

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO
PHILOSOPHICAL METHODOLOGY

The Cambridge Companion to Philosophical Methodology offers clear and comprehensive coverage of the main methodological debates and approaches within philosophy. The chapters in this volume approach the question of how to do philosophy from a wide range of perspectives, including conceptual analysis, critical theory, deconstruction, experimental philosophy, hermeneutics, Kantianism, methodological naturalism, phenomenology, and pragmatism. They explore general conceptions of philosophy, centred on the question of what the point of philosophizing might be; the method of conceptual analysis and its recent naturalistic critics and competitors; perspectives from continental philosophy; and also a variety of methodological views that belong neither to the mainstream of analytic philosophy, nor to continental philosophy as commonly conceived. Together they will enable readers to grasp an unusually wide range of approaches to methodological debates in philosophy.

GIUSEPPINA D'ORO is Reader in Philosophy at Keele University. Her publications include *Collingwood and the Metaphysics of Experience* (2002), *Collingwood's An Essay on Philosophical Method* (2005) and *Reasons and Causes: Causalism and Anti-Causalism in the Philosophy of Action* (2013).

SØREN OVERGAARD is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Copenhagen. His recent publications include *Wittgenstein and Other Minds* (2007) and *An Introduction to Metaphilosophy* (2013).

OTHER VOLUMES IN THE SERIES OF CAMBRIDGE
 COMPANIONS

- ABELARD *Edited by* JEFFREY E. BROWER *and*
 KEVIN GUILFOY
- ADORNO *Edited by* THOMAS HUHN
- ANCIENT SCEPTICISM *Edited by* RICHARD BETT
- ANSELM *Edited by* BRIAN DAVIES *and*
 BRIAN LEFTOW
- AQUINAS *Edited by* NORMAN KRETZMANN *and*
 ELEONORE STUMP
- ARABIC PHILOSOPHY *Edited by* PETER
 ADAMSON *and* RICHARD C. TAYLOR
- HANNAH ARENDT *Edited by* DANA VILLA
- ARISTOTLE *Edited by* JONATHAN BARNES
- ARISTOTLE'S POLITICS *Edited by* MARGUERITE
 DESLAURIERS *and* PAUL DESTRÉE
- ATHEISM *Edited by* MICHAEL MARTIN
- AUGUSTINE 2nd edition *Edited by*
 DAVID MECONI *and* ELEONORE STUMP
- BACON *Edited by* MARKKU PELTONEN
- BERKELEY *Edited by* KENNETH P. WINKLER
- BOETHIUS *Edited by* JOHN MARENBO
- BRENTANO *Edited by* DALE JACQUETTE
- CARNAP *Edited by* MICHAEL FRIEDMAN *and*
 RICHARD CREATH
- THE COMMUNIST MANIFESTO *by*
 TERRELL CARVER *and* JAMES FARR
- CONSTANT *Edited by* HELENA ROSENBLATT
- CRITICAL THEORY *Edited by* FRED RUSH
- DARWIN 2nd edition *Edited by* JONATHAN HODGE
and GREGORY RADICK
- SIMONE DE BEAUVOIR *Edited by*
 CLAUDIA CARD
- DELEUZE *Edited by* DANIEL W. SMITH *and*
 HENRY SOMERS-HALL
- DESCARTES *Edited by* JOHN COTTINGHAM
- DESCARTES' MEDITATIONS *Edited by*
 DAVID CUNNING
- DEWEY *Edited by* MOLLY COCHRAN
- DUNS SCOTUS *Edited by* THOMAS WILLIAMS

Continued at the back of the book

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-12152-2 — The Cambridge Companion to Philosophical Methodology

Edited by Giuseppina D'Oro, Søren Overgaard

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

The Cambridge Companion to
**PHILOSOPHICAL
METHODOLOGY**

Edited by Giuseppina D'Oro and Søren Overgaard



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-12152-2 — The Cambridge Companion to Philosophical Methodology
 Edited by Giuseppina D'Oro, Søren Overgaard
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107121522

© Cambridge University Press 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Names: Overgaard, Søren, editor.

Title: The Cambridge companion to philosophical methodology / [edited by] by Giuseppina D'Oro and Søren Overgaard.

Description: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2016. |

Series: Cambridge companions | Includes bibliographical references and index. Identifiers: LCCN 2016045341 |

ISBN 9781107121522 (hardback: paper) |

ISBN 9781107547360 (pbk.: paper) Subjects: LCSH: Methodology.

Classification: LCC BD241. C3255 2016 | DDC 101—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2016045341>

ISBN 978-1-107-12152-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-54736-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>page x</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xv
Introduction	i
SØREN OVERGAARD AND GIUSEPPINA D'ORO	
Part I: Visions of Philosophy	ii
1 Doing Philosophy	13
ALESSANDRA TANESINI	
2 Philosophy as Rational Systematization	32
NICHOLAS RESCHER	
3 Sense-making From a Human Point of View	44
A. W. MOORE	
4 Disagreement in Philosophy: An Optimistic Perspective	56
HERMAN CAPPELEN	
Part II: Conceptual Analysis and the Naturalistic Challenge	75
5 Impure Conceptual Analysis	77
HANS-JOANN GLOCK	
6 What Can We Do, When We Do Metaphysics?	101
AMIE L. THOMASSON	

viii Contents

7	Armchair Metaphysics Revisited: The Three Grades of Involvement in Conceptual Analysis	122
	FRANK JACKSON	
8	A Naturalistic Methodology	141
	HILARY KORNBLITH	
9	What is Negative Experimental Philosophy Good For?	161
	JONATHAN M. WEINBERG	
	Part III: Between Analysis and the Continent	185
10	Life-changing Metaphysics: Rational Anthropology and its Kantian Methodology	187
	ROBERT HANNA	
11	Collingwood's Idealist Metaontology: Between Therapy and Armchair Science	211
	GIUSEPPINA D'ORO	
12	Pragmatism and the Limits of Metaphilosophy	229
	ROBERT B. TALISSE	
13	On Metaphysical Quietism and Everyday Life	249
	DAVID MACARTHUR	
14	The Metaphilosophy of the Analytic–Continental Divide: From History to Hope	274
	ROBERT PIERCEY	
	Part IV: Continental perspectives	293
15	Phenomenological Method and the Achievement of Recognition: Who's Been Waiting for Phenomenology?	295
	DAVID R. CERBONE	
16	Existentialist Methodology and Perspective: Writing the First Person	317
	J. REYNOLDS AND P. STOKES	

Contents	ix
17 Hermeneutics and the Question of Method KRISTIN GJESDAL	337
18 Critical Theory’s Philosophy FABIAN FREYENHAGEN	356
19 An Extension of Deconstructionist Methodology LEONARD R. LAWLOR	379
20 Pathological Experience: A Challenge for Transcendental Constitution Theory? JEAN-LUC PETIT	398
<i>Bibliography</i>	418
<i>Index</i>	450

CONTRIBUTORS

HERMAN CAPPELEN is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Oslo and at the University of St Andrews. He is the co-author of many papers and seven monographs, including *Insensitive Semantics*, *Relativism and Monadic Truth*, *Philosophy without Intuitions*, and *The Inessential Indexical*. He is the Co-Director of ConceptLab and the Editor-in-Chief of the journal *Inquiry*.

DAVID R. CERBONE is Professor of Philosophy at West Virginia University. He is the author of *Understanding Phenomenology*, *Heidegger: A Guide for the Perplexed*, and *Existentialism: All That Matters*, as well as numerous articles on Heidegger, Wittgenstein, and the phenomenological tradition. He also co-edits the *Routledge Research in Phenomenology* series.

GIUSEPPINA D'ORO is Reader in Philosophy at Keele University. Her research interests lie at the intersection between idealism, philosophy of mind, and metaphilosophy. She is the author of *Collingwood and the Metaphysics of Experience*, the editor (with Constantine Sandis) of *Reasons and Causes: Causalism and Anti-Causalism in the Philosophy of Action*, and has published many papers on Collingwood's contribution to philosophical methodology and action theory.

FABIAN FREYENHAGEN is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Essex. His research interests include the Frankfurt School, ethics, and political philosophy. He is the author of *Adorno's Practical Philosophy* and has published articles in journals such as *Hegel Bulletin*, *Kantian Review*, and *Politics, Philosophy & Economics*.

Contributors

xi

KRISTIN GJESDAL is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Temple University. Her publications include *Gadamer and the Legacy of German Idealism* and a number of articles on Herder, post-Kantian philosophy, hermeneutics, and aesthetics. She is the co-editor of the *Oxford Handbook of German Philosophy in the Nineteenth Century*, the editor of *Key Debates in Nineteenth-Century Philosophy*, and the co-editor of the forthcoming *Cambridge Companion to Hermeneutics*.

HANS-JOHN GLOCK is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Zurich (Switzerland) and Visiting Professor at the University of Reading (UK). He is the author of *A Wittgenstein Dictionary*, *Quine and Davidson*, *La mente de los animales*, and *What is Analytic Philosophy?* He has edited *The Rise of Analytic Philosophy*, *Wittgenstein: a Critical Reader*, *Strawson and Kant*, and co-edited *Wittgenstein's Philosophical Investigations*, *Wittgenstein and Quine*, *Wittgenstein and Analytic Philosophy*, and *The Blackwell Companion to Wittgenstein*.

ROBERT HANNA is an independent philosopher, co-director of the *Critique & Contemporary Kantian Philosophy* project, and a visiting research professor at PUC-PR, Brazil. He is a philosophical generalist with a broadly Kantian orientation, and has authored or co-authored six books, including *Kant and the Foundations of Analytic Philosophy*, *Kant, Science, and Human Nature*, *Rationality and Logic*, *Embodied Minds in Action* (co-authored with M. Maiese), and *Cognition, Content, and the A Priori: A Study in the Philosophy of Mind and Knowledge*.

FRANK JACKSON is an Emeritus Professor at The Australian National University. He works in the philosophy of mind and language, and ethics. His publications include *Language, Names, and Information*, *Conditionals*, *Perception*, and *From Metaphysics to Ethics*.

HILARY KORNBLITH is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Massachusetts, Amherst. His work has focused on ways in which a scientific understanding of the mind can shed light on traditional philosophical problems in epistemology and related areas. He is the author of *Inductive Inference and its Natural Ground*, *Knowledge and its Place in Nature*, *On Reflection*, and *A Naturalistic Epistemology: Selected Papers*.

xii Contributors

LEONARD LAWLOR is Edwin Erle Sparks Professor of Philosophy at Penn State University. His research interests are in contemporary continental philosophy, especially French philosophy of the 1960s. He is the author of seven books, among which are *This is not Sufficient* and *Derrida and Husserl*. His new book is called *From Violence to Speaking out*.

DAVID MACARTHUR is an Associate Professor in the Philosophy Department at the University of Sydney. He works on liberal naturalism, contemporary pragmatism, scepticism, metaphilosophy, and philosophy of art and architecture. He is editor of the forthcoming *Pragmatism as a Way of Life* by Hilary and Ruth Anna Putnam.

A. W. MOORE is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Oxford. He is the author of four books: *The Infinite*, *Points of View*, *Noble in Reason*, *Infinite in Faculty: Themes and Variations in Kant's Moral and Religious Philosophy*, and *The Evolution of Modern Metaphysics: Making Sense of Things*. He is also co-editor of the journal *MIND*.

SØREN OVERGAARD is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Copenhagen. He is the author of *Husserl and Heidegger on Being in the World* and *Wittgenstein and Other Minds* and co-author (with Paul Gilbert and Stephen Burwood) of *An Introduction to Metaphilosophy*.

ROBERT PIERCEY is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Campion College of the University of Regina. His interests include hermeneutics, pragmatism, metaphilosophy, and the philosophy of history. He is the author of *The Uses of the Past From Heidegger to Rorty* and *The Crisis in Continental Philosophy*.

JEAN-LUC PETIT is Professor of Philosophy at the Université de Strasbourg. He has organized a series of workshops and conferences intended to promote dialogue between phenomenology and cognitive (neuro)science. In collaboration with Alain Berthoz at the Collège de France (Paris), he has co-authored *The Physiology and Phenomenology of Action* and edited several collected volumes at the interface between these same topics.

NICHOLAS RESCHER is Distinguished University Professor of Philosophy at the University of Pittsburgh. Author of over one hundred books covering virtually every branch of philosophy, he has

served as President of the American Philosophical Association, the American Catholic Philosophical Association, and the Metaphysical Society of America. His many years of contribution to philosophy have been recognized by honorary degrees from seven universities on three continents.

JACK REYNOLDS is Professor of Philosophy and Associate Dean (Research) of the Faculty of Arts and Education at Deakin University, Australia. His recent books include: *Phenomenology, Naturalism and Science* (forthcoming), *Chronopathologies: The Politics of Time in Deleuze, Derrida, Analytic Philosophy and Phenomenology*, and *Analytic Versus Continental: Arguments on the Methods and Value of Philosophy* (with James Chase).

PATRICK STOKES is Senior Lecturer in Philosophy at Deakin University. He works on issues of personal identity, moral psychology, time, memory, and death, with a focus on bringing continental work (particularly Kierkegaard) into analytic debates. He is the author of *The Naked Self* and *Kierkegaard's Mirrors*.

ROBERT B. TALISSE is W. Alton Jones Professor of Philosophy at Vanderbilt University. His research interests include pragmatism, contemporary political philosophy, and social epistemology. He is the author of many articles and several books, including *A Pragmatist Philosophy of Democracy* and *Democracy and Moral Conflict*.

ALESSANDRA TANESINI is Professor of Philosophy at Cardiff University. She is the author of *An Introduction to Feminist Epistemologies*, of *Wittgenstein: A Feminist Interpretation*, and of several articles in feminist philosophy, the philosophy of mind and language, epistemology, and on Nietzsche.

AMIE THOMASSON is Professor of Philosophy and Cooper Fellow at the University of Miami. She is the author of *Ontology Made Easy*, *Ordinary Objects*, and *Fiction and Metaphysics*, as well as of more than sixty articles on topics in metaphysics, philosophical methodology, philosophy of mind, social ontology, and aesthetics.

JONATHAN M. WEINBERG is Associate Professor of Philosophy and the Program in Cognitive Science at the University of Arizona. He works in epistemology, philosophy of psychology, and aesthetics, as well as in experimental philosophy and philosophical methodology.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We would like to thank Hilary Gaskin at Cambridge University Press for her invaluable help on this project. We would also like to express our gratitude to Christofere Fila and Stephen Leach for their assistance in the last stages of the production of this volume. We owe a special debt of gratitude to our anonymous readers.