

## Authority and Identity in Medieval Islamic Historiography

Intriguing dreams, improbable myths, fanciful genealogies, and suspect etymologies. These were all key elements of the historical texts composed by scholars and bureaucrats on the peripheries of Islamic empires between the tenth and fifteenth centuries. But how are historians to interpret such narratives? And what can these more literary histories tell us about the people who wrote them and the times in which they lived? In this book, Mimi Hanaoka offers an innovative, interdisciplinary method of approaching these sorts of local histories from the Persianate world. By paying attention to the purpose and intention behind a text's creation, her book highlights the preoccupation with authority to rule and legitimacy within disparate regional, provincial, ethnic, sectarian, ideological, and professional communities. By reading these texts in such a way, Hanaoka transforms the literary patterns of these fantastic histories into rich sources of information about identity, rhetoric, authority, legitimacy, and centre–periphery relations.

Mimi Hanaoka is Assistant Professor of Religious Studies at the University of Richmond, where she is a scholar of history and religion. Her publications include scholarly journal articles on Persian and Islamic history and historiography. Her work as a social and cultural historian focuses on Iran and the Persianate world from the tenth to fifteenth centuries, concentrating on issues of authority and identity. In the field of global history, she concentrates on interactions between the Middle East and East Asia, focusing on the history of Iran–Japan relations.



# Cambridge Studies in Islamic Civilization

Editorial Board
Chase F. Robinson, The Graduate Center, The City University of New York (general editor)
David O. Morgan, Professor Emeritus, University of Wisconsin-Madison
Shahab Ahmed, Harvard University
Virginia Aksan, McMaster University
Michael Cook, Princeton University
Peter Jackson, Keele University

Other titles in the series are listed at the back of the book.



# Authority and Identity in Medieval Islamic Historiography

Persian Histories from the Peripheries

**MIMI HANAOKA** 

University of Richmond





## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York NY 10013

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107127036

© Mimi Hanaoka 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Hanaoka, Mimi, author.

Title: Authority and identity in medieval Islamic historiography: Persian histories from the peripheries / Mimi Hanaoka.

Description: New York: Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Series: Cambridge studies in Islamic civilization | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016013911 | ISBN 9781107127036 (Hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Iran-History-640-1256-Historiography. | Iran-History-1256-1500-

Historiography. | Turkey-History-To 1453-Historiography.

Classification: LCC DS288 .H36 2016 | DDC 955.0072-dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2016013911

ISBN 978-1-107-12703-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For my parents,
Shoichiro Hanaoka (1945–2014) and
Iola Price Hanaoka (1942–2014)



# Contents

Preface		page 1x
Acknowledgments		xi
Journal and Reference Works Abbreviations		XV
1	Introduction	1
2	Methodologies for Reading Hybrid Identities	
	and Imagined Histories	13
3	Contexts and Authorship	36
4	Dreaming of the Prophet	70
5	Holy Bloodlines, Prophetic Utterances,	
	and Taxonomies of Belonging	99
6	Living Virtues of the Land	138
7	Sacred Bodies and Sanctified Cities	168
8	Prophetic Etymologies and Sacred Spaces	204
9	The View from Anatolia	220
10	Lessons from the Peripheries	251
Bibliography		261
Index		297



## **Preface**

The primary sources used in this study are written in Arabic, Persian, and are often bilingual to varying degrees. I follow the *International Journal of Middle Eastern Studies (IJMES)* transliteration system for Arabic transliterations, and consequently I do not indicate the final  $t\bar{a}$  'marbuṭa, nor do I distinguish between the alif mamdūda and alif maqṣūra. For Persian terms, I use a modified *IJMES* transliteration system. In bilingual Arabic-Persian sources, I generally prioritize the Arabic transliteration. Due to the bilingual nature of the texts and the accompanying challenges in transliteration, I hope I will be forgiven for any inconsistencies and preferences.

Place names appear without transliteration (e.g., Tabaristan, Bukhara, Qum). When technical terms and place names used in English are part of a proper noun, such as the title of a work (e.g., *Tārīkh-i Ṭabaristān*), I include diacritical marks. Therefore, the title of the work *Tārīkh-i Bukhārā* includes diacritical marks, as does historical personage al-Bukhārī, but Bukhara as a place does not. Proper names of people and the names by which they are known, including titles, are supplied with diacritical marks (e.g., Fāṭima, Fāṭima al-Maʿṣūma, Muḥammad).

Commonly used technical terms appear without transliteration. With the exception of Imam, Shi'a, Shi'i, Shi'ism, Sunni, and Sunnism, the terms are italicized (e.g., Ahl al-Bayt, Allah, amir, Baraka, dinar, fatwa, fiqh, fuqaha, hadith, imam, isnad, madrasa, Mahdi, matn, muhaddith, qadi, sayyid, sharif, shaykh, Shu'ubiya, sunna, Sura, ulama, umma, waqf, wazir). I have referenced the IJMES Word List for guidance on which terms and names are Anglicized.



#### x Preface

I do not transliterate technical terms and titles that are commonly used in English, including Anglicized terms of Arabic origin (e.g., Abbasid, Alawi, 'Alid, Ash'ari, bazaar, Buyids, caliph, Daylami, Fatimid, Ghaznavid, Ghurid, Hanafi, Imam, Isma'ili, Jahiliya, Mamluk, Qur'an, Safavid, Saffarid, Sasanian, Seljuq, shah, Sufi, sultan, Tahirid, Talibi, Umayyad, vizier, Zaydi, Ziyarid).

I have included diacritical marks on less commonly used technical terms (e.g., abdāl, akhbār, awliyā', awqāf, a'yān, dā'ī, faḍā'il, ghulām, ijāza, khabar, khāngāh, khawārij, maḍhāhib, madhḥab, mashḥad, mawlā, miḥna, mazār, mi'rāj, rāwī, riwāyah, Rūm, ṣaḥāba, Ṣaḥīḥayn, ṭabaqāt, tābi'ūn, tafsīr, tarīqa, 'umarā', ziyārat).

For proper names, I retain the definite article "al-" at the beginning of a name only at the first mention of the proper name but exclude the definite article on subsequent mentions of the proper name (e.g., the name is rendered as al-Qummī on first mention and then subsequently as Qummī). I do not consider the "al-" for bibliographic purposes (e.g., Ḥasan ibn Muḥammad al-Qummī appears al-Qummī, Ḥasan ibn Muhammad, under "Q").

I generally give the Common Era (CE) dates for events. Whenever relevant, I also give the *hijrī* dates in the form of *hijrī*/CE dates (e.g., 613/1217, third/ninth century). When there are disagreements or disputes about dates, I attempt to note the range of possible dates and generally follow the dates used in the *Encyclopedia of Islam*, 2nd edition.

For the Qur'an, I principally reference the English translation by Ahmed Ali, final revised edition (Princeton University Press, 2001).



# Acknowledgments

This book has been supported and enriched by many people, and I am grateful and indebted for all of the help I have received. I owe much to the insights, support, and suggestions of my mentors, peers, friends, and colleagues, but all faults, deficiencies, and defects in scholarship are entirely my own. I bear full responsibility for this book's shortcomings.

At Columbia University, where I completed the dissertation out of which this book grew, I benefited from the mentorship and training of many exceptional faculty. Peter Awn and Richard Bulliet were ideal guides on this journey, and they saw the project through all its iterations, from the kernel of an idea to a completed dissertation. Hossein Kamaly at Barnard College, Mehdi Khorrami at NYU, and Masoud Jafari Jazi at the Institute for Advanced Studies at Princeton University expertly shared with me the nuances and rigors of classical Persian literature.

In the field of Arabic language and literature, I benefited from the expertise of Taoufik Ben-Amor, George Saliba, and George El-Hage at Columbia University. At the Center for Arabic Studies Abroad (CASA) at the American University in Cairo, I enjoyed the superb training and unflagging patience of Zeinab Taha, Hebatalah Salem, Azza Hassanein, Raghda El-Essawi, Shereen El-Ezabi, Nevenka Korica, Mahmoud Al-Batal, and Abbas Al-Tonsi.

Elizabeth Castelli and members of the Departments of Religion at Columbia University and Barnard College generously shared their expertise and advice on my research. Neguin Yavari at The New School provided consistent encouragement during my graduate training. Members of Columbia University's Middle East and North Africa (MENA) workshop offered thoughtful critiques, insights, and a space to share works in



## xii Acknowledgments

progress. The staff of the Columbia University Libraries enabled much of the research necessary for this project.

The Jacob K. Javits Fellowship and the Graduate School of Arts and Sciences of Columbia University supported my doctoral work at Columbia University. The CASA and the American Institute of Iranian Studies provided financial support for training in Arabic and Persian.

Friends and colleagues have allowed me to present works in progress, and they have challenged me to refine and rethink my work. Kazuo Morimoto at the Institute for Advanced Studies on Asia, The University of Tokyo, generously invited me to present part of my research on dreams in 2012. Michael Pregill at Boston University was a thoughtful colloquium interlocutor for an early version of Chapter 4. I explored part of my research on dreams in my 2013 article in *Iranian Studies* and a limited version of the ideas presented in Chapter 2 in my 2015 article in the *Journal of Persianate Studies*. The audience and panelists at the annual meetings of the Middle East Studies Association (MESA) and American Academy of Religion (AAR) provided valuable feedback. I am grateful to fellow CASA alumna Kate Swearengen, who read through a manuscript draft in its entirety, efficiently and thoroughly, and offered thoughtful comments.

At the University of Richmond, my colleagues both within and beyond the Department of Religious Studies encouraged this project. The Office of the Dean of the School of Arts and Sciences and the Faculty Research Council of the School of Arts and Sciences provided financial support for this project. The staff of Boatwright Memorial Library, and especially the Inter-Library Loan department, enabled me to access many materials necessary to develop and complete this work.

At Cambridge University Press, William Masami Hammell gave me the opportunity to transform my manuscript into a book, an endeavor that Maria Marsh brings to fruition. The anonymous readers who read my manuscript and generously offered valuable comments and critiques greatly improved this work.

In Tokyo, I received extraordinary support and kindness from Machiko Romaine and Kazuko Nishikawa, as well as Tim Thornton and the faculty and staff of the American School in Japan.

At home, Shahan Mufti has been a well of kindness: loving, helpful, and supportive. Through challenges and in happiness, he has been there throughout. With their unlimited love, Totoro and Mochi bring joy to every day.



## Acknowledgments

xiii

I owe my deepest debt of gratitude to my parents, Shoichiro Hanaoka (1945–2014) and Iola Price Hanaoka (1942–2014). They supported every aspect of my life with unconditional love, boundless generosity, and tireless encouragement. There is a Japanese proverb (*sode furi au mo tashō no en*), which states that those whose sleeves so much as brush against each other in this life have been bound together in many previous lifetimes. I hope that I will have the good fortune to meet them in future lifetimes, too. I dedicate this book to them.



# Journal and Reference Works Abbreviations

BSOAS	Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies
EI2	Encyclopedia of Islam, Second Edition
EI3	Encyclopedia of Islam, Third Edition
EIr	Encyclopedia Iranica
EQ	Encyclopaedia of the Quran
IJMES	International Journal of Middle Eastern Studies
JAOS	Journal of the American Oriental Society
JSAI	Jerusalem Studies in Arabic and Islam
JRAS	Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society