AQUINAS ON THE METAPHYSICS OF THE HYPOSTATIC UNION

The hypostatic union of Christ, namely his being one person who is simultaneously human and divine, is one of the founding doctrines of Christian theology. In this book Michael Gorman presents the first full-length treatment of Aquinas’s metaphysics of the hypostatic union. After setting out the historical and theological background, he examines Aquinas’s metaphysical presuppositions, explains the basic elements of his account of the hypostatic union, and then enters into detailed discussions of four areas where it is more difficult to get a clear understanding of Aquinas’s views, arguing that in some cases we must be content with speculative reconstructions that are true to the spirit of Aquinas’s thought. His study pays close attention to the Latin texts and their chronology, and engages with a wide range of secondary literature. This book will be of great interest to theologians as well as to scholars of metaphysics and medieval thought.

MICHAEL GORMAN is Associate Professor in Philosophy at The Catholic University of America, Washington, DC. He is the co-editor of Categories: Historical and Systematic Essays (2004) and the author of numerous journal articles.
AQUINAS ON THE
METAPHYSICS OF THE
HYPOSTATIC UNION

MICHAEL GORMAN

The Catholic University of America, Washington, DC
This book is dedicated
to my parents,
Michael and Maxine,
pro filiis suis primiti fidei praecones.
Contents

Acknowledgments xi
 Abbreviations for Works of Aquinas ix

Introduction 1

1 Person and Nature in Philosophical Perspective 14
   Introduction 14
   Person in Philosophical Perspective 15
   Nature and Human Nature in Philosophical Perspective 19
   Conclusion 34

2 Aquinas’s Basic View of the Incarnation 35
   Introduction 35
   The Incarnation: Motivations and Alternate Scenarios 35
   Christ as a Divine and Human Person 36
   Two Senses of “Nature” 45
   Union in Nature? Union in Person? 46
   Conclusion 52

3 The Incarnation and Divine Simplicity, Immutability, and Impassibility 53
   Introduction 53
   Simplicity and the Incarnation 53
   Immutability, Impassibility, and the Incarnation 57
   Conclusion 72

4 How Does Christ’s Human Nature Not Ground Its Own Person? 73
   Introduction 73
   Substantial Natures and Person-Grounding 73
   Substantial Natures and Dignity 86
   Why Does the Assumed Humanity Not Ground a Supposit? 87
   Conclusion 99
# Table of Contents

5 The Number of Existences (*Esse*) in Christ
   - Introduction
   - Some Questions Concerning Christ’s Existence
   - Which of These Questions Was Aquinas Asking?
     - *Esse* as Fact vs. *Esse* as Act
     - Qualified and Unqualified Existence of Supposit
     - Finally, Aquinas’s Ideas on Christ’s Existence(s)
     - A Second *Esse* as Act?
   - Conclusion

6 The Consistency of Christology
   - Introduction
   - The Mereological Replacement Strategy
   - Christological Consistency in *In III Sent.*
   - A General Worry about the Mereological-Replacement Interpretation
   - Christological Consistency in *ST* III
   - A Thomistic Approach to the Consistency Problem
   - Conclusion

Conclusion

Bibliography

Index
A good number of the ideas in this book grew out of a dissertation I wrote long ago, in partial fulfillment of requirements for a doctorate in theology, awarded by Boston College in 1997. This book is far from being that dissertation; even so, my first words of thanks must go to my Doktorvater, Matthew Lamb, and my committee members, Stephen Brown and Marilyn Adams. I am also very grateful to Charles Hefling; although he was not on my committee, he did talk me out of a very different and certainly ill-fated project, for which I will forever be grateful. Most of the research on that dissertation was conducted at the Thomas-Institut of the University of Cologne in the 1996–97 academic year, with funding from the Hanns-Seidel Stiftung, and with generous hosting by Jan Aertsen.

Later research that contributed to the present book was done in the spring of 2008 at the Thomas-Institut, with funding from the Fulbright Commission, with generous hosting by Andreas Speer. Since then, I have in addition received a few small research grants, and a sabbatical, from The Catholic University of America.

Many other people have contributed to my understanding of the issues discussed in this book, or at any rate they have tried (whatever is received is, alas, received according to the mode of the receiver): Jeffery Brower, Maria Burger, Richard Cross, Brian Daley, Gregory Doolan, Brian Embry, Ludger Honnefelder, Peter King, Gyula Klima, Jonathan Jäderberg, Gregory LeNave, Timothy Pawl, Alexander Pruss, Michael Rota, Eleonore Stump, Jason West, Kevin White, Thomas Joseph White, and John Wippel. I beg forgiveness from those I’ve forgotten.

Previous versions of some of the ideas were presented in various venues: the Cornell Summer Colloquium in Medieval Philosophy; the Villanova Conference on Patristic, Medieval, and Renaissance Philosophy; the International Congress on Medieval Studies (“Kalamazoo”); the Katholisch-Theologische Fakultät, Universität Innsbruck; the Forschungskolloquium of the Thomas-Institut of the Universität zu Köln; the Arbeitsgemeinschaft
Acknowledgments

Kritische Scholastikforschung, Philosophisches Seminar B, Universität Bonn; the Albertus-Magnus Institut in Bonn; the International St. Thomas Aquinas Society; a conference on the Metaphysics of Aquinas at Fordham University. I am grateful to listeners for their feedback and criticisms.

Thomas Howes commented on antepenultimate drafts of a number of chapters. Richard Cross commented on the penultimate draft of Chapter 6. Teresa Bippus commented in detail on the penultimate draft of everything. I’m grateful to them all for their criticisms, including their refusals to pretend that unclear things were clear. I am grateful as well to two anonymous referees from Cambridge University Press, who made very useful criticisms and suggestions.

Also deserving of thanks are research assistants who, over the years, have helped me with various aspects of the project: Taylor Abels, Mary Elizabeth Halper, Thomas Howes, Kevin Kambo, Edward Langley, Kevin Oriani, Michael Staron, and S. Matthew Stolte.

My wife and children have helped and supported me in ways that only academic families can fully understand. They deserve more thanks than I am able to give.
Abbreviations for Works of Aquinas

CT Compendium Theologiae
De Ente De Ente et Essentia
De Potentia Quaestiones Disputatae De Potentia
De Prin. Nat. De Principiis Naturae
De Rat. Fidei De Rationibus Fidei
De Spiritualibus Quaestio Disputata De Spiritualibus Creaturis
De Unione Quaestio Disputata De Unione Verbi Incarnati
De Veritate Quaestiones Disputatae De Veritate
In De Trin. In Boethii De Trinitate
In Meta. In Libros Metaphysicorum
In Sent. Scriptum super libros Sententiarum
QD De Anima Quaestiones Disputatae De Anima
Quodl. Quaestiones de Quodlibet
SCG Summa Contra Gentiles
ST Summa Theologiae