

DEATH AND THE AFTERLIFE IN BYZANTIUM

For all their reputed and professed preoccupation with the afterlife, the Byzantines had no systematic conception of the fate of the soul between death and the Last Judgement. *Death and the Afterlife in Byzantium* marries for the first time liturgical, theological, literary, and material evidence to investigate a fundamental question: What did the Byzantines believe happened after death? This interdisciplinary study provides an in-depth analysis and synthesis of hagiography, theological treatises, apocryphal texts, liturgical services, as well as images of the fate of the soul in manuscript and monumental decoration. It also places the imagery of the afterlife, both literary and artistic, within the context of Byzantine culture, spirituality, and soteriology.

Vasileios Marinis is Associate Professor of Christian Art and Architecture at Yale University. His research focuses on the art and architecture of early Christianity and the Middle Ages, with particular interest in the ritual, liturgical arts, and material culture of these periods. He has published on a wide range of topics, from Early Christian tunics decorated with New Testament scenes to medieval tombs, graffiti, relics, and liturgical commentaries.

DEATH AND THE AFTERLIFE IN BYZANTIUM

THE FATE OF THE SOUL IN
THEOLOGY, LITURGY, AND ART

VASILEIOS MARINIS

Associate Professor of Christian Art and Architecture

The Institute of Sacred Music

Divinity School

Yale University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University’s mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107139442
© Vasileios Marinis 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2017

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Marinis, Vasileios, author.
Title: Death and the afterlife in Byzantium : the fate of the soul in
theology, liturgy, and art / Vasileios Marinis, Associate Professor of Christian
Art and Architecture, The Institute of Sacred Music, Divinity School, Yale University.
Description: 1 [edition]. | New York : Cambridge University Press, 2016. |
Includes bibliographical references and index.
Identifiers: LCCN 2016024242 | ISBN 9781107139442 (hard back : alk. paper)
Subjects: LCSH: Death–Byzantine Empire. | Future life–Byzantine Empire. | Byzantine Empire.
Classification: LCC BL504 .M28 2016 | DDC 236/.4–dc23
LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2016024242>

ISBN 978-1-107-13944-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
<i>A Note on Capitalization and Spelling</i>	xiii
<i>List of Abbreviations of Manuscript Locations</i>	xv
INTRODUCTION	1
PART I THEOLOGIES	7
1 THE INVENTION OF TRADITIONS: JEWISH AND CHRISTIAN APOCRYPHA	9
2 THE DIVERSITY OF THE AFTERLIFE IN LATE ANTIQUITY	15
3 CONTINUITY, SYSTEMATIZATION, AND ENCYCLOPEDISM IN THE MIDDLE BYZANTINE PERIOD	28
4 VISUALIZING THE AFTERLIFE	49
5 LATE BYZANTIUM AND THE ENCOUNTER WITH THE WEST	74
PART II LITURGIES	83
6 THE AFTERLIFE OF THE SOUL IN LITURGICAL SERVICES	85
7 HELPING AND REMEMBERING THE SOUL: LITURGICAL COMMEMORATIONS AND PRAYERS	93
8 TWO EXCEPTIONAL SERVICES	107

vi	CONTENTS	
	CONCLUSIONS	131
	<i>Appendix: The Text and Translation of the Kanon eis Psychorragounta</i>	135
	<i>Notes</i>	141
	<i>Bibliography</i>	167
	<i>Index</i>	191

FIGURES

1 Separation of the soul from the body, fol. 63v, <i>Heavenly Ladder</i> of John Klimax, 1081, Princ. Garrett 16.	page 50
2 Separation of the soul from the body, fol. 137r, Theodore Psalter, 1066, Lond. Add. 19352.	51
3 The separation of the soul from the body; the weighing of deeds, fol. 11v, early twelfth century, Athon. Dionysiou 65.	52
4 Separation of the soul from the body, twelfth century, fresco, Refectory of the Patmos monastery, Greece.	53
5 The weighing of deeds, tenth century, fresco, Yılanlı Kilise at Belisırma, Cappadocia, Turkey.	54
6 The Last Judgment, fol. 51v, second half of the eleventh century, Paris. gr. 74.	55
7 The Last Judgment, eleventh and twelfth centuries, mosaic, Cattedrale di S. Maria Assunta, Torcello, Italy.	56
8 Detail of the Last Judgment, early tenth century, fresco, Ayvalı Kilise, Cappadocia, Turkey.	57
9 The Last Judgment, early fourteenth century, fresco, funerary chapel of the katholikon of Chora monastery (now Kariye Müzesi), Istanbul, Turkey.	59
10 The death of a man and his soul in Hades contemplating the eternal fire, fol. 93r, Theodore Psalter, 1066, Lond. Add. 19352.	60
11 The soul in Hades; a monk admitted to paradise, fol. 12r, early twelfth century, Athon. Dionysiou 65.	61
12 Lazaros in Abraham's bosom and the rich man in Hades, fol. 145v, second half of the eleventh century, Paris. gr. 74.	62
13 Hades receiving the souls of sinners, fol. 8v, Chludov Psalter, ninth century, Mosq. 129.	64
14 Hades receiving the souls of sinners, fol. 18r, Bristol Psalter, eleventh century, Lond. Add. 40731.	64
15 The raising of Lazaros, fol. 31v, Theodore Psalter, 1066, Lond. Add. 19352.	65
16 Prince Ioasaph visits Hades, fol. 101r, eleventh century, Athon. Iveron 463.	65
17 Prince Ioasaph visits Hades, fol. 156v, fourteenth century, Paris. gr. 1128.	66
18 Prince Ioasaph visits paradise, fol. 100r, eleventh century, Athon. Iveron 463.	67
19 Abraham's bosom, fol. 24v, Theodore Psalter, 1066, Lond. Add. 19352.	68

viii LIST OF FIGURES

20	The Last Judgment, eleventh century, icon, Monastery of Saint Catherine's, Sinai, Egypt.	70
21	Paradise, detail of Figure 20, eleventh century, icon, Monastery of Saint Catherine's, Sinai, Egypt.	71
22	Lazaros in Abraham's bosom and the rich man in Hades, fol. 144r, eleventh century, Laurent. Plut.VI.23.	72
23	The monk on his deathbed, illustration of I.3, p. 323, in so-called Horologion of the Akoimeton Monastery, late twelfth–early thirteenth century, Leimon. 295.	111
24	The monk on his deathbed, praying to an icon of the Theotokos and Christ child (left) and to an icon of Christ with his fellow monks (right), illustration of I.4, p. 324, and III.3, p. 325, in so-called Horologion of the Akoimeton Monastery, late twelfth–early thirteenth century, Leimon. 295.	112
25	The separation of the soul from the body (left) and the body of the monk thrown to the dogs and birds (right), illustration of VI.2, p. 336, and VI.3, p. 337, in so-called Horologion of the Akoimeton Monastery, late twelfth–early thirteenth century, Leimon. 295.	113
26	The body of the monk is devoured by dogs and birds as passersby pray on his behalf (left) and two angels escort the monk's soul toward Christ (right), illustration of VI.4, p. 338, and VII.1, p. 339, in so-called Horologion of the Akoimeton Monastery, late twelfth–early thirteenth century, Leimon. 295.	113
27	Judgment by scales, illustration of VII.2, p. 340, in so-called Horologion of the Akoimeton Monastery, late twelfth–early thirteenth century, Leimon. 295.	114
28	The soul in Hades, illustration of VIII.4, p. 345, in so-called Horologion of the Akoimeton Monastery, late twelfth–early thirteenth century, Leimon. 295.	115
29	The monk on his deathbed praying to an icon of the Theotokos (left), monk on his deathbed surrounded by his fellow monks (center), and separation of the soul from the body (right), illustration of V.4, VI.1, and VI.2, respectively, first half of thirteenth century, fresco, upper-story chapel in tower of St. George, Chilandar Monastery, Mount Athos.	116
30	The body of the monk is devoured by wild animals and birds as passersby pray on his behalf, illustration of VI.4, first half of thirteenth century, fresco, upper-story chapel in tower of St. George, Chilandar Monastery, Mount Athos.	116
31	The soul in Hades tormented by demons, illustration (from left to right) of VIII.1, VIII.2, and VIII.3, first half of thirteenth century, fresco, upper-story chapel in tower of St. George, Chilandar Monastery, Mount Athos.	117
32	The Theotokos interceding on behalf of the soul, illustration of IX.4, first half of thirteenth century, fresco, upper-story chapel in tower of St. George, Chilandar Monastery, Mount Athos.	117
33	The separation of the soul from the body (top) and angels carry the soul pursued by demons (bottom), illustration of IV.3 and VII.1,	

LIST OF FIGURES	ix
respectively, fourteenth century, fresco, exonarthex gallery, St. Sophia, Ohrid.	118
34 Judgment by scales, angels intercede before the throne of Christ, angels intercede with an icon of the Theotokos above the soul in Hades, and the soul carried by demons to a personified Hades, illustration of VII.2, VII.3, VII.4, and VIII.1, respectively, fourteenth century, fresco, exonarthex gallery, St. Sophia, Ohrid.	119
35 The soul in Hades, illustration of IX.1, IX.2 (?), and IX.3 (?), fourteenth century, fresco, exonarthex gallery, St. Sophia, Ohrid.	119
36 The Theotokos interceding on behalf of the soul, illustration of IX.4, fourteenth century, fresco, exonarthex gallery, St. Sophia, Ohrid.	120
37 Drawing of Figure 36.	120
38 The monk on his deathbed praying to an icon of Archangel Michael, illustration of V.3, p. 333, in so-called Horologion of the Akoimeton Monastery, late twelfth–early thirteenth century, Leimon. 295.	122

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

It is my great pleasure to acknowledge the individuals and institutions that facilitated the completion of this study. My research was generously funded by the Dumbarton Oaks Research Library and Collection, the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation, the American Friends of the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation, and the Macmillan Center at Yale University. The Yale Institute of Sacred Music provided further funding and a generous grant that aided the publication of this book. Many colleagues offered guidance and sensible advice. I thank Christopher A. Beeley, Albrecht Berger, Teresa Berger, Sarah T. Brooks, Deb Brown, Adam Cohen, Bishop Georgios of Thebes, Ludmila Gordon, Peter Hawkins, Martin Jean, Viktoria Kepetzi, Ioannis Mylonopoulos, Robert Nelson, Markus Rathey, Robert Ousterhout, Linda Safran, Apostolos Spanos, Bryan Spinks, Chloë F. Starr, Gregory Sterling, Alice-Mary Talbot, and particularly Sally M. Promey. Several people took time from their busy schedules to read chapters or even the whole book and offer constructive criticisms and helpful comments: Harold W. Attridge, Emmanuel Bourboughakis, Ivan Drpić, Nina Glibetić, Georgi R. Parpulov, Manu Radhakrishnan, Gabriel Radle, and Alicia Walker. I am particularly indebted to Annemarie Weyl Carr, who generously helped me think through many of the iconographic issues; to Joel Kalvesmaki, whose insistence on clarity and sound arguments made this a much better book; and to the two anonymous reviewers for their many useful suggestions. For research support I thank Lucas del Priore, Andjela Gavrilović, Georgia Kolovou, Carolyn Rolleston, Ermolaos Roussias, Roman Shlyakhtin, Erik Yingling, and especially Sonja Anderson and Emma Langham Brown. Jacqueline Campoli, Kristen Forman, Andrea Hart, Trisha Lendroth, Liz Santamaria, and Athanasia Toubali kindly took care of many practicalities. I am also grateful to Beatrice Rehl and Asya Graf at Cambridge University Press for good advice and steadfast encouragement since the beginning of this project. For permissions to reproduce photographs I thank Konstantia Kefala, Dora Konstantellou, Ioannis Melianos, Robert Nelson, Robert Ousterhout, Aneta Serafimova, Fr. Justin Sinaites, and Nebojša Stanković. I would also like to thank my extended family in Greece and Turkey, and particularly Eugenia Marini, Efi Marini, and Kadriye Dalgıç.

This book is for Örgü and Daphne. I know of no better paradise than life with them.

A NOTE ON CAPITALIZATION AND SPELLING

For the capitalization of the places and states of the afterlife I follow the *Oxford English Dictionary* (thus Hades, but paradise, hell, and gehenna). For the spelling of Byzantine proper names I follow the *Oxford Dictionary of Byzantium*. Even though I aim for consistency, I beg the reader’s indulgence in cases of lack thereof.

ABBREVIATIONS OF MANUSCRIPT LOCATIONS

Athon.	Mount Athos
Crypt.	Grottaferrata, Biblioteca del Monumento Nazionale
Laurent.	Florence, Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana
Leimon.	Lesbos, Leimonos Monastery
Lond.	London, British Library
Monac.	Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek
Mosq.	Moscow, State Historical Museum
Paris.	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France
Petrop.	Saint Petersburg, National Library of Russia
Princ.	Princeton, University Library
Sinai.	Mount Sinai, Monastery of Saint Catherine
Taur.	Turin, Biblioteca Nazionale Universitaria
Vatic.	Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana
Vindob.	Vienna, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek
Walters	Baltimore, Walters Art Museums