

INDEX

accession, to WTO, 82-3 domestic regulation under, 261-71 ACTA. See Anti-Counterfeiting Trade in EC - Trademarks and Geographical Indications, 262, 263-4 Agreement African Group, 78 GATT 1994 and, 262 scope of, 261-2 Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization (WTO trade law and, 406-7 trade restrictions under, 269 Agreement) Article II:3, 421 TRIPS Agreement and Article IV:5, 29 assessment relevance of, 265-71 Article IX:2, 186-90 conflicts between, 267, 286-7 Article X:3, 200 conformity assessment procedures Article XII:1, 83 in, 264-5 explanatory notes to, 205 standards in, 271 general interpretative note to Annex overlap between, 262-5 1A of, 31 Agreement on Textiles and preamble, 424 Clothing, 41 single undertaking and, 403, 418, 420 Agreement on the Application of Sanitary and Phytosanitary three pillar structure for, 29-31 TRIPS integration within, 28-37 Measures (SPS Agreement), Agreement on Preshipment 261, 406-7 Inspection, 279 Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects Agreement on Subsidies and of Intellectual Property Countervailing Measures Rights (TRIPS Agreement). See also Berne Convention (SCM Agreement), 272-6 Article 1.1(a)(1), 272 for the Protection of Literary Article 5-7, 273 and Artistic Works; dispute Article 8.2(a), 272 prevention; dispute settle-Article 9, 272 ment, under TRIPS; Dispute Article 31, 272 Settlement Understanding; DSB recommendations, 275-6 General Agreement on financial incentives under, 275 Tariffs and Trade; non-violation complaints; Paris government contracts under, 274-5 IPRs under, 274-5 Convention for the research and development subsidies Protection of Industrial under, 273-5 Property; TRIPS Council Agreement on Technical Barriers to Anti-Dumping Agreement and, Trade (TBT Agreement), 276 - 7177, 186–90, 192, 212 arbitrations on suspension of Article 2.2, 266-7 obligations under, by title, Article 5.1, 266 xxxvii



Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-14468-2 - WTO Dispute Settlement and the Trips Agreement: Applying Intellectual Property Standards in a Trade Law Framework Matthew Kennedy Index More information

> Agreement on TRIPS (cont.) Article 1.1, 111, 121-2, 153-4, 159, 179 Article 2.1, 195

Article 2.2, 196-7 Article 3, 101, 171-2 Article 3.1, 207-8 Article 3.2, 211-12

Article 4, 101, 207-8 Article 5, 101, 211–12 Article 6, 236, 243, 370 Article 7, 146, 162, 175, 176

Article 8, 146, 176–7, 216–17, 368–70 Article 9.1, 114, 194-5

Article 13, 115, 116, 130, 143, 195, 223 Article 15.1, 178

Article 16.1, 165-6 Article 17, 94-5, 115-16, 143, 183-4

Article 20, 277-8 Article 22.1, 178 Article 22.2, 109-11 Article 23.1, 267-8 Article 23.4, 127, 178

Article 24.1, 100-1 Article 24.3, 94-5 Article 24.5, 94-5

Article 27.1, 165-6, 216-17

Article 27.2, 217-18 Article 27.3(b), 163-4 Article 28.1, 143-4

Article 30, 115-16, 143, 189

Article 31, 244

Article 31(f), 79–80, 185–6, 249 Article 31(h), 79-80, 185-6

Article 33, 122-3, 164

Article 39, 101

Article 39.3, 178, 217-18

Article 41.1, 240 Article 41.2, 240

Article 42-48, 123, 139

Article 49, 284 Article 50, 123

Article 50.8, 284 Article 51-61, 114

Article 52-57, 214

Article 59, 110, 170, 172–3 Article 61, 161

INDEX

Article 62, 164 Article 63, 73-4, 213 Article 63.1, 149, 212-13

Article 63.2, 212-13

Article 63.3, 73, 74, 128, 149, 212-13

Article 64, 355, 363 Article 64.2, 33-4, 376 Article 64.3, 33-4, 376

Article 65, 75 Article 65.3, 99-100 Article 65.4, 88 Article 66.2, 275 Article 67, 80

Article 68, 74 Article 69, 215 Article 70, 190 Article 70.2, 176

Article 70.8(a), 139, 160-1

Article 70.9, 160-1 Article 71.2, 200 Article 73, 212-13

'as applied' claims under, 128-32 'as such' claims under, 116

basic principles of, 119-21 border enforcement measures in,

214, 241, 287

challengeable measures, 116-32 'as applied', 128-32

'as such', 116

basic principles of TRIPS and, 119 - 21

discretionary measures, 117-25

enforcement obligations and, 123 - 5

after exhaustion of local remedies, 125 - 32

for individual IPRs, 125-32 mandatory/discretionary

distinction in, 118 minimum standards of protection and, 121-3

nationality of claims, 129-30 compulsory licensing under, 239,

243-9, 266-7 conflicts

> with GATT 1994, 231, 246, 249-52, 287, 406



INDEX 437

between retaliation and WIPO conventions, 322, 324-6 with TBT Agreement, 266-7 dispute settlement before, 3-18 disputes under, by title, xxxiv-xxxvi Doha Declaration on, 78-80 DSU integration of, 28-37 enforcement, domestic, 123-5 expertise, 393-5 export restrictions in, 241-2, 244, 249 freedom of transit and, 255-7 FTAs under, 96 functions of, 1 future implications for, 415 GATS and, overlap with, 282 GATT 1994 and, overlap with, 227 - 31historical development of, 1-3 IGOs and, coordination with, 425-7 institutional linkage with GATT, 205 - 6interpretation of IPR provisions in, 397-9 mandatory/discretionary distinction in, 118, 120 MFN treatment under, 210-11 minimum standards agreement for, implementation of, 391–3 national treatment under, 171-2, 207-8, 209 non-derogation clause in, 196-7 non-violation complaints under, 359-62, 367-76, 412-14 application of any measure, 367 - 70moratorium on, 376 nullification or impairment of agreements, 370-4 remedies for, 374-5 Paragraph 6 System and, 177-8, 186, 213, 231, 249, 253-5, 260, 268 preamble first recital, 206, 227-8, 269, 360 second recital, 3-4, 208 third recital, 213-16 fourth recital, 128 fifth recital, 182-4

seventh recital, 3-4, 8-9 eighth recital, 426 private rights and, 125, 144, 180-1, 218-20, 309-12, 402 retaliation under, 317-33 estoppel, 326-7 on IPRs, 327-33 obligations that DSB can suspend, 318 - 21treaty conflict resolutions, 324-6 WIPO obligations, 321-7 WTO provisions, 322-4 SCM Agreement and, 272-6 special and differential treatment, 242-3, 253, 418-19 TBT Agreement and assessment relevance of, 265-71 conflicts with TRIPS, 267, 286-7 conformity assessment procedures in, 264-5 standards in, 271 overlap with, 262-5 technology transfer requirements and, 275, 277-8 TFA and, 41, 260, 279-80 trade law in, 225, 400-3 Trade Policy Review Mechanism and, 81-2 trade-related issues under, 424-5 treaty interpretation and, 158-92 balance, 175-6 certainty as factor in, 181 context as element in, 169-79 deference in, 159-62 effectiveness principle in, 173-4 general rule, 162-3 international law as influence on, 189 object and purpose of treaty, 179 - 84objectives and principles of intellectual property, 175-9 ordinary meaning of terms, 163-9 subsequent documents, 186-90 supplementary means of, 190-2 territoriality principle, 177-8 use of authentic elements outside treaty text, 184-90



> 438 INDEX Agreement on TRIPS (cont.) Australia - Ammonium Sulphate, 371 unilateral redress and, 8-18, 43, Australia - Tobacco Plain Packaging, 86-8, 388-90 46, 102, 131 WTO framework integration in, 28 - 37balance-of-payment import Agreement on Trade-Related restrictions, 258-9 Beijing Treaty on Audiovisual **Investment Measures** (TRIMS Agreement), 277-8 Performances, 102 technology transfer requirements, Berne Convention for the Protection of 277 - 8Literary and Artistic Works Andean Trade Preference Act (ATPA), Appendix, 243, 244 15, 90 Article IV, 263, 267 compulsory licensing scheme Anti-Counterfeiting Trade Agreement (ACTA), 103 under, 267 Anti-Dumping Agreement, 159, 161, Article 5(1), 114, 327 167, 276-7 Article 9(2), 248 IPR law and, 277 Article 11, 194-5 Antigua and Barbuda Article 13(3), 248 in arbitration on suspension of Article 17, 183-4 TRIPS obligations, xxxvii Article 20, 197, 325 countermeasures on IPRs, 328 dispute settlement mechanisms under, 5 Appellate Body export prohibitions in, 243-4 composition of appellate divisions, 60-2 minor exceptions under, 115, 185 de novo review, 139, 140 national treatment exceptions, expertise, 23, 61 171 - 2fact/law distinction, 136-8 retroactive protection, 293-4 in Canada - Patent Term, 122-3, retaliation measures under, 322-3 164, 219 special agreements under, 324-5 in India - Patents (US), 108, 137, US accession to, 6 139, 160, 353 Vienna Convention on the Law of in Uruguay Round negotiations, 34 Treaties and, 194 in US – Section 211 Appropriations bilateral investment treaties (BITs), Act, 119-20, 123, 137, 101 - 2139-41, 163-4, 171, 174, 181, bilateral wine and spirits agreements, 195, 210-11 100 - 1Argentina BITs. See bilateral investment treaties GSP for, US withdrawal of benefits border enforcement, 214, 241-2, 287 from, 87 Brazil. See also US – Import Restrictions in Section 301 investigation, 10-11 on Certain Products from in TRIPS disputes, xxxiv-xxxvi Brazil 'as such' claims. See challengeable in arbitration on suspension of TRIPS obligations, xxxvii measures ATPA. See Andean Trade countermeasures on IPRs, 328 Preference Act in GSP country practice reviews, 90 Australia in Section 301 investigations, 11, Special 301 and, 13 14, 70

in TRIPS disputes, xxxiv-xxxvi

Special 301 and, 12-13, 14



INDEX 439

in TBR investigation, 93 in TRIPS disputes, xxxiv-xxxvi, in, 397 53-4 Brussels Draft, 18-19, 22, 323 391 - 2Budweiser, 48, 295 Bulgaria, Special 301 and, 99-100 burden of proof, in dispute settlement, outcome of, 65 141 - 7panelists for, 59 in Canada - Pharmaceutical Patents. 143-4, 146 in US - Clove Cigarettes, 146-7 in US - Section 110(5) Copyright Act, 143 - 4in US - Wool Shirts and Blouses, trade law in, 402 142_3 Canada in TBR investigations, 93-4, 101 in TRIPS disputes, xxxiv-xxxvi, 53 - 4Canada - Patent Term, xxxiv-xxxvi, 46, 48-9, 55, 70 'as such', 116 compliance measures in, 290, 293, 295 119-21 dispute prevention and, 76-7 exclusive rights, duration of, 114 FTAs and, 100 GATT jurisprudence in, 222–3 minimum standards agreement and, 118 and, 392 minimum standards of protection in, 122 - 3ordinary meaning of terms, 165-6 summary of, 428 trade law in, 402 Aviation Zoloft and, 48-9, 293 Canada - Pharmaceutical Patents, xxxiv-xxxvi, 46 burden of proof in, 143-4, 146 compliance measures in, 290 conformity assessment procedures 57, 59, 70 in, 265

interpretation of IPR provisions minimum standards agreement and, object and purpose of TRIPS, 181 ordinary meaning of terms, 168-9 patent laws in, 188 public policy considerations, 183 standard of review in, 135 summary of, 428-9 terms of reference in, 115, 391-2 Caribbean Basin Economic Recovery Act (CBERA), 14-15, 88, 90 causes of disputes. See dispute settlement, under TRIPS Chairman's statement, 186 challengeable measures, 116-32 'as applied', 128-32 basic principles of TRIPS and, discretionary, 117-25 enforcement obligations and, 123-5 for individual IPRs, 125-32 mandatory/discretionary distinction minimum standards of protection and, 121-3 nationality of claims, 129-30 Chicago Convention. See Convention on International Civil China. See also specific cases in Section 301 investigations, 13, 14 Special 301 and, 12-13, 14, 89 in TRIPS disputes, xxxiv-xxxvi, 47-52 China – Intellectual Property Rights, 46, accession commitments in, 83 compliance measures in, 290 context as element in, 170 copyright denial in, 114, 135 criminal procedures in, 85, 100, 161 customs procedures in, 65, 110

dispute prevention and, 73, 74, 77

dispute prevention and, 76

evidence of domestic law in,

149-50, 152

effectiveness principle and, 174

exceptions to exclusive rights in,

115-16, 391-2



440 INDEX

China – Intellectual Property (cont.) WIPO obligations and, 322-7 evidence of domestic law in, 152 cross-retaliation exclusive rights, denial of, 114 principles of, 335-6 FTAs and, 100 under Section 301, 2, 11 mandatory/discretionary distinction in TRIPS disputes, 333-49, 410-12 in, 123-4 under TRIPS in goods and services minimum standards agreement disputes, 71, 336 and, 393 contingent authorization of, object and purpose of TRIPS, 180-1 337 - 45ordinary meaning of terms, 168-9 by developing countries, 329–32, outcome of, 65 345 - 9threshold level in, 338-42 public policy objectives, 183-4 standard of review in, 135-6 in Uruguay Round negotiations, 27, summary of, 429-30 29 - 30wrong measures in, 110 Cuba, in TRIPS disputes, 54, 315-16 Codex standards, 269-70 customs procedures. See also border compensation, 298-9 enforcement compliance measures, 63-7 Agreement on Preshipment after DSB recommendation Inspection, 260, 279 in Canada - Patent Term, 290, TFA, 41, 260, 279-80 293, 295 Customs Valuation Agreement, 278-80 in Canada - Pharmaceutical Patents, 290, 296-7 deference in China - Intellectual Property in assessment of facts, 134 Rights, 290, 297-8 in treaty interpretation, 159-62 in EC - Trademarks and Denmark, in TRIPS disputes, Geographical Indications, xxxiv-xxxvi, 314 290, 294, 295, 296-8 developing countries in *India – Patents (EC)*, 290, 292 cross-retaliation under TRIPS by, in India - Patents (US), 295 329-32, 345-9 lack of special and differential treatment for. in US - Section 110(5) Copyright 45, 242-3, 253, 417-21 technical cooperation for, 80 Act, 290-1, 298-300 in US - Section 211 Appropriations under TFA, 419-20 Act, 290-1 in TRIPS disputes, 45, 46, 417-21 compulsory licensing in Uruguay Round negotiations, 8, under Berne Appendix, 243-4, 267 25-6, 27GATT 1994 and, 243-7 discretionary measures. See mandaunder Paragraph 6 System, 247-9 tory/discretionary distinction TBT Agreement and, 267-8 dispute prevention, 72-83 under TRIPS, 239, 243-7, 249, 266-7 African Group and, 78 conflicts. See treaties Canada - Pharmaceutical Patents, Convention on International Civil 74, 76 Aviation, 189 Canada - Patent Term, 76-7 countermeasures on IPRs China - Intellectual Property Rights, form of, 327-33 73, 74, 77 obligations that DSB can suspend, Doha Declaration and, 78-80 318 - 21EC – Pharmaceuticals, 77



INDEX 441

EC – Trademarks and Geographical	in FTAs, 99-100
Indications, 77	GATT basic principles, 207-13
technical cooperation and, 80-1	and avoidance of trade barriers,
with Trade Policy Review	213–16
Mechanism, 81–2	and conditions of competition
transparency as, 72-4	between products, 221–3
TRIPS Council reviews of	and IPR protection, 216-24
legislation, 74–8	non-discrimination, 207–12
US - Patents Code, 77	and public policy objectives,
US – Section 110(5) Copyright	223-4
Act, 76–7	transparency, 212–13
US – Section 211 Appropriations	GATT dispute settlement
Act, 73-4	mechanism, 18–28
US – Section 337 – II, 77	procedural effectiveness of, 24–8
dispute settlement, under TRIPS.	through trade sanctions, 25–6, 27
See also Dispute Settlement	for intellectual property, 1–2
Understanding; evidence;	interpretation of IPR provisions in,
non-violation complaints	397–9
alternative mechanisms proposed,	multilateral procedures, 6-8, 41-72
18–19, 21–3, 27	as channel for Section 301
Berne Convention and, 5	procedures, 44–5, 84–5
challengeable measures in, 116–32	differences from unilateral
'as applied', 128–32	procedures, 84–5
'as such', 116	non-compliance, 66-7, 290-1
basic principles of TRIPS and,	objectives of, 3–4, 385–90
119–21	outcomes as result of, 63–7
discretionary, 117-25	panelists as part of, 58-60
enforcement obligations and,	participation in, 42–7
123-5	performance indicators in, 62–70
for individual IPRs, 125-32	Paris Convention and, 4–5
mandatory/discretionary	as proportion of WTO
distinction and, 118	disputes, 41–2
minimum standards of protection	reduction of tensions, 83–103
and, 121-3	through bilateral agreements,
nationality of claims, 129-30	96-103
complainants in, 43-5, 47-54	through multilateral channel for
compliance measures in, 63-7	Section 301 procedures,
after DSB recommendation, 290,	44, 84–5
293, 295	in EU cases, 92-6
developing countries, 45, 417-21	in US cases, 84-92
development of, 2	respondents in, 45
DSB recommendations for, 66	retaliation, 71–2
effective and expeditious procedures	scope of, 41
for, 385–8	Section 301 and, 83
EU and, 43-5, 52-3	sources of disputes, 54-7
evidence in, 141-55	domestic law disagreements, 56
burden of proof for, 141–7	treaty interpretation
forms of, 147–55	disagreements, 54–5
	-



> 442 INDEX dispute settlement (cont.) Article 16.4, 27-8 Special 301 and, 47-9 Article 17, 115 standard of review and proof in, Article 17.3, 23 395 - 7Article 17.6, 23 terms of reference for, 107-16 Article 17.13, 136 and exceptions to exclusive rights, Article 17.14, 27-8 115 - 16Article 19.1, 111 and claims in general, 114-15 Article 21.3, 27-8, 62 and unidentified measures, Article 21.5, 35, 111 107 - 13Article 22.2, 111, 375 and unspecified legal bases of Article 22.3, 27–8, 29, 301, 318, complaints, 113-16 319-21, 323-4, 334, 375 and wrong measures, 109-11 Article 22.4, 316 Article 22.7, 27-8 third parties in, 45-7 timing of disputes, 67-70 Article 23, 27-8, 92 before TRIPS Agreement, 3-18 Article 26.1, 354, 356, 375 unilateral redress exclusions in, Article 26.2, 377, 378 388-90 Brussels Draft of, 22, 33, 111 US and, 43-5, 47-52 Dunkel Draft of, 23, 31, 33-4, 326 Dispute Settlement Body (DSB), 29, 31 flexibility in, 421-4 jurisdiction of, 42 future applications of, 415-21 international IPR framework, recommendations of, 66-7, 289-98 clarification through findings and addition to, 385-8 conclusions, 296-8 minimum standards agreement non-compliance with, 66-7, 290-1 for, implementation of, prospective effect of, 291-6 391 - 3rate of compliance with, 289-91 procedures for, 390-9 retaliation, authorization of, 300-49 measures in, 111-13 obligations in TRIPS that DSB can multilateral procedures, 6-8, 41-72 for new WTO agreements, 415-21 suspend, 318-21 Dispute Settlement Understanding practices under, 35-7 (DSU). See also non-violation proportion of WTO disputes under TRIPS, 41-2 complaints; remedy provisions, in DSU; retaliation purpose and function of, 103-4 Article 1.1, 41 rules and procedures of, 31-5 Article 3.3, 111 effectiveness of, 63-7, 385-8 Article 3.7, 111 special and additional rules, 31-5 Article 4.2, 111 standard of review under, 133, 395 - 7Article 4.4, 111 Article 6.1, 27–8 TRIPS Agreement integration with, 28 - 37Article 6.2, 107–8, 111, 113 Article 8.1, 22–3 unilateral redress exclusion as part Article 8.2, 22-3 of, 27-8, 388-90 Article 8.7, 27-8 Doha Declaration, 78-80 Article 11, 133 African Group and, 78 HIV/AIDS under, 79 Article 12.8, 70 for LDCs, 79-80 Article 12.9, 70 Article 13, 22-3 legal status, 187-8



INDEX 443

domestic law in Canada - Pharmaceutical Patents, 149-50, 152 in China - Intellectual Property Rights, 152 deference in assessment of, 134 in dispute settlement, under TRIPS 56 in EC - Protection of Trademarks and Geographical Indications, 149-51, 152 forms of evidence of, 148-53 in India - Patents (US), 149-50, 152 SPS Agreement and, 261 TBT agreement and, 261-71 in US - Section 110(5) Copyright Act, 149-50, 152 Dominican Republic in CBERA and GSP country practice reviews, 9-16, 90 Doha Declaration and, 78 TRIPS disputes and, 54 DSU. See Dispute Settlement Understanding Dunkel Draft, 23, 31, 33-4, 326 EC. See European Communities EC and a member state - Seizure of Generic Drugs in Transit, 126, 255 EC - Asbestos, 371-2 EC - Bananas III, 48 cross-retaliation in, 71, 319, 328-9, 330-1, 337-42, 346-7 EC - Citrus, 365-6 EC - Pharmaceuticals, 77 EC - Trademarks and Geographical Indications, xxxiv-xxxvi, 46, 48-9, 59, 61, 70 'as applied' claim, 126 Budweiser and, 48-9, 295 compliance measures in, 290, 294, 295 context as element in, 170 dispute prevention and, 77 effectiveness principle in, 174 evidence of domestic law, 149-51, 152

exceptions to exclusive rights in, 115, 391 - 2interpretation of terms in, 205 minimum standards agreement and, 391 - 2non-discrimination provisions in, 208, 209 non-violation complaints and, 366, 369 ordinary meaning of terms, 165-6 outcome of, 65 public policy objectives, 183-4 standard of review in, 134, 135-6 summary of, 430-1 TBR reports and, 94-5 TBT Agreement and, 262, 263-4, 268 - 9terms of reference in, 115, 391-2 trade law in, 402 wrong measures in, 109-11 **Ecuador** in arbitration on suspension of TRIPS obligations, xxxvii countermeasures on IPRs, 328-9 Special 301 and, 83 EEC. See European Economic Community EEC - Oilseeds I, 371 EEC - Oilseeds II, 371, 372 EFTA. See European Free Trade Association Enabling Clause, 92, 254-5 estoppel, 326-7 EU. See European Union European Free Trade Association (EFTA), 98-9 European Communities (EC). See also European Union; specific cases in arbitration on suspension of TRIPS obligations, xxxvii NCPI and, 9, 16–18 Special 301 and, 13 in TRIPS disputes, xxxiv-xxxvi, 43-5, 52-3 European Union (EU) bilateral wine and spirits agreements, 100 - 1



INDEX

444 European Union (EU) (cont.) with EFTA, 98-9 DSU in, 92-6 with EU, 97-9 FTAs in, 97-9 IPRs in, 96-100 GSP scheme, 17-18 TRIPS and, 96 TBR investigations by, 92-6, 332 with US, 97-9 in TRIPS disputes, 43-5, 52-3 freedom of transit, 255-7, 279-80 unilateral redress investigations in, FTAs. See free trade agreements 388 - 90evidence, 141-55 GATS. See General Agreement on burden of proof and, 141-7 Trade in Services in Canada - Pharmaceutical General Agreement on Tariffs and Patents, 143-4, 146 Trade (GATT 1994), 204-24. in US - Clove Cigarettes, 146-7 See also Dispute Settlement in US - Section 110(5) Copyright Understanding Act, 143-4 Article I:1, 91, 92, 142-3, 207-8 in US - Wool Shirts and Blouses, Article II:1, 142-3 142 - 3Article III, 142-3, 235, 238-41 under DSU, 395-7 Article III.1, 223 forms of, 147-55 Article III:4, 173, 207-8, 209, regarding domestic law, 234-5, 241 148-53 Article III Ad note, 234-5 freedom of method of Article V:3, 257 implementation, 153-4 Article IX:6, 111, 154, 257-8 under TRIPS Agreement, 395-7 Article X:1, 212-13 exhaustion of intellectual property Article XI, 236, 250, 251, 369 rights, 188, 227, 236, 252-3, Article XI:1, 142-3, 145, 234-5, 241, 277, 370, 377-8, 379 243, 247, 249, 285-6 Article XI:2(c)(i), 142-3 exhaustion of local remedies, 125-32 expertise Article XX, 36, 142-3, 145, 211-12, under DSU, 57-62 216-17, 231-8, 369 Article XX(b), 237, 249 in TRIPS disputes, 22–3, 33, 57–9, 61-2,393-5Article XX(d), 232-4, 235, 239-40, export prohibitions and restrictions 243, 245–6, 285–6, 404–5 in Berne Convention, 243-4 Article XX(g), 167, 168 under GATT 1994, 241-52, 287 Article XXI, 212-13 retaliation and, 247-9 Article XXII, 32, 205-6 in TRIPS, 242-4, 249 Article XXIII, 24-5, 32, 112, 205-6, 225 fact/law distinction, in appellate review, Article XXIII:1(b), 259, 354, 356 136 - 8Article XXIII:1(c), 377 Article XXIV, 97–8, 213, 254–5 free trade agreements (FTAs) Article XXVI:5, 205 bilateral incentives in, 105 Canada - Patent Term and, 100 Article XXXIII, 205 China - Intellectual Property Rights balance-of-payments import and, 100 restrictions under, 258-9 DSU and, 100 basic principles of, 119-21 dispute settlement mechanisms in, border enforcement measures and, 241-2, 287 99-100



INDEX 445

compulsory licensing and, 239, 243 - 7dispute settlement mechanism, 18 - 28procedural effectiveness of, 24-8 trade sanctions under, 25-6, 27 Enabling Clause, 92 enforcement of domestic regulation under, 238-41 export prohibitions and restrictions under, 241-52, 287 fair trade preconditions under, 231 - 8freedom of transit under, 255-7 impediment to attainment of objectives under, 379-81 institutional linkage with TRIPS, 205 - 6IPRs under, 19-24 marks of origin under, 257-8 MFN treatment under, 210-11, 252-5, 257-8 Paragraph 6 System and, 253–5, 260 regional exhaustion, 252-3 minimum standards of protection, 121 - 3national treatment under, 229, 234-40, 286 non-violation complaints under, 259, 357-9, 363 situation complaints under, 352-4, 377 - 9TBT Agreement and, 262 with Trade Policy Review Mechanism, 81-2 TRIPS and as complementary agreement, 227-31, 285-6 textual similarities with, 216-18 treaty conflicts with, 231, 246-7, 249-52, 286-7, 406 Uruguay Round, 1-2, 4-5 General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS), 129, 177, 280 - 5Article VI, 283-4 Article XIV, 284, 369

Article XVII, 211, 223 function of, 280-1 market access obligations under, 283 MFN treatment under, 282-3 modes of supply under, 281 national treatment under, 282-3 private rights in, 218-19 retaliation under, 319 territorial scope of, 281 TRIPS and, overlap with, 282 Generalized System of Preferences (GSP) AGOA and, 90 for Argentina, US withdrawal of benefits, 87 ATPA and, 90 CBERA and, 157.10, 157.50country practice reviews, 90 eligibility criteria for, 90-2 EU and, 17-18 for Honduras, US withdrawal of benefits, 88 for India, US withdrawal of benefits, 88 intellectual property under, 14-16 for Mexico, US reduction of benefits, 15 for South Africa, 91 for South Korea, EU withdrawal of benefits, 17-18 for Turkey, 91 US and, 14-16, 90-1 Germany - Sardines, 371 Greece, in TRIPS disputes, xxxiv-xxxvi GSP. See Generalized System of Preferences

Hague Agreement Concerning the
International Registration of
Industrial Designs, 102, 211
Harmonized System, 185
Havana Charter, 424
Havana Club, 67, 126
HIV/AIDS, 79
Honduras
GSP for, US withdrawal of GSP
benefits from, 88

in TRIPS disputes, 54



446 INDEX

IGOs. See intergovernmental organizations India GSP for, US withdrawal of benefits from, 88 in Section 301 investigation, 13 Special 301 and, 12-13, 14 in TRIPS disputes, xxxiv-xxxvi India - Patents (EC), 108-9 compliance measures in, 290, 292 discretionary measure in, 122 minimum standards of protection, 122 summary of, 431-2 India - Patents (US), 109-11 appellate review of, 137, 139 compliance measures in, 290, 292, 295 context as element in, 170 evidence of domestic law in, 149-50, 152 GATT jurisprudence, 221 mandatory/discretionary distinction in, 122 minimum standards agreement and, 391 - 2minimum standards of protection in, 122 non-violation complaints and, 352-4, 365-6 object and purpose of TRIPS in, 180 - 1standard of review in, 134, 135-6 summary of, 431-2 unidentified measures in, 108-9 Indonesia in GSP country practice reviews, 90 in NCPI investigation, 16-17 in TRIPS disputes, xxxiv-xxxvi, 54 Indonesia - Autos, xxxiv-xxxvi, 57, 276, 278, 432 intergovernmental organizations (IGOs), 425-7 International Convention for the Protection of New Varieties of

interpretation. See dispute settlement, under TRIPS; Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties interpretation. See specific treaties; Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties IPIC Treaty. See Treaty on Intellectual Property in Respect of **Integrated Circuits** Ireland, in TRIPS disputes, xxxiv-xxxvi Japan Special 301 and, 12-13 in TRIPS disputes, xxxiv-xxxvi, 44 Japan - Alcoholic Beverages I, 21, 111, 154, 258 Jordan, in NCPI complaint, 16 Korea. See South Korea Korea - Various Measures on Beef,

least-developed countries (LDCs) Doha Declaration and, 79-80 HIV/AIDS in, 79 MFN treatment for, 253-4 technology transfer incentives for, 275 transitional period extensions for, 418 lex posterior principle, 250, 324 lex specialis principle, 250, 251 Lisbon Agreement for the Protection of Appellations of Origin and their International Registration, 102, 198-9 local remedies. See exhaustion of local remedies

36, 181

of False of Deceptive
Indications of Source on
Goods, 192, 211
mandatory/discretionary distinction,
118, 120
in China – Intellectual Property
Rights, 123–4

Madrid Agreement for the Repression

International Court of Justice, 5

Plants (UPOV), 5-6, 171-2



INDEX 447

in India - Patents (US), 122 in US - Section 211 Appropriations Act, 119-20 marks of origin, 257-8 Marrakesh VIP Treaty, 102, 193 measures. See challengeable measures; compliance measures Mexico in GSP review, 15 Special 301 and, 12-13 MFN treatment. See most-favoured nation treatment Mid-Term Review Decision, 3-4, 18 - 19most-favoured nation (MFN) treatment under GATS, 282-3 under GATT 1994, 210-11, 252-5, 257 - 8Paragraph 6 System and, 253-5, 260 regional exhaustion, 252-3 under TRIPS, 207-8, 210-11 national treatment under GATS, 282, 283 under GATT 1994, 229, 234-40, 286 under TRIPS, 171-2, 207-8, 209 NCPI. See New Commercial Policy Instrument negative rights, IPRs as, 176-7, 261, 311, 362 New Commercial Policy Instrument (NCPI) investigations under, 16-17 procedures of, 9, 16-18 TBR as replacement of, 92-6 US - Section 337 and, 16-17 non-discrimination provisions, 207-12 non-violation complaints, 354-76 anti-circumvention of substantive rules, 362-76 EC - Trademarks and Geographical Indications and, 366, 369 under GATT 1994, 259, 357-9, 363 India - Patents (US) and, 353, 365-6 for market access, under tariff concessions, 259, 355-62

role of TRIPS Agreement in, 359-62 Paragraph 6 System and, 370 under TRIPS, 359-62, 367-76, 412-14 application of any measure, 367 - 70Ministerial decisions on, 352, 355, 376 moratorium on, 376 nullification or impairment, 370-4 remedies for, 374-5 Norway - Trondheim Toll Ring, 294 nullification or impairment in non-violation complaints, 370-4 and retaliation measures, 302-17 choice of compliance scenario, 308 - 10economic losses, 302-7 reciprocity in, 315 regarding IPRs, 311-12, 314 method of measurement, 311-14 in US - Section 110(5) Copyright Act, 299-300 in US - Section 211 Appropriations Act, 307

Omnibus Trade and Competitiveness Act of 1988, 12

Pakistan in GSP country practice reviews, 90

in TRIPS disputes, xxxiv-xxxvi panel composition, 22-3, 58-9 Paragraph 6 System Chairman's statement, 186 MFN treatment and, 253-5, 260 non-violation complaints and, 370 restrictions on trade and, 249, 268 in TRIPS, 177-8, 186, 213, 231 Paraguay, in Section 301 investigation, 89 Paris Convention for the Protection of **Industrial Property** Article 1(4), 167 Article 2(1), 195 Article 2(3), 211-12 Article 6 quinquies, 193-4



Paris Convention (cont.)

Article 8, 174

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-14468-2 - WTO Dispute Settlement and the Trips Agreement: Applying Intellectual Property Standards in a Trade Law Framework Matthew Kennedy Index More information

INDEX

Assembly, 4-5 balance-of-payments import Patents, 290, 296-7 restrictions under, 258-9 dispute settlement mechanisms Rights, 290, 297-8 in EC - Trademarks and under, 4-5 effectiveness principle and, 174 Geographical Indications, marks of origin and, 257-8 290, 294, 295, 296-8 national treatment exceptions, 171-2 retaliation measures and, 322-3 in India - Patents (US), 295 special agreements under, 324-5 lack of Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties and, 194 Act, 290-1, 298-300 WIPO and, 5-6 in US - Section 211 Patent Co-operation Treaty (PCT), 211 Appropriations Act, 290-1 Patent Law Treaty, 102 DSB recommendations, 289-98 PCT. See Patent Co-operation Treaty conclusions, 296-8 Portugal, in TRIPS disputes, prospective effect of, 291-6 xxxiv-xxxvi rate of compliance with, 289–91 positive obligations, on intellectual retaliation, 300-49 property, 104, 105, 106, 109, 111 authorization of by DSB, 300-2 priority foreign countries under Special

under GATS, 218–19
under TRIPS, 125, 144, 180–1,
218–20, 309–12, 402
procedural issues. *See also* appellate
review; burden of proof; evidence; challengeable measures; retaliation; standard of review; terms of reference

318–21
cross-retaliation, 3
in goods and se
under TRI
contingent at
337–45
threshold lev
options in, 335-

301, 12, 13, 14, 86-7, 88-90,

99-100

private rights

in agreements, 106–7 principles of, 33 trade law in, 205–6 in TRIPS dispute public health. *See* Doha Declaration 410–12 Punta del Este Declaration, 54, 206, 228 for developing control of the public health.

remedy provisions, in DSU. See also exhaustion of local remedies; compensation; cross-retaliation; DSB recommendations; retaliation compensation, 298–300

compliance measures, 63–4 after DSB recommendation

293, 295 in Canada - Pharmaceutical in China – Intellectual Property in *India – Patents (EC)*, 290, 292 in US – Section 110(5) Copyright clarification through findings and Berne Convention and, 322-3 countermeasures on IPRs as form of, 327-33 obligations that DSB can suspend, 318 - 21cross-retaliation, 333-49, 410-12 in goods and services disputes under TRIPS, 342-5 contingent authorization of, threshold level in, 338-42 options in, 335-6 principles of, 334-7 in TRIPS disputes, 333-49, for developing countries, 345–9 in EC - Bananas III, 71, 319, 328-9, 330-1, 337-42, 346-7 under GATS, 319 level of nullification or impairment in, 302-17 through choice of compliance, 308 - 10through economic losses,

302 - 7

in Canada - Patent Term, 290,



INDEX 449

for industrial property rights, 314 for IPRs, 311-12 material reciprocity in, 315 method of measurement, 311-14 reciprocal treatment, 315-17 obligations that DSB can suspend, 350 - 1Paris Convention and, 322-3 purpose of, 300 reciprocity, 315 Rome Convention and, 322-3 rules and procedures for, 301 trade sanctions as under DSU, 27-8, 29-31, 301 under GATT 1994, 25-6, 27 under Section 301, 11 in WIPO, lack of, 7-8, 27 in US - Gambling, 71, 310, 328, 331, 338, 347 in US - Import Restrictions on Certain Products from Brazil, 11, 12, 26, 29, 349 in US - Section 110(5) Copyright Act, 304-5, 308-10, 320, 332 in US - Section 211 Appropriations Act, 307 in US - Upland Cotton, 71, 328, 331, 337-42, 343, 347-9 retroactivity application of TRIPS Agreement and, 189-90 Berne Convention and, 293-4 copyright and related right protection under TRIPS and, 293 - 4DSB recommendations and, 291-3 Rome Convention national treatment exceptions, 171-2 retaliation measures under, 322–3 special agreements under, 324-5 WIPO and, 5-6 SCM Agreement. See Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures Section 301, of Trade Act of 1974,

Brazil exports sanctions under, 11-12,70as driver of dispute settlement under TRIPS, 48 IPR investigations under, 11, 48-9 NCPI modeled after, 16-18 Omnibus Trade and Competitiveness Act of 1988 and, 12 purpose of, 10-11 Special 301 and, 12, 13 Trade and Tariff Act of 1984 and, 10 - 11trade sanctions under, 11 USTR and, 9-14 US - Section 301 Trade Act panel report, 86 single undertaking, 402-3, 417-21 situation complaints, 352-4, 377-9, 412-14. See also non-violation complaints Sonny Bono Copyright Term Extension Act, 315 South Africa Doha Declaration and, 78 GSP eligibility for, 91 South Korea bilateral agreement with United States, 10-11, 17-18, 210-11 in Section 301 investigation, 10-11 Special 301 and, 12-13, 70 in TBR investigation, 95 WIPO Treaty and, 8 withdrawal of GSP benefits for, 17-18 Special 301, 12, 13, 48-9, 83, 88-90 priority foreign countries, 13, 14, 88-9 priority watch list, 12-14, 70, 89-90 special and differential treatment, 45, 243, 253-4, 417-21 SPS Agreement. See Agreement on the Application of Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures standard of review, 132-41 in Canada - Pharmaceutical Patents, 135 in China - Intellectual Property Rights, 135-6

9-16

amendment of, 86



Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-14468-2 - WTO Dispute Settlement and the Trips Agreement: Applying Intellectual Property Standards in a Trade Law Framework Matthew Kennedy Index More information

INDEX

standard of review (cont.) border enforcement measures in, 287 in EC -Trademarks and developing countries under, 419-20 Geographical Indications, trade law, IPRs under, 400-10 134, 135-6 in Canada - Pharmaceutical in India - Patents (US), 134, 135-6 Patents, 402 standards in Canada - Patent Term, 402 in EC - Trademarks and geographical indications and, 269-71 patents and, 271 Geographical Indications, 402 GATT 1994 and, 404-5 Sweden, in TRIPS disputes, in procedural issues, 205-6 xxxiv-xxxvi, 314 Switzerland, in TRIPS disputes, 44 sanctions under, 407-10 SPS Agreement and, 406-7 Taiwan TBT Agreement and, 406-7 in TRIPS text, 400-3 in Section 301 investigation, 14 Special 301 and, 12-13, 14 in US - Section 110(5) Copyright Act, in TBR investigation, 95-6 402-3, 408-9 in US – Section 211 Appropriations TBR. See Trade Barriers Regulation TBT Agreement. See Agreement on Act, 400-1Technical Barriers to Trade trade name protection, 171, 174, 319-20 technical cooperation, 80 Trade Policy Review Mechanism, terms of reference for panels, 107-16 81 - 2exceptions to exclusive rights and, trade sanctions 115-16 under DSU, 27-8, 29-31, 301 claims in general and, 114-15 under GATT 1994, 25-6, 27 unidentified measures and, 107-13 under Section 301, 11 unspecified legal bases of complaints in WIPO, lack of, 7-8, 27 and, 113-16 traditional expressions, 270 wrong measures and, 109-11 treaties. See also specific treaties; Vienna territoriality, 177-8 Convention on the Law of Thailand **Treaties** conflicts, 56, 218-20, 246-7 in NCPI investigation, 17 in Section 301 investigations, 13 **GATT 1994** Special 301 and, 12-13, 14 and TRIPS, 231, 246-7, 249-52, in TBR investigation, 95 286-7, 406 Trade Act of 1974. See Section 301; retaliation under TRIPS and WIPO Special 301 conventions, 322, 324-6 Trade and Tariff Act of 1984 TBT Agreement and TRIPS, 267, GSP renewal under, 14-16 286 - 7Section 301 amendment in, 10-11 Treaty on Intellectual Property in Trade Barriers Regulation (TBR) Respect of Integrated Circuits EC - Trademarks and Geographical (IPIC), 6-8, 171-2, 207, 211-12 Indications and, 94-5 investigations under, 92-6, 332 TRIMS Agreement. See Agreement on procedures of, 92-6 Trade-Related Investment US – Section 110(5) Copyright Act Measures and, 93 TRIPS Agreement. See Agreement on Trade Facilitation Agreement (TFA), Trade-Related Aspects of 41, 279-80 **Intellectual Property Rights**



INDEX 451

TRIPS Council, 60, 103 development of, 29 dispute prevention and, 73-4 Doha Declaration and, 78-80 reviews of legislation, 75, 77 Turkey, GSP eligibility for, 91 Ukraine in GSP country practice reviews, 90 in Section 301 investigations, 85, 88-9 in TRIPS disputes, 54 United States (US). See also Generalized System of Preferences; Section 301; Special 301; specific cases in arbitrations on suspension of TRIPS obligations, xxxiv-xxxvi Berne Convention and, 6 Copyright Act in, amendment of, 76–7 DSB recommendations non-compliance with, 66-7, 290-1 DSU and, 84-92 to further Section 301, 84-8 GSP eligibility criteria, 90-2 and TRIPS-consistent measures, 86-8 and TRIPS-inconsistent measures, 84-8 FTAs with, 97-9 GSP in for Argentina, withdrawal of benefits from, 87 ATPA and, 90 CBERA and, 90 country practice reviews, 90-2 eligibility criteria for, 14-16, 90-2 for Honduras, withdrawal of benefits from, 88 for India, withdrawal of benefits from, 88 intellectual property under, 14-16 for South Africa, 91 for Turkey, 91 in NCPI investigation, 16-17 reform of foreign IPR laws and practices by, 6 Tariff Act of 1930 in, 64-5 trade sanctions imposed by, 8

in TRIPS disputes, xxxiv-xxxvi, 43-5, 47-52 United States Trade Representative (USTR), 9-14 priority watch list and watch list drawn up by, 12-13, 89-90 Section 301 and, 9-12, 84-6 Special 301 and, 12-14, 88-90 TRIPS dispute settlement and, 47–52 unilateral redress exclusion of, 86, 87, 388-90 Universal Declaration on Human Rights, 189 UPOV. See International Convention for the Protection of New Varieties of Plants Uruguay Round, of GATT, 1-2, 4-5, 11-12, 13, 20 US - Gambling, 291 cross-retaliation measures in, 71, 303, 310, 328, 331, 338, 342, 347 US - Import Restrictions on Certain Products from Brazil, 11, 12, 26, 29, 349 US - Large Civil Aircraft, 274-5 US - Manufacturing Clause, 21, 26, 235 US - Patents Code, 57, 77 US - Section 110(5) Copyright Act, xxxiv-xxxvi, 46, 55, 56, 61, 70, 386 burden of proof in, 143-4 compensation in, 298-9, 304 compliance measures, lack of, 67, 290 - 1context outside treaty text, 184-5 dispute prevention and, 76-7 evidence of domestic law in, 149-50, 152 exceptions to exclusive rights in, 115-16, 391-2 GATT jurisprudence in, 221-3 initiation of dispute, circumstances, 52 interpretation of IPR provisions in, 397, 399 measure at issue, enactment of, 67 minor exceptions doctrine in, 191



Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-14468-2 - WTO Dispute Settlement and the Trips Agreement: Applying Intellectual Property Standards in a Trade Law Framework Matthew Kennedy Index More information

INDEX

Viagra, 126, 295 US - Section 110(5) (cont.) nullification or impairment in, 71, Vienna Convention on the Law of 299-300 Treaties public policy objectives and, 183 Article 28, 189 retaliation in, 71, 320, 332 Article 30, 250, 324 summary of, 432-3 Article 31, 162-3 terms of reference in, 115-16, 391-2 Article 31(1), 163, 169, 179 trade law in, 402-3, 408-9 Article 31(2)(a), 184-5 WTO jurisprudence in, 223 Article 31(3)(a), 186-90 US - Section 211 Appropriations Act, Article 31(3)(b), 188 xxxiv-xxxvi, 46, 53, 55, 60, Article 31(3)(c), 129, 189 70, 195, 386 Article 31(4), 166 appellate review of, 137, 139-41 Article 32, 190, 198 compliance measures, lack of, 66-7, Article 34, 421 290 - 1Article 41, 324-6 context as element in, 171 Berne Convention and, 194 discretionary measures in, 119-20 customary rules of interpretation in, dispute prevention and, 73-4 158 - 9Havana Club and, 67, 126 Paris Convention and, 194 implementation of, 66 initiation of dispute, WCT. See WIPO Copyright Treaty WIPO. See World Intellectual Property circumstances, 52 measure at issue, enactment of, 55 Organization mandatory/discretionary distinction WIPO Copyright Treaty (WCT), 102, in, 119-20, 393 200-1,327nationality of claims, 129-30 WIPO obligations and, 321-7 non-discrimination provisions and, WIPO Performance and Phonograms 208, 209 Treaty (WPPT), 102, 327 nullification or impairment in, World Intellectual Property 71, 307 Organization (WIPO) object and purpose of TRIPS, 181 Arbitration and Mediation Center, 8 original owners in, 139-41, 307 Berne Convention and, 5-6 outcome of, 65, 67 conventions, 192-204 redundancy in, 174 effectiveness, principle and, 193-4 retaliation in, 71, 307 prior developments in, 198-9 summary of, 433-4 relevance in TRIPS interpretation, trade law and, 400-1 193-8 trade name protection in, 171, 174, scope of incorporation in 319 - 20TRIPS, 193 US - Section 301 Trade Act, 86, 87, 135 special agreements under, 197–8 US - Section 337, 16-17, 20-2, 26, 36, subsequent developments under, 57, 77, 121, 222, 386 199-201 *US - Spring Assemblies*, 20–1, 125, 236 cooperation agreement with WTO, US - Upland Cotton, 291 80, 202, 324-5, 425-7 cross-retaliation measures in, 71, dispute settlement mechanisms 328, 331, 337-42, 343, 347-9 under, 4-8, 22 USTR. See United States Trade global protection systems, 178 Representative International Bureau of, 201-4



INDEX 453

IPIC Treaty and, 207 IPRs and, 102-3 levels of protection in treaties, 34 Paris Convention and, 5-6 proposed Treaty on the Settlement of Disputes between States in the Field of Intellectual Property, 6-8, 131 retaliation and WIPO obligations, 321 - 7Rome Convention and, 5-6 technical cooperation with, 80 - 1technical expertise and, 393-5 UPOV and, 5-6 World Trade Organization (WTO), agreements within. See also specific agreements covered agreements invoked in disputes, 36 three pillar structure for, 29–31

World Trade Organization (WTO) See also Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization accession to, 81-2 administrative structure for, 29-31 cooperation agreement with WIPO, 80, 202, 324-5, 425-7 dispute settlement reports, xvi-xxxiii Secretariat, 60, 62, 80 technical cooperation with, 80 Trade Policy Review Mechanism, 81-2 WPPT. See WIPO Performance and Phonograms Treaty WTO. See World Trade Organization WTO Agreement. See Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization

Zoloft, 48, 126, 293