

Machiavelli's Florentine Republic

What do modern republics have to fear? *Machiavelli's Florentine Republics* reconstructs Machiavelli's answer to this question from the perspective of the *Florentine Histories*, his most probing meditation on the fate of republican politics in the modern age. It argues that his principle goal in narrating the defeat of Florentine republicanism is to debunk the views of leading humanists concerning the overall health of republican politics in modernity and the distinctive challenges that modern republics should expect to face. The Medici family had exposed these vulnerabilities better than anyone else, and Machiavelli reconstructs their political strategy to show how conventional ideas of moral and political virtue are the most potent instruments of princely ambition in a city that wants to be free.

Michelle T. Clarke is Associate Professor of Government at Dartmouth College. She received her Ph.D. in Political Science from Yale University in 2007. Clarke's research focuses on Machiavelli, Florentine humanism, Roman political thought, and interpretive methods. Her work has been published in the *Journal of Politics*, *History of Political Thought*, *Political Studies*, *Political Research Quarterly*, and the *Review of Politics*.



Machiavelli's Florentine Republic

MICHELLE T. CLARKE

Dartmouth College







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107125506

DOI: 10.1017/9781316410776

© Michelle T. Clarke 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2018

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data
Names: Clarke, Michelle T., author.
Title: Machiavelli's Florentine republic / Michelle T. Clarke.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge
University Press, 2018. | Includes bibliographical references and index.
Identifiers: LCCN 2018000411 | ISBN 9781107181717 (alk. paper)
Subjects: LCSH: Machiavelli, Niccolao, 1469–1527. Istorie fiorentine. |
Florence (Italy) – Politics and government – 1421–1737. | Republicanism –
Italy – Florence – History – 16th century.
Classification: LCC DG736.3.M333 C55 2018 | DDC 945/.506 – dc23
LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2018000411

ISBN 978-1-107-12550-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For C. and C.



Holy Father of thy Country, this title hath been conferred on thee by the people, by the senate, and by us, the knights. But history had already conferred it; yet didst thou also receive, though late, thy title true; long time hadst thou been Father of the World. Thou bearest on earth the name which Jupiter bears in high heaven: of men thou art the father, he of the gods. Romulus, thou must yield pride of place. Caesar by his guardian care makes great thy city walls: the walls thou gavest to the city were such as Remus could o'erleap. Thy power was felt by Tatius, the little Cures, and Caenina; under Caesar's leadership whate'er the sun beholds on either side is Roman. Thou didst own a little stretch of conquered land: all that exists beneath the canopy of Jove is Caesar's own. Thou didst rape wives: Caesar bade them under his rule be chaste. Thou didst admit the guilty to thy grove: he hath repelled the wrong. Thine was a rule of force: under Caesar it is the laws that reign. Thou didst the name of *dominus* bear: he bears the name of *princeps*.

- Ovid, *Fasti* 2, lines 134-144

When he had seduced the army with gifts, the people with grain, and everyone with the charms of peace, he grew stronger little by little. He collected the responsibilities of the Senate, the magistrates, and the courts for himself, with no one to stop him because the most energetic men had fallen in battle or proscriptions. As for the rest of the aristocrats, the more willingly they subjected themselves to slavery, the more they were rewarded with wealth and honors Everything was peaceful, and the magistrates had the same names as before. The younger citizens had been born after Augustus's victory at Actium, and the older ones were born during the civil wars. Who remained who had known the Republic?

- Tacitus, The Annals, 1.3-1.5



Contents

Acknowledgments List of Abbreviations		<i>page</i> ix xi
2	Another Republicanism	27
3	Italy after the Inundation	59
4	The Questionable Virtues of the Medici	92
5	Republican Virtue, Reconsidered	132
6	Political Ideas in History	158
Bibliography		171
Index		187



Acknowledgments

This book has been a long time coming, and I am deeply grateful for the support I have received in the many years it took for me to write it. It originated as a dissertation written at Yale University under the direction of Steven B. Smith, who always let me walk my own path intellectually, asking only that I aim high and fight hard. While at Yale, I also benefitted from the guidance and encouragement of Bryan Garsten, Norma Thompson, and Ian Shapiro, all of whom profoundly shaped my thinking about Machiavelli and introduced me to the themes of rhetoric, historiography, and realism that underpin this book.

Dartmouth College has generously supported my work on this project, as have my fabulous colleagues in the Government Department, who trusted my instincts and abilities enough to cheer me on when I decided to start things afresh a few years into my junior appointment with a couple of babies in tow. Special thanks go to Luke Swaine, Jim Murphy, Anne Sa'adah, and especially Russ Muirhead for patiently helping me to work out my intuitions about Machiavelli and political life more generally.

Portions of this book have been presented to audiences at Harvard University, Tufts University, the University of California at Davis, and the University of New Hampshire, as well as annual meetings of the American Political Science Association, the New England Political Science Association, and the Association for Political Theory. Chapter 5 is a revised and expanded version of "The Virtues of Republican Citizenship in Machiavelli's Discourses on Livy," *The Journal of Politics* 75 (2013): 317–329.

I am also very grateful to Cambridge University Press for standing behind this book and seeing it through to completion: my editors, Lew Bateman and Robert Dreesen, truly have the patience of saints. The three



Acknowledgments

X

anonymous reviewers for Cambridge were all immensely helpful in bringing the book into its final form; the care and attention they gave to commenting on it was truly extraordinary and led to several important changes.

All that I have done and will do professionally has its roots in the transformative introduction to political theory that I received as an undergraduate at Tufts University, where Rob Devigne and Vickie Sullivan stepped into my life at a critical moment and made me into something. Matt Clarke made endless sacrifices on behalf of this and other projects through the years, shouldering far more than his share of our domestic labors with cheerfulness and love. Winifred Amaturo, my dearest of friends, read countless versions of this manuscript, talked me through every difficulty, and all but carried me over the finish line at the end. Finally, thank you to my lovely children for making life a wonderful gift throughout.



Abbreviations

I have used the following abbreviations for Machiavelli's works. All quotations are drawn from these translations, unless otherwise noted.

- P The Prince, trans. Harvey C. Mansfield (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1998). References to *The Prince* are cited by chapter.
- D Discourses on Livy, trans. Harvey C. Mansfield and Nathan Tarcov (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996). References to the Discourses are cited by book and chapter.
- FH Florentine Histories, trans. Harvey C. Mansfield and Laura Banfield (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1988). References to the Histories are cited by book and chapter.