

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12384-7 - Emergencies in Public Law: The Legal Politics of Containment

Karin Loevy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

EMERGENCIES IN PUBLIC LAW

Debates about emergency powers traditionally focus on whether law can or should constrain officials in emergencies. *Emergencies in Public Law* moves beyond this narrow lens, focusing instead on how law structures the response to emergencies and what kind of legal and political dynamics this relation gives rise to. Drawing on empirical studies from a variety of emergencies, institutional actors, and jurisdictional scales (terrorist threats, natural disasters, economic crises, and more), this book provides a framework for understanding emergencies as long-term processes rather than ad hoc events, and as opportunities for legal and institutional productivity rather than occasions for the suspension of law and the centralization of response powers.

The analysis offered here will be of interest to academics and students of legal, political, and constitutional theory as well as to public lawyers and social scientists.

Karin Loevy is a research scholar with the Institute of International Law and Justice at NYU School of Law where she also manages the JSD Program. Her work on law and the politics of emergencies has been published in such journals as the *Asian Journal of International Law*; *Studies in Law, Politics, and Society*; and the *Journal of Transnational Law and Contemporary Problems*. Previously, she worked as a litigator with a leading Israeli public law firm.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12384-7 - Emergencies in Public Law: The Legal Politics of Containment

Karin Loevy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12384-7 - Emergencies in Public Law: The Legal Politics of Containment

Karin Loevy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Emergencies in Public Law

THE LEGAL POLITICS OF CONTAINMENT

KARIN LOEVY

New York University School of Law



Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-12384-7 - Emergencies in Public Law: The Legal Politics of Containment
Karin Loevy
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107123847

© Karin Loevy 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Loevy, Karin, author.

Emergencies in public law : the legal politics of containment / Karin Loevy.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-12384-7 (hardback)

1. Emergency management – Law and legislation. I. Title.

K4700.L64 2015

342.73'0418–dc23 2015021260

ISBN 978-1-107-12384-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-12384-7 - Emergencies in Public Law: The Legal Politics of Containment
Karin Loevy
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

To Yotam and Ayala

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12384-7 - Emergencies in Public Law: The Legal Politics of Containment

Karin Loevy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page</i> xi
Introduction: After Exception	1
Shifting the Question	5
Overview	6
Part I Theories of Containment	6
Part II Practices of Containment	8
Part III Consequences of Containment	12
Horizons of Containment	13
 Part I: Theories of Containment	
1 An Introduction to the Background Theoretical Problem: The Paradox and Its Paradigmatic Solutions	17
The Background Theoretical Question: Can Law Constrain Emergency Measures?	17
The Post-9/11 Emergency Powers Debate	21
Extralegal, Legal, and Dictatorship Answers: The Paradigmatic Responses to the Problem of Containment	24
Conclusion	39
 2 The Legacy of the Models in the Legal Politics of Emergencies	41
From Models to Mechanisms	41
On Dictatorship	42
From Prerogative to Martial Law and Suspension Acts in the Common Law Tradition	43

	The State of Siege in the French Tradition	45
	The State of Exception in the German Tradition	46
	From Mechanisms to the “Emergency Paradigm”	48
	Conclusion	52
 Part II: Practices of Containment		
3	The Legal Politics of Definitions: Article 15 Derogations in the House of Lords	57
	The <i>Belmarsh</i> Case and the Politics of Defining the Indefinable	58
	What Is an Emergency?	60
	Article 15 of the ECHR and the <i>Belmarsh</i> Answer to the Indefinable	76
	<i>Belmarsh</i> : A Window to an Alternative Politics of Definitions	91
	Conclusion	119
 4	 The Legal Politics of Authorization: The Office of Legal Counsel (OLC) in the U.S. Executive and the Joint Committee on Human Rights (JCHR) in the U.K. Parliament	 122
	Overview	123
	The Problem of Authorization and the Politics of Power and Constraint	125
	The Problem of Authorization and the Alternative Politics of Institutional Competence	129
	Distribution of Powers to Respond in the US and in the UK Post-9/11	130
	The OLC and the JCHR: Roles and Capabilities of Institutional Actors in Different Authorization Structures	138
	Conclusion	174
 5	 The Legal Politics of Jurisdiction: Regional Intervention in a Domestic Disaster, Cyclone Nargis in 2008	 176
	Making Sense of Evolving Regional Capabilities	177
	Emergencies and the Problem of Jurisdiction	179
	The Event and its Jurisdictional Politics: Creating a Humanitarian Space	180
	ASEAN: The Regional Intervention	196
	Conclusion	213

<i>Contents</i>		ix
6	The Legal Politics of Time and Temporality: Ticking Time in the Israeli Supreme Court	218
	The Exceptional Time Frame	221
	The Ticking-Bomb Scenario: Torture’s Exceptional Time	225
	Torture Beyond Exceptional Time: Timelines and Time Frames in the 1999 Israeli Supreme Court Decision	232
	Conclusion	255
 Part III: Consequences of Containment		
7	The Legal Politics of Change and Continuity in Emergencies	261
	Three Traditions and their Distinct Narratives of Change in Emergencies	261
	Two Examples: January 1827 and September 2011	271
	Conclusion	280
8	Horizons of Containment: A Dialectical Process Story of Emergencies and Change	282
	Bridging over Two Historical Narratives about Crisis and Change	283
	Analysis: Disaster Relief Precedents in Early Congressional Debates about Response to the Great Depression	288
	Conclusion	308
	Epilogue: The Process of Emergency	311
	<i>Index</i>	319

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-12384-7 - Emergencies in Public Law: The Legal Politics of Containment
Karin Loevy
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12384-7 - Emergencies in Public Law: The Legal Politics of Containment

Karin Loevy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

The book is a culmination of my doctoral dissertation at NYU School of Law but it traveled far and accumulated many academic debts. The idea originated in the National University of Singapore from the inspirational law and security courses that I took with Victor Ramraj and Simon Chesterman. Their direction and mentorship shaped the first stages of my work and influenced my orientation. I am profoundly indebted to my advisor at NYU Mattias Kumm, for his guidance and perceptive supervision, for many inspiring conversations, and for steadily believing in my project, even when I could not. I also thank the members of my committee: Stephen Holmes and Pasquale Pasquino, for long consultations and for reading and commenting on many drafts. Even before I met them, their work on the theory of emergency powers inspired my thinking and sparked my imagination.

I am also deeply thankful to others who took time to read and discuss my work with me. David Dyzenhaus's scholarship on emergency powers was the intellectual reason for my pursuit in this project and I am deeply grateful for his patience in reading and commenting on some tedious drafts of early chapters and for supporting my research. Leonard Feldman, whose remarkable work in this field was and still is inspirational, kindly allowed me to audit his class at CUNY, read and commented on a draft to Chapter 6, and provided me with opportunities to rethink my initial ideas. Susanne Krasmann, David Kretzmer, Ron Harris, Yoram Shachar, Shai Lavi, Moshe Halbertal, Oren Gross, David Garland, David Golove, Daniel Hulsebosch, Daniel Earnst, Yuen Foong Kohng, Marc de Wilde, Jasper Finke, Michael Atlan, Itamar Mann, and Nitzan Lebovitz – all read and commented on parts of my work. I am indebted to all of them.

I was fortunate to be part of the NYU School of Law JSD community whose support and friendship I could not have done without. Most of all I would like to thank my friends at the JSD program. Special thanks to Vanessa Cassado,

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12384-7 - Emergencies in Public Law: The Legal Politics of Containment

Karin Loevy

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Guy Sinclair, Arie Rosen, David Kosar, Tawanda Mutasah, Rocio Lorca, Lisa Kerr, Moran Yahav, Megan Donaldson, Emily Kidd White, Neto Waite, Hillary Nye, Yu-Jie Chen, Leonid Sirota, Yael Lifshitz, and Tamar Megiddo for their kind support and willingness to discuss my ideas. I especially like to thank Joseph Weiler for his invaluable advice and mentorship as the JSD director and later on. His commitment to the doctoral students and to me, even after I graduated, has provided me with a stimulating and intellectual environment, and made NYU my home. I owe much gratitude to Lewis Kornhauser, Chair of the JSD Program for his kindhearted sustenance and to Benedict Kingsbury for providing me an institutional home at IILJ. To Claudia Golden and Danielle Leads, the managers of 22 Washington Square North, I am indebted for providing the most nurturing workplace a scholar can dream of.

And indeed, this book would have remained a dream without John Berger, my editor at Cambridge University Press. His encouragement, endurance, and professionalism helped me cross the Rubicon of the review process and production with ease. I also thank two anonymous reviewers for careful and positive reading of the manuscript and for their valuable feedback and advice. I'm thankful to Joanne Hindman whose proficient and detailed labor was a great benefit in the revision process, and to Stephen Acerra and Minaketan Dash for their competence in guiding the manuscript through the production process. I thank the Minerva Center for the Rule of Law Under Extreme Conditions, Faculty of Law and the Department of Geography and Environmental Studies, University of Haifa, for its generous support in the publication stage.

My family in Israel, my mother Zipa, my father Ram, my sisters, Noa and Netta and their wonderful husbands and kids are my ongoing energy source, my sunshine. My parents especially, have read and reread drafts with love and care, worry and enthusiasm. I am forever indebted to my mother's intellectual passion and sensitivity and my father's dedication to detail and precision, as an artist he taught me their value. Special thanks to Basmat Hazan for her continuous inclination to listen to my emergency stories and for her unwavering loyalty and support. I'm immensely grateful to Yossi Tamir who helped me see the value of my work and painstakingly encouraged me every step of the way. My father-in-law Ouri Dinour who read many drafts was tremendously helpful in the research for the cover image. I also thank my friends Adeline Rosenstein, Nadia Roden, Ghiora Aharoni, and Tirza Bassel for helpful suggestions regarding the book cover image and especially Vanessa Cassado for her help in obtaining permission to use the image.

Finally, and more than all, I would like to thank my husband, Eran Dinour, for walking with me in this journey, for listening to my endless worries, for

Acknowledgments

xiii

reading draft after draft and talking to me until the late hours of the night, catching me when I was about to fall, tolerating my hesitancy, and taking pride in my success. And to my kids, Yotam and Ayala, I thank you for being as you are, warm and loving, curious and astonishingly creative. I dedicate this book to you.