

## THE RULE OF LAW IN THE REAL WORLD

In *The Rule of Law in the Real World*, Paul Gowder defends a new conception of the rule of law as the coordinated control of power, and demonstrates that the rule of law, thus understood, creates and preserves social equality in a state. In a highly engaging, interdisciplinary text that moves seamlessly from theory to reality, using examples ranging from ancient Greece through the present, Gowder sheds light on how societies have achieved the rule of law, how they have sustained it in the face of political upheaval, and how it may be measured and developed in the future. *The Rule of Law in the Real World* is an essential work for scholars, students, policy makers, and anyone else who believes the rule of law is critical to the proper functioning of society. For more information, visit <http://rulelaw.net>. This title is also available as Open Access on Cambridge Core.

Paul Gowder is an associate professor of law and of political science at the University of Iowa, researching constitutional law, ethics, normative and conceptual jurisprudence, political philosophy, computational and empirical legal studies, and game theory. Before joining academia, he worked as a public interest litigator practicing poverty and civil rights law.

# The Rule of Law in the Real World

PAUL GOWDER

University of Iowa



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
 978-1-107-13689-2 — The Rule of Law in the Real World  
 Paul Gowder  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)



**CAMBRIDGE**  
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
 New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,  
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of  
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781316502020](http://www.cambridge.org/9781316502020)

© Paul Gowder 2016

This work is in copyright. It is subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions  
 of relevant licensing agreements; with the exception of the Creative Commons version  
 the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part of this work may take  
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

An online version of this work is published at [doi.org/10.1017/9781316480182](https://doi.org/10.1017/9781316480182)  
 under a Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 which permits  
 re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes  
 providing appropriate credit to the original work is given. You may not  
 distribute derivative works without permission. To view a copy of this license, visit  
 © Creative Commons – Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International –  
 CC BY-NC-ND 4.0

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third  
 parties. Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these  
 third-parties directly.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI [10.1017/9781316480182](https://doi.org/10.1017/9781316480182)

First published 2016

Printed in the United States of America

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data*

Gowder, Paul, author.

The rule of law in the real world / Paul Gowder.

New York : Cambridge University Press, 2016.

LCCN 2015038101 | ISBN 9781107136892 (hardback)

LCSH: Rule of law.

LCC K3171 .G69 2016 | DDC 340/.11–dc23

LC record available at <http://lccn.loc.gov/2015038101>

ISBN 978-1-107-13689-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-316-50202-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence  
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this  
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will  
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-107-13689-2 — The Rule of Law in the Real World  
Paul Gowder  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

*For Vero*

Contents

|  |                |
|--|----------------|
| <i>Acknowledgments</i>                                     | <i>page xi</i> |
| <b>Introduction</b>  | <b>1</b>       |
| <b>1 The rule of law: a basic account</b>                  | <b>7</b>       |
| I Opening technicalities                                   | 8              |
| II The weak version of the rule of law in two principles   | 12             |
| A Regularity   | 12             |
| B Publicity  | 15             |
| III Vertical equality                                      | 18             |
| A Respect and hubris                                       | 19             |
| B Terror   | 20             |
| C Normative robustness                                     | 22             |
| IV Closing technicalities                                  | 24             |
| <b>2 The strong version of the rule of law</b>             | <b>28</b>      |
| I Generality and the idea of a relevant distinction        | 29             |
| A Many conceptions of generality                           | 29             |
| B Against the formal conception of generality              | 29             |
| C Public reason as relevance criterion                     | 33             |
| II How to apply the public reason conception of generality | 33             |
| A Public reason: expressive                                | 33             |
| B Finding the expressive content of a law                  | 35             |
| 1 Reasons and meanings                                     | 35             |
| 2 Proof of concept   | 38             |
| III Generality as egalitarian principle                    | 40             |
| <b>3 Generality and hierarchy</b>                          | <b>42</b>      |
| I The literacy tests: a model of nongeneral law            | 42             |
| II The rule of law and social facts                        | 45             |
| A The disjunctive character of rule of law commands        | 45             |

|     |  |    |
|-----|--|----|
| III | The rule of law and the criminalization of poverty                         | 45 |
| A   | The rule of law critique of economic injustice                             | 47 |
| IV  | Is this still the rule of law?   | 48 |
| V   | Private power and ordinary citizens  | 51 |
| A   | Does the rule of law require ordinary citizens to obey the law?            | 51 |
| B   | The Jim Crow challenge   | 53 |
| 4   | <b>Egalitarian liberty and reciprocity in strategic context</b>            | 58 |
| I   | The rule of law as a technology of constraint                              | 59 |
| II  | Some arguments for the liberty thesis                                      | 62 |
| A   | The incentives argument  | 62 |
| B   | The chilling effects argument  | 63 |
| 1   | The problem of complexity  | 66 |
| C   | The planning argument  | 68 |
| D   | Neorepublican liberty  | 70 |
| E   | Democratic liberty   | 73 |
| III | Libertarian equality   | 74 |
| 5   | <b>Isonomia: The dawn of legal equality</b>                                | 78 |
| I   | How was the rule of law implemented in Athens?                             | 79 |
| A   | An overview of the Athenian legal system                                   | 79 |
| B   | The rule of law and the oligarchy  | 80 |
| C   | The Athenian rule of law   | 80 |
| 1   | Regularity   | 81 |
| 2   | Publicity  | 83 |
| 3   | Generality   | 84 |
| II  | Equality and the Athenian rule of law                                      | 85 |
| A   | A catalog of Athenian evidence   | 86 |
| 1   | Forensic evidence for the Athenian equality thesis                         | 86 |
| 2   | Evidence from poets, philosophers, and historians                          | 89 |
| III | But is the rule of law really consistent with egalitarian democracy?       | 91 |
| A   | The conceptual objection: constitutionalism as the rule of law             | 91 |
| B   | The practical objection: arbitrary democracy and the trial of the generals | 93 |
| C   | The problem of informality   | 94 |
| IV  | Law contra oligarchy   | 95 |
| V   | Appendix: A brief time line of the late-fifth-century Athenian upheavals   | 95 |
| 6   | <b>The logic of coordination</b>   | 97 |
| I   | The strength <i>topos</i> and the amnesty                                  | 97 |
| A   | The struggle between oligarchs and democrats, an overview                  | 98 |
| B   | The puzzle of the amnesty  | 99 |

## Contents

ix

|          |   |            |
|----------|---|------------|
| C        | Did the Athenians learn from experience?  | 103        |
| D        | The problems of commitment: disagreement<br>and temptation                          | 105        |
| E        | Athens as a case of transitional justice  | 108        |
| II       | Formalizing and generalizing Athens   | 109        |
| A        | The model   | 112        |
| 1        | Proof   | 117        |
| 2        | Analysis  | 117        |
| <b>7</b> | <b>Parliament, Crown, and the rule of law in Britain</b>                            | <b>120</b> |
| I        | The British rule of law: illusory?  | 121        |
| A        | Hobbesian sovereignty and the absolute-power coalition                              | 123        |
| B        | Constraint, coordination, custom, and the constitution                              | 124        |
| C        | A historical precedent: customary manorial courts                                   | 128        |
| II       | The rule of law and equal status in seventeenth-century England                     | 129        |
| A        | Magna Carta as egalitarian text   | 130        |
| B        | The parliamentary debates of 1628   | 134        |
| 1        | Villeins and status   | 136        |
| 2        | Dishonor, fear, and contempt  | 137        |
| 3        | Political liberty and coordination  | 139        |
| 4        | Reviewing the evidence  | 140        |
| III      | Civic trust and the British rule of law in later years                              | 141        |
| <b>8</b> | <b>The logic of commitment</b>  | <b>143</b> |
| I        | The rule of law's teleology of equality?  | 145        |
| A        | Commitment, full generality, and the internal point of view                         | 151        |
| II       | Commitment and institutions   | 154        |
| A        | Democracy and the rule of law   | 158        |
| III      | Diversity, generality, and democracy  | 160        |
| IV       | Simulating legal stability  | 161        |
| <b>9</b> | <b>The role of development professionals: measurement<br/>        and promotion</b> | <b>168</b> |
| I        | Rule of law development   | 168        |
| A        | Persuasive commitment-building  | 171        |
| B        | Generality development  | 172        |
| C        | Radical localism  | 172        |
| 1        | Locally driven project design   | 175        |
| II       | Studying the rule of law: new empirical directions                                  | 176        |
| A        | The new measure: methods  | 179        |
| 1        | Structure and scaling   | 179        |
| 2        | Item selection and scale-fitting  | 181        |
| B        | Limitations   | 183        |
| C        | Behavior of the measure   | 183        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| III Appendix: Scores and states                              | 184        |
| A Rule of law scores   | 185        |
| B The rule of law and other measures of political well-being | 186        |
| <b>Conclusion: a commitment to equality begins at home</b>   | <b>189</b> |
| <i>Notes</i>   | 197        |
| <i>References</i>  | 249        |
| <i>Index</i>   | 271        |



## Acknowledgments

Part of this book is derived from my prior publications, although all have been heavily revised and no chapter has previously appeared elsewhere in its entirety. Parts of Chapter 1 and Chapter 2 have previously appeared in part in Paul Gowder, 2013, “The Rule of Law and Equality,” *Law and Philosophy* 32(5): 565–618 (reproduced by permission per Springer copyright transfer agreement). Parts of Chapter 2 and Chapter 3 have previously appeared in part in Paul Gowder, 2014, “Equal Law in an Unequal World,” *Iowa Law Review* 99(3): 1021–81 (copyright retained and republication rights reserved by the undersigned). Parts of Chapter 5 and Chapter 6 have previously appeared in part in Paul Gowder, 2014, “Democracy, Solidarity, and the Rule of Law: Lessons from Athens,” *Buffalo Law Review* 62(1): 1–67 (copyright retained and republication rights reserved by the undersigned). Finally, part of Chapter 6 has appeared in part in Paul Gowder, 2015, “Trust and Commitment: How Athens Rebuilt the Rule of Law,” in Claudio Corradetti, Nir Eisikovits, and Jack Volpe Rotondi, eds., *Theorizing Transitional Justice* (Ashgate, 2015) (copyright retained and republication rights reserved by the undersigned). In addition, parts of “The Rule of Law and Equality” and “Democracy, Solidarity, and the Rule of Law: Lessons from Athens” as well as parts of Chapter 1 and Chapter 4 were previously part of my (unpublished, and not otherwise available) Stanford University PhD dissertation (2012) (during which process I received financial support from the Gerhard Casper Stanford Graduate Fellowship and the Geballe Dissertation Prize Fellowship). The final months of the writing of this book were supported by the Institute for Advanced Study, School of Social Science.

So many people have offered kind feedback that the only possible way to acknowledge them all is in a soulless alphabetical list (and many are unfortunately forgotten), to wit: Arash Abizadeh, Danielle Allen, Elizabeth Anderson, Marcus Arvan, Kristen Bell, Patricia Broussard, Rachel Brule, Dustin Buehler, Steven Burton, Joshua Cohen, Charlton Copeland, David Dyzenhaus, James Fearon, Gary Fine, Evan Fox-Decent, Tom Gallanis, Robert Gordon, Avner Greif, Enrique Guerra, Peter Halewood, Herb Hovenkamp, John Inazu, Patti Lenard,

Jacob Levy, Catherine Lu, Dan Markel (late and greatly missed), Candace McCoy, Hudson Meadwell, Frank Michelman, Ebrahim Moosa, Muriel Morisey, Victor Muñoz-Fraticelli, Michael Nafi, Josiah Ober, Angela Onwuachi-Willig, Mark Osiel, Andrew Rehfeld, John Reitz, Tobey Scharding, Micah Schwartzman, Ahmed Souaiaia, Natalie Stoljar, Brian Tamanaha, Alexander Tsesis, Eli Wald, Daniel Weinstock, and Adrian Wing, as well as those others who helped out in the many workshops noted below. Joshua Cohen and Josiah Ober in particular provided endless support and inspiration, both intensively during the writing of the PhD dissertation that suggested the skeleton for this book and with wise advice thereafter.

I would also like to thank the University of Iowa research assistants who have contributed to the preparation of this book, Brett Holubeck, Shawn McCullough, Malvika Rawal, Estiven Rojo, and Eric Schmitt, as well as Seth Jones, a professional copy editor who rescued my references after a technological catastrophe, and Rhonda DeCook and her students in a University of Iowa statistical consulting seminar, Stephanie Kriewall and Laura Hosch, who provided invaluable assistance with early modeling attempts. Alejandro Ponce of the World Justice Project very kindly provided the raw data on which the analyses in Chapter 9 were carried out, and Margaret Levi kindly connected us. Corey Yanofsky and Joe Foley provided kind advice for writing the R code that made up the simulation in Chapter 8. The assistance of Brenna Miller and Benjamin Rogers at the University of Iowa High Performance Computing cluster has been invaluable in actually getting that simulation running. Mandy Keifetz miraculously conjured an index out of thin air (and experience, and skill, and training).

Various parts of this book have been presented in numerous workshops and conferences, including the Sharing Scholarship, Building Teachers Workshop at Albany Law School; Arizona State University Legal Scholars Workshop; ClassCrits V, Culp Colloquium at Duke University; Big Ten Untenured Faculty Conference at Indiana University Maurer School of Law; the workshop on egalitarianism at the Institute for Advanced Study, School of Social Science; Iowa Legal Studies Workshop; Mid-Atlantic People of Color Legal Scholarship Conference; Midwest Junior Scholars Workshop at Washington University, St. Louis; Montreal Political Theory Manuscript Workshop of the Groupe de Recherche Interuniversitaire en Philosophie Politique de Montréal; Southeast/Southwest People of Color Legal Scholarship Conference; Stanford Humanities Center Workshop, Stanford Political Theory Workshop, a classics/political science seminar at Stanford, a Stanford Law School workshop, and a joint workshop between the Freeman Spogli Institute for International Studies and Stanford Law School; and faculty job talks in 2011 and 2012 at the University of California (Hastings), University of Iowa, University of Virginia, and Washington University (St. Louis); I have benefited greatly from feedback from the participants therein, some, but not all, of whom are individually mentioned above.