Indigenous Elites and Creole Identity in Colonial Mexico, 1500–1800

Modern Mexico derives many of its richest symbols of national heritage and identity from the Aztec legacy, even as it remains a predominantly Spanish-speaking, Christian society. This volume argues that the composite, neo-Aztec flavor of Mexican identity was, in part, a consequence of active efforts by indigenous elites after the Spanish conquest to grandfather ancestral rights into the colonial era. By emphasizing the antiquity of their claims before Spanish officials, native leaders extended the historical awareness of the colonial regime into the pre-Hispanic past, and therefore also the themes, emotional contours, and beginning points of what we today understand as “Mexican history.” This emphasis on ancient roots, moreover, resonated with the patriotic longings of many creoles, descendants of Spaniards born in Mexico. Alienated by Spanish scorn, creoles associated with indigenous elites and studied their histories, thereby reinventing themselves as Mexico’s new “native” leadership, and the heirs to its prestigious antiquity.

Peter B. Villella is Assistant Professor of History at the University of North Carolina at Greensboro.
Cambridge Latin American Studies

General editor

Herbert S. Klein
Gouverneur Morris Emeritus Professor of History, Columbia University and
Hoover Research Fellow, Stanford University

Indigenous Elites and Creole Identity in Colonial Mexico, 1500–1800

Other books in the series

1. Ideas and Politics of Chilean Independence, 1808–1833, Simon Collier
2. Church Wealth in Mexico: A Study of the ”Juzgado de Capellanías” in the
   Archbishopric of Mexico 1800–1856, Michael P. Costeloe
   Conflict, P. A. R. Calvert
4. Britain and the Onset of Modernization in Brazil, 1850–1914, Richard Graham
5. Parties and Political Change in Bolivia, 1880–1952, Herbert S. Klein
6. The Abolition of the Brazilian Slave Trade: Britain, Brazil and the Slave Trade
   Question, 1807–1869, Leslie Bethell
7. Regional Economic Development: The River Basin Approach in Mexico, David
   Barkin and Timothy King
8. Economic Development of Latin America: Historical Background and
   Contemporary Problems, Celso Furtado and Suzette Macedo
10. Miners and Merchants in Bourbon Mexico, 1763–1810, D. A. Brading
11. Alienation of Church Wealth in Mexico: Social and Economic Aspects of the
    Liberal Revolution, 1856–1875, Jan Bazant
13. Bolivia: Land, Location and Politics Since 1825, J. Valerie Fifer, Malcolm
    Deas, Clifford Smith, and John Street
14. A Guide to the Historical Geography of New Spain, Peter Gerhard
15. Silver Mining and Society in Colonial Mexico: Zacatecas, 1546–1700, P. J.
    Bakewell
16. Conflicts and Conspiracies: Brazil and Portugal, 1750–1808, Kenneth Maxwell
    Attitudes and Sexual Values in a Slave Society, Verena Stolcke
18. Politics, Economics and Society in Argentina in the Revolutionary Period,
    Tulio Halperín Donghi
19. Politics in Argentina, 1890–1930: The Rise and Fall of Radicalism, David Rock
20. Studies in the Colonial History of Spanish America, Mario Góngora
21. Chilean Rural Society from the Spanish Conquest to 1930, Arnold J. Bauer
22. Letters and People of the Spanish Indies: Sixteenth Century, James Lockhart
    and Enrique Otte
    Rout, Jr.
24. The Cristero Rebellion: The Mexican People Between Church and State,
    1926–1929, Jean A. Meyer
25. Allende’s Chile: The Political Economy of the Rise and Fall of the Unidad
    Popular, Stefan de Vylder

(continued after the index)
Indigenous Elites and Creole Identity in Colonial Mexico, 1500–1800

PETER B. VILLELLA

University of North Carolina, Greensboro
For Judy
Contents

Figures xi
Abbreviations xiii
Acknowledgments xv
Note on language xvii

1 Introduction 1
2 The natural lords: asserting continuity, 1531–66 29
3 Cacique informants and early Spanish texts, 1535–80 73
4 Cacique-chroniclers and the origins of creole historiography, 1580–1640 112
5 Cacique-hidalgos: envisioning ancient roots in the mature colony 149
6 Cacique-patrons: Mexicanizing the church 187
7 Cacique-letrados: an Indian gentry after 1697 226
8 Cacique-ambassadors and the “Indian nation” in Bourbon Mexico 261
9 Conclusion 301

Works cited 314
Index 337
Figures

1  Caciques and the development of Mexican creolism  page 23
2  The viceroy and the natural lords, from Codex Osuna  40
3  Arms of don Antonio Cortés Totoquihuaztl  47
4  Intermarriage among the high nobility of central Mexico, sixteenth century  76
5  The foundation of Tenochtitlan, from Codex Tovar  145
6  Cano family genealogy  170
7  Salazar family genealogy  183
8  Probanza of don Julian Carrasco of Élta, 1734  247
9  Certificate of minor orders ordination of don Miguel de Aparicio Sánchez y Salazar, 1711  257
10  Don Patricio Antonio López, Mercurio yndiano  276
11  Mexican calendar wheel from Historia de Nueva-España by Francisco Antonio Lorenzana  294
12  Engraving of San Felipe de Jesús, in José María Montes de Oca, Vida de San Felipe de Jesús  304
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AGN:</td>
<td>Archivo General de la Nación, Mexico City, Mexico</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BN:</td>
<td>Bienes Nacionales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I:</td>
<td>Indios</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RC:</td>
<td>Reales Cédulas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RCO:</td>
<td>Reales Cédulas Originales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TR:</td>
<td>Tributos</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U:</td>
<td>Universidad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VM:</td>
<td>Vínculos y Mayorazgos</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGI:</td>
<td>Archivo General de Indias, Seville, Spain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECJ:</td>
<td>Escribanía de Cámara de Justicia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I:</td>
<td>Indiferente</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J:</td>
<td>Justicia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MX:</td>
<td>Audiencia de México</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PR:</td>
<td>Patronato Real</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UCB:</td>
<td>Bancroft Library, University of California, Berkeley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HL:</td>
<td>Huntington Library, San Marino, CA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LC:</td>
<td>Miscellaneous Manuscript Collection, Library of Congress, Washington, DC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LL:</td>
<td>Lilly Library, Indiana University, Bloomington, IN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRT:</td>
<td>La nobleza indígena del centro de México después de la conquista</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Emma Pérez-Rocha and Rafael Tena, eds. (México: Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, 2000).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
xiv  

Abbreviations

RLI:  *Recopilación de las leyes de los reynos de las indias*  
Archivo Digital de la Legislación en el Perú, Congreso de la República del Perú. www.leyes.congreso.gob.pe/leyes_indias.htm
Acknowledgments

Beyond the pioneering work of many who have gone before, this book reflects the expertise, patience, and generosity of numerous mentors, colleagues, peers, and sponsors, both at home and abroad.

The idea for this research derived from my doctoral studies under Kevin Terraciano at UCLA. It was Kevin who first directed me toward the study of indigenous nobles in Mexico, whose thoughtful and steady guidance transformed my sophomoric enthusiasm into a productive historical inquiry, and whose effective pedagogical style has been the model for my own. I was also privileged to work with the master Hispanists Teofilo Ruiz and Anthony Pagden, both of whom encouraged me to broaden my contemplation of colonial Mexico and include a trans-Atlantic context. Anna More’s knowledge of the arcane baroque intellectual world of New Spain helped shape and focus my own investigations, while José Moya’s insights on method and approach were invaluable during the early stages of my work.

As a graduate student, I also benefitted in countless ways from many peers and friends, all of whom model and contribute to UCLA’s grand tradition of ethnohistory. The tireless Dana Velasco Murillo offered good cheer and friendship as well as indispensable scholarly criticism, and her suggestions greatly improved earlier drafts of this book. Whether in Los Angeles, Mexico City, or Seville, I learned consistently from a most inquisitive and insightful cohort, including Xochitl Flores, Zeb Tortorici, Benjamin Cowan, Brad Benton, Pablo Sierra, León García, Verónica Gutiérrez, Owen Jones, and Miriam Melton-Villanueva. As a scholar, I am ultimately a product of UCLA’s unique and wonderful intellectual ferment, exemplified by long afternoons in Kevin’s office, poring over...
Nahuatl documents while sharing research, ideas, food, laughter, and perhaps a *mezcalito*.

It is difficult to overestimate the importance of informal guidance and correspondence on the early development of junior scholars. Susan Schroeder’s reputation for generosity in this regard is only exceeded by her universal esteem as an historian, and I am deeply grateful for her criticisms of an early draft. Rebecca Earle kindly assisted with some early research, while John Chuchiak, Camilla Townsend, David Tavárez, Stafford Poole, Matthew Restall, Greg O’Brien, and Kris Lane have freely offered scholarly expertise and advice over the years. I am grateful to the late Peer Schmidt, who introduced me to an entire corpus of non-Anglophone scholarship, as well as Jim Muldoon, who convinced me that everything modern has a medieval antecedent. Last but not least, in its final form this book reflects the careful and thoughtful input of Herb Klein, Deborah Gershenowitz, and the anonymous readers at Cambridge University Press, all of whom spent considerable energy helping me to refine a rough idea into a coherent history.

My work has also relied heavily on generous institutional support. I am indebted to the experts at numerous libraries and archives, in particular the Archivo General de la Nación and the Biblioteca Nacional in Mexico City, as well as the Archivo General de Indias in Seville, Spain. My foreign research over the years was enabled by the UCLA Graduate Division, the UCLA Latin American Institute, and the UNCG Office of Research and Economic Development. I was also privileged and honored to reside as a research fellow at the John Carter Brown Library at Brown University, the Young Research Library Special Collections at UCLA, the Lilly Library at Indiana University, and the Huntington Library in San Marino, CA. Most importantly, a generous fellowship from the American Council for Learned Societies in 2012–13 afforded me the time and freedom necessary to compile my data, refine my ideas, and craft them into the present form.

There is a psychological challenge to writing, which can be an isolating endeavor. I could not have completed this project without consistent emotional support and encouragement from those whom I love the most. I thank my father and stepmother, my brothers, and my late mother, all of whom kept me afloat in ways never fully articulated or even understood. Finally, I extend eternal gratitude to my beloved wife Judy, whose wisdom, strength, and good humor I rely on every day.
Note on language

The texts examined and often excerpted in this volume are highly eclectic, and present problems of spelling and translation. This is magnified in the case of proper names, which vary considerably between authors, and even within the same texts, in both early modern Nahuatl as well as Castilian-Spanish.

When quoted directly, names and words in both Castilian and Nahuatl have been left as they are found in the primary sources. Where necessary, I clarify the most ambiguous or confusing cases in parentheses.

Outside of direct quotations and paraphrases, all Castilian-derived names and places are modernized to match standard contemporary spellings; the same is true for Mexican place names. The spelling of Nahuatl-derived place names that do not match contemporary Mexican usage, meanwhile, has been regularized according to the orthographical system adopted by James Lockhart in *Nahuatl as Written: Lessons in Older Written Nahuatl* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2002). All other Nahuatl words also follow Lockhart’s spelling conventions.

The name of the ninth ruler of Tenochtitlan varies as much today as it did in the sixteenth century. I have chosen “Moctezuma” because it is the most familiar variation in modern usage. The same goes for other well-known Nahua leaders. As regards Nahuatl reverential formulations – the suffix –tzin indicating honor or importance – I follow the authors of the texts being analyzed.

As for the colonial-era natural lords, in all cases I address them with don or doña and a Christian name. This is how they would have expected to be addressed, and how their own compatriots would have done so.

All translations from any language, unless otherwise indicated, are my own.