



The Quest for Universal Social Policy in the South

Universal social policies have the power to reduce inequality and create more cohesive societies. How can countries in the South deliver universalism? This book answers this question through a comparative analysis of Costa Rica, Mauritius, South Korea, and Uruguay, and a detailed historical account of Costa Rica's successful trajectory. Against the backdrop of democracy and progressive parties, the authors place at center stage the policy architectures defined as the combination of instruments that dictate the benefits available to people. The volume also explores the role of state actors in building pro-universal architectures. This book will interest advanced students and scholars of human development and public and social policies as well as policymakers eager to promote universal policies across the South.

JULIANA MARTÍNEZ FRANZONI is Professor in the Institute for Social Research at the University of Costa Rica.

DIEGO SÁNCHEZ-ANCOCHEA is Associate Professor in the Political Economy of Latin America and Director of the Latin American Centre at the University of Oxford.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-12541-4 — The Quest for Universal Social Policy in the South
Juliana Martínez Franzoni , Diego Sánchez-Ancochea
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

The Quest for Universal Social Policy in the South

Actors, Ideas, and Architectures

JULIANA MARTÍNEZ FRANZONI AND
DIEGO SÁNCHEZ-ANCOCHEA



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-12541-4 — The Quest for Universal Social Policy in the South
Juliana Martínez Franzoni, Diego Sánchez-Ancochea
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107125414

© Juliana Martínez Franzoni and Diego Sánchez-Ancochea 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Martínez Franzoni, Juliana, author. | Sánchez-Ancochea, Diego, author.

Title: The quest for universal social policy in the south : actors, ideas and architectures / Juliana Martínez Franzoni, Diego Sánchez-Ancochea.

Description: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2016.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016015460 | ISBN 9781107125414 (Hardback) |

ISBN 9781107564893 (Paperback)

Subjects: LCSH: Developing countries—Social policy—Case studies.

Classification: LCC HN980 .M3145 2016 | DDC 306.09172/4—dc23 LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2016015460>

ISBN 978-1-107-12541-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> vi
<i>List of Tables</i>	vii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv
Part I Universalism in the South	1
1 Introduction	3
2 Universalism in the South: Definition and Relevance	27
Part II A Comparative Study of Policy Architectures	47
3 Policy Architectures and Universal Outputs Today	49
4 The Long-Term Influence of Policy Architectures	70
Part III Building Universalism in Costa Rica	105
5 The Foundations of the Policy Architecture in the 1940s	107
6 Moving Further Towards Unification in the 1970s	123
7 Contradictory Moves under Market Pressures since the 1980s	151
Part IV Conclusions	183
8 Actors and Ideas in Comparative Perspective	185
9 The Quest for Universalism: Implications for Contemporary Policy-making	202
<i>References</i>	217
<i>Index</i>	245

Figures

1.1 Universal Outputs as a Triangle of Coverage, Generosity, and Equity	<i>page 7</i>
1.2 GDP per Capita (US\$ 2005), 1960–2012	14
1.3 GDP per Capita (US\$ 2005), 1960–2012 (1976 = 100)	14
1.4 Policy Architectures as an Independent Variable in the Short Run	17
1.5 Policy Architectures as an Independent Variable in the Long Run	18
1.6 Political Determinants of Policy Architectures	24
3.1 Dimensions of the Policy Architecture	56
3.2 Countries with High Newborn Delivery Attended by Professional Personnel: Generosity and Equity in Health Care Provision, 2013	64
6.1 Costa Rica: Milestones in the Expansion of Health Care and Pensions, 1969–1977	127
6.2 Incorporation of the Poor to the Health Care Architecture	136
7.1 Overall Rates in Payroll Taxes, 1942–1980	155
7.2 Social Policy Regime: Funding Source by Policy as Percentages, 2004	158
7.3 Appointments in Private and Public Sector by Income Decile, 1998–2004	169

Tables

1.1	Periods of Democracy and Authoritarianism in Each of the Four Selected Countries since the Creation of the Foundational Policy Architecture	<i>page</i> 15
3.1	Human Development Indicators, 2012	54
3.2	Current Policy Architectures in Health Care by Country	59
3.3	Index of Universal Outputs per Country by Component, Category, and Total Values	63
3.4	Current Policy Architectures in Pensions: Policy Instruments by Country and Component	67
5.1	Social Insurance: Presidential Draft and Bill Approved by Congress	114
6.1	Measures to Reorganize the Delivery of Health Services, 1960s	130
6.2	Rural Health Program: Number of Posts and Coverage, 1973–1983	141
6.3	Successive Changes in the Law, January 1973–December 1974	144
7.1	Costa Rica: Wages and Contributions to Social Policy Among Formal Workers, 1985–2010, Monthly Colones	159
7.2	Policy Architecture: Existing and Proposed by Private Actors	173
7.3	Pensions: Policy Instruments by Stages of the Policy Process	179
8.1	Factors Behind Foundational Architectures in Health Care	187
8.2	Factors Behind the Transformation of Architectures in Health Care	192

viii

Tables

8.3 Foundational Architecture: Stylized Depiction of Explanatory Model	200
8.4 Transformations in the Architecture: Stylized Depiction of Explanatory Model	201

Acknowledgements

The research that led to this book started five years ago. Fieldwork, data analysis, a partial rethinking of the entire project, and finally write-up subsequently followed. In the process of completing all these tasks, we met new people and discovered new places, spent time with friends, and enjoyed conversations we treasure about politics, social policy, inequality, and life affairs. Not surprisingly we have much to thank to a significant number of institutions and people without whom this book and the process that led to it would have been impossible. We hope not to forget any of them.

Our intellectual collaboration began in 2006 when together with Maxine Molyneux we received a British Academy grant to organize conferences on economic models, social policy, and inequality in London and Costa Rica. Since then, Maxine has been a tireless supporter, personal friend, and a role model for both of us. We thank her for her valuable advice, including early discussion of the ideas that gave birth to this book as well as more recent feedback on several drafts.

The project received a major push thanks to a British Academy Small Grant and Juliana's Visiting Fellowship at the Kellogg Institute in Notre Dame. Her year-long visit was also made possible by a Fulbright's fellowship for Central American scholars. The British Academy proposal benefited from insightful inputs from Leigh Payne and Tim Power as well as administrative support from personnel at the School of Interdisciplinary Area Studies in Oxford. Scott Mainwaring, Carmelo Mesa-Lago, Mitchell Seligson, and Jorge Vargas Cullell supported Juliana's application to the Kellogg where she could focus on our research in a nourishing environment. At the Kellogg, Robert Fishman and Samuel Valenzuela suggested ways to improve our comparative methodology. Lovely evenings spent with their families helped Juliana and her family cope with the harsh winter. Fulbright

happened to have a warm chaperone in their San José headquarters: Ana Lucía Pérez turned complex paperwork into a simple task.

In these initial stages of the project – as well as at other moments more recently – Evelyne Huber was always available and amazingly supportive. She helped us refine the methodology of our British Academy proposal and met often with Juliana during their joint stay at the Kellogg. She has been a great source of encouragement and inspiration for us.

Three institutions were fundamental for the completion of this research from beginning to end. The Instituto de Investigaciones Sociales (IIS) at the Universidad de Costa Rica (UCR) directed by Carmen Coameño provided sustained institutional support throughout the research process. A very special thanks goes to Ciska Raventós, former director of the IIS, who opened the door for Juliana to begin her academic career in Costa Rica. Juliana’s junior colleagues, Francisco Robles and Koen Voored, have for several years now shared their warmth and enthusiasm about our work, and Kathia Castro, the Institute’s administrative director, has been crucial in dealing with the many administrative “firsts.”

The Latin American Centre and the Oxford Department of International Development funded Diego’s fieldwork trips to Costa Rica. They have also been amazing homes for him, and many of his colleagues (including Leigh and Tim already mentioned as well as David Doyle, Valpy FitzGerald, Nandini Gooptu, Eduardo Posada-Carbó, Frances Stewart, and Rosemary Thorp) supported this project in diverse ways. We also thank CAF-Development Bank of Latin America, which funded Juliana’s trip to Oxford and some of Diego’s time in Costa Rica within the agreement CAF-Latin American Centre.

Visiting fellowships for both of us from the program Desigualdades at the Free University of Berlin were instrumental for the completion of the book. Desigualdades-funded stays in Berlin spread throughout 2011, 2012, and 2013. Altogether we had over two months of writing accompanied by long walks in the city and useful conversations with colleagues from the program. All the Desigualdades team was helpful and kind. Special thanks to our friend Barbara Fritz: she encouraged us to apply to the fellowship, supported the application, invited us to her house (where we could talk with Bert as well), and gave us useful feedback.

The project involved intense fieldwork in Costa Rica as well as archival research in New York, Geneva, and London. In Costa Rica,

Acknowledgements

xi

the personnel of the National Assembly archive, Miguel Madrigal Ureña and Luis Felipe Calderón Uriarte, went out of their way to provide all the information on key laws and legislative debates. We also thank Carlos Adrián Ramírez Martín of the Library Enrique Guier Sáenz at the D. Rafael Angel Calderón Guardia Museum. At the Caja Costarricense del Seguro Social we thank Emma Zúñiga for access to historical records. We would also like to acknowledge the support of Geraldine Hawkins at the Franklyn Delano Roosevelt Archives in New York; Remo Becci, Ariel Golan, and Keiko Niimi at the International Labour Organization in Geneva; and the personnel of the Abel-Smith Archives at the London School of Economics.

In Costa Rica, we interviewed dozens of politicians and state and social actors. These conversations helped us refine our arguments and gather valuable information on Costa Rica's policymaking in the last four decades. Those interviews – more than any other piece of data – confirmed to us the quality of the state actor we mention so many times in this book. We are particularly thankful to Jorge Vargas Cullell who gave us sharp pointers on different parts of this project, suggested several people to interview, and has shaped many of our views on Costa Rican politics. He is not only an impressive academic but also a generous friend.

During 2014, Juliana benefited from a fellowship from the Mobility Program of the University of Costa Rica – the first of its kind – to conduct fieldwork in Argentina and Uruguay. Special thanks go to Juany Guzmán and Alberto Cortés, dear friends and during that time directors of the Centro de Investigaciones y Estudios Políticos (UCR), and to Carmen Caamaño, Director of IIS, for their support in opening a door that will benefit many other researchers in the future. The Centro Interdisciplinario para el Estudio de las Políticas Públicas (CIEPP, Argentina) and the Department of Political Science at Universidad de la República (Uruguay) were Juliana's home in the Southern Cone. Ruben Lo Vuolo and Camila Arza at CIEPP and Carmen Midaglia and Maria Ester Mancebo in Montevideo were fantastic hosts. Our research benefited enormously from their intellectual energy, generosity, and personal warmth. We look forward to future collaborations with all of them.

Many colleagues provided feedback in at least some parts of the manuscript or gave us useful ideas and critical bits of data on particular topics. Their work has also been a source of inspiration and informs

this book in multiple ways. Colleagues who gave us feedback include (in alphabetical order): Armando Barrientos, Daniel Béland (who read the whole manuscript), Janine Berg Anne-Emanuelle Birn, Mary Clark, David Díaz, David Doyle, Christina Ewig, Fernando Filgueira, Gerardo Hernández, Huck-Ju Kwon, Rubén Lo Vuolo, Lena Lavinás, Carmelo Mesa-Lago, James McGuire, Sheila Page, Jennifer Pribble, Jeremy Seekings, John Stephens, and Enrique Valencia. We also thank the two anonymous reviewers at Cambridge University Press as well as the reviewers of a paper published in *Latin American Politics and Society*, which constituted the basis for Chapter 4.

When venturing to compare three countries other than Costa Rica, we benefited from the help of several colleagues. For Mauritius, Jeremy Seekings sent us his excellent articles on pensions and gave us ideas to think about health care. He also provided constructive comments on the overall project. Erik Erikson's graduate thesis was also very useful. For South Korea, we received feedback from Huck-Ju Kwon, who pointed out inaccuracies in our interpretation of South Korea's current architecture and other parts of the manuscript and who invited us to Seoul. In Uruguay, Fernando Filgueira, Guillermo Fuentes, Carmen Midaglia, and Marcelo Setaro came several times to our rescue and readily shared their time and ideas.

In the course of these past five years, we have received useful feedback in the many seminars we did individually and jointly. These include presentations in the Programa de Acumulación, Distribución y Desigualdad at the IIS (UCR) in Costa Rica, Nuffield College, the Oxford Department of International Development, the University of East Anglia, and the University of Bath in the UK, the Kellogg Institute for International Studies (Notre Dame) and the Watson Institute for International and Public Affairs (Brown) in the United States, the Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean in Mexico, the Banco de la República in Colombia, the Universidad de Pacífico in Peru, the universities of Buenos Aires and San Andrés in Argentina; the Universidad de la República in Uruguay; the Seoul National University in South Korea; and FLACSO, FES and the Universidad de La Habana in Cuba. We also had useful discussions at international conferences where we participated including "The Political Economy of Social Policy in North America: Convergence towards Universalism?" (St Antony's College); "National Development, Social Inclusion and Smart Governance" (Seoul National University); and

Acknowledgements

xiii

“The Transformation of Latin American Social Policy: Dynamics, Models and Outcomes” (University of Bath).

The Latin American Studies Association (LASA) conferences have always been a key professional venue for both us. In Toronto, San Francisco, Washington, Chicago, and Puerto Rico, at least one of us organized panels on social policy where we exchanged ideas on the meaning of universalism and the politics of social policy. They were unique opportunities to receive critical feedback and to feel part of an engaging community of likeminded colleagues. We also received useful comments at conferences of the Society for the Advancement of Socio-economics and, more recently, ISA’s Research Committee on Poverty, Welfare and Social Policy (RC19) and the Red de Economía Política de América Latina (REPAL).

The team of research assistants who contributed to the project at different moments was exceptional. Thanks to Rossana Castiglioni’s diligent recommendation, we were fortunate to meet Sara Acuña Ávalos who undertook archival work in Santiago de Chile. Luis Ángel Oviedo continues providing us with fantastic statistical support and Donna Harrington edited several versions of many chapters. At the beginning of the project, Ana Luz Sáenz Ramírez helped us with archival research in San José, and Héctor Solano undertook archival research and helped us in the organization of historical data and preliminary analysis of the data presented in Chapter 6. Diana León Espinoza demands special mention and a huge thanks. She helped us with archival research, the management of data sets, general editing, the preparation of the bibliography . . . and was a lifesaver at all times!

At Cambridge University Press, we have benefited from John Haslan’s guidance, Christofere Fila and Carrie Parkinson’s support in the production process, and Jennifer Miles Davis’ efficient copyediting. We acknowledge the permission to use parts of old papers in the book granted by *Latin American Politics and Society* and *Latin American Research Review*. We also thank Humberto Jerez at FLACSO México for design of the book cover (and Alicia Puyana for making this collaboration possible) and Fernando Filgueira, Rebeca Gryspan, and Evelyne Huber for their endorsements.

We are particularly indebted to Camila Arza, Jennifer Pribble and Ken Shadlen for reading our manuscript at different stages and for their extreme patience and generosity in helping us improve our argument. This book is definitely better due to their inputs, which, in

the case of Ken, a dear friend of Diego, was not only intellectual but emotional as well. We look forward to new projects with them in the future.

We are thankful for our intellectual partnership and friendship. So much so that we are ready to embark on new joint projects to continue learning about research and policy from each other.

Our biggest gratitude goes to our families. Our life partners Rosa and Mauricio have been amazingly supportive during the whole project. They shouldered all domestic duties and caretaking when we were away working on the book and welcomed us back home tired but with a supportive smile. Silvia, Maite and Maya came to accept our absences as well as our busy presence when working together in either of our homes in Oxford and San Isidro. They are all an amazing source of energy and happiness. We did our best to make them part of this project. We know that they enjoyed visiting Berlin, Buenos Aires, and Costa Rica and that they cherish the extended family we built along the way. This book is dedicated to the five of them.

Abbreviations

AFAP	Administradoras de Fondos de Ahorro Provisional (Pension Savings Funds Administrators)
ASSE	Administración de los Servicios de Salud del Estado (State Administrator of Health Services)
AUGE	Plan de Acceso Universal de Garantías Explícitas (Universal Access Plan with Explicit Guarantees)
BPS	Banco de Provision Social (Social Welfare Bank)
BRP	Basic Retirement Pension
CCSS	Caja Costarricense del Seguro Social (Costa Rican Social Insurance Agency)
CCTs	Conditional Cash Transfers
CISS	Conferencia Interamericana de Seguridad Social (Inter-American Conference on Social Security)
CN	Concertación Nacional (National Pact)
COOPESAIN	Cooperativa Autogestionaria de Servidores para la Salud Integral (Self-Management Cooperative for Integral Health)
COOPESALUD	Cooperativa Autogestionaria de Servicios Integrales de Salud (Self-Management Cooperative of Integral Health Services)
COOPESANA	Cooperativa Cogestionaria de Salud de Santa Ana R.L (Health Self-Management Cooperative of Santa Ana)

DFID	Department for International Development
DGSS	Dirección General de Seguridad Social (General Board for Social Security)
DISSE	Dirección de Seguros Sociales por Enfermedad (National Board of Social Insurance)
DRG	Diagnosis Related Groups
EBAIS	Equipos Básicos de Atención Integral en Salud (Basic Comprehensive Health Care Teams)
ECLAC	Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean
FODESAF	Fondo de Desarrollo Social y Asignaciones Familiares (Social Assistance Fund)
FONASA	Fondo Nacional de Salud (National Health Care Fund)
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GP	General Practitioner
IDS	Institute of Development Studies
IFIs	International Financial Institutions
ILO	International Labour Organization
IMAS	Instituto Mixto de Ayuda Social (Mixed Institute of Social Assistance)
IMF	International Monetary Fund
INA	Instituto Nacional de Aprendizaje (National Learning Institute)
ITCO	Instituto de Tierras y Colonización (Institute of Land and Colonization)
LPT	Ley de Protección al Trabajador (Workers' Protection Law)
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MOH	Minister of Health
NBLS	National Basic Living Standard
NHI	National Health Insurance
NHS	National Health System
NPF	National Pension Fund
NPS	National Pension System

Abbreviations

xvii

NRF	National Resource Fund
NSF	National Savings Fund
OECD	Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development
PAHO	Pan American Health Organization
PANI	Patronato Nacional para la Infancia (Childrens National Agency)
PLN	Partido Liberación Nacional (National Liberation Party)
SIPROCIMECA	Sindicato de Profesionales en Ciencias Médicas de la C.C.S.S. e Instituciones Afines (Union of Medical Professionals of the Costa Rican Social Insurance Agency)
SNAIS	Sistema Nacional Integral de Salud (National Integrated Health System)
SUPEN	Superintendencia de Pensiones (Pensions Supervision Agency)
UCIMED	Universidad de Ciencias Médicas (University of Medical Science)
UM	Unión Médica (Medical Union)
UNICEF	United Nations Children’s Fund
UNRISD	United Nations Research Institute for Social Development
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WHO	World Health Organization
WOP	War on Poverty