## Contents

*List of Figures* *page xiii*
*Foreword by Professor Carlos Correa* *xv*
*Acknowledgements* *xix*
*List of Abbreviations* *xxi*
*Table of Cases* *xxv*
*Table of Treaties, Declarations, Resolutions and Others* *xxxi*

1 **Introduction** 1
   1.1 The Importance and Purpose of This Study 1
   1.2 The Scope and Structure of This Study 5

**PART I INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS, INNOVATION AND TRANSFER OF ESTS** 9

2 **Concepts and Context: IPRs, Innovation and Transfer of ESTs** 11
   2.1 Innovation and Transfer of Technology as Part of the Solution to Climate Change 11
   2.2 Describing Innovation and Transfer of Environmentally Sound Technologies 13
     2.2.1 Defining Environmentally Sound Technologies 13
     2.2.2 Describing Technology Transfer 16
     2.2.2.1 Definition of Technology Transfer 16
     2.2.2.2 Channels of Technology Transfer 18
   2.3 Fundamental Issues in Innovation and Transfer of ESTs 25
     2.3.1 ESTs as “Global Public Goods” 25
     2.3.2 Failures in the Markets for Technology and IPRs as a Policy Response 26
     2.3.3 The Concept of IP Rights and Their Justification 28
# Table of Contents

2.4 The Global Distribution of Innovation and International Transfer of ESTs: Evidence to Date

  2.4.1 Literature Review: Who Owns ESTs and Who Are the Major EST Transferees? 32

  2.4.2 Empirical Study: Global Distribution of Innovation and International Transfer of ESTs

    2.4.2.1 High Concentration of EST innovations as Indicated by Patent Filing under PCT 38

    2.4.2.2 The Direction of International Technology Transfer – Which Countries Are Deriving Income from IPRs? 41

    2.4.2.3 The Strengthening of IPRs and the Rise of Revenue Transfer 43

3 International Legal Framework Governing IPRs, Innovation and Transfer of Technologies, Including ESTs

  3.1 Introduction 47

  3.2 The NIEO Approach to Regulate Innovation and Transfer of Technology

    3.2.1 The Revision of the Paris Convention

        3.2.1.1 Introduction to the Paris Convention 50

        3.2.1.2 The Demand for the Revision of the Paris Convention 51

        3.2.1.3 The Unfinished Negotiations for the Revision 53

    3.2.2 The Unsuccessful Creation of an International Code of Conduct for the Transfer of Technology

        3.2.2.1 The Major Characteristics of the Latest Draft 55

        3.2.2.2 The Failure of the Code and Its Implications 57

  3.3 Intellectual Property Rights and Technology Transfer under the TRIPS Agreement

    3.3.1 The Emergence of the TRIPS Agreement 60

    3.3.2 Global Minimum IPR Standards and Their Implications

        3.3.2.1 Commitments to Global Minimum IPR Standards 65

        3.3.2.2 The Implications of Global Minimum IPR Standards 69

    3.3.3 Technology Transfer-Oriented Provisions of the TRIPS Agreement 74
Table of Contents

3.4 Technology Transfer and Intellectual Property Rights in International Climate Framework 78
   3.4.1 Technology Transfer under the UNFCCC Agreements 79
      3.4.1.1 The Principle of Common but Differentiated Responsibilities 79
      3.4.1.2 EST Transfer Commitments under the UNFCCC 82
      3.4.1.3 The Kyoto Protocol 87
      3.4.1.4 Technology Transfer in the Post-Kyoto Climate Regime 91
      3.4.1.5 The Adoption of the Paris Agreement 94
   3.4.2 Intellectual Property Rights in the International Climate Change Regime 96
      3.4.2.1 Technology Transfer and IPRs at the 1992 Rio Summit 96
      3.4.2.2 Divergent Proposals or Unilateral Actions on the Road to Copenhagen 98
      3.4.2.3 The Copenhagen Negotiations and Afterwards 104
   3.5 Conclusion 106

4 The Effects of Minimum IPR Standards Shaped by TRIPS on Innovation and Transfer of ESTs 109
   4.1 Introduction 109
   4.2 Mandatory Minimum IPR Standards Under TRIPS 110
      4.2.1 Patents 111
      4.2.2 Trade Secrets 114
      4.2.3 Enforcement of IPRs 118
      4.2.4 Controversy over the Effect of Minimum IPR Standards on Technology Transfer 119
   4.3 The Positive Role of Minimum IPR Protection in Facilitating Innovation and Transfer of ESTs 121
      4.3.1 IP Rights as an Enabling Factor for Innovation of ESTs 122
         4.3.1.1 The Incentive Effects of IPRs on Innovation of ESTs 123
         4.3.1.2 The Role of Patent-Induced Information Disclosure in Innovation of ESTs 128
4.3.2 Strong IP Rights as a Prerequisite for IP Holders to Transfer ESTs

4.3.2.1 IPRs and FDI, Licensing and Trade
4.3.2.2 IPRs as an Important Factor Influencing the Transfer of ESTs

4.4 The Potentially Negative Effects of Strong IPR Protection on Innovation and Transfer of ESTs

4.4.1 The Exclusive Effects of IPRs on Innovation of ESTs
4.4.2 IP Rights and Abusive or Anti-Competitive Practices in EST Transfer

4.4.2.1 Patent Blockage
4.4.2.2 High Licensing Fees
4.4.2.3 Refusal to License
4.4.2.4 Other Abusive or Anti-Competitive Practices

4.5 Concluding Remarks

PART II INTERPRETING THE TRIPS AGREEMENT FOR FACILITATING INNOVATION AND TRANSFER OF ESTS

5 Rules Governing Treaty Interpretation and the Elements against Which the TRIPS Agreement Should Be Interpreted

5.1 Introduction
5.2 Rules Governing Treaty Interpretation

5.2.1 The Principle of Good Faith
5.2.1.1 The Principle of Effectiveness
5.2.1.2 The Link Between Good Faith and Legitimate Expectations

5.2.2 Determining Ordinary Meaning under Article 31
5.2.2.1 Ordinary Meaning
5.2.2.2 “In the Light of Its Object and Purpose”
5.2.2.3 “In Their Context”
5.2.2.4 “Elements to Be Considered Together with the Context”

5.2.3 Supplementary Means of Interpretation under Article 32

5.3 The Object and Purpose of WTO and TRIPS

5.3.1 The Sustainable Development Objective of the WTO
5.3.1.1 Sustainable Development as an Objective of the WTO
### Table of Contents

5.3.1.2 The Role of Sustainable Development in Interpreting TRIPS 197
5.3.2 The Object and Purpose of the TRIPS Agreement 203
  5.3.2.1 Article 7: “Objectives” 205
  5.3.2.2 Article 8: “Principles” 207
  5.3.2.3 Interpreting the TRIPS Agreement in Light of its Objectives and Principles 211

6 Interpreting Patent–Related Flexibilities in the TRIPS Agreement for Facilitating Innovation and Transfer of ESTs 233
  6.1 Introduction 233
  6.2 Patenable Subject Matter Under Article 27 236
    6.2.1 Non-Discrimination (Article 27.1) and ESTs 237
      6.2.1.1 The Principle of Non-Discrimination under Article 27.1 237
      6.2.1.2 “Non-Discrimination as to the Field of Technology” and ESTs 239
    6.2.2 Patent Eligibility Requirements 246
      6.2.2.1 Interpretation of the Patentability Requirements 246
      6.2.2.2 The Relevance of the Patentability Requirements for WTO Members to Facilitate Innovation and Transfer of ESTs 250
      6.2.3 Permissible Exclusions for ESTs? 253
  6.3 Limits to Patent Rights in the TRIPS Agreement 256
    6.3.1 Introduction 256
# Table of Contents

6.3.2 Limited Exceptions to Patent Rights under Article 30
- 6.3.2.1 Conditions in General 259
- 6.3.2.2 Interpretation of the “Three-Step” Test 262
- 6.3.2.3 Examples of Relevant Exceptions under Article 30 for ESTs 270
- 6.3.2.4 Conclusion 272

6.3.3 Exhaustion of Rights and Parallel Imports
- 6.3.3.1 Exhaustion of Rights 273
- 6.3.3.2 Parallel Imports for Patented ESTs 276

6.4 Compulsory Licensing under Article 31
- 6.4.1 The Concept of Compulsory Licensing 278
- 6.4.2 Grounds for Granting Compulsory Licences
  - 6.4.2.1 Grounds for Granting Compulsory Licences in General 282
  - 6.4.2.2 Local Working Requirements and Non-Discrimination under Article 27 283
  - 6.4.2.3 Enumerated Grounds for Compulsory Licences under Article 31 289
- 6.4.3 Conditions for the Grant of Compulsory Licences
  - 6.4.3.1 Procedural Requirements 291
  - 6.4.3.2 Substantive Requirements 293
- 6.4.4 Compulsory Licensing as a Policy Lever for EST Transfer
  - 6.4.4.1 The Case of Improved Access to Medicine and Compulsory Licences 298
  - 6.4.4.2 Compulsory Licences for Transfer of ESTs: Feasibilities and Opportunities 300
  - 6.4.4.3 Compulsory Licences for Transfer of ESTs: Challenges 304

6.5 Conclusion 307

7 Interpreting Competition-Related Flexibilities in the TRIPS Agreement for Facilitating Innovation and Transfer of ESTs
- 7.1 Introduction 311
- 7.2 Article 8.2: Basic Principle
  - 7.2.1 Scope of Application 315
  - 7.2.1.1 Abuse of IP Rights 316
Table of Contents

7.2.1.2 Practices That Unreasonably Restrain Trade 318
7.2.1.3 Practices That Adversely Affect the
International Transfer of Technology 320
7.2.2 The Requirement That Appropriate Measures Be
TRIPS-Consistent 322
7.2.3 Relevance of Article 8.2 for EST Transfer 325
7.3 Article 40: Control of Anti-Competitive Practices in
Contractual Licences 326
7.3.1 Legal Effects of Article 40.1 327
7.3.2 Members’ Sovereign Power to Regulate
Anti-Competitive Licensing Practices under
Article 40.2 329
7.3.2.1 A Competition Approach to Regulate
IPR-Related Abusive or Anti-Competitive
Licensing Practices and Conditions 330
7.3.2.2 Examples of Anti-Competitive Practices 333
7.3.3 Relevance for EST Transfer 335
7.4 Article 31(k): Compulsory Licensing as a Remedy to
Anti-Competitive Practices 337
7.4.1 Interpretation of Article 31(k) 337
7.4.2 Relevance for the Innovation and Transfer
of ESTs 339
7.5 Conclusion 343

8. Conclusions and Recommendations 346
8.1 Introduction 346
8.2 Problems Identified 347
8.2.1 Global Asymmetries in the Innovation and
Transfer of ESTs 347
8.2.2 The Role of IPRs as a Contentious Issue in
International Climate Change Negotiations 348
8.2.3 The Mixed Effects of Minimum IPR Standards
Shaped by TRIPS on Innovation and Transfer
of ESTs 349
8.3 A Balanced and Pro-Competitive Interpretation of
the TRIPS Flexibilities 350
8.3.1 The Methodology of Legal Interpretation 350
8.3.2 Interpretation of Patent-Related Flexibilities 352
8.3.3 Interpretation of Competition-Related Flexibilities 354
# Table of Contents

8.4 The Insufficiency of Treaty Interpretation and Possible Remedies 355
  8.4.1 Factors Affecting the Sufficiency of Treaty Interpretation 356
  8.4.2 A Doha-Type Declaration on Intellectual Property Rights and Climate Change 358
    8.4.2.1 Potential Elements of the Declaration 359
    8.4.2.2 Potential Challenges and Solutions 361
  8.4.3 International Guidelines for Licensing of IPR-Protected ESTs 364
    8.4.3.1 The Need for International Guidelines for Licensing of IPR-Protected ESTs 365
    8.4.3.2 Potential Elements for Guidelines on Licensing IP-Protected ESTs 366
    8.4.3.3 Potential Benefits and Challenges of the Licensing Guidelines 368

Appendix 371
Bibliography 373
Index 411