ARISTOTLE ON FEMALE ANIMALS

Aristotle’s account of female nature has received mostly negative treatment, emphasizing what he says females cannot do. Building on recent research, this book comprehensively revises such readings, setting out the complex and positive role played by the female in Aristotle’s thought with a particular focus on the longest surviving treatise on reproduction in the ancient corpus, the Generation of Animals. It provides new interpretations of the nature of Aristotle’s sexism, his theory of male and female interaction in generation and his account of inherited features. It also discusses a range of more general issues which can and should be re-examined in light of Aristotle’s account of female animals: his methodology, hylomorphism, teleology and psychology. Aristotle on Female Animals will be valuable to all those interested in Aristotle’s philosophy and the history of gender.

SOPHIA M. CONNELL is an Affiliated Lecturer in the Faculty of Philosophy, University of Cambridge, a Fellow of Selwyn College and a Bye Fellow of Newnham College. She has published articles on Aristotle’s biology and Galen and Aristotle on women’s bodies.
ARISTOTLE ON FEMALE ANIMALS
A Study of the *Generation of Animals*

SOPHIA M. CONNELL
*University of Cambridge*
For my mother and my daughters
# CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of figures and tables</th>
<th>page x</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of abbreviations</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Introduction**

Preliminaries concerning Aristotle’s study of nature

**Part I  Methodology in the study of Aristotle on female animals**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1 Feminism, sexism and Aristotle</th>
<th>17</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Feminist histories of philosophy</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Unravelling erroneous associations Part 1: the metaphysics of oppositions</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Unravelling erroneous associations Part 2: biology and politics</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 Combining the concerns of feminist and traditional scholars of Aristotle</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 Aristotle’s sexism</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2 Consistency in the <em>Generation of Animals</em></th>
<th>53</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Methodology in scholarship on Aristotle and the <em>Generation of Animals</em></td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 The <em>Generation of Animals</em> and the <em>Analytics</em></td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Situating the GA in Aristotle’s study of nature and living things</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Generation in different animal varieties</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 More detailed accounts of the generative process</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 The female role: need there be any contradiction?</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7 Notes on dialectic in the <em>Generation of Animals</em></td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

Part II  Re-assessing the generative role of the female animal in Aristotle

Introduction 91

3 Menstrual blood and female semen 93
  3.1 Ancient seed theories: Aristotle as contrasted with
      Hippocrates and Galen 93
  3.2 Aristotle’s arguments for the differing functions
      of male and female 95
  3.3 Aristotle on female semen 101
  3.4 Contrasting views on the role of the female in generation 107

4 Matter 121
  4.1 The female contribution as ‘inert’ or ‘raw’ matter 121
  4.2 The craft analogy and the metaphysics of animate
      existence 123
  4.3 The agrarian metaphor: the female principle as external
      food 127
  4.4 Nutrition: bodily mixture versus bodily structure
      and function 132
  4.5 Blood: the female principle as internal food 141
  4.6 The metaphysics of female matter: the female principle
      as the body 151
  4.7 Craft analogies revisited 156

Part III  Re-assessing the generative role of the male animal in Aristotle

Introduction 161

5 The male as efficient and formal cause of generation 163
  5.1 The male as generator and source of change 163
  5.2 Male and female as jointly actualized potentials 170
  5.3 Male and female interaction and gradual foetal
      development 172
  5.4 The male role as actual 177

6 Interpretations of Aristotle on the male role 181
  6.1 The principle of life (ζΩτικΩν archΩn) 181
  6.2 Theological vitalism 187
  6.3 Materialist interpretations 195
  6.4 Aristotle and vitalism 229
## Contents

**Part IV  Generation in lower animals and particular instances**  
235  
   Introduction  
   235  
7  Generation in lower animals  
   239  
   7.1  Aristotle’s teleology and ordering of animal kinds  
   239  
   7.2  Generation in fish and bees  
   243  
   7.3  Wind-eggs  
   252  
   7.4  On the margins of life: the phenomenon of spontaneous generation  
   255  
8  Aristotle on sexual differentiation  
   265  
   8.1  One or two sexes for Aristotle?  
   265  
   8.2  Male and female animals are functional wholes  
   267  
   8.3  The chemistry of sex difference  
   270  
   8.4  The physiology of sex difference  
   276  
   8.5  Sex opposition: the female as simultaneously successful and failed  
   280  
   8.6  Females and teleological explanations  
   284  
9  Aristotle on heredity  
   292  
   9.1  The dilemma concerning Aristotle on heredity  
   292  
   9.2  Aristotle’s account of hereditary resemblance  
   293  
   9.3  GA IV.3: interpretative issues  
   300  
   9.4  Individual form interpretations  
   302  
   9.5  Alternative solutions: understanding *kinêsis*  
   318  
10  Teleology and necessity in the *Generation of Animals*  
    325  
    10.0  Introduction  
    325  
    10.1  Explanations in terms of material necessity in Aristotle’s biology  
    328  
    10.2  Explanations of infertility  
    337  
    10.3  General explanations of deformity  
    340  
    10.4  Explanations of proneness to deformity  
    352  
    10.5  Explanations of proneness to environmental effects in subsidiary parts  
    361  
    10.6  Teleology, material necessity and the generation of animals  
    369  
11  Conclusion  
    374  

*Bibliography*  
380  
*Index locorum*  
407  
*General index*  
427
LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES

Figure

1.1 ‘Weibermacht’ (The power of women), copper engraving, Southern Germany or Switzerland, sixteenth–eighteenth century © INTERFOTO / Alamy  page 8

Tables

2.1 The syllogistic form of scientific knowledge  57
2.2 Citations of others’ views in the GA  87
4.1 Ancient medical model likening foetus to plant  130
4.2 A postulated Aristotelian model likening foetus to plant  131
4.3 Comparison of the Aristotelian and ancient medical models likening foetus to plant  148
4.4 Revised Aristotelian model likening foetus to plant  149
4.5 Levels of formation of matter in Aristotle  152
7.1 Goals of living beings  240
10.1 Hierarchy of generative success according to Aristotle  339
10.2 Possible generative outcomes in terms of hereditary resemblance  343
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book is a development of my work for an MPhil and a PhD in the Faculty of Classics, University of Cambridge. It has gone through many changes since that time. I am most especially grateful to my PhD supervisor, Geoffrey Lloyd, who has always believed that this work would eventually be complete. I would like to thank him for his profound insights and his generous support. I would also like to acknowledge the assistance of Myles Burnyeat, Robert Wardy, Nicholas Denyer, David Sedley and Malcolm Schofield, who advised me during my early research, and David Charles, my external PhD examiner.

I have presented earlier versions of the chapters of this book in various settings and have particularly benefitted from the criticisms and suggestions of Allan Gotthelf, James Lennox, Robert Bolton, Marguerite Deslauriers, Devin Henry, Mariska Leunissen, Joseph Karbowski, Philip van der Eijk, Andrew Coles, Sabine Fellinger, Chad Weiner and Richard King. Most recently, I presented part of Chapter 6 at the Sorbonne, University of Paris. I would like to thank David Lefebvre, Greg Salmieri, James Lennox and Andrea Falcon for their questions on that occasion. I am also very grateful to Liba Taub and Rae Langton, my generous colleagues at Newnham College, for reading over and commenting on drafts of chapters.

Academic institutions that have supported me over the years include the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, Darwin College, Cambridge, St John’s College, Cambridge, the Faculty of Philosophy, University of Cambridge and Newnham College, Cambridge. I am very grateful to those involved in the editing and production of this book. From Cambridge University Press I thank especially Michael Sharp, Elizabeth Hanlon, David Mackenzie and two anonymous readers for their extremely helpful comments and criticisms. Thanks also
Acknowledgements

to Ramya Ranganathan for project management, Kevin Hughes for copy editing, Ellisif Wasmuth for help with the Index locorum and Chiara Blanco for proofreading the Greek text.

I am grateful to my friends and family for their many kindnesses, particularly my mother and father, Rosanna Omitowoju, Susanna Avery-Quash, Jan-Melissa Schramm, Christopher Schramm, John Short, William Elliott, Daria Chrin-Elliott, Anthea Connell, Derek Matravers, Alix Cohen, Florian Steinberger, Jane Heal, Fraser MacBride, Simon Harrison, Lubomira Radoilska, Helen Dolling, Katherine Woodard, Melinda Rose, Katie Tomkies, Erika Hutchinson and Daryll Hughes. They will all know how much it means to me to publish this book. Finally, I owe the greatest debt of gratitude to my husband, Phil Connell. If there is any virtue in having completed this project, I must share it with him, a true friend. ‘For what our friends achieve is, in a way, achieved through our own agency’ (EN 1112b27).

xii
ABBREVIATIONS

Aristotle’s works

A. Po. Analytica Posteriora (Posterior Analytics)
A. Pr. Analytica Priora (Prior Analytics)
Cael. De Caelo (On the Heavens)
Cat. Categoriae (Categories)
de An. de Anima (On the Soul)
Div. Somn. De Divinatione per Somnum (On Divination by Dreams)
EE Ethica Eudemia (Eudemian Ethics)
EN Ethica Nicomachea (Nicomachean Ethics)
GA De Generatione Animalium (Generation of Animals)
GC De Generatione et Corruptione (Generation and Corruption)
HA Historia Animalium (History of Animals)
IA De Incessu Animalium (Progression of Animals)
Insomn. De Insomniis (On Dreams)
Juv. De Juventute et Senectute [De Vita et Morte] (On Youth and Old Age [On Life and Death])
Long. De Longitudine et Brevitate Vitae (On Length and Shortness of Life)
MM Magna Moralia
MA De Motu Animalium (Movement of Animals)
Mem. De Memoria et Reminiscentia (On Memory and Recollection)
Metaph. Metaphysica (Metaphysics)
Mete. Meteorologica (Meteorology)
PA De Partibus Animalium (Parts of Animals)
Ph. Physica (Physics)
Poet. Poetica (Poetics)
Pol. Politica (Politics)
List of abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Resp</td>
<td>De Respiratione (On Respiration)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rh</td>
<td>Rhetorica (Rhetoric)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sens</td>
<td>De Sensu et Sensibilibus (On Sense and Sense Objects)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somn</td>
<td>De Somno et Vigilia (On Sleep and Waking)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Top</td>
<td>Topica (Topics)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Works by other Greek authors**

**Hippocrates**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aër</td>
<td>Airs, Waters, Places</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aph</td>
<td>Aphorisms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carn</td>
<td>On Fleshes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cord</td>
<td>On the Heart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Epid</td>
<td>Epidemics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genit</td>
<td>On Generation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loc. Hom</td>
<td>Places in Man</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morb</td>
<td>On Diseases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morb. Sacr.</td>
<td>On the Sacred Disease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mul</td>
<td>On Diseases of Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nat. Hom</td>
<td>On the Nature of Man</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nat. Puer</td>
<td>On the Nature of the Child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steril</td>
<td>On Sterility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vict</td>
<td>On Regimen</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Galen [Claudius]**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sem</td>
<td>De Semine (On Semen)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UP</td>
<td>De Usu Partium (On the Usefulness of the Parts of the Body)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ut. Diss.</td>
<td>De Uteri Dissectione (On the Anatomy of the Uterus)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Hesiod**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Theog</td>
<td>Theogony</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

xiv
List of abbreviations

Plato

Phlb. Philebus
Rep. Republic
Ti. Timaeus

Pseudo-Aristotle

Mu. De Mundo (On the Universe)
Pr. Problemata (Problems)
Spir. De Spiritu (On Breath)

Theophrastus

CP De Causis Plantarum (On the Causes of Plants)
HP Historia Plantarum (Enquiry into Plants)
Metaph. Metaphysics

Other abbreviations


References to Aristotle’s texts follow Bekker pagination and Peck’s emendations, unless otherwise specified.
References to Plato’s texts follow Stephanus pagination.
Translations of the Generation of Animals are adapted from Peck in Aristotle (1942). Translators of other works are cited in footnotes.