

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-11680-1 - The Consequences of Social Movements

Edited by Lorenzo Bosi, Marco Giugni and Katrin Uba

Excerpt

[More information](#)

INTRODUCTION

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-11680-1 - The Consequences of Social Movements

Edited by Lorenzo Bosi, Marco Giugni and Katrin Uba

Excerpt

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-11680-1 - The Consequences of Social Movements

Edited by Lorenzo Bosi, Marco Giugni and Katrin Uba

Excerpt

[More information](#)

1 THE CONSEQUENCES OF SOCIAL MOVEMENTS

Taking stock and looking forward

Lorenzo Bosi, Marco Giugni, and Katrin Uba

Citizens of both democratic and authoritarian countries seem to become less supportive of those in power and more willing to use non-conventional forms of collective action for putting pressure on authorities. This was the case, for example, during the past few years, with the major upsurges of protest, in Eastern Europe (Coloured Revolutions), in the Middle East (Arab Spring), in Southern Europe (the *Indignados* in Spain, the *Agonaktismenoi* in Greece), in the United States (Occupy Wall Street), in Chile (the *Pinquinos*), as well as anti-government protests in Hong Kong, Thailand, and South Africa. Such waves of mobilization, comparable in their size to those of the 1960s and 1970s, bring to the fore some important questions for social movement research and call for a deeper understanding of social and political change: When and how does mobilization make a difference? When and how do activists achieve their goals? Is protest a necessary and/or sufficient condition for producing social and political change? Do social movements have any long-term legacies on our societies? Do they change the life choices of those participating in protest activities? How does all this vary both across contexts and across different movements?

These and related questions are not new, but until the 1970s scholars paid little attention to the consequences of social movements as

We would like to thank all the authors contributing to this volume and the Swedish Riksbankens Jubileumsfund for its generous support of the MOVEOUT network and its activities, especially the workshop held at Uppsala University in September 2012. We would also like to thank the reviews of this volume for their valuable feedback and the editing and proof-reading team at the Cambridge University Press

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-11680-1 - The Consequences of Social Movements

Edited by Lorenzo Bosi, Marco Giugni and Katrin Uba

Excerpt

[More information](#)

4 / Lorenzo Bosi, Marco Giugni, and Katrin Uba

protest was mainly regarded as an irrational action with no instrumental goals (Buechler 2004). Since then, also thanks to some pioneering works (Gamson 1990; Piven and Cloward 1979; Schumaker 1975), a new research field emerged slowly and allowed one of the present authors to note as late as in 1998 that “we still lack systematic empirical analyses that would add to our knowledge of the conditions under which movements produce certain effects” (Giugni 1998: 373). The field was revamped, amongst other things, also thanks to two edited collections entirely devoted to the study of different kinds of the effects of social movements (Giugni et al. 1998, 1999). This sudden focus on social movement outcomes could be related not only to the wave of democratization in the Eastern Europe and Latin America in the 1990s, but also to the fact that sufficient time had passed from the mobilization of the 1968 generation in Western Europe and civil rights mobilization in the United States. While research on social movements can study ongoing events, research on their outcomes has to wait for some changes to take place before being able to inquire into their causes. Even if the immediate political outcomes of Colored Revolutions or the Occupy movement seem self-evident, to find out about the broader cultural outcomes of such recent events one has to wait for a longer time.

Since the late 1990s, a wealth of studies have improved our knowledge of how collective mobilizations and protest activities may bring about social and political change. Scholarship has in particular focused on three broad types of outcomes. First, scholars interested in the personal and biographical consequences of social movements have studied “effects on the life-course of individuals who have participated in movement activities, effects that are at least in part due to involvement in those activities” (Giugni 2008: 1588–1589, see Giugni 2004a for a review). Second, cultural change or changes in the social norms and behaviors in which political actors operate, have been studied the least (see review in Earl 2004). The third, political change, or those effects of movement activities that alter in some way the movements’ political environment, have been studied most often (see reviews in Amenta and Caren 2004; Amenta et al. 2010; Burstein and Linton 2002; Giugni 1998, 2008; Uba 2009). Research on the biographical, cultural, and political outcomes of social movements has provided a number of important insights into the conditions and processes through which movements succeed or fail. At the same time, however, there remain a number of silences that must be voiced. This book expressly addresses such silences. It challenges conventional studies of the consequences of social movements by covering issues on which there has been little or no research at all.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-11680-1 - The Consequences of Social Movements

Edited by Lorenzo Bosi, Marco Giugni and Katrin Uba

Excerpt

[More information](#)

5 / The consequences of social movements

The volume covers such issues as the impact of social movements on the life-course of movement participants and the population in general (Part I: People), on political elites and markets (Part II: Policies), and on political parties and processes of social movement institutionalization (Part III: Institutions). We believe this volume makes a significant contribution to research on social movement outcomes by achieving three aims: (1) *theoretically*, by showing the importance of hitherto undervalued topics in the study of social movements outcomes; (2) *methodologically*, by expanding the scientific boundaries of this research field through an interdisciplinary approach and new methods of analysis; and (3) *substantially*, by providing new empirical evidence about social movement outcomes from Europe and the United States, such as mobilization for ethical fashion, protest against school-closures, institutionalization processes in deeply divided societies, and effects on activists of far-right and LGBT movements.

In the remainder of this chapter we introduce the contributions included in the volume. In doing this, we point to theoretical, methodological, and substantial developments made by scholarly work on each of the three issues mentioned above, on the one hand, and to remaining blind spots on all three counts, on the other. We conclude with some directions for future research.

People

Previous work on social movements and personal change

People might change for a variety of reasons over their lifetime: because they go to school, because they go through the army, because they find a partner (or split up from one), because they find a job (or lose a job), have children, move from where they live (neighborhood, city, country), because they meet new friends, because they go through particular transformative events. And among other reasons, people might change in part due to their involvement in social movement activities. This type of personal change is what interests us in this section. If contentious politics scholars have spent quite an amount of energy trying to explain why, when, and how people join social movements activities – with competing analytical approaches – it is also true that the post-movement lives of former activists have received some attention (see Giugni 2004a for a review).

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-11680-1 - The Consequences of Social Movements

Edited by Lorenzo Bosi, Marco Giugni and Katrin Uba

Excerpt

[More information](#)

6 / Lorenzo Bosi, Marco Giugni, and Katrin Uba

Scholars focusing on the long-term biographical impact of movement participation have suggested through their empirical works, mainly concerning highly committed activists within the New Left in the United States, that activists in their post-movement lives tend to continue to espouse political attitudes close to those they embraced during their mobilization, and to show a high level of socio-political commitment and to pursue different lifestyles (jobs and structure of families) in concert with their beliefs (Fendrich 1993; McAdam 1988; Jennings 1987; Taylor and Raeburn 1995; Whalen and Flacks 1989; Wilhelm 1998; Whittier 1995). Further studies examining participation in other types of movements (Klatch 1999), less committed activists (Sherkat and Blocker 1997), and movements embracing political violence (Kampwirth 2004; Viterna 2013) have shown similar results, confirming that participation in social movements has long-term powerful and enduring effects on the political and personal lives of those who have been involved.

A more recent trend in the literature, rarely mentioned in relation to biographical outcomes, examines “institutional activists” (Grodsky 2012; Pettinicchio 2012; Santoro and McGuire 1997), also labeled “inside agitators” (Eisenstein 1996), “insider activists” (Banaszak 2010), “unobtrusive activists” (Katzenstein 1998), and “activists in office” (Watts 2006). Following this literature, past participation in social movements might continue to influence political action inside the institutions (Kim et al. 2013). In pursuing the movement’s goals through conventional bureaucratic channels, “institutional activists” show their long-term commitment to the cause. For example, in the period spanning from the Kennedy to the Clinton administration, women’s commitment to the feminist cause in the United States “creat[ed] concrete policy changes that altered the social landscape” of the country (Banaszak 2010: 4). Similar processes occurred in the north of Europe when environmentalists went into the political institutions through green parties (Rootes 2004).

In the case of regime changes, the impact of “institutional activists” is even clearer (Bosi, Chapter 14; Della Porta, forthcoming). Furthermore, activists retaining their commitments in their post-movement lives can also continue to participate politically and join new movements during their life-course. In doing so, they are “direct routes” in the spillover effect of frames, discourses, tactics, organizational structure, and identities occurring among different movements across time (Meyer and Whittier 1994; Whittier 2004).

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-11680-1 - The Consequences of Social Movements

Edited by Lorenzo Bosi, Marco Giugni and Katrin Uba

Excerpt

[More information](#)

7 / The consequences of social movements

In transforming individuals, social movements may also engender broad processes of social change. Social movement scholars have investigated, even if to a lesser extent, the aggregate-level change in life-course patterns, where social movements activism has much broader social and cultural consequences on society at large behind former social movement activists (McAdam 1999; Wilhelm 1998). Alternative lifestyle patterns, stripped of their original political or counter-cultural content, are diffused and adapted through socialization processes across new cohorts as new life-course norms in the long term. As Rochon notes, “the microfoundations of movement mobilization thus create new patterns of social thought and action, contributing to the breadth and pace of change in cultural values . . . The ripple effects of movement activism also have an impact on family, friends, and fellow members of a group” (1998: 162). The biographical consequences affect then not only those who were active participants in a cycle of protest, but also “many casual participants” (Polletta and Jasper 2001: 296).

Social movements are often presented in the literature as transforming their activists and societies in unintended ways. The category of unintended consequences has been attached to these types of outcomes because it has been said that social movements publicly claim policy changes. But social movements, through their everyday politics, publicly contest cultural values, opinions and beliefs with the aim of self-changing societies through “educating as well as mobilizing activists, and thereby promoting ongoing awareness and action that extends beyond the boundaries of one movement or campaign” (Meyer 2003: 35).

The chapters in Part I of the book

The five chapters that form Part I of this volume extend beyond existing research on biographical outcomes at the empirical, methodological, and analytical levels. Unlike the bulk of the literature on social movement outcomes, which is primarily interested in examining successful mobilizations, in Chapter 2, Karen Beckwith examines why social movement activists persist after experiences of loss. To address this question, the author examines two coalfield communities and women’s activist experience in the National Union of Mineworkers (NUM) strike against the National Coal Board in Britain in the 1984–85 period, and compares remobilization efforts in the same communities in the NUM’s 1992–94 anti-pit closure campaign. Testing competing explanations of

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-11680-1 - The Consequences of Social Movements

Edited by Lorenzo Bosi, Marco Giugni and Katrin Uba

Excerpt

[More information](#)

8 / Lorenzo Bosi, Marco Giugni, and Katrin Uba

political opportunity, political resources, and political learning, in her work Beckwith hypothesizes that the impact of loss upon future remobilization chances may be less dependent on the actual material circumstances of the actors or even on the issues involved than on the nature of the collective experience of the campaign. Former activists' experience in the course of a campaign – whether they have won or lost in the past – can lead to political learning that can instruct and inspire second attempts or lead to the decision to never try again.

In Chapter 3, Kathleen Blee uses extensive life history narratives with an innovative model that infers causal mechanisms from narrated counterfactual processes to understand, from the perspectives of activists themselves, the steps by which social movement involvement changes the lives of activists. In doing so, she draws on four fields of research in order to build her conceptual framework, the scholarships on narrative, on political imagination, on turning points, and on interpretive processes. Blee draws her empirical research from two right-wing women activists (a current member and a former activist of the US racist movement), analyzing their self-definitions before they entered the racist movement, their experiences of mobilization and participating in a racial movement, and their assessments of how they were affected by such activism.

In Chapter 4, Marco Giugni and Maria Grasso test the relationship between engagements in social movement activities, measured through participation in demonstrations, and the subsequent political life of participants (i.e., political interest, self-positioning on the left-right scale, voting for the left, membership in environmental organizations, and party membership). They use panel data on Switzerland to inquire whether low-degree engagement in social movement activities also has the strong impact observed by previous work on strongly committed activists. They find that previous participation in demonstrations in Switzerland significantly affected the participants' political attitudes and behaviors in the long term, namely fifteen years later. Their findings suggest that the results found on New Left activists in the United States are broadly generalizable to other countries, other cohorts, non-New Left activism, and lower levels of involvement.

In Chapter 5, Camille Maslet examines the unexplored topic of the intergenerational influence of social movements by looking at the specific case of feminist activists and their children. The analysis is based on a case study of women who took part in the French Women's

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-11680-1 - The Consequences of Social Movements

Edited by Lorenzo Bosi, Marco Giugni and Katrin Uba

Excerpt

[More information](#)

9 / The consequences of social movements

Liberation Movement in the 1970s and their offspring. Drawing on the political socialization and biographical outcomes literatures, in her chapter Maslet focuses on two main aspects: first, the study of the second generation and the issue of family transmission can add to our understanding of the activists' careers and the long-term effects of activism on their lives; second, the content of the political inheritance of the activists' children. The analysis reveals the existence of effects of the feminist movement on the children's political socialization. This chapter suggests another way of looking at aggregate-level changes through the study of the children of former social movements activists.

Finally, in Chapter 6, Nancy Whittier analyses aggregate-level biographical outcomes of the LGBT movement in the United States (specifically the gay and lesbian movements), focusing on collective identity as a biographical outcome in the broader population, the impact of cultural and policy change on life-course outcomes, and generational/cohortal variations. Whittier focuses first on collective identity definition and diffusion as conditioned by cohort for both participants and non-participants. She then looks at how cultural and policy outcomes affect the life-course of the beneficiary constituency, LGBT people. She focuses on the following life-course outcomes: employment and earnings, couplehood and marriage, and parenting.

Avenues for future research on social movements and personal change

The five chapters in this part of the book introduce unresearched themes, alongside new methodological and analytical approaches, which we hope will be developed further in future research on social movements and personal change. Yet, a number of avenues for future research on social movements and personal change may be mentioned as well. First, it is necessary for future research to focus on the life-course patterns of movements' targets, in addition to movements' activists and participants. Here the literature on victims of armed groups can be particularly helpful, specifically as it entails the trauma experienced by victims in both the short term and the long term (Bosi and Giugni 2012).

Second, more attention should be placed on variation among different types of biographical outcomes (Stewart et al. 1998; Corrigan-Brown 2012; Viterna 2013; Blee, Chapter 3; Maslet, Chapter 5). Once we have established that participating in social movements has a lasting

10 / Lorenzo Bosi, Marco Giugni, and Katrin Uba

effect on individuals, we should investigate differences among those who participate as we have looked at such differences in the mobilization process, for example, on their level of involvement, closeness to the leadership or previous biographical characteristics, etc. Jocelyn Viterna suggests in her important work (2013) that the arena where an activist demobilizes determines his/her post-movement activist life.

Third, if it is true that research on biographical consequences has been mainly biased toward studying social movements and personal change in Western countries among progressive movements, we should broaden our knowledge by starting to look at biographical outcomes in “awkward” movements (Viterna 2013; Blee, Chapter 3) and in non-Western societies (Hasso 2001; Viterna 2013).

Finally, we need to recognize the structure–agency dynamic shaping participants’ post-movement lives (Bosi 2014), connecting biographical outcomes “to the historical contexts where they are developing” (Fillieule and Neveu 2014). If the literature on social movements has started progressively to move beyond the movement-centric approach explanations, this has not yet happened in the sub-field of research that examines biographical outcomes. Micro-level analyses are still very much concerned with how individual experience in social movements is fundamental for participants’ post-movement lives, so they lose the rest of the picture. The rest of the picture concerns in particular the determining power of the modern state within the political and social environment, which is able to produce the external factors and forces that channel and mitigate contentious politics and thus ultimately shapes the post-movement lives of activists (Bosi 2014). In order to do this, we need to re-locate our studies on personal change at the intersection of thematic focus on disengagement/transformation/outcomes. This means we ought to study biographical outcomes together with conflicts’ decline and post-conflict transformation of societies and institutions (Bosi 2014).

Policies

Previous work on social movements and policy change

Research on the consequences of social movement has long focused on political, and even more narrowly, policy outcomes, and still often does so (see Amenta and Caren 2004; Amenta et al. 2010 for reviews). Nearly