PLOTINUS AND EPICURUS

This volume investigates why Plotinus, a philosopher inspired by Plato, made critical use of Epicurean philosophy. Eminent scholars show that some fundamental Epicurean conceptions pertaining to ethics, physics, epistemology and theology are drawn upon in the *Enneads* to discuss crucial notions such as pleasure and happiness, providence and fate, matter and the role of sense perception, intuition and intellectual evidence in relation to the process of knowledge acquisition. By focusing on the meaning of these terms in Epicureanism, Plotinus deploys sophisticated methods of comparative analysis and argumentative procedures that ultimately lead him to approach certain aspects of Epicurus' philosophy as a benchmark for his own theories and to accept, reject or discredit the positions of authors of his own day. At the same time, these discussions reveal what aspects of Epicurean philosophy were still perceived to be of vital relevance in the third century AD.

ANGELA LONGO is Associate Professor of Ancient Greek Philosophy at the University of L'Aquila. Her research focuses on Plato and late Platonism, particularly Plotinus, Syrianus, Hermias and Proclus. Her books include *Plotin, Traité 2 (IV, 7). Sur l'immortalité de l'âme. Introduction, traduction, commentaire et notes* (2009) and *Argument from Hypothesis in Ancient Philosophy* (2011).

DANIELA PATRIZIA TAORMINA is Associate Professor of Ancient Greek Philosophy at the University of Rome 'Tor Vergata', Visiting Professor at the University of Paris I, Panthéon-Sorbonne, at the Friedrich-Schiller-Universität Jena, at the École Pratique des Hautes Études (EPHE), Paris. Her books include *Plutarco di Atene: L'Uno, l'anima e le forme* (1989), *Jamblique, critique de Plotin et de Porphyre: Quatre études* (1999) and *Giamblico: I frammenti dalle epistole. Introduzione, testo, traduzione e commento* (with R. M. Piccione, 2010).

PLOTINUS AND EPICURUS

Matter, Perception, Pleasure

EDITED BY ANGELA LONGO and DANIELA PATRIZIA TAORMINA







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107124219

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2016

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data Longo, Angela, editor. Plotinus and Epicurus : matter, perception, pleasure / edited by Angela Longo and Daniela Patrizia Taormina. New York City : Cambridge University Press, 2016. Includes bibliographical references and index. LCCN 2016006108 ISBN 9781107124219 LCSH: Plotinus. Epicurus – Influence. LCC B693.Z7 P55 2016 DDC 186/.4 – dc23 LC record available at http://lccn.loc.gov/2016006108

ISBN 978-1-107-12421-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

www.cambridge.org

Contents

List of contributors Preface	<i>page</i> vii x
Daniela Patrizia Taormina List of abbreviations Note on transliteration	xiii xviii
Introduction Angela Longo and Daniela Patrizia Taormina	I
PART I HISTORICAL OVERVIEW	
The school and texts of Epicurus in the early centuries of the Roman empire <i>Tiziano Dorandi</i>	29
PART II COMMON ANTI-EPICUREAN ARGUMENTS IN PLOTINUS	
2 The mention of Epicurus in Plotinus' tr. 33 (<i>Enn.</i> II 9) in the context of the polemics between pagans and Christians in the second to third centuries AD: Parallels between Celsus,	
Plotinus and Origen <i>Angela Longo</i>	51
3 Epicureans and Gnostics in tr. 47 (Enn. III 2) 7.29–41 Manuel Mazzetti	69
4 'Heavy birds' in tr. 5 (<i>Enn</i> . V 9) 1.8: References to Epicureanism and the problem of pleasure in Plotinus <i>Mauricio Pagotto Marsola</i>	82

v

vi	Contents		
5	Plotinus, Epicurus and the problem of intellectual evidence: Tr. 32 (<i>Enn</i> . V 5) 1 <i>Pierre-Marie Morel</i>	96	
6	'What is known through sense perception is an image'. Plotinus' tr. 32 (<i>Enn</i> . V 5) 1.12–19: An anti-Epicurean argument? <i>Daniela Patrizia Taormina</i>	113	
PAI	RT III PLOTINUS' CRITICISM OF EPICUREAN DOCTRINES		
7	Corporeal matter, indefiniteness and multiplicity: Plotinus' critique of Epicurean atomism in tr. 12 (<i>Enn.</i> II 4) 7.20–8 <i>Marco Ninci</i>	133	
8	Plotinus' reception of Epicurean atomism in <i>On Fate</i> , tr. 3 (<i>Enn.</i> III 1) 1–3 <i>Erik Eliasson</i>	160	
	RT IV EPICUREAN ELEMENTS IN PLOTINUS: Me instances		
9	<i>Athroa epibolē</i> : On an Epicurean formula in Plotinus' work <i>Andrei Cornea</i>	177	
10	Plotinus and Epicurus on pleasure and happiness <i>Alessandro Linguiti</i>	189	
Bil	liography	199	
Ina	lex locorum	215	
	Index of modern authors 2		
Ina	Index of main concepts		

www.cambridge.org

Contributors

- ANDREI CORNEA teaches political philosophy at the Department for European Studies of the University of Bucharest. He has written several books on classical philosophy, such as *When Socrates was Wrong* (2004) (French version: *Lorsque Socrate a tort* (2009)) and *A History of Nonbeing in Greek Philosophy* (2010); as well as on issues concerning moral and epistemic relativism (*The Khazarian Tournament* (1996; 2003)) and liberty in the modern world (*The Miracle* (2014)). He has also translated into Romanian several works of Plato (*Republic* (1986), *Theaetetus* (2012), *Philebus* (1993)) and Aristotle (*Metaphysics* (2003; 2007), *On Generation and Decay* (2010)), the *Enneads* of Plotinus (2003; 2006; 2009) and the extant works of Epicurus (in press).
- TIZIANO DORANDI is Directeur de recherche au CNRS (Villejuif, France). His interests include papyrology (especially the Herculaneum Papyri), textual criticism, ancient biography and ancient philosophy. In addition to other books and his many articles, he has recently published a new edition of Diogenes Laertius, *Lives of Eminent Philosophers* (Cambridge, 2013).
- ERIK ELIASSON (PhD 2005, Associate Professor/Docent 2012, Uppsala) is Research Fellow of the Istituto Svedese di Studi Classici, Rome, and Research Fellow of the Helsinki Collegium for Advanced Studies. His publications include *The Notion of That Which Depends on Us in Plotinus and Its Background (Philosophia Antiqua* vol. CXIII (2008)), as well as studies on Middle Platonism, Neoplatonism and the early commentators on Aristotle's *Ethics*.
- ALESSANDRO LINGUITI is Associate Professor of the History of Ancient Philosophy at the Department of History and Cultural Heritage of the University of Siena and a member of the Academia Platonica Septima Monasteriensis founded by M. Baltes. His main publications are *L'ultimo*

viii

List of contributors

platonismo greco: Principi e conoscenza (1990); Anonymous, Commentary on the Parmenides, in Corpus dei papiri filosofici greci e latini vol. 111 63– 202 (1995); Plotin, Traité 36 (I 5) (2007); and Proclo, Teologia Platonica (2007, with Mario Casaglia).

- ANGELA LONGO has been Associate Professor of Greek Philosophy at the University of Geneva (Switzerland) and is currently working at the University of L'Aquila (Italy). She is a specialist in Plato and the Platonic tradition, both pagan and Christian. She is the author of books on Plato (*La tecnica della domanda e le interrogazioni fittizie in Platone* (2000); French translation: *L'Art du questionnement et les interrogations fictives chez Platon*, transl. Alain Lernould (2007)), Plotinus (*Plotin, Traité 2 (IV,* 7): Sur l'immortalité de l'âme, with intr., transl. and comm. (2009)) and Syrianus (*Siriano e i principi della scienza*; prefazione di Jonathan Barnes (2005)). She is also the editor of the collected volumes Syrianus et la métaphysique de l'Antiquité tardive (2008) and Argument from Hypothesis in Ancient Philosophy (2011).
- MANUEL MAZZETTI is a PhD student at La Sapienza University in Rome. He graduated in 2013 from the University of Siena with a thesis about divine providence in Alexander of Aphrodisias and the early Peripatetics. Some results of his thesis are now published in *Annali di Studi Umanistici* I (2014). He is currently working on the topics of causal determinism and free will in relation to the Hellenistic philosophers.
- PIERRE-MARIE MOREL is Professor of Ancient Philosophy at the Université Paris I-Panthéon Sorbonne, and Senior Member of the Institut Universitaire de France. He is the author of *Democrite et la recherche des causes* (1996), *Atome et nécessité: Démocrite, Epicure, Lucrèce* (2000), *Aristote: Une philosophie de l'activité* (2003), *De la Matière à l'action: Aristote et le problème du vivant* (2007) and *Epicure: La Nature et la raison* (2009). He has recently translated Epicurus' letters and maxims into French: *Epicure, Lettres, Maximes et autres textes* (2011). He has also published articles on Aristotle, the Greek Atomists and Plotinus.
- MARCO NINCI, an alumnus and former research fellow of the Scuola Normale Superiore di Pisa, focuses on Greek patristics and its relation to pagan Neoplatonism and medieval philosophy. After publishing an annotated translation of Plotinus' Fifth *Ennead* prefaced by an extensive introduction (M. Ninci, *Il pensiero come diverso dall'Uno, Quinta Enneade* (2000)), he has continued his work on Plotinus by authoring a number of wide-ranging articles. His edition of the Greek letters by

List of contributors

the Venetian humanist Vincenzo Quirini is in press at Edizioni di Storia e Letteratura (Rome), and he is currently completing a monograph on Plotinus for Il Mulino (Bologna).

- MAURICIO PAGOTTO MARSOLA is Professor of Ancient Philosophy at the Federal University of São Paulo (Unifesp). His research concerns methodological questions in Plotinus, such as exegesis, dialectic, and discursive and non-discursive thought, and the status of the One. In recent years, his studies have concerned also Plotinus' anthropological typology in the context of the Plotinian reading of Platonic dialogues and the anti-Gnostic treatises. This latest research is in the context of the project of editing Plotinian treatises ('Projet Plotin'), directed by Professor Jean-Marc Narbonne.
- DANIELA PATRIZIA TAORMINA is Associate Professor of Greek Philosophy at the University of Rome 'Tor Vergata'. She has published numerous articles and book chapters on philosophy in Late Antiquity, especially on metaphysics and the doctrine of the soul. Her works include the books *Plutarco di Atene: L'Uno, l'anima e le forme* (1989), *Jamblique, critique de Plotin et de Porphyre: Quatre études* (1999) and *Giamblico: I frammenti dalle epistole. Introduzione, testo, traduzione e commento* (with R. M. Piccione, 2010). She is the co-editor of the collected volumes *L'essere del pensiero: Saggi sulla filosofia di Plotino* (2010), *Aglaïa: Autour de Platon* (Mélanges offerts à Monique Dixsaut, 2010), and *La filosofia antica: Itinerario storico e testuale* (2012).

ix

Preface

This volume arises from the PRIN MIUR 2009 project Le filosofie postellenistiche da Antioco a Plotino (Post-Hellenistic philosophies from Antiochus to Plotinus). In particular, it reflects the work organised by the research unit set up by Angela Longo and Daniela Patrizia Taormina, Gli atomi di Epicuro e l'ordine di Plotino: Uno scorcio sugli usi plotiniani dell'epicureismo (Epicurus' Atoms and Plotinus' Order: An Overview of Plotinus' Use of Epicureanism). The terms 'atoms' and 'order' here refer not to any specific field, but to the underlying conceptual structures of the two philosophies, at work in all areas of enquiry: physics, ontology and ethics. The idea of conducting this comparative work on Plotinus came from Angela Longo, and was immediately and enthusiastically taken up. This enthusiasm might seem rather surprising, given that Platonism and Epicureanism may not unreasonably be regarded as philosophies so distant from one another as to appear quite incompatible and unsuitable for comparison. Recent studies have shown, however, that it is possible to bridge the distance between the two. Beyond the polemic, clear points of contact between the two philosophies have been seen to emerge.

What we have, then, is a twofold perspective. On the one hand, the polemical distance between two highly distinctive philosophies is bound to bring out important aspects of both. On the other hand, the emergence of unexpected convergences sheds light on some significant historical and theoretical aspects.

In our pursuit of this perspective, we organised three symposia: on 29 November 2012 at the headquarters of the Società Geografica Italiana (Palazzetto Mattei) in Rome, on 7 and 8 March 2013 at the University of L'Aquila and on 19 April at the Swiss Institute in Rome.

In these symposia we sought to contextualise Plotinus' position within the framework of the more general debate between late Platonists and Epicureans, not least in relation to specific theoretical stances held by Epicurus and his followers. The papers delivered covered a broad range of topics:

Preface

'So that you may understand the philosopher under every aspect and not judge him before knowing him': The school and writings of Epicurus in the early centuries of the Roman empire (T. Dorandi); Epicurus and Epicureans against geometry? (F. Verde); Aspects of Plutarch's anti-Epicureanism: A re-assessment (E. Kechagia); Sextus Empiricus and the Epicurean telos: Is pleasure preferable by nature? (E. Spinelli); Epicurus and Epicureanism in Seneca (S. Maso); No deviations allowed: Causality and Epicurean atomism in Plotinus' tr. 3 (Enn. III I) (C. Arruzza); 'Heavy birds' (tr. 5 (Enn. V 9) I.8): References to *Epicureanism and the problem of pleasure in Plotinus* (M. Pagotto Marsola); Corporeal matter, indefiniteness and multiplicity: Plotinus' critique of Epicurean atomism in treatise 12 (Enn. II 4) 7.20-8 (M. Ninci); Dieu, le monde et les corps: Le retournement du motif épicurien de la fatigue et de l'inaction (Plotin, traité 6 (Enn. IV 8) 2) (J.-F. Balaudé); Plotinus, Epicurus and the problem of intellectual evidence: Treatise 32 (Enn. V5) I (P.-M. Morel); What is known through sense perception is an image': Plotinus' tr. 32 (Enn. V 5) 1.12–19: An anti-Epicurean argument? (D. P. Taormina); Arnobius' Christian Epicureanism (C. Moreschini); With Epicurus against Platonists: Augustine on the physiology of the human body (Th. Fuhrer); and Proclus confronting real and imagined Epicureans (C. Steel).

My thanks go to the speakers and to all the people who took part in the symposia and contributed to turning them into important moments of mutual engagement among scholars through in-depth and wide-ranging discussions: our students and colleagues, especially F. Alesse, A. Aportone, G. Basileo, R. Chiaradonna, A. Conti, A. Corti, G. Di Tommaso, L. Ferroni, F. Fronterotta, F. Giampietri, F. G. Masi, A. M. Ioppolo, C. Maggi, L. Perilli, A. Serangeli, G. Schiavon and C. Tommasi.

The present volume only includes those works presented in the three symposia that were turned into a text focusing on Plotinus' criticism of Epicureanism. The volume also features five contributions that, while developed in the context of the project, for purely contingent reasons were not preceded by any discussion during the symposia: A. Longo, *The mention of Epicurus in Plotinus' tr. 33* (Enn. *II 9) in the context of the polemics between pagans and Christians in the second to third centuries* AD: *Parallels between Celsus, Plotinus and Origen*; M. Mazzetti, *Epicureans and Gnostics in tr. 47* (Enn. *III 2) 7.29–41*; E. Eliasson, *Plotinus' reception of Epicurean atomism in* On Fate, *tr. 3* (Enn. *III.1) 1–3*; A. Cornea, Athroa epibolē: On an Epicurean formula in Plotinus' work; A. Linguiti, Plotinus and Epicurus on pleasure and happiness.

We have greatly benefited from a set of critical remarks by anonymous reports.

xii

Preface

We are most grateful to Sergio Knipe for his accurate translation or proofreading of the articles in the present volume. We would like to thank John M. Dillon for his conscientious re-reading of the manuscript. And the authors' grateful thanks also go to Rosario Scalia for his careful preparation of the three indices.

Daniela Patrizia Taormina

Abbreviations

This list contains the abbreviations used in this volume to refer: 1. to collections of works, fragments, papyri and inscriptions; 2. to collections of modern studies; 3. to ancient authors and works or fragments. In the case of authors of a single work, references, as a rule, are by author's name only. For modern editions of the most important works, see *Ancient Authors, Editions, Translations and Commentaries Cited* below in this volume.

1 Collections of works or fragments of various authors, of papyri and inscriptions

CAG	Commentaria in Aristotelem Graeca, Prussian Academy series,
	Berlin 1891–1909.
CPF	Corpus dei papiri filosofici greci e latini, Florence 1989–.
DG	Diels, H. (ed.) Doxographi Graeci, Berlin 1879.
DK	Diels, H. and Kranz, W. (eds.) Die Fragmente der Vorsokratiker,
	with. transl. and notes, Berlin 1951–2. (1st edn. 1903).
IG	Inscriptiones Graecae, Berlin 1902–.
LS	Long, A. A. and Sedley, D. N. The Hellenistic Philosophers
	(2 vols.), Cambridge 1987.
NH	Bibliothèque Copte de Nag Hammadi, Québec <i>et al.</i> 1997–.
PBerol.	Berliner Leihgabe griechischer Papyri.
PHerc.	Herculanenses Papyri.
POxy.	Oxyrhynchus Papyri.
SEĞ	Supplementum Epigraphicum Graecum, Leyden 1923–.
SSR	Giannantoni, G. (ed.) Socratis et Socraticorum Reliquiae
	(4 vols.), Naples 1985.
SVF	Stoicorum Veterum Fragmenta, ed. von Arnim, J. (3 vols.),
	Stuttgart 1903–5.
Us.	Usener, H. Epicurea, Leipzig 1887 (repr. Stuttgart 1966).

xiii

xiv	List of abbreviations	
2 Collections of modern studies		
ANRW	<i>Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt</i> , ed. Temporini, H. and Haase, W., Berlin and New York 1972–.	
DphA	<i>Dictionnaire des Philosophes Antiques</i> , publié sous la direction de R. Goulet, Paris 1989–.	
RE	Pauly, A. and Wissowa, G. (<i>et al.</i>), <i>Realencyclopädie der classis-</i> <i>chen Altertumswissenschaft</i> , Stuttgart, after Munich 1893–.	

3 Ancient authors and works or fragments

Aët.	Aëtius <i>Placita</i>
Alcin.	Alcinous <i>Didaskalikos</i>
Alex.	Alexander Aphrodisiensis
Fat.	De fato
in de Sens.	In librum De sensu commentarium
in Metaph.	In Aristotelis Metaphysica commentarium
Mant.	De anima libri Mantissa
Mixt.	De mixtione
Prov.	De providentia
Quaest.	Quaestiones
An.	Anonymous in Theaetetum
Arist.	Aristoteles
Cael.	De Caelo
de An.	De Anima
EN	Ethica Nicomachea
GC	De generatione et corruptione
Mem.	De Memoria
Metaph.	Metaphysica
Mete.	Meteorologica
Phys.	Physica
Po.	Politica
Protr.	Protrepticus
Sens.	De sensu et sensibilibus
Attic.	Atticus
Fr.	Fragmenta
Aug.	Augustinus
Conf.	Confessiones
Calcid.	Calcidius

List of abbreviations

in Tim.	In Timaeum
Cicero	
Div.	De divinatione
Fat.	De fato
Fin.	De finibus
Luc.	Lucullus
ND	De natura deorum
Tusc.	Tusculanae disputationes
Clem.	Clemens Alexandrinus
Ex. Theod.	Excerpta ex Theodoto
Strom.	Stromateis
Demetr. Lac.	Demetrius Lacon
D.L.	Diogenes Laërtius <i>Vitae</i>
Diog. Oen.	Diogenes Oenoandensis New Fragments
Epic.	Epicurus
Ep. Hdt.	Epistula ad Herodotum
Ep. Id.	Epistula ad Idomeneum
Ep. Men.	Epistula ad Moeneceum
Ep. Pyth.	Epistula ad Pythoclem
Fr.	Fragmenta
Nat.	De Natura
RS	Ratae Sententiae
VS	Sententiae vaticanae
Eus.	Eusebius
PE	Praeparatio evangelica
Gal.	Galenus
Libr.	De libris suis
PHP	De placitis Hippocratis et Platonis
Himerius	
Orat.	Orationes
Нірр.	Hippolytus
Ref.	Refutatio omnium haeresium
Irenaeus	
adv. Haer.	Adversus Haereses
Lact.	Lactantius
ID	De ira Dei
Luc.	Lucianus Samosatensis
Alex.	Alexander seu pseudomantis
	*

xv

xvi	List of abbreviations
Lucr.	Lucretius
DRN	De rerum natura
Orig.	Origenes
Cels.	Contra Celsum
Phil.	Philo Alexandrinus
Op. mun.	De opificio mundi
Phld.	Philodemus
De piet.	De pietate
Sign.	De signis
Plato	
Gorg.	Gorgias
Lg.	Leges
Phd.	Phaedo
Phdr.	Phaedrus
Phil.	Philebus
Pol.	Politicus
Resp.	Res publica
Symp.	Symposium The sectors
Tht. Tim.	Theaetetus Timaeus
Plot. Enn.	Plotinus Enneades
Enn. Tr.	Enneaaes Treatise
Plut.	Plutarchus Chaeronensis
An. Procr.	De animae procreatione in Timaeo
Col.	Adversus Colotem
Is. et Os.	De Iside et Osiride
Stoic. Rep.	De Stoicorum repugnantiis
Suav. viv.	Non posse suaviter vivi secundum Epicurum
Porph.	Porphyrius
Abst.	De abstinentia
Marc.	Ad Marcellam
Plot.	Vita Plotini
Procl.	Proclus
in Tim.	In Platonis Timaeum commentaria
Sen.	Seneca
Ep.	Epistulae
S.E.	Sextus Empiricus
Μ	Adversus mathematicos

List of abbreviations

xvii

PH	Pyrrhonei hypotyposes
Them.	Themistius
Or.	Orationes
Theon Sm.	Theon Smyrnaeus, <i>Expositio rerum mathematicarum ad legendum Platonem utilium</i>

Transliteration

Key words in Greek are transliterated and printed in italics. Only a long vowel at the end of a word is marked with a macron, whereas macra placed on other long vowels within a word are not marked.

xviii