THE LEGITIMACY OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS

With the ad hoc tribunals completing their mandates and the International Criminal Court under significant pressure, today’s international criminal jurisdictions are at a critical juncture. Their legitimacy cannot be taken for granted. This multidisciplinary volume investigates key issues pertaining to legitimacy: criminal accountability, normative development, truth-discovery, complementarity, regionalism, and judicial cooperation. The volume sheds new light on previously unexplored areas, including the significance of redacted judgements, prosecutors’ opening statements, rehabilitative processes of international convicts, victim expectations, court financing, and NGO activism. The book’s original contributions will appeal to researchers, practitioners, advocates, and students of international criminal justice, accountability for war crimes, and the rule of law.

Nobuo Hayashi is a researcher at PluriCourts at the University of Oslo. He is a specialist in international humanitarian law, international criminal law, and moral philosophy.

Cecilia M. Bailliet is Professor and Director of the Master’s Programme in Public International Law at the University of Oslo. She has published widely within the areas of international law, human rights, refugee law, counter-terrorism, and peace. She is currently on the Steering Committee of PluriCourts research project, where she is Coordinator of the International Criminal Law Pillar.
STUDIES ON INTERNATIONAL COURTS AND TRIBUNALS

General Editor

Andreas Føllesdal, University of Oslo
Geir Ulfstein, University of Oslo

Studies on International Courts and Tribunals contains theoretical and interdisciplinary scholarship on legal aspects as well as the legitimacy and effectiveness of international courts and tribunals.

Other Books in the Series

Mads Andenas and Eirik Bjorge (eds.) A Farewell to Fragmentation: Reassertion and Convergence in International Law
To Klára
N.H.

In honour of the memory of my maternal great-grandmother,
Cecilia, who gave her savings to her eldest son so that he could
escape the Holocaust in which she perished
C.M.B.

To Dave, Poppy and Dougal
J.N.
CONTENTS

List of Contributors page x
Acknowledgements xviii
List of Abbreviations xix

Introduction 1
NOBUO HAYASHI, CECILIA M. BAILLIET, AND JOANNA NICHOLSON

PART I Theories and Perspectives 23
1 The Legitimacy of International Criminal Tribunals 25
LARRY MAY AND SHANNON FYFE

2 Conceptualising and Measuring the Legitimacy of International Criminal Tribunals 41
SILJE AAMBØ LANGVATN AND THERESA SQUATRITO

3 Between International Criminal Justice and Injustice: Theorising Legitimacy 66
SERGEY VASILIEV

4 Legitimacy, Legality, and the Possibility of a Pluralist International Criminal Law 92
ASAD KIYANI

5 The Legitimacy and Effectiveness of International Criminal Tribunals: A Criminal Policy Perspective 116
ATHANASIOS CHOULIARAS

vii
PART II Norms and Objectives 139

6 Legitimacy and ICC Jurisdiction Following Security Council Referrals: Conduct on the Territory of Non-Party States and the Legality Principle 141
ROGIER BARTELS

7 Is the Yugoslav Tribunal Guilty of Hyper-Humanising International Humanitarian Law? 179
NOBUO HAYASHI

8 ‘One of the Challenges that can Plausibly be Raised Against Them? On the Role of Truth in Debates about the Legitimacy of International Criminal Tribunals 206
JAKOB V.H. HOLTERMANN

9 Hidden Legitimacy: Crafting Judicial Narratives in the Shadow of Secrecy at a War Crimes Tribunal – A Speculation 228
TIMOTHY WILLIAM WATERS

PART III Complementarity and Regionalism 245

10 Positive Complementarity and Legitimacy – Is the International Criminal Court Shifting from Judicial Restraint Towards Interventionism? 247
IGNAZ STEGMILLER

DOROTHY MAKAZA

12 Legitimacy Defects and Legal Flaws of the Special Tribunal for Lebanon: Dilemmas of the ‘Peace Through Justice’ Theorem 297
MARTIN WÄHLISCH

PART IV Parties to the Proceedings 323

13 Prosecutors’ Opening Statements: The Rhetoric of Law, Politics, and Silent War 325
DAMIEN ROGERS
CONTENTS

14 Effectiveness of International Criminal Tribunals: Empirical Assessment of Rehabilitation as Sentencing Goal 351
BARBARA HOLÁ, JESSICA KELDER, AND JORIS VAN WIJK

15 Procedural Justice, Legitimacy, and Victim Participation in Uganda 376
STEPHEN SMITH CODY

PART V States and NGOs 399

16 Things Fall Apart: Battles of Legitimation and the Politics of Noncompliance and African Sovereignty from the Rwanda Tribunal to the ICC 401
VICTOR PESKIN

17 Financing Lady Justice: How the Funding Systems of Ad Hoc Tribunals Could Lend Themselves to the Possibility of Judicial Bias 426
MISTALE TAYLOR

18 Global Civil Society, the ICC, and Legitimacy in International Criminal Justice 449
KJERSTI LOHNE

Index 473
CONTRIBUTORS

CECILIA M. BAILLIET is Professor Dr. jur., Coordinator of the ICL Pillar at the PluriCourts Centre of Excellence on the Legitimacy of International Courts Project, and Director of the Master’s Program in Public International Law at the University of Oslo. She has a doctoral degree in law from the University of Oslo, and a combined JD/MA (honours) degree from the George Washington University Law School and Elliott School of International Affairs. She has published widely within the cross-fields of international public law, human rights, women’s law, refugee law, IHL, and counter-terrorism. Among her publications are: Promoting Peace Through International Law (2015), Non-State Actors, Soft Law and Protective Regimes (Cambridge University Press 2012), Cosmopolitan Justice and Its Discontents (co-edited with Katja Franko Aas, 2011), and Security: A Multidisciplinary Normative Approach (2009).

ROGIER BARTELS is a Legal Officer in Chambers at the International Criminal Court and a research fellow at the Military Law Section of the Netherlands Defence Academy. He has a law degree from Utrecht University and an LLM from the University of Nottingham. He previously worked, inter alia, as an associate legal officer at the ICTY, at the Dutch national prosecutor’s office (where he worked on the first genocide case before a Dutch court), and as a legal adviser on IHL at the Netherlands Red Cross. His PhD research at the University of Amsterdam concerns the legal regime applicable to armed conflicts involving non-state actors that take place across borders. He publishes mainly on IHL and ICL. His recent publications address the interplay between these two branches of public international law. He regularly teaches as a guest lecturer at universities and as part of legal trainings for humanitarian workers and military personnel.

ATHANASIOS CHOULIARAS is a postdoctoral researcher at Panteion University of Political and Social Sciences, Greece. After completing his
graduate studies in law (Democritus University of Thrace, Greece), at
postgraduate level he studied criminology (University of Barcelona, Spain), philosophy and sociology of law (both at National and Kapodistrian University of Athens, Greece), and attended various specialisation courses in ICL. He concluded his PhD thesis on the emergence of an international criminal justice system, combining both criminological and criminal law approaches (Democritus University of Thrace, Greece), for which he was awarded a research grant from the Alexander S. Onassis Public Benefit Foundation. He has published various articles in Greek and English on human rights protection, criminology, victimology, and (international) criminal law.

Stephen Smith Cody is a research fellow at the Human Rights Center at the University of California, Berkeley, School of Law, and Visiting Assistant Professor of Law, McGeorge School of Law, University of the Pacific. He is working on a comparative study of victim participation at the ICC in Uganda, Democratic Republic of the Congo, Kenya, and Côte d’Ivoire. He holds a PhD in sociology from the University of California, Berkeley, a JD from Berkeley Law, and an MPhil in social anthropology from Cambridge University.

Shannon Fyfe is currently a PhD student in philosophy at Vanderbilt University, where she previously obtained her JD. Her prior work includes an internship with the ICTR Office of the Prosecutor, and the American Society of International Law’s Arthur C. Helton Fellowship for international human rights law in Tanzania.

Nobuo Hayashi is a Researcher at PluriCourts, University of Oslo Law Faculty, and a Senior Legal Advisor at the International Law and Policy Institute. He specialises in ICL, especially war crimes and modes of liability; IHL, particularly the fundamental principles, conduct of hostilities, and protection of victims; and public international law, including recourse to force (jus ad bellum) and state responsibility. He regularly teaches postgraduate students in law and political science, as well as commissioned officers, military lawyers, judges, prosecutors, defence counsel, diplomats, government officials, humanitarian relief specialists, and NGO representatives. He previously worked, inter alia, at the Peace Research Institute Oslo (PRIO), the Norwegian Centre for Human Rights, and the ICTY Office of the Prosecutor.
LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

BARBORA HOLA works as Assistant Professor at the Department of Criminal Law and Criminology, Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam. She is a fellow at the Center for International Criminal Justice and a member of the steering committee of the European Criminology Group on Atrocity Crimes and Transitional Justice. In 2006, she received her law degree (summa cum laude) at the Faculty of Law, Charles University, Prague. In 2007, she received her LLM in International and European Law at the University of Amsterdam. In 2012, she obtained her PhD in supranational criminology from Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam. In her research, she focuses on issues of transitional justice, in particular (international) criminal trials, sentencing of international crimes, and enforcement of international sentences. In 2013, the Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research awarded her the prestigious VENI grant for a project on vertical (in)consistency of international sentencing.

JAKOB V.H. HOLTERMANN is Associate Professor in jurisprudence at iCourts – Centre of Excellence for International Courts, University of Copenhagen. He holds a PhD in philosophy. He has written extensively on the philosophy of legal science, in particular parallels between Scandinavian legal realism and the ongoing empirical turn in legal scholarship; and the philosophy of ICTs, in particular in the light of challenges from proponents of restorative justice/truth and reconciliation commissions. His current research focuses on the role of truth in legitimisation debates about ICTs, and explores, among other things, the ambiguity among proponents of ICTs with regard to embracing epistemic goals alongside more traditional criminal justice goals such as crime prevention or just deserts.

JESSICA KELDER works as an Education and Research Staff member at the Institute of Political Science at Leiden University. After obtaining her bachelor’s degree in Political Science (Leiden University), she followed the LLM Law and Politics of International Security (Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam) and MSc International Crimes and Criminology (Vrije Universiteit, cum laude). After obtaining her degrees, she worked as a junior researcher for the Center of International Criminal Justice. Her research for the research project on vertical (in)consistency in international sentencing focused on the domestic prosecution of perpetrators of international crimes in Bosnia and Herzegovina and Rwanda. In 2014, she was awarded the Master Thesis Award by the Department of Criminal Law and Criminology of Vrije Universiteit and the Master Thesis Award by the Dutch
Criminology Association (NVC). For this study, she focused on early release procedures of convicts of international criminal tribunals, their rehabilitation, and their return to society.

**Asad Kiyani** is an Assistant Professor in the Faculty of Law, and an Adjunct Professor in the Centre for Transitional Justice and Post-Conflict Reconciliation, at the University of Western Ontario. He earned his PhD in Law at the University of British Columbia, where his doctoral work considered the theoretical foundations of international criminal law from the combined perspective of postcolonial theory and criminal law philosophy. That research was supported by a Vanier Canada Graduate Scholarship (Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada) and a Four-Year Fellowship (UBC), and led to the award of the Charles Bourne Scholarship in International Law and the Dean of Law PhD Prize. Asad is an alumnus of the Liu Institute for Global Issues, and in 2014–2015 was a visiting researcher at the Nathanson Centre for Transnational Human Rights, Crime and Security, and the Institute for Feminist Legal Studies (Osgoode Hall). He received his LLB from Osgoode Hall (Toronto), and his LLM (First Class) from Cambridge in 2008. Asad’s research focuses on critical legal theory, legal pluralism, domestic and transnational criminal law, and the legitimacy of international tribunals.

**Silje Aambø Langvatn** is a postdoctoral fellow in political philosophy at the PluriCourts Centre of Excellence – Centre for the Study of the Legitimate Roles of the International Judiciary, University of Oslo. She has a PhD in political philosophy, University of Bergen (2013), and has been a Visiting Fellow at the Government Department, Harvard University (2009) and a Law and Philosophy Fellow at Yale Law School (fall 2016). The focus of her current research is on conceptions of ‘legitimacy’, and how legitimacy is distinct from, but also connected to ideas such as morality, justice, legality, and social acceptance. In particular, she discusses legitimacy in relation to international courts, and whether ideas of public justification and public reason can supplement the current dominant conceptions of legitimacy for this type of entity.

**Kjersti Lohne** is a PhD Research Fellow at the University of Oslo, where she works at the Department of Criminology and Sociology of Law. Her primary research focuses on the relationship between humanitarian and penal governance, and specifically the role of NGOs
vis-à-vis the ICC. She has also published on sexual violence in armed conflicts, privacy and data protection, and the implications of drones for humanitarian action. She has been a visiting researcher at the Centre for Criminology at the University of Oxford and the Center for International Criminal Justice at Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam, and is a member of the Research School in Peace and Conflict at PRIO.

Dorothy Makaza is a DAAD scholar who is currently pursuing her PhD in international law at the University of Hamburg, Germany. She also holds a master’s degree in Human Rights and Conflict Management from Scuola Superiore Sant’ Anna in Italy, as well as a bachelor’s degree in law (LLB) from the University of Fort Hare in South Africa. She previously interned for various international organisations, including Amnesty for Women and the German Institute of Global and Area Studies (Institute for African Affairs).

Larry May is the W. Alton Jones Professor of Philosophy, Professor of Law, and Professor of Political Science, at Vanderbilt University. He has published thirteen authored books in political philosophy and ICL. His most recent books are Global Justice and Due Process (Cambridge University Press 2011), After War Ends (Cambridge University Press 2012), Limiting Leviathan: Hobbes on Law and International Affairs (2013), and Proportionality in International Law with Michael Newton (2014).

Joanna Nicholson is a researcher at PluriCourts at the Faculty of Law, University of Oslo, specialising in the fields of ICL and IHL. Her PhD thesis was written at the Norwegian Centre for Human Rights and is entitled Fighters as Victims in International Criminal Law. She received her LLB from the University of Glasgow and holds an LLM from the University of Oslo in Public International Law. Prior to this she spent a number of years working as a lawyer in private practice and as a public prosecutor in the Scottish courts.

Victor Peskin’s scholarship focuses on the politics of ICTs and the contentious relationships between these tribunals and states complicit in violations of IHL. He is currently a tenured Associate Professor in the School of Politics and Global Studies at Arizona State University. He is the author of International Justice in Rwanda and the Balkans: Virtual Trials and the Struggle for State Cooperation. The book was selected as a
Choice Outstanding Academic Title. His journal articles have been published in *Human Rights Quarterly*, the *Journal of International Criminal Justice*, the *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, and *Genocide Studies and Prevention*. Peskin, who spent a recent sabbatical year at The Hebrew University Faculty of Law, is currently working on a project that examines the politics of a potential ICC investigation in the context of the Israeli–Palestinian conflict.

**Damien Rogers** lectures within the Politics Programme at Massey University, New Zealand, and is reading towards a PhD degree in law at the University of Waikato. His thesis is provisionally entitled *Chief Among the Angels: International Prosecutors of Atrocity Crime and the Modernist Project*. He is author of *Postinternationalism and Small Arms Control: Theory, Politics, Security* (2009), and holds a PhD degree in Political Science and International Relations from the Australian National University, and postgraduate degrees from the University of Canterbury and Victoria University of Wellington. Before entering academia, he spent nearly a decade working within New Zealand’s intelligence community, including at the Government Communications Security Bureau, Ministry of Defence, New Zealand Defence Force, and the Border Security Group of Immigration New Zealand.

**Theresa Squatrito** is a political science postdoctoral research fellow at the PluriCourts Center of Excellence. Before joining the PluriCourts Center at the University of Oslo, she was a postdoctoral research fellow at Stockholm University. She received her PhD from the University of Washington, Seattle, in political science. She is an author of *The Opening Up of International Organizations* (Cambridge University Press 2013). She has also published articles in the *Review of International Studies*, *International Organization, Review of International Organizations*, and the *Journal of Human Rights*, among others. Her research explores international law and international organisations, focusing on institutional design, legitimacy, and civil society.

**Ignaz Stegmiller** studied law at the Justus Liebig University of Giessen, the Humboldt University of Berlin, and the University of X Nanterre, Paris. He graduated in 2005, and holds a law degree (first state exam). During his PhD research period with Professor Kai Ambos at the Georg August University of Goettingen, he also spent three months in The Hague at the ICC, and one semester at Yale University. In December
2009, he earned his Doctor juris from the Georg August University of Goettingen (summa cum laude). His research topic was ‘The Pre-Investigation Stage of the International Criminal Court – Criteria for Situation Selection’. From 2011 to 2012, he worked as a Technical Advisor of GIZ/CPS for the Cambodian Human Rights Action Committee (CHRAC) in Cambodia. Since December 2012, he has been working as Coordinator for International Programs of the Faculty of Law at the Franz von Liszt Institute for International and Comparative Law, Department for Public Law, International Law and European Union Law.

**Mistale Taylor** is a PhD candidate at Utrecht University, and a Counsel at the pro bono law firm PILPG. Her PhD research focuses on the EU’s obligations under international human rights law to protect its citizens’ fundamental right to data protection extraterritorially in view of demarcations on exercising jurisdiction under public international law. For PILPG, she conducts research into various areas of ICL and human rights law to provide pro bono legal advice for states, governments, and NGOs in conflict or post-conflict situations.

**Sergey Vasiliev** is an Assistant Professor at the Grotius Centre for International Legal Studies, Faculty of Law, Leiden University. He was previously a postdoctoral researcher and lecturer at the law schools of Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam (2012–15) and the University of Amsterdam (2006–12). In 2009–12, he served in several capacities in the International Expert Framework on International Criminal Procedure, including the editorship of *International Criminal Procedure: Principles and Rules* (Oxford University Press, 2013). Vasiliev holds a PhD from the University of Amsterdam and an LL.M. from Maastricht University. He is the co-editor and author of a number of publications in international and comparative criminal law, and the member of the editorial board of the *Leiden Journal of International Law*.

**Timothy William Waters** is Professor of Law and Associate Director of the Center for Constitutional Democracy, Indiana University Maurer School of Law. His interests include formation of states, ethnic conflict, and transitional justice. He is editor of *The Milošević Trial – An Autopsy* (2013). His current research involves devising an effective right of secession. He has taught at Boston University, University of Mississippi, Bard College, and Central European University, and worked for the OSCE in Bosnia, OSI, and the ICTY. His academic qualifications/positions
LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS


JORIS VAN WIJK is Associate Professor of Criminology at Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam. He is executive director of the Center for International Criminal Justice, and director of the master’s programme in International Crimes and Criminology. Additionally, he is one of the conveners of the ESC Research Group on Atrocity Crimes, and a board member of the Dutch Society of Criminology. In 2011, he was a visiting professional at the ICC Office of the Prosecutor. In 2013, he was a visiting scholar at the University of Oslo. His research focuses on international criminal justice, in particular on the consequences of the application of Article 1F of the Refugee Convention, and the lives of perpetrators after being acquitted or convicted by international tribunals.

MARTIN WÄHLISCH serves as Political Affairs Officer in the Office of the Special Coordinator for Lebanon (UNSCOL). He is an Affiliated Scholar at the Issam Fares Institute for Public Policy and International Affairs (American University of Beirut), and Lecturer at the Center for Peace Mediation and the Institute for Conflict Management (European University Viadrina). Prior to joining the United Nations, he has worked as a legal adviser for the Berghof Foundation in national dialogue support programmes (Lebanon, Yemen), the German Foreign Office (Special Task Force Afghanistan, German Embassy Kosovo), and non-governmental organizations (Russia, Kosovo). He holds a PhD (Dr. jur.) in public international law from the Humboldt University of Berlin.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book was conceived at a conference titled ‘The Legitimacy and Effectiveness of International Criminal Tribunals Conference’, hosted in Oslo, 28–29 August 2014, by PluriCourts, Centre for the Study of the Legitimate Roles of the Judiciary in the Global Order, a Centre of Excellence project at the University of Oslo Law Faculty. We appreciate the support provided by PluriCourts for this project. We offer our deepest thanks to our dear friend and colleague Joanna Nicholson, PluriCourts Researcher, for her thorough assistance with the final editing process. Finally, we are grateful to Elizabeth Spicer, Communications Editor at Cambridge University Press, for her commitment to this publication.

xviii
ABBREVIATIONS

ACJHPR  African Court of Justice, Human and Peoples, Rights
ACJHR  African Court of Justice and Human Rights
AMIS  African Union Mission in Sudan
ASP  Assembly of States Parties
AU  African Union
CERA  Conditional Early Release Agreement
CHRAC  Cambodian Human Rights Action Committee
CICC  Coalition for the International Criminal Court
DAAD  Deutscher Akademischer Austausch Dienst
DCC  Document Containing the Charges
DRC  Democratic Republic of the Congo
ECCC  Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia
HRC  Human Rights Center
ICC  International Criminal Court
ICCPR  International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICL  International criminal law
ICRC  International Committee of the Red Cross
ICT  International criminal tribunal
ICTR  International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY  International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
IDP  Internally-displaced persons
IHL  International humanitarian law
IMT  International Military Tribunal
IMTFE  International Military Tribunal for the Far East
IPS  International Prosecution Section
LRA  Lord’s Resistance Army
MICT  Mechanism for International Criminal Tribunals
NGO  Non-governmental organisations
OPCV  Office of Public Counsel for Victims
OTP  Office of the Prosecutor
PILPG  Public International Law and Policy Group
PRIO  Peace Research Institute Oslo
PTS  Political Terror Scale

xix
XX LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

RPE  Rules of Procedure and Evidence
RPF  Rwandan Patriotic Front
RSCSL Residual Special Court for Sierra Leone
RtoP Responsibility to protect
SADC Southern African Development Community
SCSL Special Court for Sierra Leone
STL Special Tribunal for Lebanon
UN United Nations
UNDP UN Development Programme
UNIIIC United Nations International Independent Investigation Commission
UNSC UN Security Council
UPDF Ugandan Peoples Defence Forces
US United States
VPRS Victim Participation and Reparations Section