Are Part of the Culpability Calculus and Are Not Affirmative Defenses	8
F The Duration of Culpable Acts Affects Their Culpability	9
G No Mistake of Law Problem	10
III A Road Map of the Book	11
PART I PROBLEMS AND PUZZLES OF RISKING	15
2 Risking Other People’s Riskings	17
I Causally Downstream Actors’ Culpable Riskings	18
A Increasing the Risks of Another’s Wrongs	19
B When Downstream Harms Don’t Count on Your Ledger	32
C The Hard Case of Merchants	40
II Causally Downstream Innocent Actors: Misinterpretations and Other Risky Beliefs of Victims	43
III Causally Downstream Actors Who Cause or Risk Harm to Others and the Question of Criminalization of the Causally Upstream Acts	48

IV	Overdetermination and Preemptive Complicity	51
V	“Harmless” Torturers and Tiny Differences	56
3	Risks and “Other Law” Beliefs	61
4	Omissions and Culpable Riskings: Problems, Problems	66
I	The Triggers of Duties to Act	66
II	The Culpability of Those Who Fail to Rescue When They Have a Duty to Do So	72
A	Culpability in General	72
B	Culpability for Omissions	73
III	Culpability and Time	79
IV	Culpability and Ignorance of Law	81
V	Conclusion	82
5	Is There a Case for Proxy Crimes?	83
I	The Culpability Mismatch	84
II	The Ignorance of Law Problem	86
III	The Danger of Proxy Crimes	89
IV	The Multiple Punishments Problem	90
V	Proxy Crimes and Nonretributive Punishment	91
	PART II PROBLEMS AND PUZZLES OF CULPABILITY	93
6	Moral Ignorance	95
I	A First Look at the Puzzle	95
II	The Psychopath	97
III	Ordinary Criminals	99
IV	The “Cultural Defense”	105
V	Conclusion	107
7	The Violator of Deontological Constraints	108
I	The Puzzle of Preventing Use as a Means	108
II	Why It Is Permissible to Intervene	111
III	A Second Look at the Means Principle, Ducking Cases, and Third-Party Intervention	115
IV	Alec Walen’s Restricting and Nonrestricting Claims Approach	117
V	Complications	120
A	When It Is Impermissible to Prevent the Preventer	120
B	Giving the Choice to the Preventer	123
C	Distinguishing among Permissions	124

	<i>Contents</i>	<i>ix</i>
	D Property	125
	E Culpability Doesn't Matter	127
	VI Ethics Is Hard . . . Can Culpability Follow?	128
8	Mass Murders, Recidivists, and Volume Discounts	133
	I Volume Discounts	133
	A The Problem of Multiple Attempts	133
	B Mass Murderers	137
	II Recidivism	139
	III Possible Accounts of the Phenomena?	141
	PART III PROBLEMS AND PUZZLES OF PUNISHMENT	145
9	The Problem of Psychological Disconnection between the Culpable Actor and the Person to Be Punished	147
	I The Challenge of Personal Identity	148
	A The Puzzle	148
	B Parfit's Relation R and Dresser's Extension to the Criminal Law	149
	II How Should the Criminal Law Conceptualize an "Identity Defense"?	155
	A Moral Agency/Status Responsibility	155
	B The Act Requirement	158
	C At the Excuse/No-Act Border: Blips, Brews, and Brainwashing	159
	D Identity, Character, and Excuse	163
	E Coda: Memory and Punishment – Another Sort of Concern	168
	III The Challenge of Dissociative Identity Disorder (DID)	169
	A One Body, Multiple Persons	171
	B One-Person Views	175
	C Integration Quandaries	176
10	Distributing Retributive Desert	180
	I Some Preliminaries about Retributive Desert	180
	II Distributive Puzzles	187
	A Desert and the Means Principle	187
	B Selection Questions: The Mode of Punishment, the Time of Punishment, and the Choice among the Deserving	195
	III Meshing Retributive Desert with Other Distributions	198
	A Unequal Distributions in Susceptibility to Punishment	198
	B What Suffering Counts as Punishment?	200

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-15994-5 — Reflections on Crime and Culpability
Larry Alexander , Kimberly Kessler Ferzan
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

C When Suffering Does Not Count as Punishment	205
D Retributive Justice and Positive Desert	207
IV Conclusion	209
 PART IV CONCLUSION	 211
 11 Conclusion	 213
 Indexes	 215

Acknowledgments

We are grateful to the many audiences who helped us refine our arguments and to the many scholars who engaged with the manuscript.

Chapter 2 benefited from audiences at the University of Virginia Law School, Duke Law School, the London School of Economics Law School, and Edinburgh Law School.

Chapter 4 benefited from discussions at the conference on the Ethics and Law of Omissions at the University of California, San Diego, and a workshop at UC Irvine's Legal Philosophy Center.

Chapter 7 benefited from discussions at the conference honoring Larry Alexander at Yale Law School; the APA Pacific Division annual meeting in 2017; Oxford's Moral Philosophy Seminar; and Warwick's Centre for Ethics, Law, and Public Affairs Seminar.

Chapter 9 benefited from audience discussions at UVA's Student Scholarly Lunch and UVA's Board of Trustees and Alumni Council Luncheon.

Chapter 10 benefited from presentation at the London School of Economics Law School.

We are particularly grateful to our friends and colleagues who participated in the University of Virginia Law School workshop on the book manuscript, including Charles Barzun, Mitch Berman, Josh Bowers, Steve Garvey, Debbie Hellman, Doug Husak, Stephen Morse, Fred Schauer, and Ken Simons. And additional thanks for insights along the way are due to Matt Adler, Sam Buell, Andrew Cornford, Antony Duff, Bashshar Haydar, Jeremy Horder, Heidi Hurd, Leslie Kendrick, Chloe Kennedy, Jeff McMahan, Sandra Marshall, Michael Moore, Federico Picinali, Ketan Ramakrishnan, Nick Sage, Gregg Strauss, Victor Tadros, Patrick Tomlin, Emmanuel Voyiakis, Alec Walen, and Peter Westen.

We thank our research assistants at San Diego – Mary Allain, Garrett Gaughan, Jessica Hidell, and Michelle Sellwood – and UVA – Michael Corcoran, Scott Harman, Chinmayi Sharma, Isabel Tuz, and Michael West.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-15994-5 — Reflections on Crime and Culpability
Larry Alexander , Kimberly Kessler Ferzan
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Larry thanks Cecilia Salanger and Brigid Bennett for their excellent stenographic support and Dean Stephen Ferruolo for summer research grant support. And he thanks the best criminal lawyer he knows, his wife, Elaine, for her intellectual and emotional support.

Kim is grateful for the Caddell and Chapman Research Chair, which she held while drafting this manuscript, and thanks Deans Paul Mahoney and Risa Goluboff for research support. She also thanks Marc and Griffin Ferzan for their support as she worked on the manuscript and for dinnertime conversations working through wildly unrealistic hypotheticals.