

EAST ASIAN PERSPECTIVES ON POLITICAL LEGITIMACY

What makes a government legitimate? Why do people voluntarily comply with laws, even when no one is watching? The idea of political legitimacy captures the fact that people obey when they think governments' actions accord with valid principles. For some, what matters most is the government's performance on security and the economy. For others, only a government that follows democratic principles can be legitimate. Political legitimacy is therefore a two-sided reality that scholars studying the acceptance of governments need to take into account. The diversity and backgrounds of East Asian nations provide a particular challenge when trying to determine the level of political legitimacy of individual governments. This book brings together both political philosophers and political scientists to examine the distinctive forms of political legitimacy that exist in contemporary East Asia. It is essential reading for all academic researchers of East Asian government, politics, and comparative politics.

Joseph Chan is Professor in the Department of Politics and Public Administration at the University of Hong Kong. He was a visiting scholar at the Harvard-Yenching Institute and was Founding Director of the Centre for Civil Society and Governance at the University of Hong Kong.

Doh Chull Shin is Jack W. Peltason Scholar in Residence at the Center for the Study of Democracy at the University of California, Irvine; and Professor Emeritus, Korea Foundation Chair, and Middlebush Chair at the University of Columbia, Missouri.

Melissa S. Williams is Professor of Political Science, and was the founding Director of the Centre of Ethics at the University of Toronto. She is the author of Voice, Trust, and Memory: Marginalized Groups and the Failings of Liberal Representation (1998).



More Information



East Asian Perspectives on Political Legitimacy

BRIDGING THE EMPIRICAL-NORMATIVE DIVIDE

Edited by

JOSEPH CHAN

University of Hong Kong

DOH CHULL SHIN

University of California, Irvine

MELISSA S. WILLIAMS

University of Toronto





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York NY 10006, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107134423

© Cambridge University Press 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Chan, Joseph Cho Wai, 1960– editor. | Sin, To-ch'ŏl, editor. | Williams, Melissa S., 1960– editor.

East Asian perspectives on political legitimacy: bridging normative and political analysis / edited by Joseph Chan, DohChull Shin, Melissa S. Williams.

New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2016.

LCCN 2016026901 | ISBN 9781107134423 (hardback)

LCSH: Legitimacy of governments – East Asia. | Political culture – East Asia. | East Asia – Politics and government. | BISAC: LAW / Comparative.

LCC JQ1499.A58 E37 2016 | DDC 320.01/1-dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2016026901

ISBN 978-1-107-13442-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List	of Contributors	page vii
Preface and Acknowledgments		ix
1.	Political Legitimacy in East Asia: Bridging Normative and Empirical Analysis Melissa S. Williams, Joseph Chan, and Doh Chull Shin	1
2.	Reasons to Obey: "Multiple Modernities" and Constructions of Political Legitimacy Melissa S. Williams	25
3.	Do East Asian States Enjoy a Legitimacy Premium? Bruce Gilley	55
4.	Political Legitimacy in China: A Confucian Approach Daniel A. Bell	78
5.	Political Legitimacy in Hong Kong: A Hybrid Notion Wai-man Lam	107
6.	The Evolution of Political Legitimacy in Singapore: Electoral Institutions, Governmental Performance, Moral Authority, and Meritocracy Kenneth Paul Tan and Benjamin Wong	135
7.	Polarized Politics, Government Legitimacy, and Democratic Legitimacy in Taiwan Min-Hua Huang	166



More Information

VI	Contents	
8.	The Legitimacy of Democratic Rule in Korea: From the Perspective of the Mass Citizenry Doh Chull Shin and Youngho Cho	190
9.	Political Legitimacy, Satisfaction, and Japanese Democracy Benjamin Nyblade	218
10.	Legitimacy as a Hybrid Phenomenon Leigh Jenco	238
Index		257



Contributors

Daniel A. Bell is Dean of the Faculty of Politics and Public Administration, Shandong University.

Joseph Chan is Professor in the Department of Politics and Public Administration at the University of Hong Kong.

Youngho Cho is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Sogang University.

Bruce Gilley is Professor of Political Science at Portland State University.

Min-Hua Huang is Associate Professor of Political Science at National Taiwan University.

Wai-man Lam is Assistant Professor in the School of Arts and Social Sciences at the Open University of Hong Kong, and Honorary Associate Fellow in the Centre for Civil Society and Governance at the University of Hong Kong.

Leigh Jenco is Associate Professor of Political Theory in the Department of Government at the London School of Economics and Political Science.

Benjamin Nyblade is Director of the Empirical Research Group at the University of California, Los Angeles School of Law.

Doh Chull Shin is Jack W. Peltason Scholar in Residence at the Centre for the Study of Democracy at the University of California, Irvine; Professor Emeritus, Korea Foundation Chair; and Middlebush Chair at the University of Columbia, Missouri.

Kenneth Paul Tan is Associate Professor at the Lee Kuan Yew School of Public Policy at the National University of Singapore.



More Information

viii

List of Contributors

Melissa S. Williams is Professor of Political Science at the University of Toronto.

Benjamin Wong was Associate Professor at the National Institute of Education, Nanyang Technological University.



Preface and Acknowledgments

This volume grows out of a multiyear international research collaboration, East Asian Perspectives on Politics, whose broad purpose is to help advance the emerging field of comparative political theory. Our aim, like that of the growing number of scholars working on non-Western political thought, is to "departedialize political theory," that is, to decenter European traditions of thought in defining the parameters of our field. The project on East Asian Perspectives on Politics proceeded through a series of six workshops, held between 2010 and 2012, at leading universities in East Asia and Canada: Fudan University, the National University of Singapore, Seoul National University, the University of Hong Kong, Keio University, and the University of Victoria. The project has also received significant institutional support from the Centre for Ethics at the University of Toronto and the Peter Wall Institute at the University of British Columbia.

The project would not have been possible without the generous financial support and visionary leadership of the Shibusawa Ei'ichi Memorial Foundation, based in Tokyo, Japan. It is exceedingly rare for research foundations to take a chance on a research field that has not yet garnered widespread recognition in the academy. Comparative political theory has come into common parlance in the past several years, and a small but growing number of universities have designated the field as a target for faculty recruitment. But the field was barely on the horizon in 2005, when the Shibusawa Foundation sponsored a special panel on cross-cultural political thought at a colloquium at the University of Toronto. We are deeply indebted to the foundation, and in particular to its president, Masahide Shibusawa; its managing director, Jun'etsu Komatsu; and its research director, Masato Kimura.

We also owe an enormous debt of gratitude to the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada for significant financial support for



Preface and Acknowledgments

X

this project. This support not only made it possible to involve many Canadian scholars in the project but also to foster the work of talented younger scholars through the graduate workshops that accompanied each conference.

Thanks to the encouragement and sage guidance of Dr. Kimura, the initial panel discussion in Toronto led to a series of planning workshops for a more ambitious research collaboration. We worked together to identify excellent scholars in political theory working throughout East Asia, in addition to allies in Canadian universities, who became our core project team: Terry Nardin and Leigh Jenco, then both at the National University of Singapore; Mark Warren and He Baogang, who worked with Zhenglai Deng and Sujian Guo to organize the workshop at Fudan University; Joseph Chan at the University of Hong Kong, who recruited Doh Chull Shin to co-organize the workshop from which this volume grew; Youngmin Kim and Bumsoo Kim, who organized the workshop at Seoul National University; and Ken Tsutsumibayashi, who organized the workshop at Keio University. Leigh Jenco and I worked closely with Jeremy Webber and James Tully in organizing the project's final workshop at the University of Victoria.

Together, the project team identified core concepts in political theory that are highly salient in both East Asian and Western thought traditions: deliberation, the rule of law, political legitimacy, governance and leadership, and peoplehood and citizenship. Beginning from one of these concepts, each workshop incorporated three axes of comparison into its program structure: "East" and "West"; intra-regional comparisons, with particular emphasis on China, Korea, and Japan; and contrasts or continuities between historical and contemporary readings of the concept in East Asian contexts. In addition, particularly in the workshop on legitimacy from which this volume grew, the project recruited empirical political scientists to engage with political theorists in examining the role of normative ideas in East Asian politics. The workshops stimulated unprecedented engagement between scholars working in Japan, Korea, and China and stimulated new intellectual networks linking scholars across the East Asian, North American, and European academies.

The present volume grew out of the workshop on "East Asian Perspectives on Political Legitimacy" at the University of Hong Kong, August 18–20, 2011. We are deeply grateful for the generous financial support of the University of Hong Kong through its Strategic Research Theme Initiative, and the excellent administrative support of our hosts, the Department of Politics and Public Administration and the Faculty of Social Sciences. Joseph Chan's intellectual leadership and heroic organizational efforts, together with the expert guidance of Doh Chull Shin in recruiting empirical political scientists to the project, generated a tremendously stimulating discussion over those three days. Papers



Preface and Acknowledgments

хi

were presented by Daniel Bell, Bruce Gilley, Baogang He, Min-Hua Huang, Tatsuo Inoue, Wai-Man Lam, Doh Chull Shin, Melissa Williams, and Benjamin Wong. Other colleagues delivered thoughtful commentaries on the papers: Albert Chen, Joseph Chan, Yun-han Chu, Jean-Marc Coicaud, Kuan Hsin Chi, Sungmoon Kim, Terry Nardin, Benjamin Nyblade, Kenneth Paul Tan, Daniel Weinstock, and Yan Xiaojun. The graduate workshop included papers by Kiran Banerjee, Jeffrey Bercuson, Elton Chan, Aaron Louis Landau, Kim Chong Su, and Timothy Smith.

We also wish to express our sincere thanks to those who made it possible to bring this volume to publication. Leigh Jenco, Benjamin Nyblade, and Kenneth Tan generously agreed to write or co-author original chapters to supplement the workshop papers, and all of our contributors responded conscientiously to the feedback they received in the editorial process. At Cambridge University Press, John Berger has been tremendously encouraging of our efforts, and Joanna Breeze has expertly guided us through production. Thanks also to the anonymous reviewers who provided helpful feedback. Finally, we thank Erica Frederiksen for her meticulous work in preparing the manuscript for publication, Linda Benson for excellent copyediting, Lauren Barr for preparing the index so expertly, and Sri Hari Kumar for overseeing the technical side of the production process.

I also wish to express my personal gratitude to the Justitia Amplificata program of the Goethe Universität in Frankfurt and the Freie Universität in Berlin and the Forschungskolleg Humanwissenschaften in Bad Homburg, Germany, for providing me with the space and time needed to perform my role in bringing this volume to completion.

Finally, it was with great sadness that we learned, just as this volume was being finalized, of the sudden passing of Benjamin Wong, who co-authored this volume's study of political legitimacy in Singapore. Benjamin was a cherished colleague and a gifted teacher, adored by his students. He will be sorely missed.

Melissa S. Williams