

#### GENERATING GENEROSITY IN CATHOLICISM AND ISLAM

Using an innovative methodological approach combining field experiments, case studies, and statistical analyses, this book explores how the religious beliefs and institutions of Catholics and Muslims prompt them to be generous with their time and resources. Drawing upon research involving more than 1,000 Catholics and Muslims in France, Ireland, Italy, and Turkey, the authors examine Catholicism and Islam in majority and minority contexts, discerning the specific factors that lead adherents to help others and contribute to social welfare projects. Based on theories from political science, economics, religious studies, and social psychology, this approach uncovers the causal connections between religious community dynamics, religious beliefs and institutions, and sociopolitical contexts that promote or hinder the generosity of Muslims and Catholics. The study also provides insight into what different religious beliefs mean to Muslims and Catholics, and how they understand those concepts.

Carolyn M. Warner is Professor of Political Science in the School of Politics and Global Studies at Arizona State University. She is the author of Confessions of an Interest Group: The Catholic Church and Political Parties in Post-War Europe (2000), The Best System Money Can Buy (2007), and articles in Perspectives on Politics and Psychological Science, among other journals.

Ramazan Kılınç is Associate Professor of Political Science and Co-Director of the Islamic Studies Program at the University of Nebraska at Omaha. He has published articles in *Comparative Politics, Political Science Quarterly, Politics and Religion*, and *Studies in Conflict and Terrorism*, among other journals.

Christopher W. Hale is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of Alabama. He has published in outlets such as the *American Journal of Political Science* and *Comparative Politics*.

Adam B. Cohen is Professor of Psychology at Arizona State University, and is an associate editor of the *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*. He is the author of numerous articles, book chapters, and essays, and editor of the book *Culture Reexamined* (2014).



#### CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN ECONOMICS, CHOICE, AND SOCIETY

#### Founding Editors

Timur Kuran, *Duke University* Peter J. Boettke, *George Mason University* 

This interdisciplinary series promotes original theoretical and empirical research as well as integrative syntheses involving links between individual choice, institutions, and social outcomes. Contributions are welcome from across the social sciences, particularly in the areas where economic analysis is joined with other disciplines such as comparative political economy, new institutional economics, and behavioral economics.

#### Books in the Series:

- TERRY L. ANDERSON and GARY D. LIBECAP, Environmental Markets: A Property Rights Approach
- MORRIS B. HOFFMAN, The Punisher's Brain: The Evolution of Judge and Jury PETER T. LEESON, Anarchy Unbound: Why Self-Governance Works Better than You Think
- BENJAMIN POWELL, Out of Poverty: Sweatshops in the Global Economy
  CASS R. SUNSTEIN, The Ethics of Influence: Government in the Age of Behavioral Science
- JARED RUBIN, Rulers, Religion, and Riches: Why the West Got Rich and the Middle East Did Not
- JEAN-PHILIPPE PLATTEAU, Islam Instrumentalized: Religion and Politics in Historical Perspective
- TAIZU ZHANG, The Laws and Economics of Confucianism: Kinship and Property in Preindustrial China and England
- ROGER KOPPL, Expert Failure
- MICHAEL C. MUNGER, Tomorrow 3.0: Transaction Costs and the Sharing Economy
- CAROLYN M. WARNER, RAMAZAN KILINÇ, CHRISTOPHER W. HALE and ADAM B. COHEN Generating Generosity in Catholicism and Islam: Beliefs, Institutions, and Public Goods Provision



# Generating Generosity in Catholicism and Islam

Beliefs, Institutions, and Public Goods Provision

### CAROLYN M. WARNER

Arizona State University

## RAMAZAN KILINÇ

University of Nebraska, Omaha

#### CHRISTOPHER W. HALE

University of Alabama

#### ADAM B. COHEN

Arizona State University





# CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107135512
DOI: 10.1017/9781316471722

© Carolyn M. Warner, Ramazan Kılınç, Christopher W. Hale and Adam B. Cohen 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Names: Warner, Carolyn M., 1961– author. | Kılınç, Ramazan, 1977– author. |
Hale, Christopher W., 1980– author.

Title: Generating generosity in Catholicism and Islam: beliefs, institutions, and public goods provision / Carolyn M. Warner, Ramazan Kılınç, Christopher W. Hale, and Adam B. Cohen.

Description: New York: Cambridge University Press, 2018. | Series: Cambridge studies in economics, choice, and society | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017055506 | ISBN 9781107135512 (hardback : alk. paper) | ISBN 9781316501320 (pbk. : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Generosity-Religious aspects-Christianity. | Catholic Church. |
Generosity-Religious aspects-Islam. | Islam.
Classification: LCC BV4647.G45 G46 2018 | DDC 241/.4-dc23
LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2017055506

ISBN 978-1-107-13551-2 Hardback ISBN 978-1-316-50132-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> To G. J. Lilly Cohen, Erica Hale, Halide Görgün Kılınç, and Robert Warner





#### Contents

| List of Figures |  | page ix |
|-----------------|--|---------|
|                 | st of Tables   | xi      |
|                 | knowledgments  | xiii    |
| Lis             | st of Abbreviations  | XV      |
| 1               | Introduction: What We Do and Don't Know about Religious-Bas<br>Generosity                            | ed<br>1 |
| 2               | The Charitable Consequences of Institutions and Rituals in Catholicism and Islam                     | 26      |
| 3               | Generosity, Public Goods Provision, and Religious Beliefs in<br>Catholicism and Islam: An Experiment | 67      |
| 4               | The Meaning of Religion to Catholics and Muslims   | 89      |
| 5               | Religious Communities, Prosociality, and Connections to Others                                       | 116     |
| 6               | Belief, Belonging, and Giving in Catholic Parishes and Muslim Associations                           | 143     |
| 7               | Religious Minorities and Generosity  | 165     |
| 8               | The Welfare State, Religion, and Generosity  | 187     |
| 9               | Conclusion: Religion and Public Goods Provision  | 229     |
| Appendix        |  | 239     |
|                 | further Online Appendix can be accessed at<br>ww.cambridge.org/9781107135512                         |         |
| References      |  | 263     |
| Index           |  | 287     |

vii





# Figures

| 2.1 | Chiesa di Santa Maria alla Fontana, Milan                    | page 31 |
|-----|--|---------|
| 2.2 | Poster at Saint-Pierre de Montrouge for annual               |         |
|     | diocesan pledge drive ("denier de l'Église") and Ash         |         |
|     | Wednesday, Paris   | 52      |
| 2.3 | Envelope for the Lent collection, Basilique Cathédrale       |         |
|     | du Saint-Esprit, Istanbul                                    | 54      |
| 2.4 | Saint-Pierre de Montrouge collection brochure                | 55      |
| 2.5 | Ballygall parish Church of Our Mother of Divine Grace,       |         |
|     | after a Sunday mass, Dublin                                  | 57      |
| 3.1 | Change in predicted probability of making a donation         |         |
|     | to club and public goods, Irish Catholics                    | 76      |
| 3.2 | Change in predicted probability of making a donation to      |         |
|     | club and public goods, Turkish Muslims                       | 76      |
| 3.3 | Irish Catholic religiosity and predicted probability of club |         |
|     | donations  | 79      |
| 3.4 | Turkish Muslim religiosity and predicted probability of club | )       |
|     | donations  | 79      |
| 3.5 | Essay prompts and Irish Catholic mentions of charity         | 85      |
| 3.6 | Essay prompts and Turkish Muslim mentions of charity         | 86      |
| 8.1 | Social protection spending and predicted probability         |         |
|     | of supporting citizen responsibility for public goods        |         |
|     | provision  | 196     |
| 8.2 | Religiosity and predicted probability of supporting citizen  |         |
|     | responsibility for public goods provision                    | 197     |
| 8.3 | Religious/social protection interaction and predicted        |         |
|     | probability of supporting citizen responsibility for public  |         |
|     | goods provision  | 197     |
|     |  |         |



| X   | Figures  |     |
|-----|--|-----|
| 8.4 | Taxation rates and predicted probability of supporting citizen |     |
|     | responsibility for public goods provision                      | 198 |
| 8.5 | Religious denominations and predicted probability              |     |
|     | of supporting citizen responsibility for public goods          |     |
|     | provision  | 200 |
| 86  | Kimse Yok Mu brochure about activities in Sudan                | 208 |



# Tables

| 3.1  | Proportion of participants making a donation              | page 83 |
|------|---|---------|
| 3.2  | Proportion of participants making a donation, by religion | 83      |
| A.1  | Demographics of Muslim interviewees                       | 241     |
| A.2  | Demographics of Catholic interviewees                     | 241     |
| A.3  | Experiment results: raw regression coefficients           |         |
|      | (primary models)  | 244     |
| A.4  | Raw regression coefficients, Irish Catholics with         |         |
|      | demographic data  | 244     |
| A.5  | Raw regression coefficients, Turkish Muslims with         |         |
|      | demographic data  | 246     |
| A.6  | Demographics of Turkish Muslim participants               | 247     |
| A.7  | Demographics of Irish Catholic participants               | 247     |
| A.8  | Experiment prompts and mentions of charity, Irish         |         |
|      | Catholics and Turkish Muslims                             | 248     |
| A.9  | Irish Catholics: experiment prompts and mentions of       |         |
|      | concepts and topics                                       | 250     |
| A.10 | Turkish Muslims: experiment prompts and mentions of       |         |
|      | concepts and topics                                       | 252     |
| A.11 | State expenditures and citizen responsibility for         |         |
|      | public goods provision                                    | 254     |
| A.12 | State expenditures and citizen responsibility for         |         |
|      | public goods provision by denomination                    | 258     |





# Acknowledgments

This book's proximal origins lie in a "request for proposals" notification that one of the authors received from the University of Notre Dame's Science of Generosity Program, funded by the Templeton Foundation. We thank the Science of Generosity Program, as well as the Templeton Foundation, for research funding, and Christian Smith for his role in creating and leading the program. The project benefited from the skillful work of helpful research assistants. We thank Sevde Arpacı, Matthew E. Bergman, Sherman Duckworth, Kathryn A. Johnson, Jenna A. Mudrick, Angela Pirlott, Dimitri Sementchoukov, Nick Sobecki, Scott Swagerty, and Chloe Westlund for research assistance. We are very grateful for the helpful comments and critiques of Lenka Bustikova, Paul Djupe, Richard Fording, Abdullahi Gallab, Tony Gill, Ahmet Kuru, Larry Iannaccone, Jared Rubin, Bernhard Reinsberg, David Siroky, Joseph Smith, several anonymous reviewers, and participants at seminars at Arizona State University, Chapman University, Duke University, AALIMS-Princeton University, and Yale University, on earlier papers that became part of this book. We regret if we did not or could not successfully take and implement all of their advice. Notably, we thank Timur Kuran for his initial and continuing interest in the project and book manuscript, and his insightful critiques and suggestions to improve the book. All interpretations, arguments, and any errors are our responsibility.

We also thank the Institute for Social Science Research at Arizona State University for its financial contribution to the project. We note with appreciation the contributions of Carolyn Forbes and Maureen Olmsted, of Arizona State University's Center for the Study of Religion and Conflict. Their good-spirited, competent assistance was invaluable in all aspects of the logistics of the project, including dealing with the human subjects review boards of four different universities (two overseas) and the



xiv

#### Acknowledgments

sponsored projects offices of two universities. Carolyn Warner thanks Pat Kenney, who facilitated release time for her field research, and, especially, her co-authors, who have been wonderful, indeed, generous, collaborators on all aspects of research and writing for this project.

This work could not have been done without the assistance and cooperation of the religious officials who allowed access to their religious communities, and we thank them sincerely for their openness and assistance. Professors David Farrell and Christopher Whelan at University College Dublin and Professors Ali Tekcan and Kutlu Ülgen at Boğaziçi University provided crucial assistance in facilitating the conduct of experiments with students at their universities. We appreciate the assistance of Noel Barber, S.J., and Guido Formigoni in facilitating contacts with Catholic entities in Dublin and Milan, respectively. We especially thank the interviewees and experiment participants for their willingness to take part in this project.

Parts of this book are drawn, in revised form, from "Micro-Foundations of Religion and Public Goods Provision: Belief, Belonging and Giving in Catholicism and Islam," *Politics and Religion*, 8/4 (2015): 718–744; "Religion and Public Goods Provision: Experimental and Interview Evidence from Catholicism and Islam in Europe," *Comparative Politics* 47/2 (Jan. 2015): 189–209; and "Charitable Giving Model or Muddle?," *The Review of Faith and International Affairs* 11/4 (Winter 2013): 32–36. The revised material is presented here with permission from Cambridge University Press, City University of New York, and Taylor & Francis, respectively. We thank the anonymous reviewers and the journal editors for helpful comments on the articles.

A project like this one also benefits immensely from the generosity of loved ones. Chris Hale expresses his profound gratitude to his wife, Erica Hale, who never ceases to be an inspiration and whose love, support, and sacrifice are deeply appreciated. Ramazan Kılınç's deepest gratitude goes to his beloved wife Halide Görgün Kılınç. She is certainly the person who deserves the biggest acknowledgment, not only for her support, love, and belief in him but also for making his life a happy one. Carolyn Warner thanks her husband, Joe Cutter, for his long-standing support and love, not to mention good humor about the work, and for holding down the fort while she conducted field research. She takes this opportunity to dedicate the book to her father, Robert Warner, whose love and support have been unflagging.



#### **Abbreviations**

AKP Adalet ve Kalkınma Partisi (Justice and Development Party)

CCFD Comité catholique contre la faim et pour le développement-Terre

Solidaire (Catholic Committee against Hunger and for

Development-Solidarity of the Earth)

DC Dublin Catholic interviewee
DM Dublin Muslim interviewee
EP experiment participant
IC Istanbul Catholic interviewee
IM Istanbul Muslim interviewee

KYM Kimse Yok Mu (Is Anybody Listening?)

MC Milan Catholic interviewee
MM Milan Muslim interviewee
PC Paris Catholic interviewee
PM Paris Muslim interviewee

SVdP Société Saint Vincent-de-Paul, Società San Vincenzo de Paoli,

Society of St. Vincent de Paul

TIECS Turkish-Irish Educational and Cultural Society

UCD University College Dublin
UNICEF United Nations Children's Fund

