

The Care of the Witness

During the twentieth century, witnessing grew to be not just a widespread solution for coping with political atrocities but also an intricate problem. As the personal experience of victims, soldiers, and aid workers acquired unparalleled authority as a source of moral and political truth, the capacity to generate adequate testimonies based on this experience was repeatedly called into question. Michal Givoni's book follows the trail of the problems, torments, and crises that became commingled with witnessing to genocide, disaster, and war over the course of the twentieth century. By juxtaposing episodes of reflexive witnessing to the Great War, the Jewish Holocaust, and third world emergencies, *The Care of the Witness* explores the shifting roles and responsibilities of witnesses in history and the contribution that the troubles of witnessing made to the ethical consolidation of the witness as the leading figure of nongovernmental politics.

Michal Givoni teaches in the Department of Politics and Government at Ben Gurion University of the Negev. She is co-editor of *The Power of Inclusive Exclusion: Anatomy of Israeli Rule in the Occupied Palestinian Territories* (2009).

Human Rights in History

Edited by

Stefan-Ludwig Hoffmann, *University of California, Berkeley*
Samuel Moyn, *Harvard University*

This series showcases new scholarship exploring the backgrounds of human rights today. With an open-ended chronology and international perspective, the series seeks works attentive to the surprises and contingencies in the historical origins and legacies of human rights ideals and interventions. Books in the series will focus not only on the intellectual antecedents and foundations of human rights, but also on the incorporation of the concept by movements, nation-states, international governance, and transnational law.

Also in the series:

- Davey, *Idealism Beyond Borders: The French Revolutionary Left and the Rise of Humanitarianism, 1954–1988*
- Fehrenbach and Rodogno, *Humanitarian Photography: A History*
- Fisch, trans. Mage, *The Right of Self-Determination of Peoples: The Domestication of an Illusion*
- Hoffmann, *Human Rights in the Twentieth Century*
- Hong, *Cold War Germany, the Third World, and the Global Humanitarian Regime*
- Jensen, *The Making of International Human Rights: The 1960s, Decolonization, and the Reconstruction of Global Values*
- Klose, *The Emergence of Humanitarian Intervention: Ideas and Practice from the Nineteenth Century to the Present*
- Snyder, *Human Rights Activism and the End of the Cold War: A Transnational History of the Helsinki Network*
- Winter and Prost, *René Cassin and Human Rights: From the Great War to the Universal Declaration*

The Care of the Witness

A Contemporary History of Testimony in Crises

MICHAL GIVONI

Ben Gurion University of the Negev



Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-107-15094-2 — The Care of the Witness
 Michal Givoni
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107150942

© Michal Givoni 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2016

This book was published in Hebrew by the Van Leer Jerusalem Institute and Hakibbutz
 Hameuchad Publishing House in 2015, under the title *The Ethics of Witnessing:
 A History of a Problem*.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Givoni, Michal, author.

The care of the witness : a contemporary history of testimony in crises / Michal Givoni.
 Etikaṭ ha-'edut. English

Cambridge [UK] : Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Series: Human rights in history

LCCN 2016026628 | ISBN 9781107150942 (hardback)

LCSh: Testimony (Theory of knowledge) | Witnesses. | Holocaust, Jewish
 (1939-1945) – Personal narratives. | Human rights. | Evidence, Hearsay.

LCC BD238.T47 G5813 2016 | DDC 177-dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2016026628>

ISBN 978-1-107-15094-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page</i> vii
Introduction	I
1 The Ethics of Witnessing and the Politics of the Governed	19
The Politics of Autonomous Witnessing	20
Witnessing as a Conscious Practice of Freedom	30
Where Ethics and Politics Intersect	40
2 Witnessing Beyond Politics: Testimony Theory between Auschwitz and the Crisis of Representation	49
From the <i>Testis</i> to the <i>Martyr</i>	55
From the Witness to the Subject	69
From Testimony to the Experience of Witnessing	78
From the Catastrophe to the Global Emergency Zones	90
3 Witnesses in Public: The Authority of Experience and the Critique of Testimonies Following the Great War	99
A Fighting Truth	109
The Composed Witness	115
Witnessing against Literature	124
4 Empathic Listeners and Alarmed Spectators: Secondary Witnessing and Existential Ruin in the Fortunoff Video Archive for Holocaust Testimonies	136
Communities of Witnessing	146
The Inner Witness and Its Rehabilitation	150
The Alarmed Spectator and the Diminished Self	157
From the Survivor to the Witness	166

5	Humanitarian Governance and Ethical Cultivation: Médecins Sans Frontières and the Advent of the Expert-Witness	172
	A New Humanitarian Rationality	180
	The Physician's Burden	183
	Expert-Witnessing and Active Presence	190
	The Discrepancies of Global Governance	195
	Witnessing and the Humanitarian/Political Divide	201
	Conclusion: Revisiting the Ethics of Witnessing	204
	<i>Bibliography</i>	217
	<i>Index</i>	233

Acknowledgments

My preoccupation with witnessing mutated through several phases before it turned into the book you are holding. It germinated while I was writing my PhD dissertation at the Cohn Institute for the History and Philosophy of Science and Ideas at Tel Aviv University, when the gulf between the theory of testimony that so enchanted contemporary thinking around the ethics of memory on the one hand, and the humanitarian practice of witnessing I was studying on the other, first struck me as philosophically awkward and politically suspect. Adi Ophir, my dissertation supervisor, was probably the reason why I was so attracted in the first place to the contact zones between moral concern and political activism and to the messy intersections between theory and practice that the troubles of witnessing appeared to form. Adi's work had a tremendous influence on my thinking, his intellectual engagement provided me with an example of what thinking should be about, and his unfaltering support convinced me that my own thinking may have some merit. I am immensely grateful to Adi for being such an inspiring, encouraging, and generous mentor.

The ideas that came to feature in this book coalesced while I was a Fulbright postdoctoral fellow at the Department of History at UC Berkeley. Thomas Laqueur, who hosted me in Berkeley, followed this study in one of its most critical phases and helped me hone my approach to the historicization of witnessing, which until then had seemed as bewildering as it was cardinal. I'm grateful to Tom for sharing with me his immense erudition and penetrating comments, as well as for his good advice and warm hospitality. Adriana Kemp, who accepted the invitation of the Van Leer Jerusalem Institute to be the editor of the Hebrew edition of this book, helped me transform the still scratchy text I brought back

from Berkeley into a far more coherent manuscript. I was repeatedly amazed at the precision with which her comments could target the flaws in my arguments and guide me toward alternatives. Amos Goldberg, the reviewer of the Hebrew manuscript, and the anonymous readers of the English manuscript, offered excellent comments in a true spirit of constructive critique; I'm deeply thankful to all of them for their incisive and open-minded reading.

The Hebrew edition of the book came to life thanks to Yehouda Shenhav, the editor of the *Theory & Criticism in Context* book series in which the book was published, and I'm indebted to him for envisioning this work long before I dared to do so and for prompting me to write it. I'm grateful to Sam Moyn and Stefan-Ludwig Hoffmann for the incredible opportunity to publish the English version of the book in their *Human Rights in History* series. I thank Debbie Gershenowitz, the editor in charge from Cambridge University Press, for her help and support during the various stages of the publication process. Natalie Melzer translated portions of the Hebrew manuscript into English and copyedited others and, beyond her professionalism, I'm grateful to her for being such an engaged and astute reader. Neve Gordon, Penny Ismay, Yoav Kenny, Yossi Loss, Ronit Peleg, and Galia Plotkin Amrami read parts of the manuscript in various states of fruition and offered valuable comments and, no less importantly, friendly support.

I would like to thank the people who shared their time and knowledge of witnessing with me and helped me access the materials on which this research is based. Rony Brauman opened the door to the Parisian headquarters of Médecins sans Frontières-France, helped me navigate the history of the organization, and patiently answered my inquiries. Laurence Binet from MSF's CRASH, the author of a fascinating study on *témoignage*, generously shared her thoughts and materials with me; Fabrice Weissman, also from CRASH, offered useful links, articles, and reflections; and Judith Soussan and Xavier Crombé kept me in the loop with regard to new studies and documents after I finished my research in Paris. Beyond Médecins sans Frontières, I'm grateful to Joanne Rudof of The Fortunoff Video Archive for Holocaust Testimonies at Yale University for her assistance during my visit in New Haven and for helping me understand how the activities of the Fortunoff Archive evolved over the years. I could not have written this book without all those who lent a helping hand during the research and the writing process, but, needless to say, the responsibility for the remaining faults and for the arguments expressed here is entirely my own.

Acknowledgments

ix

Many institutions supported the research and writing of this book. I thank Rivka Feldhay, then head of The Cohn Institute for the History and Philosophy of Science and Ideas, Leo Corry who replaced her, and Bert and Barbara Cohn for a scholarship that allowed me to conduct extensive research at the archives of Médecins sans Frontières in Paris. I'm grateful to The Minerva Center for Human Rights at Tel Aviv University for another scholarship as well as for a subsequent research grant. I thank the United States-Israel Educational Foundation for a Fulbright postdoctoral fellowship that took me to the inspiring setting of UC Berkeley. In addition, I thank The Rothschild-Caesarea School of Communication at Tel Aviv University, The David Horowitz Research Institute on Society and Economy at Tel Aviv University, The Minerva Humanities Center at Tel Aviv University, and my present academic home, the Department of Politics and Government at Ben Gurion University, for grants and fellowships that helped me devote time for writing. Finally, I acknowledge with gratitude a grant from the Faculty of the Humanities and Social Sciences at Ben Gurion University that supported the translation of the book.

I thank the organizers and participants of the conferences and workshops in which I presented parts of this study. These include the annual conference of the Sapir Forum for Cultural Studies (June 2014); The London Conference in Critical Thought (June 2012); APSA Annual Meeting (September 2011); the workshop on The Dilemmas of International Humanitarian Aid in the Twentieth Century, organized by Johannes Paulmann at the German Historical Institute, London (May 2011); The Political Concepts Workshop held in the Zentrum für Literatur- und Kulturforschung, Berlin (December 2011) and the Lexical Conference in Political Thought held at Tel Aviv University (January 2010); the workshop on Human Rights and Humanitarianism in the 1970s, organized by Sam Moyn and Jan Eckel at the Freiburg Institute for Advanced Studies (June 2010); and the workshop on Marking Evil: The Memory of the Holocaust in a Global Age, organized by Haim Hazan and Amos Goldberg at the Van Leer Jerusalem Institute (December 2008). In particular, I thank Guillermina Seri, who commented on my paper at the APSA meeting, and Falko Schmieder, who was the respondent at the Political Concepts Workshop in Berlin. In addition to these, I'm also grateful to Tom Keenan for the invitation to present this work at the Human Rights Program lecture series at Bard College in September 2011, and for his generosity in many other things.

Finally, I would like to thank Yossi Loss for agreeing to follow me around the world to all the places that this work has taken me and for tolerating its emotional side-effects. I dedicate the book to my children, Raphael and Naomi. Writing it has convinced me that witnessing is not likely to vanish from our political arenas any time soon, but also that the past and present forms of witnessing cannot foretell its future ones. And though I would like to see Raphael and Naomi grow up in a world whose share of evils is diminished and the need for witnesses reduced, it is also my hope that where the need exists there will be courageous people willing to face up to the challenges of witnessing.

* * *

Earlier versions of some of the arguments presented in the book were previously published in the following articles: “Not to Be Governed Thusly: Tracing the Contours of Non-Governmental Politics,” *Theory & Criticism* 34 (2009): 191–198 (in Hebrew); “Witnessing/Testimony,” *Mafte’akh, A Lexical Journal of Political Thought* 2 (2010): 147–169; “Humanitarian Governance and Ethical Cultivation: Médecins sans Frontières and the Advent of the Expert-Witness,” *Millennium* 40(1) (2011): 43–63; “Beyond the Humanitarian/Political Divide: Witnessing and the Making of Humanitarian Ethics,” *Journal of Human Rights* 10(1) (2011): 55–75; “The Ethics of Witnessing and the Politics of the Governed,” *Theory, Culture & Society* 31(1) (2014): 123–142.