Black Resettlement and the American Civil War

Based on sweeping research in six languages, *Black Resettlement and the American Civil War* offers the first comprehensive, comparative account of nineteenth-century America’s greatest road not taken: the mass resettlement of African Americans outside the United States. Building on resurgent scholarly interest in the so-called colonization movement, the book goes beyond tired debates about colonization’s place in the contest over slavery, and beyond the familiar black destinations of Liberia, Canada, and Haiti. Striding effortlessly from Pittsburgh to Panama, Toronto to Trinidad, and Lagos to Louisiana, it synthesizes a wealth of individual, state-level, and national considerations to reorient the field and set a new standard for Atlantic history. Along the way, it shows that what haunted politicians from Thomas Jefferson to Abraham Lincoln was not whether it was right to abolish slavery, but whether it was safe to do so unless the races were separated.

Sebastian N. Page is a historian of the United States and Atlantic world during the nineteenth century. He is the co-author of *Colonization after Emancipation: Lincoln and the Movement for Black Resettlement*. 
CAMBRIDGE STUDIES ON THE AMERICAN SOUTH

Series Editors:
Mark M. Smith, University of South Carolina, Columbia
Peter Coclanis, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill

Editor Emeritus:
David Moltke-Hansen

Interdisciplinary in its scope and intent, this series builds upon and extends Cambridge University Press’s longstanding commitment to studies on the American South. The series offers the best new work on the South’s distinctive institutional, social, economic, and cultural history and also features works in a national, comparative, and transnational perspective.

Titles in the Series
Sebastian N. Page, Black Resettlement and the American Civil War
Hayden R. Smith, Carolina’s Golden Fields: Inland Rice Cultivation in the South Carolina Lowcountry, 1670-1860
Wilson Jeremiah Moses, Thomas Jefferson: A Modern Prometheus
Joan E. Cashin, War Stuff: The Struggle for Human and Environmental Resources in the American Civil War
David Stefan Doddington, Contesting Slave Masculinity in the American South
Lawrence T. McDonnell, Performing Disunion: The Coming of the Civil War in Charleston, South Carolina
Enrico Dal Lago, Civil War and Agrarian Unrest: The Confederate South and Southern Italy
Daniel J. Vivian, A New Plantation World: Sporting Estates in the South Carolina Low Country, 1900-1940
Donald G. Mathews, At the Altar of Lynching: Burning Sam Hose in the American South
Keri Leigh Merritt, Masterless Men: Poor Whites and Slavery in the Antebellum South
Katherine Rye Jewell, Dollars for Dixie: Business and the Transformation of Conservatism in the Twentieth Century
Sarah Gardner, Reviewing the South: The Literary Marketplace and the Southern Renaissance, 1920-1941
William Thomas Okie, The Georgia Peach: Culture, Agriculture, and Environment in the American South
Karlos K. Hill, Beyond the Rope: The Impact of Lynching on Black Culture and Memory
William A. Link and James J. Broomall, eds., Rethinking American Emancipation: Legacies of Slavery and the Quest for Black Freedom
James Van Horn Melton, Religion, Community, and Slavery on the Colonial Southern Frontier
Damian Alan Pargas, Slavery and Forced Migration in the Antebellum South
Craig Friend and Lorri Glover, eds., Death and the American South
Barton A. Myers, Rebels against the Confederacy: North Carolina’s Unionists
Louis A. Ferleger and John D. Metz, Cultivating Success in the South: Farm Households in Postbellum Georgia
Susanna Michele Lee, Claiming the Union: Citizenship in the Post-Civil War South
Kathleen M. Hilliard, Masters, Slaves, and Exchange: Power’s Purchase in the Old South
Ari Helo, *Thomas Jefferson's Ethics and the Politics of Human Progress: The Morality of a Slaveholder*
Scott P. Marler, *The Merchants' Capital: New Orleans and the Political Economy of the Nineteenth-Century South*
Ras Michael Brown, *African-Atlantic Cultures and the South Carolina Lowcountry*
Johanna Nicol Shields, *Freedom in a Slave Society: Stories from the Antebellum South*
Brian Steele, *Thomas Jefferson and American Nationhood*
Christopher Michael Curtis, *Jefferson's Freeholders and the Politics of Ownership in the Old Dominion*
Jonathan Daniel Wells, *Women Writers and Journalists in the Nineteenth-Century South*
Peter McCandless, *Slavery, Disease, and Suffering in the Southern Lowcountry*
Robert E. Bonner, *Mastering America: Southern Slaveholders and the Crisis of American Nationhood*
Black Resettlement and the American Civil War

SEBASTIAN N. PAGE

University of Oxford
For the Pelican!
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of Figures and Maps</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terminology</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviations</td>
<td>xvii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 The Revival of “Colonization,” to 1861</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 The Revival of “Emigration,” to 1862</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 The Republican Party and Resettlement, to 1863</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Resettlement in Latin America, to 1864</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Resettlement in the European West Indies, to 1865</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Alternatives to Foreign Resettlement, to 1868</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Epilogue</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figures and Maps

Figures

1.1 James Mitchell (1818–1903). Methodist minister, colonizationist, and administrator page 25

2.1 Henry Highland Garnet (1815–1882). Presbyterian minister, abolitionist, and emigrationist 69

3.1 Francis Preston Blair, Sr. (1791–1876). Journalist, colonizationist, and veteran Washington insider 105

4.1 Scrip for the settlers of the Île à Vache, signed by Bernard Kock and Andrew Ripka 180

5.1 John Willis Menard (1838–1893). Poet, politician, and emigrationist 229

Maps

0.1 The Middle Americas in 1861 xix

1.1 Liberia by the 1860s 36

2.1 The major black settlements in Canada West by the 1850s 63

2.2 Hispaniola in 1861 93

4.1 Contested ground 164
Acknowledgments

“The library has just bought microfilm copies of the records of the American Colonization Society. Why don’t you find out what it was up to during the Civil War?” Those words from Jay Sexton started a project that ranged much further than I would ever have imagined, and took much longer than I would ever have dreaded. Perhaps an eternity of labor is a fitting punishment for those undergraduates who ask their supervisor for ideas for a thesis. As I committed to the topic (and then some!) for my graduate studies, Richard Carwardine became an ever more important advisor. He was joined in that respect by Richard Blackett, whose Grand Tour–like research into black emigration made possible the whistle-stop excursion that is Chapter 2. Still, I researched much of this book in Washington, DC, home to none of those people and to no institution where I have ever held an affiliation. (Though I probably have squatter’s rights to parts of the Library of Congress by now.) How lucky I am, then, for the friendship of Anna Sproul-Latimer and Irene Upshur, who made almost a year’s research so much more sociable than it might have been. It is thanks to their warm welcome whenever I go back that I call Arlington, Virginia, my home from home.

I knew from the second year of my doctoral course, when Phillip Magness and I discovered the sources that we would present in Colonization after Emancipation, that I had been sucked into a topic that no dissertation could ever encompass. It is a testament to the mercy of my examiners, Nicholas Guyatt and David Turley, that they approved an effort that somehow covered less than one-tenth of the material included in this book in eleven-tenths the number of words. Anyone who wishes to gawp at such a prolix document should head to the Vere Harmsworth
Acknowledgments

Library, where Jane Rawson or one of her wonderful team of Judy Warden, Johanna O'Connor, Martin Sutcliffe, and Richard Purkiss will call it up.

Otherwise, I have accumulated debts to so many librarians, colleagues, and even strangers who offered me their couch that I could not fairly specify any more people, beyond a quintet at Cambridge University Press: Deborah Gershenowitz, Cecelia Cancellaro, Rachel Blaifeder, and two anonymous readers. Nevertheless, I recognize three broad areas of help: emotional, financial, and institutional. The first, as ever, is the support of friends and family. The second is the generosity, in chronological order, of the Arts and Humanities Research Council, the Peter Parish Memorial Fund, the Rothermere American Institute (especially the anonymous benefactor who funded my fellowship there), and The Queen’s College, Oxford. The third is the education that I received a few hundred yards away at Corpus Christi College, where I studied for my undergraduate, master’s, and most of my doctoral degree. Those familiar with Christian iconography, or foxed by why a Briton would acknowledge, before all else, the great state of Louisiana (which I have never had the pleasure of visiting), might have already divined the origins of this book’s dedication. It has been some years since I left Corpus, but that just makes me all the keener to acknowledge its place in my intellectual development.

When I started at the college, alongside another future Americanist, David Sim, Corpus had no reputation for scholarship on the United States. Given the multivalent medievalist that is John Watts, that was no defect in itself. But over just a few years, I had the pleasure of watching Oxford’s smallest college attract an outsized cluster of experts in US history: Jay Sexton, Richard Carwardine (an old member, back as the college’s president), Nigel Bowles, Stephen Tuffnell, Skye Montgomery, Alice Kelly, and Katherine Paugh.

May the hive buzz forever.
Terminology

For the most part, this book uses “African American” and “black” interchangeably, though it is more precise whenever it (also) refers to the black populations of places other than the United States. Furthermore, it features both “freepeople” and “freedpeople”: the former were those African Americans who had been free for a long time, perhaps their entire lives, while the latter were those freed recently, even prospectively (such as by the Emancipation Proclamation or by colonizationist slaveholders who stipulated slaves’ emigration as the price of their freedom).

As befits a book that focuses on foreign countries as much as on the United States, it uses both “immigration” and “emigration,” depending on whether the sense is more one of people arriving or leaving. If both directions are pertinent, then it uses the neutral “migration.” The names and spellings of polities are the common English forms of the day, but “Hayti” is “Haiti” because of its sheer recurrence, while “Santo Domingo” is “the Dominican Republic” wherever it does not refer to the restored Spanish colony of 1861–5.
Abbreviations

For personal papers, footnotes normally cite the item, the name of the collection, and the archive. The reader should assume that such collections, whether available on microfilm, online, or as only the original manuscripts, are easily navigated with a finding aid or the obvious search terms, and that the item comes under the main series of correspondence unless stated otherwise. For personal papers arranged in a more complex manner, and for institutional records, footnotes offer more detail.

ACS American Colonization Society Records, LC
AL Abraham Lincoln Papers, LC
AR African Repository
BF Blair Family Papers, LC
BL Blair and Lee Family Papers, Princeton University
CG Congressional Globe
CO123/456 Colonial Office Records, series 123, book 456 (example)
FDP Frederick Douglass’ Paper
FO123/456 Foreign Office Records, series 123, book 456 (example)
HCPP 1812 House of Commons Parliamentary Paper, session of 1812, paper 34 (example)
LC Library of Congress
NARA National Archives and Records Administration, Washington, DC
NARA II National Archives and Records Administration, College Park, MD
xviii  

List of Abbreviations

NYPL  New York Public Library  
PRFA  Papers Relating to Foreign Affairs  
RG12/34/56  Record Group 12, entry 34, box or book 56 (example)  
RG12/M34/56  Record Group 12, microfilm series 34, reel 56 (example, “M” publication)  
RG12/T34/56  Record Group 12, microfilm series 34, reel 56 (example, “T” publication)  
TNA  The National Archives, Kew, United Kingdom  
WAA  Weekly Anglo-African  
WHS  William Henry Seward Papers, University of Rochester