

THEORETICAL BOUNDARIES OF ARMED CONFLICT AND HUMAN RIGHTS

In the last two decades, human rights law has played an expanding role in the legal regulation of wartime conduct. In the process, human rights law and international humanitarian law have developed a complicated sibling relationship. For some, this relationship is viewed as a mutually reinforcing effort between like-minded regimes designed to civilize human behavior. For others, the relationship is a more complicated sibling rivalry. In this book, an unparalleled collection of legal theorists examine the relationship between these two bodies of law. Each chapter skilfully maps the possibilities of harmonization while, at the same time, raising cautionary flags about the limits of that project. The authors not only chart the existing state of the law, but also debate the normative implications of the continuing influence of human rights norms on current practices including torture, targeted killings, the conduct of non-international armed conflicts, and post-war state building.

Jens David Ohlin is Professor of Law and Associate Dean for Academic Affairs at Cornell Law School. He specializes in international law and all aspects of criminal law, including domestic, comparative, and international criminal law.

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-13793-6 — Theoretical Boundaries of Armed Conflict and Human Rights
 Edited by Jens David Ohlin
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

ASIL STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL LEGAL THEORY

Series Editors

Mortimer N. S. Sellers (University of Baltimore)
 Mark David Agrast (American Society of International Law)

Editorial Board

Samantha Besson (Université de Fribourg)
 Allen Buchanan (Duke University)
 David Kennedy (Harvard University)
 Jan Klabbers (University of Helsinki)
 David Luban (Georgetown University)
 Larry May (Vanderbilt University)
 Mary Ellen O'Connell (University of Notre Dame)
 Onuma Yasuaki (Meiji University)
 Helen Stacy (Stanford University)
 John Tasioulas (University College London)
 Fernando Tesón (Florida State University)

The purpose of the ASIL Studies in International Legal Theory series is to clarify and improve the theoretical foundations of international law. Too often the progressive development and implementation of international law has foundered on confusion about first principles. This series raises the level of public and scholarly discussion about the structure and purposes of the world legal order and how best to achieve global justice through law.

This series grows out of the International Legal Theory project of the American Society of International Law. The ASIL Studies in International Legal Theory series deepens this conversation by publishing scholarly monographs and edited volumes of essays considering subjects in international legal theory.

Volumes in the Series:

International Criminal Law and Philosophy

edited by Larry May and Zachary Hoskins

Customary International Law: A New Theory with Practical Applications

by Brian D. Lepard

The New Global Law by Rafael Domingo

The Role of Ethics in International Law

edited by Donald Earl Childress III

Global Justice and International Economic Law: Opportunities and Prospects

edited by Chios Carmody, Frank J. Garcia, and John Linarelli

Parochialism, Cosmopolitanism, and the Foundations of International Law

edited by Mortimer Sellers

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-13793-6 — Theoretical Boundaries of Armed Conflict and Human Rights

Edited by Jens David Ohlin

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

Morality, Jus Post Bellum, and International Law

edited by Larry May and Andrew T. Forcehimes

The Future of International Law: Global Governance

by Joel P. Trachtman

Normative Pluralism and International Law: Exploring Global Governance

by Jan Klabbers and Touko Piiparinen

Jus Post Bellum and Transitional Justice

by Larry May and Elizabeth Edenberg

Negotiating State and Non-State Law: The Challenge of Global and Local Legal Pluralism

edited by Michael A. Helfand

The Theory of Self-Determination

edited by Fernando R. Tesón

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-13793-6 — Theoretical Boundaries of Armed Conflict and Human Rights

Edited by Jens David Ohlin

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

Theoretical Boundaries of Armed Conflict and Human Rights

Edited by

JENS DAVID OHLIN



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-13793-6 — Theoretical Boundaries of Armed Conflict and Human Rights
Edited by Jens David Ohlin
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York NY 10013

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107137936

© Cambridge University Press 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Names: Ohlin, Jens David, editor.

Title: Theoretical boundaries of armed conflict and human rights / edited by Jens David Ohlin.
Description: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Series: Asil studies in international legal theory | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2015042016 | ISBN 9781107137936 (Hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: War (International law) | Human rights. | BISAC: POLITICAL SCIENCE / Political Freedom & Security / Human Rights.

Classification: LCC KZ6355 .T44 2016 | DDC 341.4/8--dc23 LC record available at <http://lcn.loc.gov/2015042016>

ISBN 978-1-107-13793-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-13793-6 — Theoretical Boundaries of Armed Conflict and Human Rights

Edited by Jens David Ohlin

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

For my family

-JDO

Contents

	<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>page xi</i>
	<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xiii</i>
	Introduction: The Inescapable Collision	1
	JENS DAVID OHLIN	
PART I	Convergence & Divergence of Human Rights and Laws of War	23
1	Laws for War	25
	ADIL AHMAD HAQUE	
2	Human Rights Thinking and the Laws of War	45
	DAVID LUBAN	
3	The Lost Origins of <i>Lex Specialis</i>: Rethinking the Relationship between Human Rights and International Humanitarian Law	78
	MARKO MILANOVIC	
4	Acting as a Sovereign versus Acting as a Belligerent	118
	JENS DAVID OHLIN	
PART II	Conceptual Limits of the Law of War Framework	155
5	Ending the Global War: The Power of Human Rights in a Time of Unrestrained Armed Conflict	157
	JONATHAN HOROWITZ	
6	Folk International Law: 9/11 Lawyering and the Transformation of the Law of Armed Conflict to Human Rights Policy and Human Rights Law to War Governance	192
	NAZ K. MODIRZADEH	

X	TABLE OF CONTENTS	
7	The Use and Abuse of Analogy in IHL	232
	KEVIN JON HELLER	
PART III	New Frameworks for Regulating Armed Violence	287
8	Forcible Alternatives to War: Legitimate Violence in 21st Century International Relations	289
	JANINA DILL	
9	Whither International Martial Law?: Human Rights as Sword and Shield in Ineffectively Governed Territory	315
	JOHN C. DEHN	
10	The Next Geneva Convention: Filling a Law-of-War Gap with Human Rights Values	363
	BRIAN OREND	
	<i>Index</i>	398

Contributors

John C. Dehn is Assistant Professor at Loyola University Chicago School of Law where he is Co-Director of the National Security and Civil Rights Program. Professor Dehn served over fifteen years as an Army judge advocate in positions ranging from detainee abuse prosecutor to faculty member at West Point where he taught courses in international, constitutional and military law, coordinated international law training for all academy programs, and coached the Jean-Pictet International Humanitarian Law Competition team.

Janina Dill is an Assistant Professor in Normative International Theory at the Department of International Relations at the London School of Economics and Political Science and a Research Fellow of the Oxford Institute for Ethics, Law and Armed Conflict (ELAC) at the University of Oxford. Her first monograph, *Legitimate Targets? Social Construction, International Law and US Bombing*, was published by Cambridge University Press in October 2014.

Adil Ahmad Haque is Professor of Law and Judge Jon O. Newman Scholar at Rutgers Law School. His scholarship focuses on the law of armed conflict, international criminal law, and criminal law theory. He is currently writing a book on the moral foundations of the law of armed conflict for Oxford University Press.

Kevin Jon Heller is Professor of Criminal Law, SOAS, University of London. He is the author of *The Nuremberg Military Tribunals and the Origins of International Criminal Law* (OUP, 2011) and the co-editor (with Gerry Simpson) of *The Hidden Histories of War Crimes Trials* (OUP, 2013).

Jonathan Horowitz is a Legal Officer at the Open Society Justice Initiative, where he focuses on issues relating to human rights, national

security and counterterrorism, and international humanitarian law. Prior, Mr. Horowitz worked at the U.S. Embassy in Kabul, Afghanistan, on detainee affairs; documented and reported on detainee and “night-raid” abuses in Afghanistan; and was an investigator for habeas lawyers representing Guantanamo Bay detainees.

David Luban is University Professor and Professor of Law and Philosophy at Georgetown University, as well as Class of 1984 Distinguished Chair in Ethics at the Stockdale Center for Ethical Leadership, U.S. Naval Academy. His more than 150 articles cover international criminal law, moral and legal philosophy, professional ethics, law and literature, just war theory, and the U.S. “war on terrorism.”

Marko Milanovic is Associate Professor at the University of Nottingham School of Law. He is Vice-President, European Society of International Law, an Associate of the Belgrade Centre for Human Rights, and Co-Editor of EJIL: Talk, as well as a member of the EJIL’s Editorial Board.

Naz K. Modirzadeh is Director of the Harvard Law School Program on International Law and Armed Conflict. Modirzadeh teaches, writes about, and engages in academic and policy initiatives concerning international law related to armed conflict.

Jens David Ohlin is Professor of Law at Cornell Law School. His published books include *The Assault on International Law* (2015); *Defending Humanity: When Force is Justified and Why*, with G.P. Fletcher (2008); *Targeted Killings: Law and Morality in an Asymmetrical World*, edited with C. Finkelstein & A. Altman (2012); and *Cyberwar: Law & Ethics for Virtual Conflicts*, edited with C. Finkelstein & K. Govern (2015).

Brian Orend is the Director of International Studies, and a Professor of Philosophy, at the University of Waterloo in Canada. He has taught at Columbia, Waterloo, and the University of Lund in Sweden (where he was recently Distinguished Visiting Professor of Human Rights). His research concentrates on three areas: the ethics of war and peace (especially post-war reconstruction); human rights; and happiness.

Acknowledgments

This book began with a conference in Washington, D.C. on November 8, 2013, co-sponsored by the Legal Theory Interest Group of the American Society of International Law (ASIL) and the Berger Program International Fund of Cornell Law School. Several staff members at ASIL worked diligently to ensure the conference's success.

Associate Dean Laura Spitz and Prof. Jack Barcelo, both of Cornell Law School, were instrumental in securing the necessary funding for the conference.

Prof. Mortimer Sellers of the University of Baltimore School of Law offered his time and expertise in guiding the assembled papers toward ultimate publication in this volume. The papers from the conference workshops were revised and then supplemented by additional chapters from leading scholars in the field.

Chapter 6 is an abridged version of Naz K. Modirzadeh, *Folk International Law: 9/11 Lawyering and the Transformation of the Law of Armed Conflict to Human Rights Policy and Human Rights Law to War Governance*, 5 HARV. NAT. SEC. J. 225–304 (2014) and is published with the permission of the journal.