

Index

ab initio, 39 Accession Agreement, 146, 220-221 activist judgments, 251 air passenger compensation rights, 173-176, 192-193 air transport, 173, 279-280 aircraft licensing regulations, 176-179 Alimanovic case, 276 amendments to treaties, 30-32 amicus curiae, 165 Anagnostakis v Commission, 191 annulment proceedings, standing rights, 273 - 275anti-competitive agreements, 161 anti-discrimination law, 161-162, 164 Appellate Body of the World Trade Organization, 268 autonomy of the EU legal order, 117, 130

Barber Protocol, 231 bi-lateral exit agreement, 43 Brasserie du Pêcheur SA, 118 Brown judgment on education, 197–198, 201–202, 206 Bundesverfassungsgericht, 240

Cameron, David, 76
capital movements, 272–273
Casati case, 272
Charter of Fundamental Rights of the
European Union. See EU Charter of
Fundamental Rights
Chavallier, Valentine, 127
citizenship rights, 179–186, 192–193,
275–277
collective action (right to strike), 204
comitology, 67–68, 82
Commission v. Germany (Insurance Markets),
164
Commission v Council (ERTA), 126

235 Community lawmaking, 55, 74, 127, 197-198 competence control, 195, 209, 211, 281-282, 285 compliance monitoring framework, 280 - 283conferral principle, 199 constituent authority Court of Justice vs. EU Treaty framework, 135, 266-269 EU Treaty framework, 136-137, 150 greater sensitivity by Court, 270 introduction to, 134 judicial challenges to, 137-138, 262-263, 267, 280 overview of, 13, 16, 42-43 Constitution of the Netherlands, 224 Constitutional Act of the Republic of Lithuania, 224-225 constitutional adjudication, 215, 242, 252, 254, 278 constitutional contestation Decision on the New Settlement for the UK, 76-78 defined, 60 direct policymaking as, 231 EU policymaking, 156-167 EU Treaty limits and, 212 EU Treaty reform, 78-83 Eurozone crisis management, 87-91 introduction to, 60-61, 63 Luxembourg Compromise, 11, 71–73 Member State responses to Constitutional Issue (No.1), 215-230 overview of, 2, 10-11, 16-18, 59, 71 parallel acts of, 211 pragmatic acts, 169

representative democracy and, 187

Common Foreign and Security Policy, 80,

288



INDEX 289

Council of the European Union summary of, 261 tension in, 98 establishment of, 73-76 ultra vires as acts of, 82-83 incentive measures, 205 constitutional identity, 227, 282 as intergovernmental forum, 71 Constitutional Issue (No.1) Joint Declaration on Fundamental constitutionalisation of EU legal order, Rights, 70 122-123 overview of, 23, 29, 58 Court of Justice and, 115-122, 213-214 policymaking responsibility, 22-58 defense of, 222 political authority and, 41, 43 direct effect principle, 217-218 sanctions against Member States, 48 domestic constitutional adjustment, Counseil d'Etat, 229 Court of Auditors, 29 227 - 229EU accession acquis, 221-222 Court of Justice. See also EU policymaking of Court of Justice; Reform proposals for introduction to, 98-100, 116-118 legal scholarship on the Court, 246 Court of Justice national courts, role of, 225-227 activities of, 9 normative vision for EU integration, 129 case law on its own authority, 226 origins and evolution, 118-122 Community law, 127 overview of, 223-225 constituent authority, 135 primacy of Union law, 218-220 constitutional adjudication, 215, 242, responses to, 129, 215-230, 242-243, 252, 254, 278 256-258 constitutional contestation, 2, 10-11, summary of, 130-132, 261 16-18 Constitutional Issue (No.2) Constitutional Issue (No.1), 115-122 Court of Justice vs. EU Treaty framework, constitutionalisation of EU legal order, 122-129, 244-245, 255 introduction, 133-135 detached policymaking, 207-211 Member State response to, 230-242 direct policymaking by, 156-167, national response to, 236–242 196-200, 212, 231, 270-271, 281 political authority, 167 domestic legal orders, 114 summary of, 261 establishment of, 51 Constitutional Issue (No.3) EU decision-making processes, 62, 64, constitutional contestation, 172 74, 172, 189, 251 introduction to, 156, 169-172 EU integration and, 14–16 legal scholarship on the Court, 246, 264 EU legal order, 13-14 Member State response to, 230-242 EU policymaking, 172 EU Treaty framework vs., 11-18, national response to, 236-242 summary of, 261 115-122, 151-152 constitutional refreshment, 24, 31, 33 European integration and, 3-4 constitutional supplementation financial assistance and inflation rates, comitology, 67-68 conformity in, 98 functions under EU Treaty framework, constituent authority, 138 2 - 3defined, 60 impact of, 5-7 EU Treaty reform, 78-83 as intermediary, 81-83 inter-institutional agreements, 64-67 interpretive approach, 149-150 intra vires as acts of, 82-83 introduction to, 1-2, 98-100, 169-172 introduction to, 60-61, 63 legal scholarship on the Court, 245-254 jurisprudence on general principles, 68 - 70omission in existing legal analysis, 7-8 Member States' acts of, 134, 142-149 overview of, 2-8 overview of, 10–11, 59, 63–64 policymaking, 163-166, 231-235, summary of, 261 286-287 Constitutional Treaty, 31 'pushing back' against, 236-242 constitutionalisation of EU legal order, representative democracy and, 122-129, 244-245, 255 190-193 Costa v ENEL case, 131 revisions to scrutiny, 277-279



290 INDEX

Court of Justice. (cont.) domestic implementation process, 214 TEU demands and, 25 Union law, 12 Court of Justice, principal interlocutors direct effect principle, 217-218 EU accession acquis, 221-222 formal status of Union law, 243-245 introduction to, 213-215 **EEC Treaty** legal scholarship on the Court, 245-254 Member States and national courts, 222 - 230Member States responses to Constitutional Issue (No.1), 215-230 primacy of Union law, 218-220 summary of, 256-259 treaty signatories, 216-217 cross-border healthcare services, 157 Danish Act of Accession, 240 158-159, 178 Dano case, 275-277 decentralized system of fiscal governance, Treaties, 110 decision-making. See EU decision-making 275-276 processes Decision on the New Settlement for the UK, 76 - 78decisional supranationalism', 166 Declaration 17 (primacy of Union law), 113, 217, 234 218 - 220declaratory judgments on interpretation, 147 116 democracy as basis for EU policymaking, 277 deficit of, 8 271-272 quality of EU policymaking under, 285 representative democracy, 171, 187 Dereci case, 184-185 detached policymaking, 207-211 32 - 34direct effect principle, 217-218 direct engagement (European Citizens' Initiative), 267 direct policymaking, 156-167, 171, 196-200, 212, 231, 270-271, 281 direct representation (European 172, 189, 251 Parliament), 267 direct taxation, 200 Directive 1996/71 EC, 206 Directive 2004/28 EC, 277 discrimination anti-discrimination law, 161-162, 164 non-discrimination principle, 52, 202, 277 prohibition against, 158-159, 178 finalité of, 131 social exclusion, 50 disproportionate interference, 183 domestic constitutional adjustment, limits on, 53-57 227-229 Lisbon Treaty and, 46

domestic law in specific treaties, 103-105 domestic legal systems, 104-107, 114 Draft Agreement, 146-147 Economic and Social Committee, 153 economic integration, 160, 170 capital movements, 272-273 direct policymaking, 156-167, 196-200 EU integration and, 49-53 founding of, 67, 69, 72, 101, 263 legal system of, 141 liberalising impact of, 45 national regulatory autonomy, 55 overview of, 10, 22, 42 policymaking competence, 153 prohibition against discrimination, Vienna Convention on the Law of entitlements of workseekers, 192-193, equality principle, 232 EU accession acquis, 221-222 EU Banking Union, 86 EU Charter of Fundamental Rights, 53, 56, EU Common Foreign and Security Policy, EU Constitutional Treaty, 40-41 EU constitutionalism Court of Justice and, 9-10, 16-19, divergent approach to, 283-284 EU integration and, 169 EU Treaty framework and, 18, 24-26, key issues for, 23-58, 149-150 responses to, 242-243, 258 summary of, 261 Union law and, 99-100 EU decision-making processes, 62, 64, 74, EU free movement law, 253-254 EU integration. See also Representative democracy and EU integration challenges to, 90-91, 266-269 constitutional context of, 61-63 constitutional narrative of, 128 Court of Justice and, 3-4, 14-16 EU Treaty framework and, 7-8, 48-57 interpretation tuned to advance, 246 introduction to, 2, 60-61



INDEX 291

Member States, ratification of, 22-24 'new legal order' claim, 116-117 normative vision for, 129 objectives of, 49-51 rule of law link to, 188 values of, 51-53 EU legal order autonomy of, 117, 130 competence control, 195, 209, 211, 281-282, 285 constitutionalisation of, 122-129, 244-245, 255 national responses, 236-243 overview of, 13-14, 33 political authority within, 41-48, 264-265, 272 political order within, 133-134, 167 summary of, 130-132, 255-256, 260 - 262support for, 127-129 EU legislative policymaking. See also EU policymaking of Court of Justice; Union law co-decision legislative procedure, 66 Court of Justice and, 186-187, 196-197, exclusions on, 200-207 judicial challenges to, 265-267 judicial constitutional contestation, 171 norms to override, 16 overview of, 15, 151-152 preserving integrity of, 272-273 principle role of, 179 representative democracy and, 192–193 review of legality, 39 EU policymaking of Court of Justice. See also EU legislative policymaking air passenger compensation rights, 173-176 air transport, 173 aircraft licensing regulations, 176-179 attributed powers, 153-154 challenges to limits, 263-265 collective action (right to strike), 204 constitutional contestation, 156-167 democracy as basis for, 277 detached policymaking, 207-211 direct policymaking, 156-167, 171, 196-200, 212, 270-271 EU legislature, 186-187 EU Treaty framework vs., 193-196 evolution of, 161-163 impact of, 163-166 institutional balance, 154-156 introduction to, 151-152 judicial policymaking, 163-166, 231-235, 286-287

legislative policymaking, 15, 66, 171, medical treatments received abroad, 201-204 origins of, 158-161 overview of, 13, 49 political institutions and, 152-153 primary responsibility for, 187 quality under democracy, 285 residence rights, 182-186 resilience of the Court's platform, 166-167 social security benefits, 180-182 summary of, 167-168, 211-212 Union citizenship, 179–186 values of, 172 EU Summit (2011), 88 EU Supreme Court, 124 EU Treaty framework circumvention of limits, 208-209 closer judicial engagement with, 270 - 277constituent authority and, 136-137 Court of Justice vs., 11-18, 115-122, 151 - 152Court's functions under, 2-3 domestic effect of, 111-113 dynamics of reform, 78-83 EU constitutionalism, 9-10 EU integration and, 7-8 EU policymaking and, 172, 193-196 improving quality of, 279-280 innovative features, 113-114 internal constitutionality, 23-24, 28, 169-170 introduction to, 1–2, 98–100 legitimacy matrix, 245-256 limits to, 10-11, 263-265 normalisation through, 79-81, 85, 91 normative framework of international law, 100-102, 109-110 political authority within, 41-48, 264-265 representative democracy, 188-190 successive amendments, 16-17 summary of, 260-262 treaties as instruments of international law, 109-110 treaty amendments, 30-32 EU Treaty framework as constitutional touchstone constituent authority and, 270 EEC Treaty and, 263 EU constitutionalism and, 32-34 EU integration and, 48-57, 102 EU legislature and Court, 271-272 formal status of Union law, 34-37



292 INDEX

EU Treaty framework as constitutional European System of Central Banks (ESCB), touchstone (cont.) 90, 94 foundations of, 24-26 Eurozone crisis management internal constitutionality, 23-24 background, 84-87 introduction to, 9, 21-23, 60-61, challenges to EU integration, 90-91 169-172 constitutional contestation, 87-91 Court's contribution to, 85, 91-96 normative power, 30-32 political authority within, 41-48 introduction to, 83-85 scope of application, 26–29 normalisation with EU Treaty summary of, 57-59 framework, 85, 91 Union policymaking, 187 political responses to, 84-85, 87-90 euro currency, 49 summary of, 97 European Central Bank, 29, 87, 90, 92 Eurozone financial crisis, 4, 11 European Citizens' Initiative (ECI), executive power, 65 190-191, 267 external reactions to Court's jurisprudence, European Commission 251-252 Joint Declaration on Fundamental extra-EU intergovernmental Treaties, 88 Rights, 70 finalité of EU integration, 100 overview of, 23, 29, 58 policymaking responsibility, 22-58 First Comitology Decisions, 68 political authority and, 41, 43 flexibility clause, 42 sanctions against Member States, 48 formal status of Union law, 34-37 European Communities Act (1972), 241 France, withdrawal from European Council, European constitutional authority, 243 European Convention for the Protection of franchise extensions, 30-31 Human Rights and Fundamental Francovich case, 138-142, 149-150 Freedoms (ECHR), 4, 39, 79, 107-108, free movement law, 43-44, 153-154, 135, 146, 217, 220-221 253-254 EU accession to, 220-221 freedom of establishment, 158-160 introduction to, 4 fundamental freedoms, 124 overview of, 39, 79, 107, 135, 146 fundamental rights, 11, 31, 69, 184 procedural mechanisms, 148 Gascogne Sack Deutschland GmbH, 5 UK refusal to implement, 108 European Council. See Council of the 'general principle' of EU law, 236-237 German Basic Law, 30, 40 **European Union** European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), German Federal Constitutional Court, 107-108, 148-149 226-227, 236-239, 242, 281 European federalism, 250 G1 (Sudan) v Secretary of State for the Home European High Court, 282 Department, 240 European integration. See EU integration gouvernement des juges, 253 European Ombudsman, 179, 190 Guardian Europe v European Union, 5 European Parliament election turnout, 193 Handelsgesellschaft case, 53 incentive measures, 205 harmonising measures, 210 heterarchical vs. hierarchical relationship, Joint Declaration on Fundamental Rights, 70 129, 243 Honeywell case, 236, 238 overview of, 23, 29, 31, 58 policymaking responsibility, 22-58, horizontal axis analysis, 194 136-137 horizontal direct effect, 162, 167 political authority and, 41, 43 hot air balloon regulations, 177 representative democracy and, human rights, 11, 31, 69, 184 189-190 right to petition, 179 incentive measures, 205 sanctions against Member States, 48 indirect representation (Council and Union policy and, 164-165 Member State parliaments), 267 European Stability Mechanism (ESM), 88, individual vs. State, 123-124 93 - 94institutional activity, 169-170



INDEX 293

institutional balance, 140, 154-156, 250 Laval case, 205-207 institutional Opinions, 221 legal analysis of the Court, 7-8 institutional self-aggrandisement, 267 legal scholarship on the Court, 245-254 Institutional Theory of Law, 247 legalist approaches, 228 insurance markets, 164 legislative policymaking. See EU legislative intellectual gap, 27-28 policymaking intellectual legal movement, 127 legislative power, 65 legitimacy matrix, 245-256, 266-269, 285 inter-institutional agreements, 11, 64-67, lex specialis, 25, 210 Lisbon Treaty intergovernmental agreements, 87 Intergovernmental Conference at EEC Treaty and, 52 Ämsterdam, 233 enhanced security protection, 55 internal constitutionality, 23-24, 28, EU policymaking, 153, 155 EU Treaty framework and, 113 169-170 international criminal law, 103 European integration, 46 International Jet Management case, 176-179 institutional practices, 75 overview of, 27-28, 31, 43 international law autonomy of the EU legal order, 117 primacy of Union law, 218-220 public health protections, 202-203 domestic legal systems, 104-105 limits on states' contractual freedom, representative democracy and, 189, 193 102-104 specific rules under, 88 management of international treaty Luisi and Carbone case, 203 norms, 107-109 Luxembourg Compromise, 11, 71-73, Member States, compliance with, 79-80 Luxembourg Court. See Court of Justice normative framework of, 100-102, 128, Maastricht Treaty, 48, 143, 189, 202, 231, public international law, 100 235, 280 International Monetary Fund, 85 Mangold case, 237-239 international treaty norms, 105-109 medical treatments received abroad, interpretation rule, 126 201-204 intra-Community capital movements, 161 Member States acts of constitutional supplementation, intra-EU healthcare services, 201-204 intra vires as acts of constitutional 134, 142-149 supplementation, 82-83, 96 competence to revise treaties, 138–142 compliance with international law, Joint Declaration of the European 109-110 Parliament, Council and Commission constituent authority, 13, 16, 33, 42-43 on Practical Arrangements for the EU integration and, 22-24 Co-Decision Procedure, 66 EU Treaty framework revisions by, 30 Joint Declaration on Fundamental Rights, financial assistance to, 93 identifying problems with reform, judicial adjudication, 125 19 - 20judicial cross-fertilisation, 229 judicial policy choices, 231-235 judicial engagement, 270–277, 282 laws, 3 judicial interpretation, 137, 246-247 national courts and, 222-230 judicial policymaking. See EU policymaking non-compliance procedures, 47–48 of Court of Justice open market economy, 51 judicial self-empowerment, 269 parliamentary contributions, 47 judicial transgression, 29 political preferences of, 12 Jurisdiction of the Courts of Danzig, 108 protocol for occupational pension jurisprudence on general principles, schemes, 29 68-70 public health protections, 202-203 jus cogens doctrine, 104 responses to Constitutional Issue (No.1), 129, 215-230, 242-243, 256-258 Kalanke case, 232 sanctions against, 48 Köster case, 82-83 transfer of sovereign rights by, 123



294 INDEX

Member States (cont.) as Treaty signatories, 37-38, 216-217, 230 - 235Union law and, 12 voting rights, 89 as workseekers, 180-182, 192-193, 275-276 Meroni case, 83 monetary policy, 95 monopolies, 161 mutatis mutandis analysis, 201 national conscription, 30-31 national constitutional authority, 243 national courts, 222-230 naturalisation by deception, 142-145 Neukirchinger case, 176-179 'new legal order' claim, 116-117, 130, 140, 148, 214 Nic Shuibhne, Niamh, 253-254, 256 no-bail-out clause, 90-92, 250 'non-acceptability' of the EU Court decisions, 251 non-compliance procedures, 47-48 non-contributory unemployment benefit, non-discrimination principle, 52, 202, 277 non-power driven aircraft regulations, 177 normalisation as EU accession acquis, 221-222 normative authority, 24 normative framework EU Treaty framework as constitutional touchstone, 30-32 of international law, 100-102, 128, 228 of judicial reasoning, 249-250 supra-constitutional norms, 138, 262

occupational pension schemes protocol, 29 Official Journal, 31 open market economy, 51 Outright Monetary Transfers (OMT), 94–96

Parliament v Council, 13, 138–142, 149–150, 191
parliamentary readings, 165
passerelle clauses, 42
Patients Rights' Directive, 209
Permanent Court of International Justice (PCIJ), 107
Plaumann case, 274
pluralism, 129, 243–244
Poiares Maduro, Miguel, 248
political authority challenges, 87–90
EU legal order, 41–48, 264–265, 272

EU policymaking, 134, 152-153 within EU Treaty framework, 41-48, 264-265 political reversal of EU Court judgments, 28 post-Lisbon Treaty settlement, 190, 267 posted worker rights, 206 preliminary reference procedure, 125 primacy of Union law, 218-220 primus inter pares approach, 187, 192 Pringle case, 90–92, 250 private actors, 163 privatization processes, 30-31 progressive economic integration, 49 prohibition against discrimination, 158-159, 178 proportionality principle, 26, 55-56, 207 Protocol 8 (European Convention on Human Rights). See European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms public debt refinancing, 85 public international law, 100 pushing back' against the Court of Justice, 236-242

qualified majority voting, 166 quantitative restrictions on imported goods, 124

Rasmussen, Hjalte, 255 reform proposals for Court of Justice capital movements, 272-273 challenges to constituent authority, 137-138, 262-263, 267 challenges to EU legislative frameworks, 265-266 challenges to Treaty limits, 263-265 citizenship rights, 275-277 closer judicial engagement, 270-277 compliance monitoring framework, 280-283 EU integration challenges, 266-269 improving quality of EU Treaty framework, 279-280 introduction to, 260-262 revisions to Court scrutiny, 277-279 standing rights in annulment proceedings, 273-275 summary of, 283-287 Regulation 261/2004 EU, 173-176 representative democracy and EU integration Court of Justice and, 190-193 under EU Treaty framework, 188 - 190introduction to, 171, 187 value of, 211



INDEX

295

residence rights, 182-186 Treaty on Stability, Coordination, and restraining norms, 14 Governance in the Economic and Monetary Union (TSCG), 88, 91 right to strike, 204 Rottmann case, 142-145, 150, 240-241 Treaty on the functioning of the European Ruiz Zambrano case, 182-186, 192-193, Union (TFEU) 254 constituent authority, 42-43 EU Treaty framework limits, 195-196 rule of law, 188 financial assistance from, 93 free movement of workers, 153-154 sanctions against Member States, 48 scrutiny revisions, 277-279 inter-institutional agreements, 80 Second Comitology Decisions, 68 intra-EU healthcare services, 204 self-referential approach to legitimacy, judicial transgression, 29 247-249 Member States' non-compliance procedures, 47-48 Single European Act, 45, 67, 75, 79, 128, 155, 167 Member States' parliamentary social exclusion, 50 contributions, 47 Member States' responsibility for social market economy, 49 social security systems, 180-182, 205 enforcement, 112 overview of, 24-26 Solemn Declaration (1983), 74 sovereign debt crisis, 85 policymaking platforms, 161-162, 200, sovereign rights, 123 205-206, 264 stabilisation measures for Eurozone crisis political authority and, 43-44 management, 87, 90 preliminary reference procedure in, Stability Mechanism, 92 114 standards of good constitutional Union law and, 34-37 adjudication, 6 Treaty signatories, 37-38, 216-217, standing rights in annulment proceedings, 230-235 273-275 tripartite approach to the Eurozone crisis, State Aid review, 28-29 86-87 Statute of the Court of Justice, 282 Stone Sweet, Alex, 248 ultra vires review, 82-83, 238-239 stricto sensu form, 61-62, 101 UN Charter, 126 Sturgeon and Others case (air passenger unemployment benefit, 181 rights), 15 Union citizenship, 179–186, 192–193 subsidiarity principle, 26, 54-56 Unión de Pequeños Agricultores v. Council, Successive Treaty amendments, 273 266-267 Union institutions, 54-55 supra-constitutional norms, 138, 262 Union law. See also EU legislative Supreme Court of Denmark, 240 policymaking constituent authority, 33 teleological interpretation, 247 Constitutional Act of the Republic of Title III on social policy, 51 Lithuania, 224-225 Treaty of Lisbon. See Lisbon Treaty Convention rights and, 146 Treaty of Rome, 44, 49, 53 domestic application of, 37-41 Treaty of the European Union (TEU), formal status of, 34-37, 138, 159, 24-26 243-245 amendments to EU treaties, 110-111 free movement law, 253-254 constituent authority, 42-43 'general principle' of EU law, 236-237 EU integration and, 49-51 governing principles of, 130 EU Treaty framework and, 24-26, 113, introduction to, 12, 22 in Member State legal system, 198 framework decisions under, 217-218 'new legal order' claim, 116-117, 130, judicial transgression, 29 140, 148, 214 Member States' responsibility for political authority for, 43-48 enforcement, 111-112 primacy of, 218-220 State Aid review, 28-29 Treaty of the European Union, 34-37,

111

Union law and, 34-37, 111



296 INDEX

Union law. (cont.)
UN Charter and, 126
uniform interpretation of, 222
United States Constitution, 40
University maintenance grants, 202

Van Gend en Loos case, 124, 131, 165–166 vertical axis analysis, 194 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (VCLT), 104, 110 Viking Line case, 207 voting rights, 89

Watts case, 204 World Trade Organization (WTO), 268 WTO Dispute Settlement Understanding, 39