Index

a priori arguments, evaluation of, 16
acosmism, 129
Anderson, R. Lanier, 117–19
Anselm of Canterbury
  Monologion, 209
  ontological argument, See Proslogion;
  Proslogion II, Proslogion III
  Reply to Gaunilo, 20, 36
response to Gaunilo’s criticism, 258
Aquinas, Thomas
  approach to ontological arguments, 44
  on arguments from simplicity, 49–51
  on atheism as consistent view, 47–8
  Commentary on Boethius’ De Trinitate, 50
  critique of Proslogion II argument, 2, 29–30, 44–7
  critique of Proslogion III argument, 2
  on Damascene’s argument, 51–2
  Disputed Questions on Truth, 52
  on existence of God as self-evident, 44, 47–8, 50
  on key assumption of Proslogion II, 49
  on question-begging in Proslogion II, 48–9
  on reasoning in Proslogion III, 45
  Scriptum Super Sententias, 49
  Summa Contra Gentiles, 2, 45–6, 50–1
  Summa Theologicae, 2, 48–9, 52
argument from design, 121
Aristotle
  cosmological arguments, 1
  Metaphysics, 1
  Physics, 1
Barnes, J., 12–13
beliefs
  inferential beliefs, 18
  justification of, 17
Bonaventure (Saint)
  Disputed Questions on the Mystery of the Trinity, 50–1
Cameron, Ross, 169
Cartesian ontological arguments, 3
Characterization Principle, 250
  in Anselm’s ontological argument, 256–7
in Descartes’ ontological argument, 250–2
in Gödel’s ontological argument, 268
and Kant’s objections to ontological argument, 253–5
in Leibniz’s ontological argument, 252–3
Meinong and, 262–3
classical possibilism, 159
Commentary on Boethius’ De Trinitate
  (Aquinas), 50
Complete Cancellation Objection, 103–4
compositional pluralism, 164
conceivability
  and modal ontological argument, 231–6
  and conceptual consistency, 224–31
  Epistemic Constraint, 217, 220, 222–3, 225, 230–1
  Explanatory Constraint, 218, 222, 225, 230–1
  Fifth Imagination Account, 222–4, 232–3
  First Imagination Account, 218–19
  Fourth Imagination Account, 221, 223–4
  as imaginability, 218–24
  Imagination Account and Representation Constraint, 219–21
  Initial Conceptual Account, 225
  Modal Conceptualism, 225–6
  perceiverability and, 215–18
  philosophical conceivability, 218
  premise (1) and conceiving as imagining, 232–3
  premise (1) and Conceptual Accounts, 233–6
  Primary Conceptual Account, 231
  Representation Constraint, 217, 225, 231
  Representation Constraint and Imagination Account, 219–21
  Second Imagination Account, 219–20
  Secondary Conceptual Account, 230, 233
  Sophisticated Modal Conceptualism, 225–31, 234
  Third Imagination Account, 220–1
  Conceivability Principle, 42
  atheism, as consistent view, 47–8
  cosmological argument, 1, 94
  cosmological proof of God’s existence, 121–2, 126–8
  Critique of Pure Reason (Kant), 3, 30, 100, 254
  Curley, Edwin, 66, 68
Index 281

Damascene, St John, 51–2
deductive arguments, 14–16
derivations, and evaluation of arguments, 16–17
Descartes’ ontological argument
characterization of God, 250–2
dependence of all knowledge on knowledge of God, 58–9
Discourse on Method, 3, 58
disputes over, 53–4
doctrine of divine simplicity, 71
essence of God, 61–5
existence as predicate or property, 72–4
existence of God as self-evident, 2–3, 57, 70
formulation of, 9–10
Gassendi’s objection to, 72
grounds for intuitionism, 57–65
intuitionist account, 54–7
Kant’s objection to, 30–1, 73
Leibniz’s objections to, 71–2, 252–3
Meditations on First Philosophy, 3, 53, 56, 58–9, 65, 71, 74, 250
Mersenne’s objection, 71
necessary versus possible existence, 69–71
objections to, 71–4
Perfection Argument, 67–9
Principles of Philosophy, 3, 53, 57–9
syllogism, 65–7
theory of interference, 60–1
Discourse on Method (Descartes), 3, 58, 60
Disputed Questions on the Mystery of the Trinity (Bonaventure), 50–1
Disputed Questions on Truth (Aquinas), 52
divine simplicity, 71
Eckhard, Arnold, 83, 90, 93
essence of God, 61–5
evaluation of ontological arguments, 14–18
existence of God
from standpoint of every world, 173–4
Findlay, John N., 5, 247
Foundations of Arithmetic (Frege), 259
Free Logic Movement, 115, 119
Frege, Gottlob
Foundations of Arithmetic, 259
on existence, 196–8, 259–60
Frege–Russell view of existence claims, 198, 203
Gassendi, Pierre, 3, 72, 76–7, 79
Gaunilo of Marmoutiers, 79
critique of Proslogion II, 2, 64, 76
parody of Proslogion II argument, 2, 257–8
genealogy of ontological arguments, 11
Gödel’s ontological argument
argument and axioms, 266–8
Characterization Principle in, 268
formulation of, 9–10, 139–41
higher-order modal logic, 3–4, 266
Leibniz’s influence on, 3, 266
positive properties, 266
Gödelian family of ontological arguments
arguments, 139–45
compossibility of positives, 148–9
evaluation, 151–3
Oppy’s naturalness parody, 151
positivity and the formal axioms, 146–9
refinements to original formulation, 142–5
substantive axioms, 149–50
Hartshorne, Charles
modal ontological argument, 2, 4, 19, 178, 238, 264–5
on Proslogion III, 264
Hegel, Georg
absolute idea, 136
‘being’, 132
conflation of God and the world, 122–4
defence of ontological argument, 3
Doctrine of the Concept, 134–6
on first ontological proof, 132–4
on infinity, 123
on infinity of God, 125–7
on Kant’s objection to ontological proof, 124–5
physico-theological proof, 122
on relation between cosmological and ontological proofs, 127–8
resuscitation of proofs of God’s existence, 121–2
on second ontological proof, 130–1
on Spinoza as an acosmist, 128–30
Hume, David, 42, 72
Hume’s Fork, 41
idealization, and evaluation of arguments, 17
inferential beliefs, 18
infinity of God, 123, 125–7
intuitionist account of ontological argument, 54–7
Jacobi, Friedrich Heinrich, 121, 128, 131
Jäsche Logic (Kant), 108
Johnston, M., 12
Kant, Immanuel
analytic objections to ontological argument, 103–6
Complete Cancellation Objection, 103–4
criticism of ontological argument, 3, 102
Critique of Pure Reason, 3, 30, 99–100, 254
existence is not a predicate, 30, 72, 99, 107, 114–19
Ideal of Pure Reason, 100–2, 112
introduction of term ‘ontological argument’, 1, 9, 238
Mere Tautology Objection, 104–6
object and concept, 111–13
objections to ontological argument, 30–1, 72–3, 99, 253–5
Only Possible Argument in Support of a Demonstration of the Existence of God, 3, 99, 103, 113
Perfection Argument, 67
positing versus predication, 111
predication and determination, 110–11
proofs of existence of God, 1
Synthetic Contradictionless Objection, 106
types of predicates, 107–10
Kenny, Anthony, 71
Lateran Councils, 54
Laws (Plato), 1
Leibniz’s ontological argument
a posteriori approach, 94
a priori argument, 76
additional premise, 105
Ens necessarium and existence, 86–9
Ens perfectissimum and pure positivity, 90–4
God’s essence, existence and perfection, 78–86
influence of, 3
Meditations de Cognitione, Veritatem et Ideis, 78, 85
modal argument, 86–9
Monadology, 91
Nouveaux Essais, 85, 95
objections to Anselm’s ontological argument, 75
objections to Descartes’ ontological argument, 71–2, 75, 252–3
on perfection, 80–1
and Perfection Argument in Descartes, 67
positive idea of God, 75–8
presumption and possibility, 94–6
Principles of Nature and Grace, 95
Lewis, David
on Anselm’s first premise, 156–60
on Anselm’s second premise, 160–5
on Anselm’s third premise, 165–71, 173
on existence, 199
metaphysical modality theory applied to Proslogion II argument, 4
translation of Anselm’s arguments into counterpart theory, 155–6
logical atomism, 260–1
Longuenesse, Beatrice, 103–4
Malcolm, Norman
modal ontological argument, 4, 19, 178
Meditations de Cognitione, Veritatem et Ideis (Leibniz), 85
Meditations on First Philosophy (Descartes), 3, 53, 56, 58–9, 65, 71, 74, 250
Meinong, Alexius, 5, 199, 262–3
Meinong’s theory of pure objects, 204
Meinongianism, 198, 253
Mere Tautology Objection, 104–6
Mersenne, Marin, 3, 66, 71
Metaphysical Foundations of Natural Science (Kant), 110
Metaphysics (Aristotle), 1
modal continuity, 184
modal ontological arguments
conceivability and, 231–6
dismissal of existence is not a predicate, 119
epistemic neutrality, 242–6
formulation, 239–42
higher-order modal logic, 3–4, 266
Proslogion III as inspiration for, 19
question-begging in, 239
rational permissibility, 246–9
Monadology (Leibniz), 91
Monologion (Anselm), 209
Nagasawa, Yujin, 36
Nature of Necessity (Plantinga), 5
non-existent objects, theories of, 5
Nouveaux Essais (Leibniz), 85, 95
offices and their occupants, 5, 198–202
Only Possible Argument in Support of a Demonstration of the Existence of God (Kant), 3, 99, 103, 113
ontological arguments
arguments versus proofs, 238
as begging the question, 6, 13
Characterization Principle, 250
claims about God’s existence, 6
connections between conceivability and possibility, 5
in early modern philosophy, 250–5
genealogy of, 11
hard questions about, 8
history of discussion of, 2–5
intrinsically interesting philosophical topics, 5–8
introduction of term, 1, 9
modal versions, see modal ontological arguments
objections to, 12–14, 53
parody of, 7–8
question-begging in, 13, 239
standards for evaluation, 14–18
taxonomy, 9–11, 238
and theory of argumentation, 6–7
ontological proof of God’s existence, 121–2
ontological saturation principles, 171
parodying of ontological arguments
Gaunilo on Anselm’s argument, 2, 257–8
Oppy’s naturalness parody, 151
strong parodies, 150
to discredit arguments, 7–8
weak parodies, 150

Parsons, Terence, 5
perceivability, conceivability and, 215–18
Perfection Argument, 67–9
Phaedo (Plato), 1
Physics (Aristotle), 1
Plantinga’s ontological argument
assessment of Anselm’s argument, 176–8
assessment of extended argument, 192–4
assumption about logic of possibility, 179–80
claim for maximally great being, 11, 188–9
existence of perfect being, 246–9
formulation of, 9–10
on gratuitous bad, 189–90
on greatness, 168
on Hartshorne and Malcolm’s ontological argument, 178
island argument, 190–2
Nature of Necessity, 5
objections to extended version, 188–92
problem of parallel arguments, 180–2
Proslogion III and, 2
and Value Argument, 182–7
as ‘victorious’ version, 178–80
Plato
cosmological arguments, 1
Laws, 1
Phaedo, 1
teleological arguments, 1
Timaeus, 1
positivity
anti-negative view, 147–8
comparative view, 146
compossibility of positives, 148–9
excellence view, 146–8
Gödelian axioms, 146–9
Leibnizian view, 147
no-entailed-limit view, 147
Priest, Graham, 5
Principles of Nature and Grace (Leibniz), 95
Principles of Philosophy (Descartes), 3, 53, 57–9, 62
proofs of God’s existence
cosmological proof, 121
Hegel’s resurrection of, 121–2
non-ontological proofs, 122
ontological proof, 121–2
relation between cosmological and ontological proofs, 127–8
teleological proof, 121
Proslogion (Anselm)
pivotal text on ontological arguments, 2
Proslogion II (Anselm)
Almeida’s translation of third premise, 171–3
ambiguity of Anselm’s formula, 39–40
Aquinas’s critique of, 2, 29–30, 44–7
as centrepiece of Proslogion, 2
characterization of God, 256–7
characterization versus description, 27–9
critiques and philosophical charity, 25–6
existence in the mind, 21–2
existence in the mind and in reality, 23–5
formulation of ontological argument, 9–10
Gaunilo’s critique of, 2
greatness notion, 21, 32–5
key assumption, 49
Lewis’s translation of first premise, 156–60
Lewis’s translation of second premise, 160–5
Lewis’s translation of third premise, 165–71, 173
metaphysical modality applied to, 4
options for recasting argument, 8
original version of ontological argument, 19
parodies of argument, 2
## Index

**Proslogion II (Anselm) (cont.)**
- Plantinga’s assessment of argument, 176–8
- principle of superiority of existence, 35–6
- question-begging in, 48–9
- reconceiving as external description of key concept, 32–41
- *reductio ad absurdum* reasoning, 19–20, 23, 46–7, 256
- something-than-which-nothing-greater-can-be-thought exists in the mind, 20–2
- supreme greatness, 36–8
- switching between something-TWNG and that-TWNG, 26
- that-than-which-a-greater-cannot-be-thought, 27
- that-than-which-a-greater-cannot-be-thought cannot exist in the mind alone, 23–6
- that-than-which-nothing-greater-can-be-thought, 40
- theories of non-existent objects and, 5
- translation of arguments into counterpart theory, 155–6

**Proslogion III (Anselm)**
- Aquinas on reasoning in, 45
- Aquinas’s critique, 2
- axiology of existence, 209–13
- inspiration for modal forms of ontological argument, 19
- logical and axiological validity, 5, 195
- objective of, 2
- ontological argument, 4, 207–9

- question-begging
  - in modal ontological arguments, 239
  - in *Proslogion II*, 48–9
  - in ontological arguments, 239
  - sufficient condition for accusation of, 239

- Rationality Principle, 246–9
- *reductio ad absurdum* reasoning, 19–20, 23, 71

**Reply to Gaunilo (Anselm), 20, 36**

**Rules for the Direction of the Mind (Descartes), 60**

**Russell, Bertrand**
- ’On Denoting’, 260
- on analysis of definite descriptions, 201
- on Anselm’s ontological argument, 41
- on Descartes’ ontological argument, 53

on existence, 198
on failure of ontological argument, 260, 262
on Hegelian ontological argument, 4
on existence, 260–2
on naive Characterization Principle, 263
support for ontological argument, 1

- Sartre, Jean-Paul, 246
- Scotus, John Duns, 215
- *Scriptum Super SententIIs* (Aquinas), 49
- *Sentences* (Lombard), 2
- Sidelle, Alan, 226
- simplicity, arguments from, 49–51
- Spinoza, 92, 128–30
- Stang, N., 116
- *Summa Contra Gentiles* (Aquinas), 2, 45–6, 50–1
- *Summa Theologiae* (Aquinas), 2, 48–9, 52
- super-essentialists, 199
- superiority of existence principle, 35–6
- Sylvan (né Routley), Richard, 5, 261
- Synthetic Contradictionless Objection, 106

taxonomy of ontological arguments, 9–11, 238
- teleological argument, 1
- teleological proof of God’s existence, 121–2, 126–7
- Tichý, Pavel
- on Anselm’s axiology of existence, 209–13
- on argument in *Proslogion III*, 5, 195, 207–9
- on existence claims, 195–8
- on existence, requisite and essence, 202–5
- on greatness and God’s nature, 205–7
- on offices and their occupants, 5, 198–202
- *Timaeus* (Plato), 1
- *Towards Non-Being* (Priest), 261
- Traditional Conventionalism, 225
- transcendental theology, 99, 102

- Value Argument, 182–7
- Van Cleve, James, 115
- William of Ockham, 36, 41
- Wolffian Logic, 116
- Yablo, Stephen, 217–18
- Zalta, Ed, 5