

Political Realism in Apocalyptic Times

From climate change to nuclear war to the rise of demagogic populists, our world is shaped by doomsday expectations. In this pathbreaking book, Alison McQueen shows why three of history's greatest political realists feared apocalyptic politics. Niccolò Machiavelli in the midst of Italy's vicious power struggles, Thomas Hobbes during England's bloody civil war, and Hans Morgenthau at the dawn of the thermonuclear age all saw the temptation to prophesy the end of days. Each engaged in subtle and surprising strategies to oppose apocalypticism, from using its own rhetoric to neutralize its worst effects to insisting on a clear-eyed, tragic acceptance of the human condition. Scholarly yet accessible, this book is at once an ambitious contribution to the history of political thought and a work that speaks to our times.

Alison McQueen is Assistant Professor in the Department of Political Science at Stanford University. She writes on the history of political thought, religion in early modern political thought, and political realism. Her work has been published in *Journal of Politics, Perspectives on Politics, European Journal of Political Theory, Political Theory*, and *Critical Review of Social and Political Philosophy*. She is the recipient of the American Political Science Association's Leo Strauss Award for the best dissertation in political philosophy (2012). She has held fellowships at Princeton's University Center for Human Values and the Stanford Humanities Center.



Political Realism in Apocalyptic Times

ALISON MCQUEEN

Stanford University





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107152397 DOI: 10.1017/9781316588307

© Alison McQueen 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library
ISBN 978-1-107-15239-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



This book is dedicated to the memory of David McQueen and Jennifer McQueen



Contents

List of Figures Acknowledgments		page 1x xi
2	Understanding the Apocalypse	22
3	Machiavelli's Savonarolan Moment	63
4	Hobbes "At the Edge of Promises and Prophecies"	105
5	Morgenthau and the Postwar Apocalypse	147
6	Conclusion	192
References		206
Index		228

vii





Figures

2.I	Nero conquering Armenia, Sebasteion at Aphrodisias,	
	first century AD.	page 35
2.2	Claudius conquering Brittania, Sebasteion at Aphrodisias,	
	first century AD.	36
3.1	Sandro Botticelli, Mystic Crucifixion, c. 1500.	77
3.2	Luca Signorelli, Apocalypse Sequence, 1499–1502.	78
3.3	Luca Signorelli, Apocalypse Sequence, 1499–1502.	79
4.I	Frontispiece of Leviathan, "Head" edition, 1651.	140



Acknowledgments

We rarely do our best thinking alone. I have many people to thank for thinking through this project with me. Susan Buck-Morss supervised the doctoral dissertation that became the basis for this book. She consistently pushed me to see the project with new eyes, to find the strange in the familiar, and to take seriously the way in which images do important political theoretical work. Peter Katzenstein brought his sharp critical eye and wide-ranging intellect to every part of this project. And, as he has done for so many, Peter modeled what it means to be a generous scholar and teacher.

It was in a class with John Najemy that I first began to formulate my ideas on Machiavelli. The reading I offer in this book owes much to these early conversations, to John's own wonderful work on Machiavelli and Renaissance Florence, and to the careful attention he brought to multiple drafts of that chapter. The project benefited from John's rare combination of a breadth of vision and an eye for detail. I must acknowledge a special debt to Jason Frank. Had it not been for several seminars and many conversations with Jason, I would not have realized that I was a political theorist. He consistently saw more in this project than I knew was there. When I would turn to Jason in frustration, he would send me back to work with a renewed sense of enthusiasm. One could not ask for more.

A number of people read the manuscript in its entirety at various stages. I would like to thank David Bates, Joshua Cohen, David Como, Robert Fredona, Kinch Hoekstra, Victoria Kahn, Isaac Kramnick, Josiah Ober, Stephen O'Leary, Rob Reich, and William Scheuerman. More recently, several anonymous reviewers carefully read the manuscript and offered invaluable responses, criticisms, and corrections.

Many other people read one or more chapters and offered useful feedback. I would like to thank Dwight Allman, Samuel Arnold, Eric Beerbohm, Charles

хi



xii Acknowledgments

Beitz, Richard Bensel, Peter Breiner, Jonathan Bruno, Allen Carlson, Douglas Dow, Dan Edelstein, Matthew Evangelista, Michael Frazer, Amy Gais, Giovanni Giorgini, Joshua Goldstein, Benjamin Gregg, Randal Hendrickson, Burke Hendrix, David Johnston, Risa Kitagawa, David Laitin, Melissa Lane, Harvey Mansfield, Al Martinich, Lida Maxwell, John McCormick, Eric Nelson, Philip Pettit, Arlene Saxonhouse, Shalini Satkunanandan, John Scott, Quentin Skinner, Steven Smith, Travis Smith, Brent Sockness, Anna Stilz, Leif Wenar, and Yves Winter. I would also like to thank audiences at the various conferences and workshops where these chapters were presented. All remaining errors are, of course, the result of malevolent Fortune.

For their friendship and support during the highs and, more importantly, the lows of this project, I would like to thank Emilee Chapman, Lauren Davenport, Helena de Bres, Jennifer Hadden, Louis-Philippe Hodgson, Hallie Liberto, Jonathan Kirshner, Margaret McKinnon, Josiah Ober, David Plunkett, Lucas Stanczyk, Silvana Toska, and Leif Wenar.

I owe Burke Hendrix a special debt of gratitude. He saw this project develop from its earliest stages. The book benefited from his encouragement, questions, and gentle requests for clarification. He helped me see the humor in an often gloomy subject.

The book also benefited from the financial and institutional support of the Cornell School of Graduate Studies, Cornell's Mario Einaudi Center for International Studies, Princeton's University Center for Human Values, the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, Stanford University, Stanford's McCoy Family Center for Ethics in Society, and Stanford's Brown Faculty Fellowship.

Robert Dreesen at Cambridge University Press patiently supported this book from the outset. Julia Hrischeva and Nitesh Srivastav saw the manuscript smoothly through the production process. Wendy Nardi brought a sharp eye to copyediting.

Earlier versions of parts of Chapters 3 and 5 appeared, respectively, as "Politics in Apocalyptic Times: Machiavelli's Savonarolan Moment" in *Journal of Politics* 78, no. 3 (2016), pp. 909–24, and as "Salutary Fear? Hans Morgenthau and the Politics of Existential Crisis," *American Political Thought* 6, no. 1 (2017), pp. 78–105. Earlier versions of some brief passages of Chapter 1 appeared in "Political Realism and the Realist 'Tradition,'" *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy* 20, no. 3 (2017), pp. 296–313 and "The Apocalypse in U.S. Political Thought," *Foreign Affairs* (July 18, 2016), https://www.foreignaffairs.com/articles/united-states/2016-07-18/apocalypse-us-political-thought. Earlier versions of some brief passages of Chapter 5 appeared in "On Hans J. Morgenthau's 'The Twilight of International Morality," *Ethics* 125, no. 3 (2015): 840–2. Earlier versions of some brief passages of Chapter 6 appeared in "Apocalyptic Thought in the Age of Trump," *Foreign Affairs* (November 20, 2016), https://www.foreignaffairs.com/articles/



Acknowledgments xiii

2016-11-20/apocalyptic-thought-age-trump. I am grateful to all of these journals for allowing me to reproduce the relevant portions of those texts here.

Finally, I owe a special debt to my family. My parents, Nancy and David McQueen, first nurtured the skills and habits of scholarly work – reading, writing, and asking questions (not necessarily in that order). My aunt, Jennifer McQueen, supported and encouraged me throughout my early academic career. She was proof that it is possible to be a compassionate realist. My father and my aunt both died as this project was still unfolding. I dedicate this book to their memory.