When can a group legitimately form its own state? Under international law, some groups can but others cannot. But the standard is unclear, and traditional legal analysis has failed to elucidate it. In *The Theory of Self-Determination*, leading scholars chart new territory in our theoretical conception of self-determination. Drawing from diverse scholarship in international law, philosophy, and political science, they attempt to move beyond the prevailing nationalist conceptions of group definition. At issue are such universal questions as: When does a group qualify as a “people”? Does history matter? Or is it a question of ethnic status? Are these matters properly solved by popular vote?

Anchored in modern analytical political philosophy but with implications for a wide range of scholarship, this volume will prove essential for scholars and practitioners of international law, global justice, and international relations.

**Fernando R. Tesón** is the Tobias Simon Eminent Scholar and a professor of law at the Florida State University College of Law. A renowned scholar of political philosophy and international law, he is the author of *Justice at a Distance: Extending Global Freedom* (with Loren Lomasky, Cambridge, 2015) and *Humanitarian Intervention: An Inquiry into Law and Morality* (3rd ed., 2005), among many others. A native of Argentina, he is a founding member of the blog *Bleeding Heart Libertarians*. 
ASIL Studies in International Legal Theory

Series Editors
Mark Agrast, ASIL
Mortimer Sellers, University of Baltimore

Editorial Board
Samantha Besson, Université de Fribourg
Allen Buchanan, Duke University
David Kennedy, Harvard University
Jan Klabbers, University of Helsinki
David Luban, Georgetown University
Larry May, Vanderbilt University
Mary Ellen O’Connell, University of Notre Dame
Onuma Yasuaki, Meiji University
Helen Stacy, Stanford University
John Tasioulas, University College London
Fernando Tesón, Florida State University

The purpose of the ASIL Studies in International Legal Theory series is to clarify and improve the theoretical foundations of international law. Too often the progressive development and implementation of international law has foundered on confusion about first principles. This series raises the level of public and scholarly discussion about the structure and purposes of the world legal order and how best to achieve global justice through law.

This series grows out of the International Legal Theory project of the American Society of International Law. The ASIL Studies in International Legal Theory series deepens this conversation by publishing scholarly monographs and edited volumes of essays considering subjects in international legal theory.

Books in the series

The Theory of Self-Determination
Fernando Tesón

Negotiating State and Non-State Law: Global and Local Legal Pluralism
Michael A. Helfand

Normative Pluralism and International Law: Exploring Global Governance
Jan Klabbers and Touko Piipaerinen

Jus Post Bellum and Transitional Justice
Larry May and Elizabeth Edenberg

The Future of International Law: Global Government
Joel P. Trachtman

Morality, Jus Post Bellum, and International Law
Edited by Larry May and Andrew T. Forcehimes

Parochialism, Cosmopolitanism, and the Foundations of International Law,
Edited by Mortimer Sellers
Global Justice and International Economic Law: Opportunities and Prospects
Edited by Chios Carmody, Frank J. Garcia, and John Linarelli

The Role of Ethics in International Law
Edited by Donald Earl Childress III

The New Global Law
Rafael Domingo

Customary International Law: A New Theory with Practical Applications
Brian D. Lepard

International Criminal Law and Philosophy
Edited by Larry May and Zachary Hoskins
The Theory of Self-Determination

Edited by

FERNANDO R. TESÓN
## Contents

**List of contributors**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction: The Conundrum of Self-Determination</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Fernando R. Tesón</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Self-Determination and Moral Variation</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Bas van der Vossen</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 The Case for National Self-Determination</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Christopher W. Morris</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 The Right to Self-Determination: Earned, Not Inherent</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Frédéric Mégret</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 The Right to Exist and the Right to Resist</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Jens David Ohlin</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Self-Determination in Three Movements</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Patrick Macklem</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Self-Determination for National Minorities</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Alan Patten</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Self-Determination, Dissent, and the Problem of Population Transfers</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Matthew Lister</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Civil Disobedience, Dirty Hands, and Secession</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Michael Blake</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 “Mars for the Martians”? On the Obsolescence of Self-Determination</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>John R. Morss</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Evolution of Self-Determination of Peoples in International Law

Elizabeth Rodríguez-Santiago

Index
Contributors

Michael Blake is Professor of Philosophy and Public Affairs, and Director of the Program on Values in Society, at the University of Washington. He writes on international justice and the ethics of immigration. His most recent book is *Debating Brain Drain: May Governments Restrict Emigration?* (Oxford University Press, 2014), written with Gillian Brock.

Matthew Lister is a lecturer in department of Legal Studies and Business Ethics at the Wharton School of Business, University of Pennsylvania. He earned his PhD in Philosophy and his JD at the University of Pennsylvania. He has taught at Penn Law, Villanova Law School, and the University of Denver Law School, and has been a law clerk at the U.S. Court of International Trade and the Third Circuit Court of Appeals. He writes on immigration, international law, and legal and political philosophy, among other topics.

Patrick Macklem is the William C. Graham Professor of Law at the University of Toronto Faculty of Law. He holds law degrees from Harvard and Toronto, and an undergraduate degree in political science and philosophy from McGill. He served as Law Clerk for Chief Justice Brian Dickson of the Supreme Court of Canada. He is a recurring visiting professor at Central European University. He has been a visiting scholar at Stanford Law School, UCLA School of Law and Harvard Law School, and a Fulbright New Century Scholar. In 2006–2007, he was a Senior Global Research Fellow at the Center for Human Rights and Global Justice at NYU School of Law. In 2007–2008, he was a Member of the Institute for Advanced Study in Princeton, New Jersey. He is the author of *The Sovereignty of Human Rights* (Oxford University Press, 2015) and *Indigenous Difference and the Constitution of Canada* (University of Toronto Press, 2001), and co-editor of *From Recognition to Reconciliation* (University of Toronto Press, 2015), *Canadian Constitutional Law* (Paul Emond, 2010), *Labour and Employment Law* (Queen’s IRC Press, 2001), *The Theory of Self-Determination* (Cambridge University Press, 2014), and *Debating Brain Drain: May Governments Restrict Emigration?* (Oxford University Press, 2014), written with Gillian Brock.
x

List of contributors

2004), The Security of Freedom: Essays on Canada's Anti-terrorism Bill (2001), and has published numerous articles on international human rights law, constitutional law, indigenous peoples, ethnic and cultural minorities, and labor law and policy. He is a Fellow of the Royal Society of Canada.

Frédéric Mégret, PhD, is an associate professor at the Faculty of Law, McGill University. He also holds the Canada Research Chair in the Law of Human Rights and Legal Pluralism and is affiliated with the McGill Centre of the same name. He holds an LLB from King’s College London, a DEA from the Université de Paris I, and a PhD from the Graduate Institute of International Studies (Geneva), as well as a diploma from Sciences Po Paris. His work focuses on some of the theoretical dimensions of international law, international criminal justice, international human rights law, and the laws of war.

Christopher W. Morris is Professor of Philosophy and Chair of Department at the University of Maryland. He is a member of the executive board of the Center for Ethics and the Rule of Law, University of Pennsylvania Law School. His interests in political and legal philosophy range over topics concerning state legitimacy and sovereignty, nationalism, imperialism, and premodern forms of political organization. He is the author of An Essay on the Modern State (Cambridge University Press, 1998) and recently published an ethics textbook, Questions of Life and Death: Readings in Practical Ethics (Oxford University Press, 2011).

John R. Morss was born in London and educated at the Universities of Sheffield, Edinburgh, and Otago. He has held posts in the Universities of Ulster and Otago, and Deakin University, Victoria (Australia). He is a member of the Executive Committee of the Legal Theory Interest Group of the American Society for International Law and of the Coordinating Committee of the European Society for International Law Interest Group on International Legal Theory. He has been Visiting Fellow at the European University Institute, Florence, and at the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge. His most recent book is International Law as the Law of Collectives: Toward a Law of People (Ashgate, 2013).

Jens David Ohlin is Professor of Law at Cornell Law School. He specializes in international law and all aspects of criminal law, including domestic, comparative, and international criminal law. Ohlin’s research also focuses on the laws of war, in particular the impact of new technology on the regulation of warfare, including remotely piloted drones and the strategy of targeted killings, cyberwarfare, and the role of nonstate actors in armed
conflicts. In the area of international criminal law, Professor Ohlin concentrates on the application of traditional criminal law theory by international tribunals. He earned a PhD in philosophy and a JD from Columbia University.


Elizabeth Rodríguez-Santiago is Assistant Research Professor at the Universidad del Este in Puerto Rico where she conducts her research on international law, specially on self-determination of peoples in colonial and noncolonial contexts and on legal issues relating the Puerto Rican status. She also teaches International Law at the Centro de Estudios Avanzados de Puerto Rico y el Caribe in Old San Juan. In 2012 she received her doctorate in Public International Law from Sorbonne Law School in Paris after defending her dissertation on the subject of self-determination of peoples. Prior to this, and after finishing her BA in Economics at the University of Puerto Rico, she completed the degrees of DEUG, License and Maîtrise (JD equivalent) in French Law, as well as a Diplôme d’Études Approfondies (LLM equivalent) in International Economic Law at Sorbonne Law School.

Fernando R. Tesón is the Tobias Simon Eminent Scholar and a professor of law at the Florida State University College of Law. A renowned scholar of political philosophy and international law, he is the author of Justice at a Distance: Extending Global Freedom (with Loren Lomasky, Cambridge University Press, 2015) and Humanitarian Intervention: An Inquiry into Law and Morality (3rd ed., 2005), among many others. A native of Argentina, he is a founding member of the blog Bleeding Heart Libertarians.

Bas van der Vossen is Assistant Professor in Philosophy at the University of North Carolina Greensboro. His research interests are in political and legal philosophy. His work has appeared in the Journal of Political Philosophy, Law and Philosophy, Social Philosophy & Policy, and the Oxford Journal of Legal Studies, among other places.