

#### ART AND IMMORTALITY IN THE ANCIENT NEAR EAST

Discussions of apocalyptic thought and its sources in the ancient Near East, particularly Mesopotamia, have a long scholarly history, with a renewed interest and focus in recent decades. Outside Assyriological scholarship as well, studies of the apocalyptic give significant credit to the ancient Near East, especially Babylonia and Iran, as potential sources for the manifestations of this phenomenon in the Hellenistic period. The emphasis on kingship and empire in apocalyptic modes of thinking warrants that special attention be paid to the regal art of ancient Mesopotamia and adjacent areas in its potential to express the relevant notions. In this book, Mehmet-Ali Ataç demonstrates the importance of visual evidence as a source for apocalyptic thought. Focusing on the so-called investiture painting from Mari, he relates it to parallel evidence from the visual traditions of the Assyrian Empire, ancient Egypt, and Hittite Anatolia.

Mehmet-Ali Ataç studied architecture, art history, and archaeology, earning his Ph.D. from Harvard University, Massachusetts in 2003. He was Whiting Post-doctoral Fellow in the Humanities at Princeton University, New Jersey (2003–4) and Hetty Goldman Member in the School of Historical Studies at the Institute for Advanced Study, Princeton (2010–11). From 2004 to 2015, he taught at Bryn Mawr College, Pennsylvania. A scholar of the art of the ancient Near East, he is the author of *The Mythology of Kingship in Neo-Assyrian Art* (Cambridge University Press, 2010).



# ART AND IMMORTALITY IN THE ANCIENT NEAR EAST

MEHMET-ALI ATAÇ





## **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107154957

DOI: 10.1017/9781316651186

© Cambridge University Press 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Ataç, Mehmet-Ali, 1972- author.

Title: Art and immortality in the ancient Near East / Mehmet-Ali Ataç, Bryn Mawr College.

Description: New York: Cambridge University Press, 2017.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017004679 | ISBN 9781107154957 (hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Time and art.  $\mid$  Holy, The, in art.  $\mid$  Apocalyptic art.  $\mid$ 

 $Art, Ancient-Middle\ East-Themes, motives.$ 

Classification: LCC N8253.T5 A83 2017 | DDC 709.394-dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2017004679

ISBN 978-1-107-15495-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



In spite of sadly insufficient exploration, archaeological research does enable us to see that Teotihuacan reflects the image of infinite cycles, within which the Law of the Centre prevents the splitting asunder of opposing forces. These cycles, based upon the revolutions of the planets and upon laborious calculations, include the simplest – the yearly death and resurrection of Nature – and spread outward to embrace immense units. These great time cycles correspond to the mystic search for moments of supreme liberation, that is, of union between the individual and the cosmic soul, time and eternity, the finite and the infinite.

Laurette Séjourné, Burning Water: Thought and Religion in Ancient Mexico

Those who, indeed, attempt to deal with the unsolved problems of archaeology by an analysis and exegesis of meanings and contexts may expect to be accused of "reading into" their material meanings that are not in it. They will reply that the archaeologist or philologist who is not also a metaphysician must inevitably, sooner or later, find himself before a blank wall, which he cannot penetrate.

Ananda K. Coomaraswamy, "Walter Andrae's *Die ionische*Säule: Bauform oder Symbol?: A Review"



### **CONTENTS**

List of Illustrations	
Acknowledgments	
List of Abbreviations	
INTRODUCTION	I
Toward a Metaphysics of the Art of the Ancient Near East	I
The Corpus of Images	5
Questions of Text and Image	8
Tammuz and Gilgamesh	9
A Supra-Textual Language	14
Conceptual Bases	15
Egypt and Mesopotamia	18
Conceptions of Sacral Time and Eschatology	18
Defining Apocalyptic	21
Out of Time, Out of History	23
Artistic Production and "Regal Art"	24
The Royal Destiny	26
Art and the Apocalyptic	27
1 THE "INVESTITURE" PAINTING FROM MARI	30
Archaeological Discovery and Architectural Setting	33
The Mari Painting in the Context of the Art of the	
Ancient Near East	35
The Affinity between Mari and Assyria	40
Conceptions of Renewal in the Mari Painting	41
The Flood Myth in the Old Babylonian Period	42
Previous Interpretations	42
Alternative Views	45
A Critical Position	48
2 THE ICONOGRAPHIC ANALYSIS OF THE MARI PAINTING	50
The Ring and Rod: Beyond Legitimacy	50
The Builder King	54

vii



#### viii CONTENTS

	Gradation and Framing	55
	The Flowing Vase: Beyond Fertility	55
	Aquatic Endlessness	59
	Ishtar and Ea	61
	An Aquatic Doorway	62
	The Central Panel: Beyond a Rectangular Frame	63
	Heaven in Earth	66
	The Mythical Quadrupeds: Beyond the Apotropaic	71
	The Blue Bird in Flight: The "Phoenix"?	73
	Ascent to Heaven	76
	Coloristic Symbolism	78
	Stairway to Heaven	79
3	THE FLOOD MYTH AS PARADIGM	81
	A Note on Method	82
	The Ideal Enclosure and the Ideal Garden	83
	The Ideal Temple	86
	Numerological Symbolism	88
	A New Cosmic Order	89
	FloodVision	91
	Defining Paradeigma	92
	The Mari Painting and the Assyrian "Sacred Tree"	93
	Postscript on Shamanic Lore in the Art of Ancient Mesopotamia	98
4	THE SEMANTICS OF THE FRAME OF RUNNING SPIRALS	102
	Running Spirals as Symbolic Form	102
	The Ouroboric Serpent	104
	Primordial Chaos as Source of Periodic Destruction and Renewal	105
	Serpents, Streams, and Endless Time	113
	Neo-Sumerian Roots	116
	An Anatolian Ouroboros?	119
5	IMPLICATIONS OF SACRAL TIME AND ESCHATOLOGY	123
	Temporal Cyclicality in Ancient Mesopotamia	123
	An Apocalyptic Perspective	124
	Defying Cyclicality through Ascent	125
	The Hittite Double Winged Disk	128
	Hittite Visual Formulations of Ascent	134
	Mountain and Water	135
	To Die is to Become a God	137
	Egyptian Roots	138
	Conceptions of Temporal and Astral Eternity	141



> CONTENTS ix Nothing Babylonian 143 Conceptions of Apocalyptic Eschatology 145 Closure to the Mari Painting 148 Postscript: Why the Apocalyptic Would Have Been Esoteric 149 THE "ROYAL DESTINY": THE "GARDEN SCENE" OF ASHURBANIPAL REVISITED 151 From Ashurnasirpal to Ashurbanipal 152 Description and Historical Framework 152 Previous Interpretations and the Present Approach 157 Paradisiac Implications 158 The "Garden Scene" and its Intercultural Connections 160 "The Charms of Tyranny" 163 The Assyrian Queen Wearing the Mural Crown 168 The Celestial City 170 The Garden as a Transitional Extreme 172 A Vergilian Model 173 Ishtar and "Holy War" 176 Closure to the "Garden Scene" 177 **EPILOGUE** 179 Notes 183 Bibliography 247

Index

273



### **ILLUSTRATIONS**

Ι	Drawings of Middle Assyrian cylinder seal impressions	page 3
2	Reproduction of the "investiture" painting from the palace at Mari,	
	Old Babylonian period	6
3	The "sacred tree" relief panel from the throne room of Ashurnasirpal	
	II (883–859 BCE) in the Northwest Palace at Nimrud, Neo-Assyrian	
	period	7
4	The so-called Garden Scene or Garden Party of Ashurbanipal,	
	North Palace at Nineveh, Neo-Assyrian period BCE	7
5	Drawing of the "investiture" painting	27
6	Map of ancient Mesopotamia	31
7	Drawing of the central panel of the "investiture" painting from the	
	palace at Mari	32
8	Excavation photograph of the façade of the throne room suite in the	
	Mari palace showing the original position of the "investiture" painting	33
9	Schematic drawing of the façade of the throne room suite in the	
	Mari palace showing the original position of the "investiture" painting	34
IO	The relief carving on the Stela of Hammurapi, Old Babylonian period	34
ΙΙ	A fragment of the Stela of Urnamma (2112–2095 BCE) (the "good	
	face" of the stela) showing the king libating in front of the moon god	
	Nanna, Neo-Sumerian period (ca. 2112–2004 BCE)	35
12	Drawings of examples of Mittanian cylinder seal impressions featuring	
	"sacred trees" and winged disks	37
13	Detail of Fig. 3 showing the Assyrian winged disk	39
14	Relief panel showing a battle scene with the Assyrian winged	
	disk from the throne room (Room B) of Ashurnasirpal II in the	
	Northwest Palace at Nimrud, Neo-Assyrian period	39
15	Drawing of the façade of the Sîn temple at Khorsabad,	
	Neo-Assyrian Period	43
16	Statue of the goddess holding the flowing vase from the Mari palace,	
	Old Babylonian period	44
17	The painted faux marbre podium with an outer frame of running	
	spirals from Room 64, the throne room suite of the Mari palace,	
	Old Babylonian period	46
18	Relief showing pharaoh offering before the god Sokar, Temple	
	of Sety I, Abydos	53
19	The Basin of Gudea, found in Girsu, Neo-Sumerian period.	20
	Istanbul: Museum of the Ancient Orient	57
		- '

X



LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS xi

20	Statue of Gudea holding the flowing vase, found in Girsu,	
	Neo-Sumerian period	59
21	Stela fragment of Gudea showing a pattern of staggered flowing	
	vases, found in Girsu, Neo-Sumerian period	60
22	Drawing of the design on the cylinder seal of Gudea showing a	
	network of flowing vases in the throne of the seated deity. Paris, Louvre	60
23	Akkadian cylinder seal impression showing the god Ea seated inside	
5	the Apsû as a rectangular enclosure	64
24	Akkadian cylinder seal impression showing the god Ea seated	
	inside the Apsû as a rectangular enclosure	64
25	Akkadian cylinder seal impression showing the god Ea standing	
-5	inside the Apsû as a rectangular enclosure with steps at its bottom	65
26	Drawing of the twelfth hour of the ancient Egyptian Amduat,	٠.
	Tomb of Ramesses VI (Dynasty 20, ca. 1163–1100 BCE), Valley	
	of the Kings, Thebes	68
27	Drawing of the final scene of the ancient Egyptian <i>Book of Gates</i> ,	
- /	Tomb of Ramesses VI	70
28	Detail of the "investiture" painting from Mari, copy of Jean Lauffray,	, ,
20	showing the blue bird in the upper right hand side of the composition	73
29	Detail of Fig. 3 showing the king to the left of the "sacred tree."	95
30	Detail of Fig. 3 showing the king to the right of the "sacred tree."	9. 96
31	Assyrian cylinder seal impression showing a "sacred tree" growing	9
J1	out of a flowing vase, Middle Assyrian period	97
32	Relief panel showing a battle scene with soldiers crossing a river	91
32	from the throne room (Room B) of Ashurnasirpal II in the	
	Northwest Palace at Nimrud, Neo-Assyrian period	97
33	Relief panel showing Ashurnasirpal II between two winged	91
33	bird-headed apkallus from Room G in the Northwest Palace	
	at Nimrud, Neo-Assyrian period	99
34	Drawing of the eleventh hour of the <i>Amduat</i> , Tomb of Ramesses VI	100
35	Drawing of the fourth hour of the <i>Book of Gates</i> , Tomb of Ramesses VI	108
36	Detail from the fourth hour of the <i>Book of Gates</i> showing the twelve	100
30	goddesses personifying the hours with the time snake coiled between	
	them, Tomb of Ramesses I (Dynasty 19, 1307–1306 BCE), Valley of the	
	Kings, Thebes	109
37	D : C1 CC1 1 C1 D 1 CC - T 1 CD - TT	IIC
38	Steatite lid or cover of a lamp found at Girsu, Neo-Sumerian period	II7
39	Drawing of the steatite vase of Gudea found at Girsu, Neo-Sumerian	11,
39	period	117
40	Orthostat relief from the Early Iron Age gateway structure in	11,
40	Arslantepe/Malatya (Melid) showing a conflict between the weather	
	god and a serpent, Neo-Hittite period	H
4I	Wall painting showing the final scene from the ancient Egyptian	115
++	Book of Caverns in the tomb of Queen Tawosret, Valley of the	
	Kings, Thebes	127
42	Relief showing the Hittite sun god of heaven inside <i>Kammer 2</i>	12,
	of the Südhurg at Hattusha Hittite Empire period	120



#### xii LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

43	Seal impression of the Hittite King Tudhaliya IV, Hittite	
	Empire Period	129
44	Altar of Tukulti-Ninurta I from the Ishtar temple at Assur, Middle	
	Assyrian period	130
45	Detail of Fig. 44 showing the solar disk above the head of one	
	of the six-curled lahmu figures	131
46	The Eflatunpinar spring monument, Hittite Empire period	132
47	Stela from Malatya (Melid) showing the storm god and the sun	
	goddess facing each other under the double winged disk,	
	Neo-Hittite period	133
48	Rock relief showing Tudhaliya IV as high priest standing on	
	mountains from Shrine A of the Yazılıkaya open air sanctuary	
	outside Hattusha, Hittite Empire period	135
49	Egyptian ivory comb from the tomb of the Cobra King (Dynasty 1),	0.5
'/	Abydos, Early Dynastic period	139
50	Kudurru of Eanna-shum-iddina, governor of the Sea-Land in	57
	southern Babylonia, showing astral signs, Middle Babylonian period	144
51	Detail of Fig. 4, the "Garden Scene," showing the royal couple under	
	the grapevine canopy	153
52	Detail of Fig. 4, the "Garden Scene," showing the right hand side of	
	the relief showing fruit-bearing date palm	154
53	Relief panel showing the humiliation of the Elamite captives as	
	they bring food to the royal banquet from Ashurbanipal's North	155
54	Detail of Fig. 4, the "Garden Scene," showing the decapitated head	
	hanging from a tree	156
55	Drawing of the design on the ivory pyxis found in Assur Tomb 45,	
	Middle Assyrian period	159
56	Relief panel showing lions relaxing in a garden from the North	
	Palace of Ashurbanipal at Nineveh, Neo-Assyrian period	159
57	Procession of musicians with lions in a garden from the North	
	Palace of Ashurbanipal at Nineveh, Neo-Assyrian period	159
58	Wall painting from the tomb of Sennufer, a Theban official, showing	
	a grapevine spanning the ceiling, Dynasty 18, New Kingdom	163
59	The İvriz rock relief showing the storm god holding sheaves of	
	wheat and streams of water facing the royal figure, Neo-Hittite period	164
60	Kudurru featuring a city wall containing astral symbols, Middle	
	Babylonian period	170



#### **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

This book is the product of a decade of contemplation on conceptions of sacral time in the art of the ancient Near East, especially the Assyrian Empire. My ideas got crystallized initially in the paper "Time and Eternity' in the Northwest Palace of Ashurnasirpal II at Nimrud," which I presented at the Dartmouth College Assyrian palace relief symposium organized by Ada Cohen and Steven Kangas in 2006 at The Hood Museum of Art. I am grateful to both for offering me the first opportunity to voice thoughts on what I would live with intellectually over the following years. The greater part of the present book was researched and planned during my year as Hetty Goldman Member in the School of Historical Studies at the Institute for Advanced Study, Princeton, supported by a sabbatical from Bryn Mawr College. I thank the 2010-11 Faculty and Members of the School and its extended family in Princeton for many fundamentally stimulating discussions and conversations. Amy Gansell read the complete manuscript and offered exacting feedback. The manuscript benefited greatly from her sensibility, insight, and knowledge of the field. John Franklin sent me thoughts on select classical and ancient Near Eastern components of this study. Cory Crawford alerted me to a seminal article by Steven Holloway, "What Ship Goes There," without which certain aspects of this study could not have been developed. To all, I am most grateful. C. Akça Ataç and Çiçek Coşkun were so kind as to supply me with photographs of the Neo-Hittite stela from Malatya in the Museum of Anatolian Civilizations at Ankara, which appears here as Fig. 47.

The original title I had proposed for this study was "Art and Apocalyptic in the Ancient Near East." I thank my editor Asya Graf for the simpler and more inclusive alternative "Art and Immortality in the Ancient Near East" and her sustained support throughout the review process; and Beatrice Rehl for seeing me through the final stages of the manuscript preparation. My sincere thanks also to the anonymous readers for Cambridge University Press for criticism and references that I would not have known otherwise. Finally, many interesting conversations on apocalyptic thought, ancient and modern, took place at home in Ankara when I visited my parents, Yıldız–Mete Ataç, and sister, C. Akça Ataç, over the years, to all of whom I am also always indebted for emotional support.

X111



#### **ABBREVIATIONS**

AJA American Journal of Archaeology

BASOR Bulletin of the American Schools of Oriental Research

JANER Journal of Ancient Near Eastern Religions

JCS Journal of Cuneiform Studies JNES Journal of Near Eastern Studies

JAOS Journal of the American Oriental Society
M.A.R.I Mari: Annales de recherches interdisciplinaires

RIA Reallexikon der Assyriologie LÄ Lexikon der Ägyptologie

ZÄS Zeitschrift für Ägyptische Sprache und Altertumskunde