

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-13583-3 — Politicized Enforcement in Argentina  
Matthew Amengual  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

## Politicized Enforcement in Argentina

Countries throughout the world have passed regulations that promise protection for workers and the environment, but violations of these policies are more common than compliance. All too often, limitations of state capacity and political will intertwine, hindering enforcement. Why do states enforce regulations in some places, and in some industries, but not in others? In *Politicized Enforcement in Argentina*, Amengual develops a framework for analyzing enforcement in middle-income and developing countries, showing how informal linkages between state officials and groups within society allow officials to gain the operational resources and political support necessary for enforcement. This analysis builds on state-society approaches in comparative politics, but in contrast to theories that emphasize state autonomy, it focuses on key differences in the way states are porous to political influence.

Matthew Amengual is an assistant professor at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology in the MIT Sloan School of Management. He is affiliated with the Institute for Work and Employment Research and the Sustainability Initiative. His research on labor and environmental politics has been published in *Politics & Society*, *World Development*, *Industrial and Labor Relations Review*, and *Desarrollo Económico*.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-13583-3 — Politicized Enforcement in Argentina  
Matthew Amengual  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

# Politicized Enforcement in Argentina

## *Labor and Environmental Regulation*

MATTHEW AMENGUAL  
*Massachusetts Institute of Technology*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-13583-3 — Politicized Enforcement in Argentina  
Matthew Amengual  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107135833](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107135833)

© Matthew Amengual, 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

### *Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Names: Amengual, Matthew, author.

Title: Politicized enforcement in Argentina : labor and environmental regulation / Matthew Amengual.

Description: New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, [2016]

Identifiers: LCCN 2015042011 | ISBN 9781107135833 (Hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Administrative agencies—Argentina. | Environmental agencies—Argentina. |

Labor laws and legislation—Argentina. | Labor policy—Argentina. | Environmental law—Argentina. |

Environmental policy—Argentina—Citizen participation. | Industrial laws and legislation—Argentina. |

Industrial policy—Argentina. | BISAC: POLITICAL SCIENCE / Government / General.

Classification: LCC JL2031 .A75 2016 | DDC 331.12/0420982—dc23 LC record available at <http://lcn.loc.gov/2015042011>

ISBN 978-1-107-13583-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page</i> vii
1 Introduction: the challenge of enforcement	I
2 Explaining enforcement of labor and environmental regulations	16
PART I LABOR REGULATION	
3 Labor regulation in Argentina	51
4 Enforcement with unions in the driver's seat	73
5 State-driven and co-produced enforcement in labor regulation	112
PART II ENVIRONMENTAL REGULATION	
6 Chaotic environmental regulation in Argentina	147
7 Putting out fires in Santa Fe and Córdoba	168
8 Pollution in the "Garden of the Republic"	190
PART III CONCLUSION	
9 Conclusion	219
<i>Appendix: List of Interviews in Argentina</i>	241
<i>Works Cited</i>	251
<i>Index</i>	267

## Acknowledgments

This work was born out of a set of conversations that began for me at MIT in 2005, when a group of graduate students and faculty became intensely interested in the role of regulation in development. The gap between the promise of policies and actual practices on the ground drew our attention to the regulators who are charged with implementation on a day to day basis. We read broadly, debated intensively, and traveled to learn firsthand what was happening inside bureaucracies, firms, and societal organizations involved with regulation. We periodically reconvened at MIT to share our findings from the world and debate how regulation works, as well as ways to improve its practice. I learned a tremendous amount from my friends, mentors who were part of these discussions, and from the rich literature on regulation and states. Yet, when I set off to Argentina in 2008, the theoretical toolkit that I brought with me was, in many ways, terribly inadequate. I chose to study Argentina, in part, because I believed that I would find differences in the organization of the state bureaucracies that could account for variance in the ways regulations were implemented. The regulatory bureaucracies I encountered, however, were all far removed from the Weberian ideal-types highlighted in the literature. As a result, dominant theories were of little guidance for understanding what I encountered on the ground. The puzzle became to understand how and why seemingly flawed bureaucracies sometimes enforced regulations and sometimes did not. In searching for an answer, I needed to build upon the literature that had informed my thinking so deeply and develop a new set of tools to make sense of aspects of regulatory politics that had been otherwise hidden. Through the lens of the Argentine cases, this book is my attempt to offer a new way of thinking about the way politicized states enforce the rules of the game. By doing so, my hope is to not only shed some light on what drives different actions by states that had been otherwise homogenized, but also to reveal the possibilities and constraints of regulation that had been obscured.

In the process of writing this book, I incurred many debts. They began with my dissertation committee, who have left a huge mark on my work. Suzanne Berger patiently helped me cut through the haze to identify the contours of a theory when I could not. Steve Levitsky's careful reading and insightful suggestions immeasurably improved my work, and he provided an example of detailed field research and theoretical development to which I aspired. Mike Piore's characteristically stimulating ideas shaped my research agenda and constantly encouraged me to recognize what was truly surprising about my findings. While all members of my committee helped me tremendously, Rick Locke played an outsized role in all stages of this project. He has been a continual mentor from the inception of this work to its publication, and has demonstrated by example what it means to be a scholar committed to generating and diffusing knowledge that is rigorous and relevant.

A large part of the work I did on this project took place in Argentina. The funding I used to conduct fieldwork was provided by a grant from the MIT Center for International Studies and from the International Dissertation Research Fellowship Program of the Social Science Research Council, with funds provided by the Andrew W. Mellon Foundation. In Argentina, I was fortunate to gain insights, direction, and support from a number of colleagues and friends, including Sebastian Etchemendy, Carla Giacomuzzi, Adriana Marshall, Bárbara Medwid, Lucas Ronconi, and Cecilia Senén-Gonzalez. While conducting interviews, I often felt like a traveling salesman with nothing to sell, trying to convince people to help me when I could offer very little in return. It is no exaggeration to say that this book would not have been possible without the hundreds of people who sat down with me and shared their stories. Along the way, there were a few who helped me gain access at key moments, including José Luis Blasco, María Eugenia Di Paola, Ariel Carbajal, Alfredo Montalván, Guillermo Alonso Navone, Carlos Aníbel Rodríguez, Jorge Sappia, Omar Hugo Sereno, and José Luis Yacanto. I am greatly indebted to all of them. I am also grateful to those who worked with me on the research in Indonesia that helped shed some comparative light on the Argentine cases, especially Laura Chiro, Mohamad Anis Agung Nugroho, and Achmed Hasan.

Luckily, I had ample support in the difficult task of taking in the complicated world and forming it into this book from a broad community of scholars. I am especially grateful to: Salo Coslovsky, Kristin Fabbe, Janice Fine, Tom Kochan, Jason Jackson, Gabi Kruks-Wisner, Alisha Holland, Akshay Mangla, Roberto Pires, Susan Silbey, Ben Ross Schneider, Andrew Schrank, David Weil, and Adam Ziegfeld. Their advice and encouragement made this work immeasurably stronger. I greatly appreciate the scholars who read a complete draft at my workshop: Patrick Heller, Margaret Levi, Marcus Kurtz, Margaret Keck, Alison Post, and Richard Snyder. I also thank Anna Katsavos, for helping make sure the ideas in this book are clearly expressed. Finally, I acknowledge the *Industrial and Labor Relations Review* and *Politics & Society* for publishing articles out of this project and for permission to use the material in this book.

*Acknowledgments*

ix

While much of the last ten years was spent thinking about regulation in Argentina and elsewhere, a lot happened outside of the narrow world of research for which I am deeply grateful. For my parents, Ann and Randy, who laid the foundation for my scholarship and continually supported me to make my work possible. For the arrival of Luca, our *piccolino*, whose *vuoi giocare con me?* helped me focus on what really matters. And most of all for Monica, who has been an intellectual partner throughout this project. Busy with her own work, she nevertheless endured seemingly endless conversation about the bureaucrats, labor leaders, environmentalists, and managers who fascinated me. *Grazie*.