

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12417-2 - Religious Hatred and International Law: The Prohibition of  
Incitement to Violence or Discrimination

Jeroen Temperman

Index

[More information](#)

## INDEX

- abuse, fear of as dominating ICCPR
  - drafting 49–50
- actus reus* of the incitement offence
  - complexity of pinpointing 168
  - definitions and concepts 164–168
  - discrimination in ICCPR 187–188
  - ICCPR Article 20(2)
    - advocacy defined 169–172
    - hatred defined 172–175
    - hostility and violence defined 188–190
    - incitement defined 180–186
    - inciter, audience and target triangle 191
    - key terms of 168–186
    - proscribed results 186–190
    - religious hatred defined 175–180
  - national incitement law
    - blasphemy laws 193–195
    - hate speech/incitement to hatred laws 195–199
    - low-threshold speech offences 192–199
    - proscribed results 202–203
    - public nature of incitement 200
    - serious view of religion-based incitement 201–202
- Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, Concerning the Criminalisation of Acts of a Racist and Xenophobic Nature Committed through Computer Systems 2003 291–293
- administrative sanctions as alternative to criminal 10–11
- advocacy
  - defined 169–172
  - and intent 209–210, 211–212, 216–217, 234–237
- Albania 202, 331, 344
- Andorra 77
- anti-Semitism 92–104
- Antigua and Barbados 271, 346
- apartheid and UDHR drafting
  - discussions 27–28
- Armenia 200, 281, 332, 345
- Australia 23, 35, 41, 42, 47, 48, 71, 78, 284
  - criminal intent in ICCPR 209
  - ICCPR amendment 35–36
  - reservation regarding ICCPR 20(2) 72
  - UDHR drafting discussions 23
- Austria 47, 199, 270, 280, 281, 296–297, 298, 300, 330, 331, 345, 354–355
- Azerbaijan 236
- Barendt, Eric 241
- Belarus 202, 344
- Belgium 41, 42, 47, 88, 153–154, 155, 227, 228–229, 258, 261, 265–266, 284, 290, 297–298, 325, 346, 363
  - human rights under ICCPR Art. 20(2) 83
  - reservation regarding ICCPR 20(2) 72
  - UDHR drafting discussions 25–26
- Benesch, Susan 215–216
- blasphemy offences 193–195
- Bolivia 344
- Borisov proposal 22–23
- Bosnia and Herzegovina 202, 344
- Brazil 43, 44, 60, 71, 198, 209, 345

- Bulgaria 48, 53, 280, 344  
Burundi 88
- Camden Principles 174, 182, 217
- Canada 42, 47, 77, 89–90, 101, 102–104, 199, 219, 236, 270–271
- Chile 27, 39–41, 47, 50, 53, 55, 56, 58, 59, 346
- China 41, 47  
  ICCPR drafting discussions 34–35  
  UDHR drafting discussions 23
- Christians, Louis-Léon 5
- civil sanctions as alternative to  
  criminal 10–11
- clear and present and danger 271–273
- collective hatred, *see* group hatred
- Committee on the Elimination of Racial  
  Discrimination (CERD) 69–70  
  context of religious hatred 243, 244,  
  251–252  
  Holocaust denial 290–291  
  incitement, definition of 164–165  
  and intent 221–224  
  likelihood of harm requirements 199  
  memory laws 290–291  
  organized hatred 322–327  
  penalties permitted 335–337  
  proportionate sanctions against  
  incitement 351–353  
  *see also* International Convention  
  on the Elimination of  
  All Forms of Racial  
  Discrimination (ICERD)
- community work as penalties 363
- confiscations as penalties 360–362
- content of speeches as decisive 253–257
- context of religious hatred  
  CERD 243, 244, 251–252  
  clear and present and danger  
  271–273  
  elements in 242–245  
  European Court of Human Rights  
  252–269  
  extent of speech 244, 262–265  
  glorification of religious violence  
  308–312  
  Holocaust denial 287–288  
  Human Rights Committee 246–251
- immediate surroundings 243,  
  246–247  
  imminence of harm 240–242,  
  244–245, 246–247, 248,  
  249–250, 265–269, 270–277  
  likelihood of harm 239–240,  
  244–245, 246–247, 248,  
  265–269, 270–277  
  national incitement law 270–277  
  person behind the speech act 243, 247  
  Rabat Plan of Action 242–243, 244  
  role and position of speakers  
  260–262  
  setting of speech 262–265  
  socio-historical, economic  
  and political 242–243, 248,  
  258–260  
  state practice 270–277  
  as tipping the balance 258–269  
  vulnerability of target groups 239,  
  247, 249–250
- Convention on the Prevention of  
  Terrorism 306
- conviction of hate speech offenders  
  ICERD Article 4 141–143  
  *see also* punishment for incitement
- Council of Europe  
  Convention on the Prevention of  
  Terrorism 306  
  glorification of religious  
  violence 306  
  hate speech definition 165–166  
  Holocaust denial 291–293  
  prison sentences 342
- crimes against humanity  
  as background to ICCPR, Article  
  20(2) 32–33
- criminal intent  
  and advocacy 211–212  
  and CERD 221–224  
  and European Court of Human  
  Rights 224–233  
  expert opinion 213–214  
  and hatred 210–211  
  Human Rights Committee 216–221  
  ICCPR 208–215  
  and incitement 212  
  knowledge intent 212

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12417-2 - Religious Hatred and International Law: The Prohibition of Incitement to Violence or Discrimination

Jeroen Temperman

Index

[More information](#)

386

INDEX

- criminal intent (*cont.*)
  - multiple requirements of 233–234
  - oblique intent 212
  - proving 214–216
  - state practice 233–237
- Croatia 345
- Cyprus 47, 270, 344
- Czech Republic 345
- Czechoslovakia 42, 84
- Danish cartoons case, *see* Denmark
- defamation of religion, contradictory developments in UN 6–9
- definition of terms as issue for ICCPR 56–59
- denial of historical atrocities
  - as abuse of rights 294–297
  - Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, Concerning the Criminalisation of Acts of a Racist and Xenophobic Nature Committed through Computer Systems 2003 291–293
  - CERD 290–291
  - Council of Europe 291–293
  - European Court of Human Rights 293–303
  - Human Rights Committee 285–289
  - moderate risk assessment 297–298
  - national laws against 280–285
  - non-public 301–303
  - truth as no legal defence 298–300
- Denmark 47, 132–134, 138–141, 222, 224–226, 249–250, 262, 264, 345, 352
  - cartoons case 104–107
  - ICERD Article 4 and complaints re. religious hatred 132–134
  - Muslims, hate speech against in 111–113
- discrimination in ICCPR 187–188
- dismissals as penalties 362–363
- economic context of religious hatred 242–243, 248
- Ecuador 201
- Egypt 87–88
- Estonia 277, 345
- European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) 167, 306
- European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR)
  - Art. 10 145–146
  - Art. 17 abuse of rights clause 146, 149–152
  - comparison with ICCPR and ICERD 147–148
  - guillotine approach 149–152
  - indirect abuse of rights approach 152–153
  - lack of incitement clause 145–146
  - merits of Art. 10 complaints, judgments on 153–155
  - organized hatred 327–330
  - prison sentences 342
  - private life, respect for 153–155
  - protection from incitement, right to 156–158
- European Court of Human Rights (ECHR)
  - community work as penalties 363
  - content of speeches 253–257
  - context of religious hatred 252–269
  - dismissals as penalties 362–363
  - extent of speech 262–265
  - fines as penalties 358–360
  - glorification of religious violence 306–312
  - Holocaust denial 293–303 and intent 224–233
  - organized hatred 327–330
  - prison sentences 342–343, 354–358
  - proportionate sanctions against incitement 353–365
  - role and position of speakers 260–262
  - seizures and confiscations as penalties 360–362
  - setting of speech 262–265
  - societal context of religious hatred 258–260
  - wrongful hate speech convictions, remedies for 364–365

- European Union  
*Guidelines on the Promotion and Protection of Freedom of Religion or Belief* 195  
 hate speech, definition of 167  
 incitement, definition of 167  
 Evans, Carolyn 201–202  
 extent of speech 244, 262–265  
 extreme speech  
   dilemma of liberal states 1–4  
   fear of abuse as dominating ICCPR drafting 49–50  
   ICCPR drafting discussions 34–48  
   ICCPR provisions 31–32  
   UDHR drafting discussions 19–28  
   Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR) 17–19
- Farrior, S. 19, 21, 28–29, 51, 79, 335  
 fascism and UDHR drafting discussions 21–22  
 fear of abuse as dominating ICCPR drafting 49–50  
 fines as penalties 358–360  
 Finland 47, 280, 345  
 forfeitures as penalties 360–362  
 France 25, 40, 42, 47, 58, 92–94, 154–155, 174–175, 183–184, 219, 226–228, 229, 248, 256–257, 259–260, 261, 266, 268, 286, 294–296, 306–308, 346, 355, 358, 359–360, 362–363  
   Gayssot Act (France) 281  
   ICCPR amendment 35–36  
   ICCPR drafting discussions 46–47  
   UDHR drafting discussions 23, 25  
 Fraser, David 279–280  
 free speech, ICCPR provisions 31–32  
 freedom of expression  
   contradictory developments in United Nations 6–9  
   dilemma of liberal states 1–4  
   ECHR Art. 10 145–146  
   fear of abuse as dominating ICCPR drafting 49–50  
   glorification of religious violence 304–306  
   ICCPR drafting discussions 34–48  
   UDHR drafting discussions 19–28
- Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR) 17–18  
 US/UK v. Poland/USSR/Chile in ICCPR drafting debate 51–55
- Gayssot Act (France) 281  
 genocide, denial of  
   as abuse of rights 294–297  
   Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, Concerning the Criminalisation of Acts of a Racist and Xenophobic Nature Committed through Computer Systems 2003 291–293  
 CERD 290–291  
 Council of Europe 291–293  
 European Court of Human Rights 293–303  
 Human Rights Committee 285–289  
   moderate risk assessment 297–298  
   national laws against 280–285  
   non-public 301–303  
   truth as no legal defence 298–300  
 Georgia 201  
 Germany 40, 52, 58, 152–153, 155, 199, 231–232, 253–254, 270, 276–277, 282, 284, 296, 298, 301–304, 327–328, 329, 330–331, 352–353, 358, 362  
 Ghana and human rights under ICCPR Art. 20(2) 84  
 glorification of religious violence  
   context of religious hatred 308–312  
   Council of Europe 306  
   ECRI 306  
   European Court of Human Rights 306–312  
   freedom of expression 304–306  
   Human Rights Committee 304–306  
   and incitement 303  
   Johannesburg Principles on National Security, Freedom of Expression and Access to Information 305–306  
   national laws against 303–304  
 Greece 47, 107–111, 118, 120, 184–185, 217–218, 250, 270, 345

- group hatred
  - defined 317
  - European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) 327–330
  - ICCPR 318–322
  - ICERD 322–327
  - as man-made 317
  - punishment for incitement 347
  - state practice 330–332
- Guyana 88, 201
- hate speech
  - defined 165–166, 167
  - laws 195–199
- hatred
  - definition 172–175
  - and intent 210–211
  - religious, defined 175–180
  - see also* organized hatred
- Holocaust, the
  - as background to ICCPR, Article 20(2) 32–33
  - denial of 92–104
    - as abuse of rights 294–297
    - Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, Concerning the Criminalisation of Acts of a Racist and Xenophobic Nature Committed through Computer Systems 2003 291–293
  - CERD 290–291
  - Council of Europe 291–293
  - defined 280
  - European Court of Human Rights 293–303
  - Human Rights Committee 285–289
  - moderate risk assessment 297–298
  - national laws against 280–285
  - National Socialism Prohibition Act (Austria) 281
  - non-public 301–303
  - truth as no legal defence 298–300
- homosexuals, hatred against 178–180, 201
- hostility, defined in ICCPR 188–190
- Human Rights Committee
  - context of religious hatred 246–251
  - glorification of religious violence 304–306
  - Holocaust denial 285–289
  - ICCPR Art. 20(2), human rights under 85–88
  - individual communications 76–77
  - and intent 216–221
  - mandatory, ICCPR Article 20(2) as 74–77
  - need for legislation 74–75
  - prison sentences 341–342
  - proportionate sanctions against incitement 347–348, 349–351
  - state reporting procedures 74–77
  - types of penalties permitted 338–342
- human rights under ICCPR
  - Art. 20(2)
    - benefits and relevance of 80–81
    - Danish cartoons case 104–107
    - Holocaust, denial of 92–104
    - Human Rights Committee 85–88
    - individual communications 88–120
    - Muslims, hate speech cases in Denmark 111–113
    - Roma case in Greece 108–111
    - telephonic racist messages case 88–92
    - textual analysis 81–82
    - travaux préparatoires* 82–85
    - Wilders case (pending) 113–120
  - Hungary 53, 273–276, 280, 283, 288, 329–330, 345, 347
  - Iceland 345
  - imminence of harm 240–242, 244–245, 246–247, 248, 249–250, 265–269, 270–277
  - imprisonment 340–346, 354–358
  - incitement
    - definition 164–165, 167, 180–186
    - and glorification of religious violence 303
    - to hatred laws 195–199
    - and intent 212
    - legal threshold of 165
    - public nature of 200

- see also actus reus* of the incitement  
 offence; judgment of  
 incitement; legal nature of  
 incitement prohibition; origins  
 of incitement prohibition;  
 punishment for incitement
- intent  
 and advocacy 209–210, 211–212,  
 216–217, 234–237  
 and CERD 221–224  
 and European Court of Human  
 Rights 224–233  
 expert opinion 213–214  
 and hatred 210–211  
 Human Rights Committee 216–221  
 ICCPR 208–215  
 to incite 234–237  
 and incitement 212  
 knowledge 212  
 multiple requirements of 233–234  
 oblique 212  
 proving 214–216  
 state practice 233–237
- International Convention on the  
 Elimination of All Forms  
 of Racial Discrimination  
 (ICERD) 69
- Article 4  
 application of 126–129  
 conviction of hate speech  
 offenders 141–143  
 effective investigation of  
 complaints 137–141  
 freedom from racist incitement  
 143–144  
 ICCPR comparison 130  
 legal standing for racist hate  
 speech victims 135–136  
 as mandatory 122–130  
 religion in 130–132  
 due regard clause 323–324  
 ECHR comparison 147–148  
 incitement, definition of 164–165  
 intersectionality 158–159  
 organized hatred 322–327  
 penalties permitted 335–337  
 proportionate sanctions against  
 incitement 351–353
- International Convention on the  
 Protection of the Rights of  
 All Migrant Workers and  
 Members of Their Families  
 (CMW) 68–69
- International Covenant on Civil and  
 Political Rights (ICCPR)  
 abuse of rights clause 37–38  
 Article 20  
 adoption of 38–39  
 types of penalties permitted  
 335, 337  
 Article 20(2) *see also* human rights:  
 under ICCPR Art. 20(2)  
 advocacy defined 169–172  
 CMW comparison 68–69  
 comparative law 77–79  
 criminal intent 208–215  
 engagement with, lack of 32  
 expert opinion 213–214  
 fears and critiques of 70–72  
 free/extreme speech  
 provisions 31–32  
 hatred defined 172–175  
 hostility and violence defined in  
 188–190  
 ICERD comparison 130  
 importance of studying 4–6  
 incitement defined 180–186  
 inciter, audience and target  
 triangle 191  
 individual communications 76–77  
 key terms of 168–186  
 as mandatory 67–79  
 proscribed results 186–190  
 religious hatred defined 175–180  
 reservations entered 72–74, 78–79  
 Second World War background  
 to 32–33  
 textual analysis 67–70, 81–82,  
 209–213  
*travaux préparatoires* 70–72,  
 82–85, 208–209  
 UDHR comparison 69  
 UN Human Rights  
 Committee 74–77  
 Chilean proposal 39–40  
 Chinese proposal 34–35

- International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (*cont.*)
- Cold War-related conflict in debates 51–55
  - definitional issues 56–59
  - discrimination in 187–188
  - drafting discussions 34–48
  - ECHR comparison 147–148
  - fear-dominated debate 49–50
  - four-power amendment 43–44
  - French–Australian amendment 35–36
  - hate propaganda article 38–39
  - legislative potential 56–62
  - national liberation movements 56
  - nine-power amendment 44–45
  - organized hatred 318–322
  - Polish amendment 39–40
  - public discourse, religious
    - discussion in 55–56
  - research, religious discussion in 55–56
  - sixteen-power amendment 45
  - US/UK v. Poland/USSR/Chile in drafting debate 51–55
  - USSR proposal 37
  - voting on 47–48
  - see also* national incitement law
- intersectionality 158–159
- investigation of complaints under ICERD Article 4 137–141
- Ireland 47, 83, 200, 271, 345
- Israel 87, 281, 328
- Italy 47, 198, 280, 320–322, 330, 331, 341–342, 345
- Johannesburg Principles on National Security, Freedom of Expression and Access to Information 305–306
- judgment of incitement
  - context of religious hatred
    - CERD 243, 244, 251–252
    - clear and present and danger 271–273
    - elements in 242–245
  - European Court of Human Rights 252–269
  - extent of speech 244, 262–265
  - Holocaust denial 287–288
  - Human Rights Committee
    - 246–251
    - immediate surroundings 243, 246–247
    - imminence of harm 240–242, 244–245, 246–247, 248, 249–250, 265–269, 270–277
    - likelihood of harm 239–240, 244–245, 246–247, 248, 265–269, 270–277
    - national incitement law 270–277
    - person behind the speech act 243, 247
  - Rabat Plan of Action
    - 242–243, 244
  - role and position of speakers 260–262
  - setting of speech 262–265
  - socio-historical, economic and political 242–243, 248, 258–260
  - state practice 270–277
  - as tipping the balance 258–269
  - vulnerability of target groups 239, 247, 249–250
- ICERD Article 4 141–143
- intent
  - and advocacy 209–210, 211–212, 216–217, 234–237
  - and CERD 221–224
  - and European Court of Human Rights 224–233
  - expert opinion 213–214
  - and hatred 210–211
  - Human Rights Committee
    - 216–221
  - ICCPR 208–215
  - to incite 234–237
  - and incitement 212
  - knowledge 212
  - multiple requirements of 233–234
  - oblique 212
  - proving 214–216
  - state practice 233–237
- knowledge intent 212
- Kyrgyzstan 345

- Latvia 234, 345
- legal nature of incitement prohibition
- ECHR
- abuse of rights clause 146, 149–152
  - Art. 10 145–146
  - Art. 17 146, 149–152
  - comparison with ICCPR and ICERD 147–148
  - freedom of expression 145–146
  - guillotine approach 149–152
  - indirect abuse of rights approach 152–153
  - lack of incitement clause 145–146
  - merits of Art. 10 complaints, judgments on 153–155
  - private life, respect for 153–155
  - protection from incitement, right to 156–158
- ICCPR Article 20(2) *see also* human rights: under ICCPR Art. 20(2)
- comparative law 77–79
  - compared to CMW 68–69
  - fears and critiques of 70–72
  - individual communications 76–77
  - as mandatory 67–79
  - reservations entered 72–74, 78–79
  - state reporting procedures 74–77
  - textual analysis 67–70
  - travaux préparatoires* 70–72
  - UN Human Rights Committee 74–77
- ICERD
- application of 126–129
  - complaints re. religious hatred 132–134
  - conviction of hate speech offenders 141–143
  - effective investigation of complaints 137–141
  - freedom from racist incitement 143–144
  - intersectionality 158–159
  - legal standing for racist hate speech victims 135–136
  - as mandatory 122–130
  - religion in 130–132
  - legislative potential of ICCPR 56–62
- liberal states, dilemma of 1–4
- liberation movements 56
- Liechtenstein 236, 283, 345
- likelihood of harm 239–240, 244–245, 246–247, 248, 265–269, 270–277
- Lithuania 155, 259, 282, 345, 348
- low-threshold speech offences
- blasphemy laws 193–195
  - hate speech/incitement to hatred laws 195–199
- Luxembourg 72, 283, 345
- Macedonia 201
- Malik, Kenan 241
- Malta 73, 201, 271, 346
- marketplace of ideas 1–2
- memory laws 280–285
- Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD) 290–291
  - Human Rights Committee 285–289
  - see also* denial of historical atrocities
- mens rea*, *see* intent
- Mill, John Stuart 2
- Moldova 233, 331, 345
- Molnar, Peter 240–241, 243
- Monaco 344, 347
- Montenegro 86–87
- Muslims, hate speech against in Denmark 111–113
- national incitement law
- blasphemy laws 193–195
  - context of religious hatred 270–277
  - hate speech/incitement to hatred laws 195–199
  - intent 233–237
  - low-threshold speech offences 192–199
  - proscribed results 202–203
  - public nature of incitement 200
  - sanctions against incitement 343–348
  - serious view of religion-based incitement 201–202
  - see also* state practice
- national liberation movements 56



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12417-2 - Religious Hatred and International Law: The Prohibition of Incitement to Violence or Discrimination

Jeroen Temperman

Index

[More information](#)

392

INDEX

- National Socialism Prohibition Act (Austria) 281
- negationism, *see* denial of historical atrocities
- Netherlands 47, 58, 83, 113–120, 135–136, 137–138, 149–150, 231, 252, 253, 261, 332, 343, 346, 352, 354
- New Zealand 47, 76, 78, 343, 346  
 criminal intent in ICCPR 208–209  
 human rights under ICCPR Art. 20(2) 83  
 reservation regarding ICCPR 20(2) 72–73
- Nicaragua 198
- non-governmental organizations (NGOs) in UDHR drafting discussions 24
- Norway 47, 142–144, 235, 251–252, 345, 352
- oblique intent 212
- organized hatred  
 defined 317  
 European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) 327–330  
 ICCPR 318–322  
 ICERD 322–327  
 as man-made 317  
 punishment for incitement 347  
 state practice 330–332
- origins of incitement prohibition  
 ICCPR  
 abuse of rights clause 37–38  
 Chilean proposal 39–40  
 Chinese proposal 34–35  
 Cold War-related conflict in debates 51–55  
 definitional issues 56–59  
 drafting discussions 34–48  
 fear-dominated debate 49–50  
 four-power amendment 43–44  
 French–Australian amendment 35–36  
 legislative potential 56–62  
 national liberation movements 56  
 nine-power amendment 44–45  
 Polish amendment 39–40  
 public discourse, religious discussion in 55–56  
 research, religious discussion in 55–56  
 sixteen-power amendment 45  
 US/UK v. Poland/USSR/Chile in drafting debate 51–55  
 USSR proposal 37  
 voting on 47–48
- UDHR  
 drafting discussions 19–28  
 on extreme speech and freedom of expression 17–19  
 requisite or option, prohibition as 28–29  
 UDHR and extreme speech 17–19
- penalties for incitement, *see* punishment for incitement
- Peru 198–199, 345
- Philippines 84
- Poland 39–40, 41, 42, 45, 55, 59, 231, 283, 327, 331, 345
- political context of religious hatred 242–243, 248, 258–260
- Portugal 47, 114, 233–234, 282, 283, 344
- Preparatory Commission for the International Refugee Organization 24
- prison sentences 340–346, 354–358
- private life, respect for 153–155
- proportionate sanctions against incitement 347–348
- public discourse, religious discussion in 55–56
- public nature of incitement 200
- punishment for incitement  
 administrative sanctions as alternative to criminal 10–11  
 aggravating factors 347–348  
 alternatives to imprisonment 346–347  
 CERD 335–337, 351–353  
 community work 363  
 complexity of 334–335  
 dismissals as penalties 362–363

- European Court of Human Rights  
353–365  
fines as penalties 358–360  
Human Rights Committee 349–351  
ICCPR 335, 337  
organized hatred 347  
prison sentences 340–346, 354–358  
proportionate 347–348  
seizures and confiscations as  
penalties 360–362  
state practice 343–348  
types of penalties permitted  
335–343  
wrongful hate speech convictions,  
remedies for 364–365
- Rabat Plan of Action 194, 213, 242–243,  
244, 340, 348, 349
- religious defamation/insult laws  
193–195
- religious hatred defined 175–180
- Religious Tolerance Declaration 188
- research, religious discussion in 55–56
- Roma  
Greek case 108–111  
protection of 86–87
- Romania 53, 331
- Russia 150, 232, 304, 305, 320,  
331–332, 345
- San Marino 77
- sanctions against incitement  
administrative sanctions as  
alternative to criminal 10–11  
aggravating factors 347–348  
alternatives to imprisonment 346–347  
CERD 335–337, 351–353  
community work 363  
complexity of 334–335  
dismissals as penalties 362–363  
European Court of Human Rights  
353–365  
fines as penalties 358–360  
Human Rights Committee 349–351  
ICCPR 335, 337  
prison sentences 340–346, 354–358  
seizures and confiscations as  
penalties 360–362  
state practice 343–348  
types of sanctions permitted  
335–343  
wrongful hate speech convictions,  
remedies for 364–365
- Santa Lucia 271
- Schabas, William 2–3
- Second World War as background to  
ICCPR 32–33
- seizures and confiscations as penalties  
360–362
- Serbia 86–87, 157–158, 344
- setting of speech 262–265
- sexual orientation 178–180, 201
- Singapore 271, 345
- Slovakia 87, 201, 229, 263, 267, 283, 345
- Slovenia 75, 88, 345
- societal context of religious hatred  
242–243, 248, 258–260
- soft law policies as alternative to  
criminal law 10–11
- South Africa 28, 291  
Constitution of 198  
human rights under ICCPR Art.  
20(2) 84  
UDHR drafting discussions 27–28
- Spain 47, 114, 277, 284–285, 345
- state practice  
context of religious hatred 270–277  
glorification of religious violence,  
laws against 303–304  
human rights and ICCPR Art.  
20(2) 86–88  
intent 233–237  
organized hatred 330–332  
prison sentences 343–346  
reporting procedures 74–77, 86–88  
sanctions against incitement  
343–348  
UN Human Rights Committee  
74–77  
*see also* national incitement law
- Sweden 41, 47, 179, 319, 345
- Switzerland 87, 283
- telephonic racist messages case 88–92
- terrorism, *see* glorification of religious  
violence

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12417-2 - Religious Hatred and International Law: The Prohibition of Incitement to Violence or Discrimination

Jeroen Temperman

Index

[More information](#)

394

INDEX

- Thornberry, Patrick 130–131, 222–223
- Turkey 155, 156–157, 165–166, 199, 249, 255–256, 257, 260, 262, 264, 266–267, 268–269, 308–312, 345, 355–358, 359, 360, 362, 364
- Ukraine 344
- Union of Soviet Socialist Republics (USSR) 19, 22, 25, 37, 38, 42, 47, 48, 50, 52, 54, 55
- Borisov proposal 22–23
- ICCPR proposal 37
- UDHR drafting discussions 21–23, 25
- United Kingdom 41, 42, 47, 53, 54, 57, 59, 70, 150, 232–233, 261, 304–305, 325, 328, 344
- multiple requirements of intent 234
- reservation regarding ICCPR 20(2) 72–73
- UDHR drafting discussions 20, 26–27
- United Nations
- contradictory developments in 6–9
- Human Rights Committee
- context of religious hatred 246–251
- glorification of religious violence 304–306
- ICCPR Art. 20(2), human rights under 85–88
- individual communications 76–77
- and intent 216–221
- mandatory, ICCPR Article 20(2) as 74–77
- need for legislation 74–75
- prison sentences 341–342
- proportionate sanctions against incitement 347–348, 349–351
- state reporting procedures 74–77
- types of penalties permitted 338–342
- Religious Tolerance Declaration 188
- United States 37, 41, 42, 47, 51–52, 54, 58, 59, 272, 273, 323, 328
- clear and present and danger 271–273
- human rights under ICCPR Art. 20(2) 83
- ICCPR Art. 20(2) 78
- reservation regarding ICCPR 20(2) 73
- UDHR drafting discussions 23
- Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR)
- abuse of rights clause 18–19
- Article 7 18
- Article 30 18–19
- drafting discussions 19–28
- and extreme speech 17–19
- ICCPR Article 20(2)
- comparison 69
- implementation questions 29–30
- requisite or option, prohibition as 28–29
- Uruguay 27, 47, 49, 346
- violence
- defined in ICCPR 188–190
- against women, incitement of 201–202
- vulnerability of target groups 239, 247, 249–250
- Wilders, Geert, pending case concerning 113–120
- women, incitement of violence against 201–202
- World Jewish Congress 39
- wrongful hate speech convictions, remedies for 364–365