

REGULATING GOVERNMENT ETHICS

This book examines government ethics rules and their enforcement in China (as well as in three other jurisdictions for comparative insights). Empirical research methods (involving primarily semi-structured interviews) were employed to explore the dynamics of actual enforcement policies and practices in China. This book formed an analytical framework through reviewing existing theories on government ethics regulation and general regulation literature and analysing government ethics rules in the US, the UK, and Hong Kong. Using this framework, it seeks to explore the patterns and features of government ethics rules and their enforcement in China. It shows that the inadequacy of government ethics rules per se and the deterrence-oriented criminal enforcement style of government ethics regulation are important but ignored elements of the problem of rampant corruption in China. Such analysis has generated important and practical policy implications for China's government ethics rules and their enforcement.

CHONGHAO WU received his PhD in Law from the University of Hong Kong in 2014.

REGULATING GOVERNMENT ETHICS

An Underused Weapon in China's
Anti-Corruption Campaign

CHONGHAO WU



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-12351-9 — Regulating Government Ethics
Chonghao Wu
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107123519

© Cambridge University Press 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Names: Wu, Chonghao, author.

Title: Regulating government ethics : an underused weapon in China's anti-corruption campaign / Chonghao Wu.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom : Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Based on author's thesis (doctoral - University of Hong Kong, 2014) issued under title: Regulating government ethics in China | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2015051001 | ISBN 9781107123519 (Hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Political corruption—Law and legislation—China. | Political ethics—Law and legislation—China. | Corruption—Prevention—China.

Classification: LCC KNQ4516 .W7 2016 | DDC 345.51/02323—dc23 LC record available at <http://lcn.loc.gov/2015051001>

ISBN 978-1-107-12351-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

<i>List of figures</i>	viii
<i>List of tables</i>	ix
<i>Foreword</i>	x
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xii
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Corruption and anti-corruption	1
1.2 Regulating government ethics	3
1.3 Argument of the book	6
1.4 Organization of the book	13
2 The role of a regulatory enforcement system against corruption in China	14
2.1 Introduction	14
2.2 What is a regulatory regime against corruption?	16
2.3 The relationship between regulation against corruption and criminal approach in anti-corruption	22
2.3.1 Both are necessary and complementary	22
2.3.2 Limited room for improvement of criminal enforcement against corruption	25
2.3.3 The potential for regulation against corruption	32
2.3.4 Minor maladministration and misconduct paves the way for serious corruption in government	37
2.4 Anti-corruption approaches and ruling legitimacy of the CCP	49
2.4.1 Ruling legitimacy of the CCP	49
2.4.2 Criminal approach against corruption and the CCP legitimacy	57
2.4.3 Regulatory approach against corruption and the CCP legitimacy	60
2.5 Conclusion	61

3	Government ethics rules	63
3.1	Introduction	63
3.2	Government ethics rules in the United States, the United Kingdom, and Hong Kong	64
3.2.1	Regulating conflicts of interest	66
3.2.2	Regulating appearance of corruption	74
3.2.3	Regulating financial disclosure	82
3.2.4	Regulating outside employment and activities	85
3.3	Patterns observed in the three jurisdictions	88
3.4	Government ethics rules in China	91
3.4.1	Regulating conflicts of interest	93
3.4.2	Regulating appearance of corruption	102
3.4.3	Regulating financial disclosure	107
3.4.4	Regulating outside employment/activity	112
3.4.5	Unjustified restrictions	114
3.5	Patterns of government ethics rules in China	118
3.6	Insights and implications for the improvement of government ethics rules in China	127
3.7	Conclusion	130
4	Enforcement of government ethics rules	132
4.1	Introduction	132
4.2	Key elements of government ethics rules enforcement: the United States, the United Kingdom, and Hong Kong	134
4.2.1	Enforcement agencies	134
4.2.2	Legal authorities and responsibilities	142
4.2.3	Enforcement approaches/styles	146
4.2.4	Enforcement techniques: tactics, methods, and tools	159
4.2.5	Enforcement resource allocation	169
4.2.6	Common features of government ethics enforcement in the three jurisdictions	171
4.3	Enforcement of government ethics rules in China	173
4.3.1	Enforcement agencies	173
4.3.2	Legal enforcement power and responsibilities	196
4.3.3	Enforcement styles	199
4.3.4	Enforcement techniques: tools and tactics	211
4.3.5	Enforcement resources	215
4.4	Conclusion	218
5	Conclusion	230
5.1	Summing up: key findings and policy implications	230
5.2	Contributions	236
5.3	Recent anti-corruption developments in China	238
5.4	Further research	240

TABLE OF CONTENTS

vii

Appendices 242

A A note on research methods 242

B Key issues addressed in government ethics rules in the United States, the United Kingdom, and Hong Kong 244

C Key issues addressed in government ethics rules in China 252

D Key interview questions for DIC officials 256

E Key interview questions for regulated officials 258

F Survey questionnaire 260

Bibliography 263

Index 290

FIGURES

- 2.1 Integrity system spectrum of behaviour. 21
- 4.1 The relationship in practice among anti-corruption enforcement agencies in China. 195

TABLES

2.1 The amount of money in corruption cases from January to April 2009. 30

2.2 Process of moving from minor deviance to serious corruption for Li Zhen. 44

4.1 Key features of compliance enforcement as contrasted with deterrence enforcement. 150

4.2 Actual enforcement of existing rules governing government ethics in several DICs. 178

4.3 Cases handled by N County DIC in 2009. 186

4.4 Cases handled by R District DIC in 2008. 186

4.5 Cases handled by X City DIC in 2008. 186

4.6 DICs’ internal offices/divisions and each office’s major work. 217

FOREWORD

Regulating government ethics is the missing but essential component in China's struggle against corruption. This is the central thesis in Dr Chonghao Wu's book. It is a thesis that needs to be taken seriously. President Xi Jinping's crackdown on corruption has made international headlines, but it is only another example in a long series of such campaigns in China's history. Though unprecedented in its breadth and intensity, it will not be China's last. While the current campaign stretches to all corners of the earth in search of fugitives and stolen assets, it remains a backwards-looking journey. What is missing is the forward-looking campaign that inculcates a culture of compliance with integrity rules and leads to a sustainable system of prevention. This is where Dr Wu's study makes an important contribution. With reference to the experiences of three jurisdictions that rank within Transparency International's top twenty least corrupt countries, Dr Wu makes the case for establishing in China a two-tier system of regulating ethics and prosecuting corruption crimes. He finds that China lacks a comprehensive set of public sector integrity rules and a suitable agency to enforce such rules and promote compliance. He provides an incisive critique of the discipline inspection committees and explains why a separate government ethics agency is urgently needed. This book is essential reading for anyone interested in the reform and sustainability of China's anti-corruption system.

Dr Wu is to be congratulated on his in-depth study of a serious problem that continues to hold China back from reaching its full potential. As his supervisor, I could not have wished for a more diligent and talented student. As my first student to graduate, Dr Wu sets a high standard for all those to follow.

Simon N. M. Young
The University of Hong Kong

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I would like to express my sincere gratitude to Professor Simon N. M. Young, who supervised my PhD thesis on which this book is based, for his encouragement, dedication, patience, and support. He guided me in the right direction with the breadth and depth of his knowledge of public law in general and anti-corruption law in specific. He always provided timely and valuable advice and comments on my research throughout the time of my PhD study. He also provided me with the opportunities to attend several ICAC conferences in which I met some helpful experts in the area of anti-corruption law. He continued to give support and advice as I revised the thesis into a book. I could not have completed this book without his support and guidance. In addition to his academic training and guidance, he is also genuinely interested in my personal well-being and career development. Professor Young is a great supervisor and I consider myself extremely lucky to be his first PhD student.

I would like to thank Professor David Donald, Professor Fu Hualing, Mr Benny Tai, and three anonymous reviewers who provided encouraging and constructive comments on an early draft of the book.

I also owe my appreciation to a number of people who have helped my research. First, I would like to thank all the interviewees and survey participants for their participation in the research. Second, I would like to thank the staff at the Faculty of Law, law library, and main library at the University of Hong Kong for their professional support.

I would like to express my gratitude to Jennifer Eagleton for her help on proofreading.

I would also like to thank Joe Ng, Finola O'Sullivan, and Claire Wood at Cambridge University Press for their help and encouragement during various stages of preparing this book for publication.

Finally, I am most thankful for the support and encouragement from my parents. I would like to dedicate this book to my parents.

ABBREVIATIONS

CCDI	Central Commission for Discipline Inspection
CCP	Chinese Communist Party
CSB	Civil Service Bureau
DAEO	Designated Agency Ethics Official
DICs	Discipline Inspection Committees
ICAC	Independent Commission against Corruption
IPSA	Independent Parliament Standards Authority
MP	Member of Parliament
NIS	National Integrity System
OGE	Office of Government Ethics
POBO	Prevention of Bribery Ordinance