

ARISTOTLE'S *GENERATION OF ANIMALS*

Generation of Animals is one of Aristotle's most mature, sophisticated, and carefully crafted scientific writings. His overall goal is to provide a comprehensive and systematic account of how animals reproduce, including a study of their reproductive organs, what we would call fertilization, embryogenesis, and organogenesis. In this book, international experts present thirteen original essays providing a philosophically and historically informed introduction to this important work. They shed light on the unity and structure of the *Generation of Animals*, the main theses that Aristotle defends in the work, and the method of inquiry he adopts. They also open up new avenues of exploration of this difficult and still largely unexplored work. The volume will be essential for scholars and students of ancient philosophy as well as of the history and philosophy of science.

ANDREA FALCON is Associate Professor in the Department of Philosophy at Concordia University, Montréal. He is the author of *Corpi e Movimenti. La fortuna del De caelo nel mondo antico* (2001); *Aristotle and the Science of Nature: Unity without Uniformity* (Cambridge 2005); *Aristotelianism in the First Century BCE: Xenarchus of Seleucia* (Cambridge 2012); and *Aristotelismo* (2017). He is the editor of the *Brill's Companion to the Reception of Aristotle* (2016).

DAVID LEFEBVRE is Professor of Philosophy at the Université Clermont-Auvergne (UCA) in Clermont-Ferrand. His publications include a new translation of Aristotle's *Generation of Animals* (2014), and he is co-editor of *Dunamis. Autour de la puissance chez Aristote* (2008) and *La Métaphysique de Théophraste. Principes et apories* (2015) and author of *DYNAMIS. Sens et Genèse de la notion aristotélicienne de puissance* (2017).

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-13293-1 — Aristotle's Generation of Animals
Edited by Andrea Falcon , David Lefebvre
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE CRITICAL GUIDES

Recent Titles in this Series

Kant's Critique of Practical Reason

Edited by ANDREWS REATH and JENS TIMMERMAN

Wittgenstein's Philosophical Investigations

Edited by ARIF AHMED

Kierkegaard's Concluding Unscientific Postscript

Edited by RICK ANTHONY FURTAK

Plato's Republic

Edited by MARK L. MCPHERRAN

Plato's Laws

Edited by CHRISTOPHER BOBONICH

Spinoza's Theological-Political Treatise

Edited by YITZHAK Y. MELAMED and MICHAEL A. ROSENTHAL

Aristotle's Nicomachean Ethics

Edited by JON MILLER

Kant's Metaphysics of Morals

Edited by LARA DENIS

Nietzsche's On the Genealogy of Morality

Edited by SIMON MAY

Kant's Observations and Remarks

Edited by RICHARD VELKLEY and SUSAN SHELL

Augustine's City of God

Edited by JAMES WETZEL

Descartes' Meditations

Edited by KAREN DETLEFSEN

Kant's Religion within the Boundaries of Mere Reason

Edited by GORDON MICHALSON

Kant's Lectures on Anthropology

Edited by ALIX COHEN

Kierkegaard's Fear and Trembling

Edited by DANIEL CONWAY

Kant's Lectures on Ethics

Edited by LARA DENIS and OLIVER SENSEN

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-13293-1 — Aristotle's Generation of Animals
Edited by Andrea Falcon , David Lefebvre
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Aristotle's Physics

Edited by MARISKA LEUNISSEN

Aristotle's Politics

Edited by THORNTON LOCKWOOD and THANASSIS SAMARAS

Aquinas's Disputed Questions on Evil

Edited by M. V. DOUGHERTY

Plato's Symposium

Edited by PIERRE DESTRÉE and ZINA GIANNOPOULOU

Spinoza's Ethics

Edited by YITZHAK Y. MELAMED

Kant's Critique of Pure Reason

Edited by JAMES R. O'SHEA

Aristotle's Generation of Animals

Edited by ANDREA FALCON and DAVID LEFEBVRE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-13293-1 — Aristotle's Generation of Animals
Edited by Andrea Falcon , David Lefebvre
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

ARISTOTLE'S *GENERATION*
OF ANIMALS

A Critical Guide

Edited by

ANDREA FALCON

Concordia University

DAVID LEFEBVRE

University of Clermont-Auvergne



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-13293-1 — Aristotle's Generation of Animals
 Edited by Andrea Falcon, David Lefebvre
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
 It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
 education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107132931
 DOI: 10.1017/9781316459386

© Cambridge University Press 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
 no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
 permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Falcon, Andrea, editor. | Lefebvre, David, editor.

TITLE: Aristotle's generation of animals : a critical guide / edited by Andrea Falcon, Concordia
 University, Montréal, David Lefebvre, Université de Paris I.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2017. |

SERIES: Cambridge critical guides | "The majority of the essays collected in this
 volume originate from papers delivered at the international conference on Aristotle's
 Generation of Animals that took place in Paris, January 9-11, 2014." |

Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2017027451 | ISBN 9781107132931 (Hardback : alk. paper)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Aristotle. On the generation of animals. | Reproduction. | Animals (Philosophy)

CLASSIFICATION: LCC QP251 .A674 2017 | DDC 612.6—DC23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2017027451>

ISBN 978-1-107-13293-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy
 of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication
 and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,
 accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	page ix
<i>Preface</i>	xiii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv
Introduction: Aristotle’s Philosophy and the <i>Generation of Animals</i> <i>Andrea Falcon and David Lefebvre</i>	I
PART I THE UNITY AND STRUCTURE OF ARISTOTLE’S GENERATION OF ANIMALS	I 3
1 “One Long Argument”? The Unity of Aristotle’s <i>Generation of Animals</i> <i>Allan Gotthelf and Andrea Falcon</i>	I 5
2 Parts and Generation: The Prologue to the <i>Generation of Animals</i> and the Structure of the Treatise <i>David Lefebvre</i>	35
3 Order and Method in Aristotle’s <i>Generation of Animals</i> 2 <i>Mariska Leunissen</i>	56
PART II THE PRINCIPLES OF ANIMAL GENERATION RECONSIDERED	75
4 What Is Aristotle’s <i>Generation of Animals</i> About? <i>Pierre Pellegrin</i>	77
5 Aristotle on Epigenesis: Two Senses of Epigenesis <i>Devin Henry</i>	89

viii	<i>Table of Contents</i>	
6	A Latent Difficulty in Aristotle's Theory of Semen: The Homogeneous Nature of Semen and the Role of the Frothy Bubble <i>Marwan Rashed</i>	108
7	Function and Instrument: Toward a New Criterion of the Scale of Being in Aristotle's <i>Generation of Animals</i> <i>Cristina Cerami</i>	130
	PART III HYBRIDS, MALE AND FEMALE, PARTICULAR FORMS, AND MONSTERS	151
8	Hybridity and Sterility in Aristotle's <i>Generation of Animals</i> <i>Jocelyn Groisard</i>	153
9	Females in Aristotle's Embryology <i>Jessica Gelber</i>	171
10	Something(s) in the Way(s) He Moves: Reconsidering the Embryological Argument for Particular Forms in Aristotle <i>Gregory Salmieri</i>	188
11	Aristotle's Explanations of Monstrous Births and Deformities in <i>Generation of Animals</i> 4.4 <i>Sophia Connell</i>	207
	PART IV METHODOLOGY IN ARISTOTLE'S <i>GENERATION OF ANIMALS</i>	225
12	The Search for Principles in Aristotle: <i>Posterior Analytics</i> 2 and <i>Generation of Animals</i> 1 <i>Robert Bolton</i>	227
13	Aristotle, Dissection, and Generation: Experience, Expertise, and the Practices of Knowing <i>James G. Lennox</i>	249
	<i>References</i>	273
	<i>General Index</i>	280
	<i>Index of Passages</i>	282

Contributors

ROBERT BOLTON is Professor in the Department of Philosophy at Rutgers University. He is the author of numerous articles on Aristotle, with a concentration on his method of scientific inquiry. Some of his articles are collected in R. Bolton, *Science, dialectique et éthique chez Aristote: essais d'épistémologie aristotélicienne* (2010). He is the editor, together with James G. Lennox, of *Being, Nature, and Life in Aristotle* (Cambridge University Press 2010).

CRISTINA CERAMI is Senior Research Fellow at the CNRS, Paris (UMR 7219: SPHERE/CHSPAM). She works on Aristotle and the Aristotelian tradition in the Greek and Arabic worlds, with a special concentration on Alexander of Aphrodisias and Averroes. She is the author of *Génération et substance: Aristote et Averroès entre physique et métaphysique* (2015). She is the editor of *Nature et sagesse: physique et métaphysique dans la tradition aristotélicienne. Recueil de textes en hommage à Pierre Pellegrin* (2015).

SOPHIA CONNELL is lecturer in Philosophy at Birkbeck College, University of London. She has been a fellow, admissions tutor, and director of studies in Philosophy at Selwyn College, Cambridge, and a bye-fellow and director of studies in Philosophy at Newnham College, Cambridge. She has written articles on Aristotelian biology, and Galen and Aristotle on sex difference. She is the author of *Aristotle on Female Animals: A Study in the Generation of Animals* (Cambridge University Press 2016).

ANDREA FALCON is Associate Professor in the Department of Philosophy at Concordia University, Montreal. He works on Aristotle and the Aristotelian tradition in antiquity, with a focus on Aristotle's philosophy of nature. He is the author of *Corpi e movimenti: la fortuna del De caelo nel mondo antico* (2001); *Aristotle and the Science of Nature: Unity*

without Uniformity (Cambridge University Press 2005); *Aristotelianism in the First Century BCE: Xenarchus of Seleucia* (Cambridge University Press 2012); and *Aristotelismo* (2017). He is the editor of the *Brill's Companion to the Reception of Aristotle in Antiquity* (2016).

JESSICA GELBER is Assistant Professor in the Department of Philosophy at the University of Pittsburgh. Her current research is centered on foundational issues in ancient Greek science, particularly in Aristotle's biology, and has written about such topics as teleology, essence, and efficient causation in Aristotle's natural science. She completed her doctoral dissertation on Aristotle's *Generation of Animals* at the University of California at Berkeley.

ALLAN GOTTHELF (December 30, 1942–August 30, 2013) was Emeritus Professor of philosophy at The College of New Jersey and Anthem Foundation Distinguished Scholar at Rutgers University. He is the editor of *Aristotle on Nature and Living Things: Philosophical and Historical Studies* (1985) and, together with James G. Lennox, *Philosophical Issues in Aristotle's Biology* (Cambridge University Press 1987). His most important articles are collected in *Teleology, First Principles, and Scientific Method in Aristotle's Biology* (2012).

JOCELYN GROISARD, a former pupil of the École Normale Supérieure (Paris), has worked at the National Library of France in the section of Greek manuscripts before leaving for Japan, where he teaches French at the Tokyo Metropolitan University. He is the author of a translation of Aristotle's *Meteorology* (2008), a critical edition of Alexander of Aphrodisias' *On Mixture* [*De mixtione*] (*Sur la mixtion et la croissance*, 2013), and a monograph on ancient theories of mixture from Aristotle to Late Antiquity (*Mixis: le problème du mélange dans la philosophie grecque d'Aristote à Simplicius*, 2016).

DEVIN HENRY is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Western Ontario. He received his PhD from King's College London, where he wrote a dissertation on the metaphysical foundations of Aristotle's account of biological generation. He is the author of several articles on topics in Aristotle's philosophy of science (including classification, teleology, inheritance, and sexism), as well as Plato's late epistemology. He is currently writing a book that examines the ways in which Aristotle's general theory of substantial generation is reflected in, and modified by, his more specific account of the generation of biological substance in Aristotle's *Generation of Animals*.

List of Contributors

xi

DAVID LEFEBVRE is Professor of Philosophy at the University Clermont-Auvergne (UCA) in Clermont-Ferrand. He has published on Aristotle and the Peripatos – Theophrastus, Strato of Lampsacus. He is the author of *Dynamis: sens et genèse de la notion aristotélicienne de puissance* (2017). His most recent publications include also a new translation of Aristotle's *Generation of Animals* (2014). He has co-edited *Dynamis: autour de la puissance chez Aristote* (2008), and *La Métaphysique de Théophraste: principes et apories* (2015).

JAMES G. LENNOX is Professor of History and Philosophy of Science at the University of Pittsburgh. He has published widely on Aristotle and Darwin. Some of his articles on Aristotle's biology are collected in J. G. Lennox, *Aristotle's Philosophy of Biology: Essays in the Origins of Life Science* (Cambridge University Press 2001). He has edited, together with Allan Gotthelf, *Philosophical Issues in Aristotle's Biology* (Cambridge University Press 1987); together with Marie-Louise Gill, *Self-Motion from Aristotle to Newton* (1995); together with Robert Bolton, *Being, Nature, and Life in Aristotle* (Cambridge University Press 2010). He has translated Aristotle's *Parts of Animals* for the Clarendon Aristotle Series (2001).

MARISKA LEUNISSEN is Associate Professor in the Department of Philosophy at the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill. She works on Aristotle with a concentration on his philosophy of nature and its connections to his philosophy of science and his ethics and politics. She is the author of *Explanation and Teleology in Aristotle's Science of Nature* (Cambridge University Press 2010). She is the editor of *Aristotle's Physics: A Critical Guide* (Cambridge University Press 2015) and co-editor, with Frans J. de Haas and Marije Martijn, of *Interpreting Aristotle's Posterior Analytics in Late Antiquity and Beyond* (2010).

PIERRE PELLEGRIN is Director of Research Emeritus at the CNRS, Paris (UMR 7219: SPHERE/CHSPAM). He is the author of *La classification des animaux chez Aristote: statut de la biologie et unité de l'aristotélisme* (1982; English translation by Anthony Preus: *Aristotle's Classification of Animals: Biology and the Conceptual Unity of the Aristotelian Corpus*, 1986) and, together with Michel Crubellier, *Aristote: le philosophe et les savoirs* (2002). He is the editor, together with Daniel Devereux, of *Biologie, logique et métaphysique chez Aristote* (1990) and, together with Monique Canto-Sperber, of *Le style de la pensée: recueil de textes en hommage à Jacques Brunschwig* (2002). He has translated several works

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-13293-1 — Aristotle's Generation of Animals
 Edited by Andrea Falcon, David Lefebvre
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

of Aristotle into French, including the *Physics* (2000), *Posterior Analytics* (2005), *Parts of Animals* (2011), and *History of Animals* (2014).

MARWAN RASHED is Professor of Greek and Arabic Philosophy at Paris-Sorbonne University. Among his most recent books are *De la génération et la corruption: édition, traduction et commentaire* (2005); *Essentialisme: Alexandre d'Aphrodise entre logique, physique et cosmologie* (2007); *Alexandre d'Aphrodise: commentaire perdu à la Physique d'Aristote (Livres IV–VIII)* (2011); *L'héritage aristotélicien: textes inédits de l'antiquité* (2014, second augmented edition).

GREGORY SALMIERI teaches at Rutgers University and is a philosophy fellow at the Anthem Foundation. He previously held research and teaching positions in philosophy at the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, and Boston University. He is editor, together with Allan Gotthelf, of *A Companion to Ayn Rand* (2016) and *Knowing and Coming to Know: Essays on Aristotle's Epistemology* (forthcoming).

Preface

The majority of the essays collected in this volume originate from papers delivered at the international conference on Aristotle's *Generation of Animals* that took place in Paris, January 9–11, 2014. The conference was jointly organized in Paris at the Sorbonne University by the late Allan Gotthelf and David Lefebvre under the title “Form and Necessity: On Aristotle's *Generation of Animals*.” The conference coincided with the publication of a new French translation of *Generation of Animals* by David Lefebvre.¹ Since Allan Gotthelf was also preparing a new English translation of *Generation of Animals* and at the same time writing, together with Andrea Falcon, an article on the unity and argument of this treatise, it was decided to invite scholars who had been working on *Generation of Animals* in Europe and North America to take stock of the most significant results achieved with this important yet difficult text.

The original plan was for Allan Gotthelf and David Lefebvre to publish a volume of essays after the conference. From the very beginning, the idea was not to publish the proceedings of the conference but rather to collect in a volume some of the most interesting recent work on *Generation of Animals*, including some of the work presented at the Paris conference. When it became clear that Allan Gotthelf would not be able to complete this editorial project, the latter asked Andrea Falcon to collaborate with David Lefebvre to prepare the volume. We have selected thirteen essays, all appearing here for the first time. Two have evolved from papers presented at a fifth Pittsburgh-London (Ontario) workshop on Aristotle's *Generation of Animals* organized by Allan Gotthelf and Devin Henry at the University of Western Ontario in May 2010. One is the essay on the unity and argument of Aristotle's *Generation of Animals* that Allan Gotthelf was completing with the help of Andrea Falcon at the time of his death. This essay, which contains the most significant results of Allan Gotthelf's

¹ This translation is published in Aristotle, *Œuvres complètes* (Flammarion, Paris 2014).

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-13293-1 — Aristotle's Generation of Animals
Edited by Andrea Falcon , David Lefebvre
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

xiv

Preface

lifetime philosophical engagement with this work, opens the volume. The other is by Mariska Leunissen on the order and method adopted in the second book of *Generation of Animals*. Ten essays originate from papers delivered at the Paris conference. To these essays, we have added one by Sophia Connell on Aristotle's explanation of deformity, which is a response to the most recent scholarly work on this topic.

We would like to thank Zoli Filotas who has translated Chapter 2 from French and revised the English of the Introduction and Chapter 1.

We are grateful to Michael Sharp and Hilary Gaskin for offering to publish the volume as a Cambridge Critical Guide.

The volume is dedicated to Allan Gotthelf, who was a friend, a mentor, and an example for most of the scholars involved in this project.

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-13293-1 — Aristotle's Generation of Animals
 Edited by Andrea Falcon , David Lefebvre
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Abbreviations

<i>APo</i>	<i>Analytica posteriora</i>	<i>Posterior Analytics</i>
<i>APr</i>	<i>Analytica priora</i>	<i>Prior Analytics</i>
<i>DA</i>	<i>De anima</i>	<i>On the Soul</i>
<i>DC</i>	<i>De caelo</i>	<i>On the Heavens</i>
<i>GA</i>	<i>De generatione animalium</i>	<i>Generation of Animals</i>
<i>GC</i>	<i>De generatione et corruptione</i>	<i>Generation and Corruption</i>
<i>HA</i>	<i>De historia animalium</i>	<i>History of Animals</i>
<i>IA</i>	<i>De incessu animalium</i>	<i>On the Progression of Animals</i>
<i>Juv.</i>	<i>De juventute et senectute</i>	<i>On Youth and Old Age</i>
<i>Long.</i>	<i>De longitudine et brevitate vitae</i>	<i>On the Length and Shortness of Life</i>
<i>MA</i>	<i>De motu animalium</i>	<i>On the Motion of Animals</i>
<i>Meta.</i>	<i>Metaphysica</i>	<i>Metaphysics</i>
<i>Mete.</i>	<i>Meteorologica</i>	<i>Meteorology</i>
<i>NE</i>	<i>Ethica nicomachea</i>	<i>Nicomachean Ethics</i>
<i>PA</i>	<i>De partibus animalium</i>	<i>Parts of Animals</i>
<i>Phys.</i>	<i>Physica</i>	<i>Physics</i>
<i>Pol.</i>	<i>Politica</i>	<i>Politics</i>
<i>Prob.</i>	<i>Problemata</i>	<i>Problems</i>
<i>Resp.</i>	<i>De respiratione</i>	<i>On Respiration</i>
<i>Somn.</i>	<i>De somno et vigilia</i>	<i>On Sleep and Waking</i>