

# ESTABLISHING JUDICIAL AUTHORITY IN INTERNATIONAL ECONOMIC LAW

A central development in international law is the intensified juridification of international relations by a growing number of international courts. With this in mind, this book discusses how international judicial authority is established and managed in key fields of international economic law: trade law, investor-state arbitration, and international commercial arbitration. Adopting a unique legal-centric approach, the analysis explores the interplay between these areas of economic dispute resolution, tracing their parallel developments and identifying the ways they influence each other on processual mechanisms and solutions. Drawing together contributions from many leading scholars across the world, this volume considers issues such as the usage of precedent and the role of legitimacy, suggesting that the consolidation of judicial authority is a universal trend which impacts on state behaviour.

JOANNA JEMIELNIAK is Associate Professor at the Centre of Excellence for International Courts at the University of Copenhagen. She specialises in international business law and arbitration, and in the theory of legal interpretation and argumentation.

LAURA NIELSEN is Associate Professor at the Centre for Company Liability and an associate member of the Centre of Excellence for International Courts at the University of Copenhagen. She is an international trade law expert, but specialises also in the broader area of international economic law.

HENRIK PALMER OLSEN is Professor of Jurisprudence at the University of Copenhagen. He co-founded the Centre of Excellence for International Courts in 2012 and is a leading expert in legal theory.



#### CAMBRIDGE INTERNATIONAL TRADE AND ECONOMIC LAW

#### Series Editors

Dr Lorand Bartels, *University of Cambridge* Professor Thomas Cottier, *University of Berne* Professor William Davey, *University of Illinois* 

As the processes of regionalisation and globalisation have intensified, there have been accompanying increases in the regulations of international trade and economic law at the levels of international, regional and national laws.

The subject matter of this series is international economic law. Its core is the regulation of international trade, investment and cognate areas such as intellectual property and competition policy. The series publishes books on related regulatory areas, in particular human rights, labour, environment and culture, as well as sustainable development. These areas are vertically linked at the international, regional and national levels, and the series extends to the implementation of these rules at these different levels. The series also includes works on governance, dealing with the structure and operation of related international organisations in the field of international economic law, and the way they interact with other subjects of international and national laws.

#### Books in the series

Establishing Judicial Authority in International Economic Law Edited by Joanna Jemielniak, Laura Nielsen, and Henrik Palmer Olsen

Trade, Investment, Innovation and Their Impact on Access to Medicines: An Asian Perspective

Locknie Hsu

The Law, Economics and Politics of International Standardisation Panagiotis Delimatsis

The WTO and International Investment Law: Converging Systems Jürgen Kurtz

Export Restrictions on Critical Minerals and Metals: Testing the Adequacy of WTO Disciplines

Ilaria Espa

Optimal Regulation and the Law of International Trade: The Interface between Societal Values and WTO Law

Boris Rigod

 $\label{thm:community} The \textit{Social Foundations of World Trade: Norms, Community and Constitution}$ 

Sungjoon Cho

Public Participation and Legitimacy in the WTO Yves Bonzon



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-14710-2 - Establishing Judicial Authority in International Economic Law Edited By Joanna Jemielniak , Laura Nielsen , and Henrik Palmer Olsen Frontmatter

More information

The Challenge of Safeguards in the WTO

Fernando Piérola

General Interests of Host States in International Investment Law

Edited by Giorgio Sacerdoti, Pia Acconci, Mara Valenti, and Anna De Luca

The Law of Development Cooperation: A Comparative Analysis of the World Bank, the EU and Germany

Philipp Dann

WTO Disciplines on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures: Balancing Policy Space and Legal Constraints

Dominic Coppens

Domestic Judicial Review of Trade Remedies: Experiences of the Most

Active WTO Members

Müslüm Yilmaz

International Organizations in WTO Dispute Settlement: How Much Institutional Sensitivity?

Marina Foltea

Public Services and International Trade Liberalization: Human Rights and Gender Implications

Barnali Choudhury

The Law and Politics of WTO Waivers: Stability and Flexibility in Public

International Law

Isabel Feichtner

African Regional Trade Agreements as Legal Regimes

James Thuo Gathii

Liberalizing International Trade after Doha

David Gantz

Processes and Production Methods (PPMs) in WTO Law: Interfacing Trade and Social Goals

Christiane R. Conrad

Non-Discrimination in International Trade in Services: "Likeness"

in WTO/GATS

Nicolas Diebold

The Law, Economics and Politics of Retaliation in WTO Dispute Settlement

Edited by Chad P. Bown and Joost Pauwelyn

 $The \ Multilateralization \ of \ International \ Investment \ Law$ 

Stephan W. Schill

 ${\it Trade~Policy~Flexibility~and~Enforcement~in~the~WTO:~A~Law}$ 

and Economics Analysis

Simon A.B. Schropp





# ESTABLISHING JUDICIAL AUTHORITY IN INTERNATIONAL ECONOMIC LAW

Edited by

JOANNA JEMIELNIAK, LAURA NIELSEN,

AND HENRIK PALMER OLSEN





### **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107147102

© Cambridge University Press 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Jemielniak, Joanna, editor. | Nielsen, Laura, (Jurist), editor. | Olsen, Henrik Palmer, editor.

Establishing judicial authority in international economic law / Edited

by Joanna Jemielniak, Laura Nielsen and Henrik Palmer Olsen.

New York: Cambridge University Press, 2016.

LCCN 2015041405 | ISBN 9781107147102

LCSH: International economic relations. | International courts. |

Jurisdiction. | International commercial arbitration.

LCC K3820 .E88 2016 | DDC 343.07-dc23

LC record available at http://lccn.loc.gov/2015041405 ISBN 978-1-107-14710-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



#### CONTENTS

List of figures page ix List of tables x List of contributors xi Acknowledgements xii

Introduction

JOANNA JEMIELNIAK, LAURA NIELSEN, AND HENRIK PALMER OLSEN 1

#### PART I Courts in international economic law: emergence, interplay, and proliferation 29

- 1 Assessing the impact of WTO and regional dispute resolution mechanisms on the world trading system DAVID A. GANTZ 31
- Establishing permanent regional good offices for trade disputes in Asia
   CHANG-FA LO 78
- 3 African regional judiciaries and their jurisprudence in trade law matters

AMOS SAUROMBE 96

4 Coordinated actions in international economic law as illustrated by investment treaty arbitration and World Trade Organization disputes

GREG TEREPOSKY AND LAURA NIELSEN 119

vii



More information

viii

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-14710-2 - Establishing Judicial Authority in International Economic Law Edited By Joanna Jemielniak , Laura Nielsen , and Henrik Palmer Olsen Frontmatter

# PART II The development and usage of precedents in international economic law 139

CONTENTS

5 Minority rules: precedent and participation before the WTO Appellate Body

JOOST PAUWELYN 141

- 6 The welfare implications of precedent in international law KRZYSZTOF J. PELC 173
- 7 Features of trade law adjudication and their impact on the development of legal concepts and precedents

  ANTON K. SCHNYDER AND STEFANIE PFISTERER 188

# PART III Legitimating decisions in international economic law 213

8 Judicial ethics in international economic law: what standards of independence and impartiality apply to arbitrators and panellists?

KRISTA NADAKAVUKAREN SCHEFER 215

- 9 Judicial authority and styles of reasoning: self-presentation between legalism and deliberation

  INGO VENZKE 240
- 10 'Global Citizens' in international commercial arbitration and WTO dispute resolution

JOANNA JEMIELNIAK AND LAURA NIELSEN 263

11 Proportionality analysis and international commercial arbitration – the example of public policy and domestic courts

BENEDIKT PIRKER 290

Index 320



#### **FIGURES**

I.1	Different "layers" of disputes in the field of international economic
	law page 6
5.1	Total number of cross-references for each AB report
	(1996–2013) 152
5.2	Total number of cross-references for each AB report (1996-2013) -
	total-simple moving average 153
5.3	AB report pages and footnotes (total) 153
5.4	AB report pages and footnotes (moving average) 153
5.5	AB cross-references (total and per page) 154
5.6	AB cross-references (moving average) 154
5.7	Cross-reference visualization between five AB reports 155
5.8	The network of AB reports (1996–2013) 156
5.9	AB citation network, 1996–2000 157
5.10	AB citation network, 1996–2004 158
5.11	AB citation network, 1996–2008 159
5.12	Distribution of number of cites attracted by each of the 108 AB
	reports 161
5.13	Distribution of number of cites attracted by each AB report
	excluding three outliers zeroing (FC) bananas, zeroing

- 5.14 Distribution of number of outward citations (all 108 AB reports) 162
- 5.15 Distribution of number of outward citations excluding three outliers zeroing (EC) 21.5, zeroing (Japan) 21.5, US AD & CVD 162
- 5.16 The network of main parties in AB proceedings 169
- 5.17 The network of main parties in AB proceedings, including outsiders 170
- 5.18 The distribution of WTO member participation in AB proceedings 171

(Japan)

162



#### TABLES

5.1	Most cited AB reports page 160	
5.2	AB reports that include the most cross-references	161
5.3	Indegree and outdegree centrality (top 15 reports)	164
5.4	AB members with the most cross-references 165	
5.5	Authority and hub score of AB reports (top 15)	166
5.6	WTO members participating as main party 167	



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-14710-2 - Establishing Judicial Authority in International Economic Law Edited By Joanna Jemielniak , Laura Nielsen , and Henrik Palmer Olsen Frontmatter

More information

#### CONTRIBUTORS

- David A. Gantz, Samuel M. Fegtly Professor of Law, James E. Rogers College of Law, the University of Arizona
- Joanna Jemielniak, Associate Professor, iCourts, Faculty of Law, University of Copenhagen
- Chang-fa Lo, Justice, Constitutional Court, Taiwan, and Part-time professor, National Taiwan University College of Law
- Krista Nadakavukaren Schefer, Professor of Law, University of Basel, Switzerland
- Laura Nielsen, Associate Professor, CEVIA, Faculty of Law, University of Copenhagen
- Henrik Palmer Olsen, Professor and Vice-Dean for Research, Faculty of Law, University of Copenhagen
- Joost Pauwelyn, Professor of Law, Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies, Geneva, and Georgetown University Law Centre
- Krzysztof J. Pelc, William Dawson Scholar Associate Professor, Department of Political Science, McGill University, Canada
- Stefanie Pfisterer, Senior Associate, Homburger AG, Zurich, Switzerland Benedikt Pirker, Senior Lecturer, Institute for European Law, University of Fribourg, Switzerland
- Amos Saurombe, Professor of International Economic Law, Head of Graduate Studies, Research & Innovation in the College of Law at the University of South Africa
- Anton K. Schnyder, Professor of Law, Faculty of Law, University of Zurich, Zurich, Switzerland
- Gregory Tereposky, Partner, Borden, Ladner, Gervais, LLP, Ottawa Ingo Venzke, Associate Professor, University of Amsterdam



#### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

We would like to thank the editors of the book series for accepting our book, as well as the anonymous peer reviewers for their helpful suggestions. We would also like to thank the very professional staff at CUP, Kim Hughes and Rebecca J. Roberts, for helping us through the publication process. In addition, we would like to thank "Dreyers Fond" in Denmark for supporting the conference in December 2013 which this publication developed from. Finally, we thank our student assistants Kristoffer Krohn Schaldemose, David Steen Skovsted and Amalie Munch-Jensen, and in particular Christina Blaunfeldt, LL.M., for their help with formatting the footnotes in the entire book.