

The Schematic State

By examining the political development of racial classifications on the national censuses of the United States, Canada, and Great Britain, *The Schematic State* maps the changing nature of the census from an instrument historically used to manage and control racial populations to its contemporary purpose as an important source of statistical information, employed to monitor and rectify racial discrimination. Through a careful comparative analysis of nearly two hundred years of census-taking, it demonstrates that changes in racial schemas are driven by the interactions among shifting transnational ideas about race, the ways they are tempered and translated by nationally distinct racial projects, and the configuration of political institutions involved in the design and execution of census policy. This book argues that states seek to make their populations racially legible, turning the fluid and politically contested substance of race into stable, identifiable categories to be used as the basis of law and policy.

Debra Thompson is Assistant Professor of African American Studies at Northwestern University. She completed her PhD in the Department of Political Science at the University of Toronto in 2010 and was a SSHRC Postdoctoral Fellow with the Center for American Political Studies at Harvard University in 2010–2011. In 2011 she received the prestigious Governor General of Canada’s Academic Gold Medal and her 2008 article, “Is Race Political?” won the Canadian Political Science Association’s John McMenemy Prize for the best article published in the *Canadian Journal of Political Science*.

The Schematic State

*Race, Transnationalism, and the Politics
of the Census*

DEBRA THOMPSON
Northwestern University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107130982

© Cambridge University Press 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-13098-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures and Tables</i>	<i>page</i> vi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	vii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xi
1 Invitation	I
2 Orientation	24
3 Transnational Biological Racialism	50
4 The Death and Resurrection of Race	93
5 The Multicultural Moment	126
6 The Multiracial Moment	177
7 The Future of Counting by Race	222
<i>Appendix List of Interviews and Archival Sources</i>	265
<i>Bibliography</i>	270
<i>Index</i>	311

Figures and Tables

FIGURES

5.1	Census of Canada, 1981	<i>page</i> 141
5.2	Census of Canada, 1996	165
5.3	Census of England and Wales, 1991	170
6.1	Census of the United States, 2000	202
6.2	Census of England and Wales, 2001	213
7.1	Canadian National Household Survey, 2011	249
7.2	Census of England and Wales, 2011 – Nationality Question	250
7.3	Census of England and Wales, 2011 – Ethnicity Question	252
7.4	United States Census Bureau Alternative Question Experiment, combined Hispanic origin and race question, X3 experimental panel	256

TABLES

4.1	Estimates of selected immigrant populations in England and Wales, 1951, 1961, and 1966	107
6.1	Preferred label for the mixed-race population, 1995 CPS Supplement on Race and Ethnicity	200

Acknowledgments

You can never see the end from the beginning. And from the beginning through to the bitter end, this project was shaped with the help of those whose mention here is nothing compared to the footprints they've left in the pages that follow.

This project began long ago as my dissertation in the Department of Political Science at the University of Toronto, and I cannot begin to express the enormous gratitude I have for the members of my committee. They are all scholars of the highest sort: those who ask big, interesting questions and demand complex answers from themselves as much as from me. My supervisor Jenny Nedelsky was and remains a shining light, narrowing at times to a flashlight as she asked me crucial, pointed questions that were, of course, *the point*. Melissa Williams is nothing short of an intellectual force – indeed, a force to be reckoned with, but also a force of generosity, kindness, and integrity. Many feelings of being overwhelmed dispersed while sitting across from Joe Wong, as he taught me the unspoken rules of the academic game (and the virtues of zone defense). Last, but not least, Richard Iton was one of the most thoughtful and brilliant people I have ever known, truly the epitome of still waters running deep. I was heartbroken when he passed away in April 2013; I can only hope that he would be pleased that I am now at Northwestern University, where his legacy has become my moral compass. Together, my committee's encouragement, unwavering support, and inexplicable confidence in my abilities were unmatched, sometimes unwarranted, and never unappreciated.

Many others provided much needed guidance at various points. Rogers Smith has offered valuable input on this project over the years, which

I have always accepted with much appreciation and even greater awe. I owe a debt of gratitude to Joe Carens, whose astute advice permeates both my scholarly work and my navigation of sometimes turbulent academic waters. Working all too briefly with Jennifer Hochschild during a year spent at the Center for American Political Studies at Harvard University was an absolute pleasure. Special thanks to those who read various iterations or parts of the manuscript, especially Melissa Nobles, Ken Prewitt, Jennifer Hochschild, Lester Spence, Phil Triadafilopoulos, and Mara Loveman. Much was learned along the way from Yasmeen Abu-Laban, Tony Affigne, Abby Bakan, Keith Banting, Erik Bleich, Dan Carpenter, Heath Fogg-Davis, Lee Ann Fujii, Skip Gates, Peter Hall, Randall Hansen, Fred Harris, Barnor Hesse, Des King, James Moore, Charles Mills, Patrick Simon, Ed Schatz, and Linda White. I regret that I worked far too slowly for some of my most cherished advocates to see this finished product; rest in peace/power, Nick Nelson, Richard Simeon, and John Sinclair. Truly, I am humbled by these mentors, who have taught me the parallels of sword and pen. I have nothing to offer in return, except the promise to pay it forward.

Mad props to the Toronto crew that made my PhD years sparkle: my first and best ally Cheryl Auger, Seb Baglioni, Sarah Browning, Wayne Chu, Malcolm Cole, my arch nemesis Gabe Eidelman, Bill Flanik, Alanna Krowlikowski, Alex Livingston, the laudable Zack Taylor, my adopted brother Arjun Tremblay, Luc Turgeon, Ethel Tungohan, Steve White, and the unstoppable, incomparable Jenn Wallner. Brett Carter, Shauna Shames, John Munro, Scott Nelson, and the amazing network of scholars at the Du Bois Research Institute were fantastic colleagues at Harvard. I was fortunate to have my first academic job in the Department of Political Science at Ohio University, which was for the most part a very supportive environment, save for a nameless few who have less than a nodding acquaintance with the truth. My heartfelt admiration and thanks belong to Ly Burnier, Haley Duschinski, Kathryn Fisher, Judith Grant, Andrew Ross, Nukhet Sandal, Nina Sharpe, and my bestie/whiskey consultant Brandon Kendhammer. Big love to the special ones who always had my back: Erin Beck, Marcus Carney, Ty Carr, the talented James Farley, Meredith Jensen, Sara Lewkowicz, Matt Spolar, Cecil Walters, and the lovely Veladotas, Christy and Sophie. But above all, without the mentorship, support, and friendship of Susan Burgess, I surely would have gone mad. It is because of Susan that the academic traumas so often faced by we who live on the margins have left me bent but never

Acknowledgments

ix

broken, and I am eternally grateful. I love you all more than I can say, especially those I forgot to mention.

This project would not have been possible without the generous support of the Social Science and Humanities Research Council of Canada, which funded three years of my doctoral work through its Canada Graduate Scholarship and my postdoctoral fellowship at Harvard University in 2010–2011. In addition, institutional support from the College of Arts and Science at Ohio University, the Center for American Political Studies at Harvard University, and the Department of Political Science, the School of Graduate Studies, and the Centre for the Study of the United States at the University of Toronto was greatly appreciated. Thanks to Antoine Bilideau and Csaba Nikolenyi at the Department of Political Science at Concordia University for providing office space and library privileges during a nomadic summer in Montreal in 2011. I was fortunate to have the opportunity to present this research at a number of forums over the years, where critical feedback from smart people left me reinvigorated, even as I licked my wounds. Thanks to all those who spoke hard truths at the CRRES Speaker Series at Indiana University in 2015 (especially the talented Bernard Fraga and Akwasi Bempah), the 2012 meeting of the Western Political Science Association, the 2011 and 2012 meetings of the Canadian Political Science Association, the Department of Political Science at Concordia University in 2011, the History, Politics, and Institutions Workshop at Harvard University in 2011, and the School of Political Studies at Université d’Ottawa in 2010.

I’d like to thank my editor at Cambridge University Press, Lew Bateman, for his patience with this multi-year revision process. Two anonymous reviewers provided insightful feedback that made this a much, much stronger book. My former students and now friends Sarah Lilly and Michael Antonelli were fantastic research assistants. I would also like to thank the people that agreed to be interviewed for this project, some of whom spoke to me at length and multiple times, as well as Nicholas Jones at the United States Census Bureau, who has graciously kept me apprised of Bureau consultations and developments over the years. Bits and pieces of this research have been published elsewhere; thanks to: Springer Press for granting permission to use material from my chapter, “The Ethnic Question: Census Politics in Great Britain,” in *Social Statistics and Ethnic Diversity: Cross-National Perspectives in Classifications and Identity Politics*, eds. Patrick Simon, Victor Piché, and Amélie A. Gagnon (2015); Cambridge University Press for granting permission to use material from my 2015 article, “What Lies

Beneath: Equality and the Making of Racial Classifications,” *Social Philosophy and Policy* 31(2): 114–136; UBC Press for granting permission to use material from my chapter, “The Comparative Study of Race: Census Politics in Canada, the United States, and Great Britain,” in *Comparing Canada: Methods and Perspectives on Canadian Politics*, eds. Martin Papillion, Luc Turgeon, Jennifer Wallner, and Stephen White (2014); and Taylor and Francis for granting permission to use material from my 2012 article, “Making (Mixed-)Race: Census Politics and the Emergence of Multiracial Multiculturalism in the United States, Great Britain and Canada,” *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 35(8): 1409–1426.

My final words are for my loved ones. To my father, Joseph Thompson, who taught me to hold my cards close, combine ferocity with a moral center, and to speak in riddles. To my mother Ingrid Thompson, who always said that if we were for an instant to be tricked by the biological construction of race, being descended from slaves on one side and Holocaust survivors on the other would mean that, genetically speaking, we’re made of the toughest stuff there is. To Jessica, my academic comrade-in-arms, Leisa, the best person I know, and Jonathan, my favorite brother, for always having my back. I’m lucky that Patrick, Christina, and Megan Byrne have given me an incredible bonus family. And finally to my pack, Jack and the Notorious Ellie B., who together and forever own my heart.

I am a work in progress. Onwards.

Abbreviations

ACS	American Community Survey
AMEA	Association of Multi-Ethnic Americans
AQE	Census Alternative Questionnaire Experiment, United States
CPS	Current Population Survey, US 1995
CRE	Commission for Racial Equality, Great Britain
GRO(S)	General Register Office for Scotland
NAACP	National Association for the Advancement of Colored People
NAC	National Archives of Canada
NHS	National Household Survey, Canada
NIRSA	Northern Ireland Statistics and Research Agency
OMB	Office of Management and Budget, United States
ONS	Office for National Statistics, Great Britain
OPCS	Office of Population Censuses and Surveys, Great Britain
PRO	Public Records Office, London, England
Project RACE	Reclassify All Children Equally
RAETT	Race and Ethnic Targeted Test, US 1996
VRA	Voting Rights Act (1965)