

Plants, People and Practices

UPOV and the UPOV Convention are increasingly relevant and important. They have technical, social and normative legitimacy and have standardised numerous concepts and practices related to plant varieties and plant breeding. In this book, Jay Sanderson provides the first sustained and detailed account of the Convention. Building upon the idea that it has an open-ended and contingent relationship with scientific, legal, technical, political, social and institutional actors, the author explores the Convention's history, concepts and practices. Part I examines the emergence of the UPOV Convention during the 1950s and its expanding legitimacy in relation to plant variety protection and plant breeding more broadly. Part II explores the Convention's key concepts and practices, including plant breeder, plant variety, plant names (denomination), characteristics, protected material, essentially derived varieties (EDV) and farm-saved seed. This book is an invaluable resource for academics, policy-makers, agricultural managers and researchers in this field.

JAY SANDERSON is an Associate Professor at USC Law School (USC Australia), a member of the Australian Centre for Intellectual Property in Agriculture (ACIPA) and an adjunct with the Law Futures Centre, Griffith University Law School, Queensland. He has published widely on issues of intellectual property, plants and agri-food, and has been cited by Australia's Productivity Commission and Advisory Council on Intellectual Property. He is the co-editor of *The Intellectual Property and Food Project: From Rewarding Innovation and Creation to Feeding the World* (with Charles Lawson, 2013).



Cambridge Intellectual Property and Information Law

As its economic potential has rapidly expanded, intellectual property has become a subject of front-rank legal importance. Cambridge Intellectual Property and Information Law is a series of monograph studies of major current issues in intellectual property. Each volume contains a mix of international, European, comparative and national law, making this a highly significant series for practitioners, judges and academic researchers in many countries.

Series Editors

Lionel Bently

Herchel Smith Professor of Intellectual Property Law, University of Cambridge

Graeme Dinwoodie

Professor of Intellectual Property and Information Technology Law, University of Oxford

Advisory Editors

William R. Cornish, Emeritus Herchel Smith Professor of Intellectual Property Law, University of Cambridge
François Dessemontet, Professor of Law, University of Lausanne
Jane C. Ginsburg, Morton L. Janklow, Professor of Literary and Artistic Property Law, Columbia Law School
Paul Goldstein, Professor of Law, Stanford University
The Rt Hon. Sir Robin Jacob, Hugh Laddie Professor of Intellectual Property, University College, London
Ansgar Ohly, Professor of Intellectual Property Law, Ludwig Maximilians Universitat Munchen, Germany

A list of books in the series can be found at the end of this volume.



Plants, People and Practices

The Nature and History of the UPOV Convention

Jay Sanderson

USC Law School USC Australia





AMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia 4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi - 110002, India 79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107126497

10.1017/9781316411216

© Jay Sanderson 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Sanderson, Jay (Law teacher), author.

Title: Plants, people and practices: the nature and history of the UPOV

convention / Dr. Jay Sanderson.

Other titles: Nature and history of the UPOV convention

Cambridge intellectual property and information law.

Description: New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2017.

Series: Cambridge intellectual property and information law

Identifiers: LCCN 2016043401 | ISBN 9781107126497 (Hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: International Union for the Protection of New

Varieties of Plants-History. | Plant varieties-Patents. | Plant breeders-Legal status, laws, etc.

Classification: LCC K3876 .S25 2017 | DDC 346.04/86-dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2016043401

ISBN 978-1-107-12649-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

	Acknowledgements	age vii
1	Introduction	1
Pa	rt I	19
2	The Emergence of the UPOV Convention: A New Context of Plant Breeding and Dissatisfaction with Existing Forms of Protection	21
3	UPOV's Legitimacy: From Members and Trade to Objectives, Structure and Norms	45
Pa	rt II	79
4	Recognising Plant Breeders, Protecting Discoveries	81
5	The Proliferation, Politicisation and Legalisation of Plant Varieties	113
6	Bringing Order and Stability to Variety Denomination	139
7	Science Isn't Enough: Genotypes, Phenotypes and the Utilitarian Nature of Plant Variety Rights Schemes	162
8	Expanding Protected Material: Embedding Legal Language and Practices in the UPOV Convention	183
9	Examining and Identifying Essentially Derived Varieties: The Place of Science, Law and Cooperation	205
10	Saving and Exchanging Seeds: Licences, Levies and Speculation	231
11	The Nature of UPOV and the UPOV Convention	263

© in this web service Cambridge University Press



vi Contents

Appendix 1	<i>UPOV 1961/1972</i>	268
Appendix 2	UPOV 1978	293
Appendix 3	UPOV 1991	313
Index		334



Acknowledgements

As with any book, I have benefitted enormously from the support and help of many people. Indeed, the list of family, friends and colleagues who have supported or helped me along the way is long. However, a special debt is owed to the following people. Brad Sherman, previously based at Griffith Law School and now at the TC Beirne School of Law (UQ), for his guidance, ideas and support. He is passionate about research and a wonderful mentor and friend. Leanne Wiseman, who gave me my first research work – as a 'not so young' undergraduate law student – continues to be a mentor and collaborator. Over the years, she has also become a good friend.

I have also benefitted from discussions and comradeship with my colleagues from the Australian Centre for Intellectual Property in Agriculture (ACIPA), particularly Charles Lawson but also Carol Ballard, Matthew Rimmer, Stephen Hubicki, Berris Charnley and Brendan Tobin. Thanks also to Peter Button, Yolanda Huerta and Bernard Le Buanec from UPOV. Peter Button, in particular, has been generous with his time and patience, particularly with my initial attempts to simplify some of the technical aspects of UPOV and the UPOV Convention. Translations of the Diplomatic Conference of 1957–1961, 1972 were funded by ACIPA and done by Monique Coombs. Numerous other colleagues at the Griffith Law School and the USC Law School have contributed to this book: providing a fertile research environment (William MacNeil, Kieran Tranter, Charles Lawson and Leanne Wiseman), talking about transgenics and science fiction (Tim Peters), engaging with ideas and humour, and being man enough to wear brightly coloured pants (Edwin Bikundo), or being passionate about all things research and theoretical (Brendon Murphy). The editorial and production staff at Cambridge University Press were nothing but supportive throughout the review and publication process, and I am thankful for their efforts. It goes without saying that all faults lie with me and that nothing contained in the book reflects the views of anyone but the author.

vii



viii Acknowledgements

Finally the book would not have been possible without a loving and supportive family. Jenny and Cam (or as I like to call them, Mum and Dad) have supported everything that I have done or attempted to do. Isaac, Ruby and Baxter have grown a lot in the time it took me to complete this book. They give me perspective, joy and purpose. Most importantly, I owe so much to Jacqueline: where I am pragmatic and rational, she is creative and passionate; where I am words and thoughts, she is art and love... 'all in your back pocket'.¹

```
grey space
tender humour
restricted rage
dust
art
and
love
all in your back pocket.
Kylie Johnson, Count Me the Stars (Pier 9, 2008)
```