CONTENTS

Acknowledgements page xvi
Table of Cases xviii
Table of Legislation and Other Instruments xxiii
Abbreviations xlv

Introduction 1
1 Context 1
2 Motivations, Aims and Objectives 4
   2.1 External Dimension of EU Defence Procurement Regulation 5
   2.2 Legal Aspects of Defence Procurement in Comparative Perspective 6
   2.3 Legal Barriers to Transatlantic Defence Trade 10
3 Limitations of Analysis and Qualification of Scope 12
   3.1 Contract Formation not Contract Administration 12
   3.2 Hard Defence not Security or Dual Use 13
   3.3 USA and EU not NATO or Member States 13
   3.4 Legal Perspective Rather Than Political or Economic 15
   3.5 Limitations of Empirical Evidence 16
4 Chapters in Outline 17
5 Update 18

1 The Transatlantic Defence Market in the Context of Defence Trade Cooperation 20
   1 Introduction 20
   2 US and European Cooperation in Defence Trade 20
      2.1 Re-establishing a European Armaments Industry and NATO 21
      2.2 From European Defence Community to European Economic Community 23
      2.3 Cooperative Programmes Through NATO 26
      2.4 Reciprocal Defence Procurement 27
      2.5 Independent European Programme Group 29
      2.6 Free Acquisition Markets NATO-wide and Declaration of Principles 33
vi CONTENTS

2.7 Letter of Intent, OCCAR and EDA 38
2.8 Transatlantic Defence Industrial Cooperation 46
3 Demand-side Characteristics of the Transatlantic Defence Market 48
  3.1 Sovereignty 48
  3.2 Security 51
  3.3 Spending 52
4 Supply-side Characteristics of the Transatlantic Defence Market 54
  4.1 Structure of the Transatlantic Defence Market 55
  4.2 Transatlantic Defence Industry Integration 58
    4.2.1 Defence Industry Consolidation 58
    4.2.2 Defence Trade Flow 59
    4.2.3 Foreign Direct Investment and Foreign Market Presence 63
5 Public Procurement and Procurement Law as Barriers to Defence Trade 66
6 Conclusions 69

Part I

2 Sources of EU Defence Procurement Law 73
  1 Introduction 73
  2 Primary EU Law: Free Movement of Goods, Establishment and Services 74
  3 Limitations on Free Movement: Security Exceptions and Derogations 78
    3.1 General Features of Article 346 TFEU 79
    3.2 Public Security and Essential Security 81
    3.3 Form and Standard of Review 83
  4 Interpretations of Article 346 TFEU 85
    4.1 Member States 86
    4.2 General Court and Court of Justice of the EU 87
      4.2.1 Strict Interpretation But Lighter Touch Scrutiny 87
      4.2.2 Exports and Essential Security Interests 89
      4.2.3 Military use and Strict Justifications Under Procurement Directives 92
      4.2.4 Confidentiality Obligations in Relation to Third Countries 95
      4.2.5 Derogation to Avoid Dependence on Third Countries 97
    4.3 European Commission 99
    4.4 European Parliament 102
  5 Secondary EU Law: Directives Under the EU Defence Package 103
    5.1 Defence Directive 104
      5.1.1 Relative Scope 106
      5.1.2 Material and Personal Scope 107
5.1.3 Specifications, Performance Conditions, Security of Information and Supply 109
5.1.4 Procurement Methods 110
5.1.5 Publication, Time-limits, Information Content, Communication and Conduct 114
5.1.6 Subcontracting 114
5.1.7 Remedies 115
5.1.8 Article 346 TFEU 116
5.2 Intra-Community Transfers Directive 117
6 Conclusions 118

3 Excluded Contracts Under the Defence Directive and Cooperative Procurement 121
1 Introduction 121
2 Exclusion from the Directives But Subject to the Treaties 122
2.1 Compliance with EU Principles in Procurement 123
2.2 Member States' Rights and Obligations in Relation to Third Countries 124
2.3 Circumvention of the Defence Directive 125
3 International Agreements and Arrangements 129
3.1 General Scope 129
3.2 International Agreements and Arrangements 130
3.3 Specific Procedural Rules 131
4 International Organisations 133
4.1 General 134
4.2 International Organisations as Contracting Authorities 134
4.3 Exclusion of Exclusive and Mixed Membership Organisations 136
4.4 Purposes of the International Organisation 137
4.5 Contracts Awarded by a Member State 139
4.6 International Organisations as Public Authorities 139
4.7 EDA, OCCAR and NATO 140
4.7.1 European Defence Agency 140
4.7.2 Organisation for Joint Armament Cooperation 141
4.7.3 NATO Agencies 141
5 Cooperative Programmes Based on Research and Development 142
5.1 Personal Scope 144
5.2 Material Scope 144
5.3 R&D for a New Product and Later Phases of the Life Cycle 145
5.4 EU Oversight Through Notification 147
5.5 Defence Directive as a Catalyst for Cooperative Procurement 148
5.5.1 Cooperation to Avoid Compliance with the Defence Directive 148
## CONTENTS

5.5.2 Cooperative Procurement Remains Largely Unregulated 151

6 Conclusions 153

4 Third Country Modes of Participation in the EU Market for Defence Procurement 156

1 Introduction 156

2 Procurement Directives and Third Country Participation 157

2.1 EU and Member State Competences in Public and Defence Procurement 158

2.2 Third Country Provision in the Procurement Directives 160

2.3 Enabling Direct Third Country Contractor Participation 162

2.4 Factors Affecting Direct Third Country Contractor Participation 165

2.5 Treatment of Participating Third Country Contractors 168


3.1 Member States with Major Defence Capabilities 170

3.1.1 United Kingdom 170

3.1.2 France 172

3.1.3 Italy 174

3.1.4 Spain 175

3.1.5 Germany 176

3.2 Member States with Some or More Limited Capabilities 177

4 Differentiating other Modes of Third Country Access 179

4.1 EU Subsidiaries 180

4.2 Subcontractors 181

4.3 Products of Third Country Origin in Free Circulation 182

4.4 Teaming Arrangements 184

5 Third Country Relations in Defence Procurement 186

5.1 Equalisation of Conditions on Third Country Participation 186

5.2 Regulating Third Country Access and Treatment 187

6 Conclusions 191

5 The Defence Directive as a Barrier to Trade with the United States 193

1 Introduction 193

2 Technical Specifications 194

2.1 Emerging Practice in the Use of Technical Standards and Specifications 195

2.1.1 Standardisation Organisations 196

2.1.2 Use of Technical Specifications in Practice 197

2.2 Technical Specifications Under the Defence Directive 199

2.2.1 Order of Preference 200
2.2.2 Performance or Function 201
2.2.3 National Defence Standards 203
2.2.4 Equivalence and Interoperability 204

3 Security of Supply 204
3.1 Conceptualisation Under the Defence Directive 205
3.2 Content of Security of Supply Requirements Under the Defence Directive 208

4 Security of Supply and Third Country Export Controls 210
4.1 US Export Control Regulation: International Traffic in Arms Regulations 210
4.2 Security of Supply as a Disguised Market Access Barrier 213
4.2.1 Impact at the Prime or Lower Tiers of the Transatlantic Defence Market 214
4.2.2 Management of Security of Supply Risks 215
4.2.3 ITAR-free and the Defence Directives 216
4.2.4 ITAR as a Justification for Sole Source Procurement 220
4.3 Export Restriction Provisions Under the Defence Directive 224
4.3.1 Ability to Honour Export Obligations 225
4.3.2 Restrictions on Disclosure, Transfer and Use 228

5 Security of Supply and Supply Chain Organisation 229
5.1 Location and Organisation of the Supply Chain 229
5.2 Organisation and Location of Third Country Sources of Supply 230

6 Security of Supply and Guarantees in a Crisis 234
6.1 Guaranteeing Security of Supply 234
6.2 European Security of Supply Arrangements 236

7 Security of Information 240
7.1 General and Specific Provisions 240
7.2 Security of Information as a Disguised Market Access Barrier 242
7.3 EU Security of Information Arrangements 243

8 Conclusions 244

Part II
6 Sources of US Federal Defence Procurement Law 249
1 Introduction 249
2 Federal Statutory and Regulatory Law in the Field of Defence Procurement 250
2.1 Statutes 251
2.1.1 Armed Services Procurement Act 251
2.1.2 Competition in Contracting Act 251
2.1.2.1 Full and Open Competition 252
CONTENTS

2.1.2.2 Exclusion of Sources and Other Than Full and Open Competition 257
2.2 Regulatory Sources: Federal Acquisition Regulation and Supplements 259

3 Exercise and Oversight of the Procurement Function 260
3.1 Procurement by the Department of Defense and Military Departments 260
3.2 Executive and Legislative Oversight of Federal Procurement 262
  3.2.1 Executive Oversight 262
  3.2.2 Legislative Oversight 264
  3.2.3 Administrative and Judicial Oversight 265

4 Conclusions 268

7 Foreign Participation in Open Competition Under US Law 270
  1 Introduction 270
  2 Foreign Competition Rates in Department of Defense Procurement 271
    2.1 General Competition Rates 271
    2.2 Foreign Competition Rates 273
  3 Full and Open Competition Under US Law 276
    3.1 Full and Open Competition 277
    3.2 Discretionary Exclusion of Foreign Competition 277
      3.2.1 No Foreign Personnel Requirements 279
      3.2.2 Facility Security Clearance Requirements 280
      3.2.3 Time Limits Between Request for Proposal Release and Submission 281
    3.3 Technical Specifications 283
  4 Full and Open Competition “Case Study”: KC-X 284
    4.1 Background 285
    4.2 Bid Protest 287
    4.3 GAO Review from a Foreign Contractor Perspective 292
  5 Full and Open Competition After Exclusion of Sources 296
    5.1 Establishing or Maintaining Alternative Sources 297
      5.1.1 Increase or Maintain Competition and Likely Cost Reduction 297
      5.1.2 Interest of National Defence and Industrial Mobilisation 300
      5.1.3 Continuous Availability of a Reliance Source 301
    5.2 Small Business Set-Asides 302
      5.2.1 EU Small Business Set-Asides in Defence Procurement 304
      5.2.2 Subcontracting Under the Defence Directive 305
      5.2.3 Contract Performance Conditions and Social Considerations 307
5.2.4 EU Small and Medium-sized Enterprises and Subcontracting Policies 308
5.2.5 Transatlantic Reciprocity in Defence Procurement for Small Businesses 309
6 Conclusions 310
8 Non-competitive Procurement Under US Law 312
1 Introduction 312
2 Justifications and Approvals 313
3 Only One Responsible Source 316
3.1 Privately Developed Items and Reasons Connected with Exclusive Rights 317
3.2 Follow-on Contracts and Additional Deliveries 319
3.3 Framework Contracting 320
4 Maintenance of the Industrial Base 324
5 National Security 326
5.1 Class Justifications and Approvals 327
5.2 Competition Failures 328
5.3 National Security Exceptions Under US and EU Law 329
6 Unusual and Compelling Circumstances 331
7 Requirements of International Agreements 333
8 Necessary in the Public Interest 334
9 Conclusions 336
9 US Law on Foreign Acquisition 338
1 Introduction 338
2 Domestic Source Restrictions and Security of Supply 339
2.1 Buy American Act 340
2.1.1 Qualified and Non-qualified Countries Under the Buy American Act 343
2.2 Specialty and Rare Earth Metals 346
2.2.1 Waiver of Specialty Metals Restrictions for Qualifying Countries 346
2.2.2 Strategic Materials Critical to National Security 348
2.2.3 Conceptualising Security of Supply Under EU and US Law 350
2.2.3.1 Security and Economic Reasons 351
2.2.3.2 Protection of Critical Materials Within the EU 353
2.2.3.3 Security of Supply Guarantees 354
3 Trade Agreements and Other International Agreements 355
3.1 Government Procurement Agreement 355
3.2 NATO Cooperative Projects 356
4 Reciprocal Defence Procurement Memoranda of Understanding 357
CONTENTS

4.1 Context 358
  4.1.1 Procurement Focus is not Exclusive 358
  4.1.2 European and NATO Membership is not Exclusive 359
  4.1.3 Uncertainty as to the Effects of the RDPs in Practice 361
4.2 Main Provisions 364
  4.2.1 Material and Personal Scope 364
  4.2.2 Principles Governing Reciprocal Defence Purchasing 364
  4.2.3 Regular Discussion of Adverse Effects of Offsets and Other Policies 365
4.3 Implementing Procedures: Procurement 365
  4.3.1 General Procedures 365
    4.3.1.1 Obtaining Information About Possible Procurement 365
    4.3.1.2 Full and Equitable Consideration of all Qualified Sources 366
    4.3.1.3 Satisfaction of Requirements 367
    4.3.1.4 Offers Evaluated Without Application of "Buy National" Laws 367
    4.3.1.5 No Substantive Authorisation to Export Defence Items 367
  4.3.2 Procurement Procedures 368
    4.3.2.1 Publication of Contract Notices in a Generally Available Periodical 368
    4.3.2.2 Content of Invitations to Tender 368
    4.3.2.3 Publication of Invitations to Tender in Adequate Time 369
    4.3.2.4 Absence of a Distinct Set of Rules Specifically Concerning Award 369
    4.3.2.5 Notification of Outcome 370
    4.3.2.6 Reasons for Non-award 370
    4.3.2.7 Review and Dispute Settlement 371
5 US–UK Defence Trade Cooperation Treaty 373
  5.1 Personal and Material Scope 374
  5.2 No Export or Transfer Licence for Eligible Items 376
  5.3 Oversight and Review 377
6 Conclusions 378
10 Government-to-Government Contracts and Offsets 381
  1 Introduction 381
  2 Government-to-Government Sales and Offsets in Transatlantic Defence Trade 382
    2.1 Government-to-Government Contracts 382
    2.2 Offsets 384
    2.3 Significance in the Context of Transatlantic Defence Trade 387
  3 Government-to-Government Sales Under US and EU Law 392
CONTENTS

3.1 Foreign Military Sales Under US Law on Foreign Acquisition 392
3.2 Open Competition in US Foreign Military Sales 394
3.3 Sole Sourcing in US Foreign Military Sales 396
3.4 Government-to-Government Contracts Under the Defence Directive 403
  3.4.1 General Scope of the Exclusion 404
    3.4.1.1 Material Scope 405
    3.4.1.2 Personal Scope 406
  3.4.2 Provision on Procurement Underlying the Sale 407
  3.4.3 Third Country–EU Government Sales and Procurement from Third Countries 408
  3.4.4 EU–Third Country Government Sales 413
  3.4.5 Award of US Foreign Military Sales Without Recourse to the Exclusion 414
4 Offsets Under US and EU Law 415
  4.1 Offsets Under US Law on Foreign Acquisition 416
    4.1.1 Offsets Connected with Foreign Military Sales 416
    4.1.2 Statutory Obligations to Report Offsets 420
  4.2 Offsets Under EU Law 421
    4.2.1 Third Country Offset Provision 425
    4.2.2 Third Country Offset Receipt 426
    4.2.3 Offset Receipt in Government-to-Government Contracts 428
5 Conclusions 429

Part III

11 Regulating Defence Procurement in a Transatlantic Defence Market and Beyond: Plotting a Legal Discourse 435
  1 Introduction 435
  2 Short-term 437
    2.1 Constitutional Features Affecting Defence Procurement Legislation 438
    2.2 Legal Conditions Impacting Foreign Access 440
      2.2.1 Acquisition Planning 440
      2.2.2 Statutory Limitations on Competition 441
      2.2.3 Ad Hoc Developments Under National Law Addressing Foreign Participation 442
    2.3 Security of Supply Requirements 444
    2.4 Security Exceptions 445
    2.5 Review and Remedies 446
  3 Medium-term 447
    3.1 EU Policy on Third Countries in Defence Procurement 447
## CONTENTS

3.2 Reciprocal Defence Procurement Memoranda of Understanding 450
  3.2.1 Bilateral Approach to Meeting Transatlantic Defence Trade Objectives 451
  3.2.2 Scope 452
  3.2.3 Procedural Requirements 452
    3.2.3.1 Conditions for Participation 453
    3.2.3.2 Justifications for Limited Tendering Procedures 453
  3.2.4 Buy American Act Waiver 454
  3.2.5 National Security and Other Exceptions 454
  3.2.6 Offsets and *Juste Retour* 456
  3.2.7 Dispute Settlement 457

3.3 US–EU Government-to-Government and Offsets Legal Dialogue 459
  3.3.1 Offsets are Economically Efficient and Should be Legally Prohibited 459
  3.3.2 The USA and the EU have Explicitly Called for a US–EU Dialogue 462

4 Long-term 463
  4.1 Extending Bilateral Defence Trade Treaties on a Transatlantic Basis 464
  4.2 Transatlantic Defence General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 466
    4.2.1 Rationale 467
    4.2.2 Code of Conduct 468
      4.2.2.1 Non-discrimination and Transparency in Contract Procedures 469
      4.2.2.2 Publication of Contract Notices through a NATO-wide Portal 469
      4.2.2.3 Scope of Equipment Covered and Financial Thresholds 470
      4.2.2.4 Open Tendering Subject to Exceptions 470
      4.2.2.5 Harmonisation of Procedural Rules for Contract Award 470
      4.2.2.6 Notification and Debrief 471
      4.2.2.7 *Juste Retour* 471
    4.2.3 NATO Defence General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 472
    4.2.4 Abandonment and Prospects for Reconsideration 473
      4.2.4.1 NATO Code of Conduct 473
      4.2.4.2 NATO Transatlantic Defence Trade Treaty 475
      4.2.4.3 Lost Opportunity to Examine Legal Obstacles to Transatlantic Trade 480
  4.3 Economic NATO: Transatlantic Trade and Investment Partnership 481
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1 Recent Background to the TTIP Negotiations</td>
<td>481</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2 Initial Inclusion of Defence Procurement Within TTIP</td>
<td>482</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3 Long-term Structures for Coordinating EU and US Defence</td>
<td>486</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.4 Towards a Defence TTIP</td>
<td>487</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.5 Defence Procurement and Global Trade Liberalisation</td>
<td>491</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Conclusions</td>
<td>493</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Index** 498