Politics with the People

Many citizens in the United States and abroad fear that democratic institutions have become weak, and continue to weaken. *Politics* with *the People* develops the principles and practice of "directly representative democracy" – a new way of connecting citizens and elected officials to improve representative government. Sitting members of Congress agreed to meet with groups of their constituents via online, deliberative town hall meetings to discuss some of the most important and controversial issues of the day. The results from these experiments reveal a model of how our democracy could work, where politicians consult with and inform citizens in substantive discussions, and where otherwise marginalized citizens participate and are empowered. Moving beyond our broken system of interest-group politics and partisan blood sport, directly representative reforms will help restore citizens' faith in the institutions of democratic self-government, precisely at a time when those institutions themselves feel dysfunctional and endangered.

Michael A. Neblo is Associate Professor of Political Science and (by courtesy) Philosophy and Public Policy, and Director of the Institute for Democratic Engagement and Accountability (IDEA) at The Ohio State University.

Kevin M. Esterling is Professor of Public Policy and Political Science at the University of California, Riverside.

David M. J. Lazer is Distinguished Professor of Political Science and Computer and Information Science, and Co-Director of the NULab for Texts, Maps, and Networks at Northeastern University and a Visiting Scholar at the Institute for Quantitative Social Science at Harvard University.

Cambridge Studies in Public Opinion and Political Psychology

Series Editors

Dennis Chong, University of Southern California and Northwestern University James H. Kuklinksi, University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign

Cambridge Studies in Public Opinion and Political Psychology publishes innovative research from a variety of theoretical and methodological perspectives on the mass public foundations of politics and society. Research in the series focuses on the origins and influence of mass opinion, the dynamics of information and deliberation, and the emotional, normative, and instrumental bases of political choice. In addition to examining psychological processes, the series explores the organization of groups, the association between individual and collective preferences, and the impact of institutions on beliefs and behavior.

Cambridge Studies in Public Opinion and Political Psychology is dedicated to furthering theoretical and empirical research on the relationship between the political system and the attitudes and actions of citizens.

Books in the series are listed on the page following the Index.

Politics with the People

Building a Directly Representative Democracy

MICHAEL A. NEBLO

The Ohio State University

KEVIN M. ESTERLING

University of California, Riverside

DAVID M.J. LAZER Northeastern University/ Harvard University



Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-11726-6 — Politics with the People Michael A. Neblo , Kevin M. Esterling , David M. J. Lazer Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107117266 DOI: 10.1017/9781316338179

© Michael A. Neblo, Kevin M. Esterling and David M. J. Lazer 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-11726-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

MN: For Eileen, Anna, and Kate – the people I'm building a life with.

KE: To my wonderful wife Emily, who is always there for me when I need constructive, two-way communication, and to my two kids, Zachary and Cadence, who excel in direct and deliberative engagement (sometimes with their parents).

DL: I dedicate this volume to the memories and legacies of my grandmother, Lina Dinerstein, and of my mother, Estelle James, both of whom died during work on this book. My grandmother, born in Austria-Hungary, fled from Cossacks when she was a child, was a refugee during World War I, and immigrated to New York shortly after the war ended. My mother was an economist – one of the first women to receive her PhD in economics from MIT – and whose work on pension reform has benefited millions of people around the world. It was in her house in Washington that we conceived much of the early work on this project. They had the power of imagination and force of will to create a better world for the next generation.

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-11726-6 — Politics with the People Michael A. Neblo , Kevin M. Esterling , David M. J. Lazer Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

> Designs are brought to nothing where there is no counsel: But in the multitude of counselors they succeed. – Proverbs 15:22

Contents

<i>page</i> ix
xi
xiii
I
23
38
53
69
84
100
113
126
139
143
153
163

Figures

I.1	The voting eligible population of congressional districts continues to increase (solid line) at the same time that partisan polarization (dotted line)	
	has sharply increased post-1980	page 7
I.2	Rockwell's depiction of a New England town meeting (left) and a photo from one of Obama's town halls (right)	18
2.1	Online town hall user interface	41
2.2	The experimental design for the House of	
	Representatives study	45
2.3	Members and districts in the study, 2006	48
2.4	Ideology ratings for participating members, 2006	49
A.1	The experimental design for the House of Representatives	6
	study	145

Tables

2.1	Participating members of Congress	page 48
4.1	Immigration policy knowledge questions posttest	75
7.1	Representativeness of participants in the study	
	with Sen. Levin	117
7.2	Detainee policy knowledge items	118

Acknowledgments

This book is about people coming together in dialogue to build something new and worthwhile. We want to begin, then, by thanking those who entered into dialogue with us to build the book itself. Anything worthwhile in what we have written is due, in large part, to them.

The dialogue began with a phone call from Brad Fitch of the Congressional Management Foundation (CMF). Brad proposed joint research on how to help Congressional offices use new communications technology to serve their constituents better – that is, to improve the way that representative democracy works. In some ways, this whole project was CMF's idea. We have been extraordinarily fortunate to have them adopt us into their organizational family. We thank the entire CMF team, especially its three successive executive directors during this project: Rick Shapiro, Beverly Bell, and Brad Fitch. CMF's remarkable research staff – Kathy Goldschmidt, Nicole Folk Cooper, Collin Burden, and Tim Hysom – taught us more about Congress than any of our courses in graduate school. That we owe CMF a tremendous debt of gratitude goes without saying. What most people do not realize, however, is that the whole nation, really, owes a similar debt of gratitude for the daily, unheralded work CMF does to help Congress serve our country better.

Our collaboration with CMF led to a grant from the National Science Foundation's Digital Government Program.¹ We thank NSF, and our

¹ This material is based upon work supported by the National Science Foundation under Grant No. (IIS-0429452). Any opinions, findings, and conclusions or recommendations expressed in this material are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the National Science Foundation.

xiv

Acknowledgments

program manager, the late Larry Brandt, for the confidence he had in a group of (then) young investigators. Larry was a visionary public servant who empowered a generation of scholars to think creatively about democracy, governance, and technology. The deliberative town hall with Senator Carl Levin was funded by a generous grant from the Ash Institute for Democratic Governance & Innovation at Harvard's Kennedy School of Government. We thank the Institute, and its director, Tony Saich, for their enthusiastic support.

We are extremely grateful to the thirteen members of Congress who were brave enough to serve as test pilots for our institutional innovations: Earl Blumenauer, Michael Capuano, James Clyburn, Mike Conaway, Anna Eshoo, Jack Kingston, Carl Levin, Zoe Lofgren, Don Manzullo, Jim Matheson, David Price, George Radanovich, and Dave Weldon. As a noted political advisor once said, "There is nothing more difficult to take in hand, more perilous to conduct, or more uncertain in its success, than to take the lead in the introduction of a new order of things." We appreciate the willingness of these thirteen public servants to take a chance with us to imagine a new order of constituent communication.

It is not customary for public opinion researchers to thank their sample of respondents. But the over 2,000 people who participated in our study were not merely "subjects" in our experiments. They are, and were acting as, our fellow citizens. Those who talked to their representatives took the time to engage in a form of real (if unusual) politics. They made their voices heard in the democratic process in a way that goes beyond voting, donating, or shouting. For this, we are deeply grateful.

Three colleagues stand out for special thanks because of their crucial contributions to this project. In addition to coauthoring the articles on which Chapters 3 and 7 are based, Anand Sokhey provided detailed and helpful feedback on the entire manuscript at a crucial juncture. Ryan Kennedy, also a coauthor on those papers, currently leads the team conducting our second wave of research on consultation with Congress. (Thus, any remaining questions you have upon finishing this book should be directed to Ryan.) William Minozzi was the lead author on a paper with results crucial to Chapters 5 and 6. In addition to his extensive and insightful comments on the manuscript, William devoted a session of his graduate course to discussing a draft. We thank both him and the participants in the seminar for their helpful feedback. William is also a key member of the second wave research team.

We have had much encouragement and feedback from colleagues and friends throughout the process of researching and writing this book.

Acknowledgments

Jenny Mansbridge, a constant inspiration as a scholar and colleague, advocated for and mentored us through the entire project, and provided very detailed and helpful comments on the manuscript. André Bächtiger, Jamie Druckman, Peter Levine, Stefan McCabe, Tanja Pritzlaff, Sarah Shugars, and Craig Volden all read the entire manuscript and offered timely and invaluable feedback. For conversations about various elements of the project we thank John Dedrick, Dan Esterling, Donald Esterling, Linda Esterling, Nick Felts, Jane Fountain, Jon Green, Don Hubin, Jon Kingzette, Rick Herrmann, Amy Lee, Sandra Levy-Achtemeier, Eric MacGilvray, Ben McKean, Eileen McMahon, Ines Mergel, Laura Moses, Tom Nelson, Alexander Schellong, Piers Turner, Inés Valdez, Charlotte Weber, Steve Zeller, and Curt Ziniel, as well as participants in seminars at the University of Bremen, Harvard University, the Kettering Foundation, Northeastern University, the University of Notre Dame, Ohio State University, and Villa Vigoni. Jon Green and Jon Kingzette provided remarkably fast and reliable assistance preparing the manuscript for final publication.

Special thanks to our editor at Cambridge University Press, Robert Dreesen. Robert's early encouragement helped us to see the value of synthesizing the disparate findings in journal articles into something bigger and more coherent. His continuing encouragement and support over the years have shaped every dimension of the book, all for the better.

Strange as it may sound, the three of us would like publicly to thank each other. Our growth as colleagues and friends through this project has been among the most rewarding experiences of our careers.

Acknowledgments to families are often a mix of gratitude and apology, and we can fully appreciate why. We want to express our profound thanks to Eileen McMahon, Emily Garabedian, and Lisa Bernt. This book reflects their thoughtful comments, their support when it took us away from home, and their patience as it (slowly) materialized. And for our children, we regret the times we have been absent (literally or figuratively), and hope for a world in which their voices will be heard.

xv