

#### The Cambridge Handbook of the Capability Approach

This landmark handbook collects in a single volume the current state of research on the capability approach. It includes a comprehensive introduction to the approach, as well as new research from leading scholars in this increasingly influential multidisciplinary field, including the pioneers of capability research, Martha Nussbaum and Amartya Sen. Incorporating both approachable introductory chapters and more in-depth analysis relating to the central philosophical, conceptual and theoretical issues of capability research, this handbook also includes analytical and measurement tools, as well as policy approaches which have emerged in the recent literature. The handbook will be an invaluable resource for students coming to the capability approach for the first time, as well as for researchers engaged in advanced research in a wide range of disciplines, including development studies, economics, gender studies, political science and political philosophy.

ENRICA CHIAPPERO-MARTINETTI is Full Professor of Economic Policy at the University of Pavia. She teaches economics, sustainable development, and development economics and cooperation, at undergraduate and graduate levels. She has acted as Vice-President of the Human Development and Capability Association and currently serves that Association as editor of the *Journal of Human Development and Capabilities*.

SIDDIQUR OSMANI is Professor of Development Economics in the Department of Accounting, Finance and Economics at Ulster University. He has published widely on issues related to poverty, inequality, hunger, famine, nutrition, microcredit, the rights-based approach to development and development problems in general. He has been an editor of the *Journal of Human Development and Capabilities* and has served on the editorial board of a number of development-related journals.



MOZAFFAR QIZILBASH is Honorary Professor in the Departments of Economics and Philosophy at the University of York. He has published in journals in the fields of economics, philosophy and development studies. He has acted as Editor-at-Large as well as Vice-President of the Human Development and Capability Association, and as an editor of the *Journal of Human Development*.



# The Cambridge Handbook of the Capability Approach

Edited by

Enrica Chiappero-Martinetti University of Pavia

Siddiqur Osmani Ulster University

Mozaffar Qizilbash University of York





#### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107115286 DOI: 10.1017/9781316335741

© Cambridge University Press 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ Books Limited, Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-11528-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



In Memory of Tony Atkinson





## **Contents**

	List of Figures	page xi
	List of Tables	xii
	List of Contributors	xiii
	Foreword	xvii
	AMARTYA SEN	
	Acknowledgements	xix
	General Introduction	1
	ENRICA CHIAPPERO-MARTINETTI, SIDDIQUR OSMANI	
	AND MOZAFFAR QIZILBASH	
	Part I Historical Antecedents and Philosophical Debates	5
	Introduction to Part I MOZAFFAR QIZILBASH	6
1	The Capabilities Approach and the History of Philosophy MARTHA C. NUSSBAUM	13
2	Karl Marx and the Capabilities Approach DAVID LEOPOLD	40
3	Utility and Capability: J. S. Mill and Amartya Sen L. W. SUMNER	59
4	Intellectual History and Defending the Capabilities Approach D. WEINSTEIN	76
5	Sen, Smith and the Cambridge Tradition LUIGINO BRUNI	92
6	The Capability Approach to Well-Being and Freedom from the Viewpoint of Welfare Economics and Social Choice Theory  KOTARO SUZUMURA†	106



.,;;;

V111	CONTENTS

7	Resources or Capabilities?: An Introduction to the Debate ILSE OOSTERLAKEN	126
8	Taking Multidimensionality Seriously: Capabilities, Rawls's Primary Goods and Guiding Action HENRY S. RICHARDSON	146
9	The Capabilities Approach and Political Liberalism RICHARD ARNESON	165
10	Selecting a List: The Capability Approach's Achilles Heel RUTGER CLAASSEN	188
11	Individualism and the Capability Approach: The Role of Collectivities in Expanding Human Capabilities SOLAVA IBRAHIM	200
12	The Politics of Wonder: The Capabilities Approach in the Context of Mass Extinction  JEREMY BENDIK-KEYMER	227
	Part II Methods, Measurement and Empirical Evidence	245
	Introduction to Part II ENRICA CHIAPPERO-MARTINETTI	246
13	Social Choice and the Capability Approach MAURICE SALLES	253
14	On Capability and its Measurement PRASANTA K. PATTANAIK AND YONGSHENG XU	271
15	Analyzing Capabilities: Games, Groups and Effectivity MARTIN VAN HEES	293
16	Implementing the Capability Approach with Respect for Individual Valuations: An Illustration with Colombian Data  KOEN DECANCQ, ERIK SCHOKKAERT AND BLANCA ZULUAGA	307
17	Capability, Opportunity, Outcome and Equality RAVI KANBUR	333
18	The Distribution of Capabilities: Up, Down, Sideways and Along TANIA BURCHARDT	347



		CONTENTS	ix
19	Inter-Group Disparities in the Distribution of Human Development: Two Apparent Conundrums and How We Might Address Them PETER J. LAMBERT AND S. SUBRAMANIAN	370	
20	Multidimensional Inequality and Human Development SUMAN SETH AND MARIA EMMA SANTOS	392	
21	The Research Agenda on Multidimensional Poverty Measurement: Important and as yet Unanswered Question SABINA ALKIRE	s 417	
22	Measuring Gender Inequality Using the Capability Approach: Issues and Challenges STEPHAN KLASEN	437	
23	Econometric and Statistical Models for Operationalizing the Capability Approach  JAYA KRISHNAKUMAR	453	
24	Expanding Capabilities through Participatory Action Research ALEJANDRA BONI AND ALEXANDRE APSAN FREDIANI	477	
	Part III Issues in Public Policy	497	
	Introduction to Part III SIDDIQUR OSMANI	498	
25	On Education and Capabilities Expansion MELANIE WALKER	505	
26	Capability Approach to Children's Well-Being and Well-Becoming MARIO BIGGERI	523	
27	Capability and Disability LORELLA TERZI	544	
28	Social Exclusion and Capability Development JONATHAN WOLFF	562	
29	Human Security DES GASPER	576	
30	Income Inequality and Human Capabilities ROLPH VAN DER HOEVEN	601	
31	The Capability Approach and Human Rights POLLY VIZARD	624	



x	CONTENTS	
	32 Capabilities and the Law KATHARINE GELBER	643
	33 Capabilities, Public Reason and Democratic Deliberation JAY DRYDYK	660
	34 Entitlements and Capabilities SANJAY G. REDDY AND ADEL DAOUD	677
	35 Religion and the Capability Approach séverine deneulin and augusto zampini-davies	686
	Index	706



# **Figures**

6.1	Informational tree of normative social evaluations	page 108
10.1	Criteria/methods for selecting basic capabilities	197
14.1	Illustration of theorem 3	287
16.1	Consequences of using common weights	313
16.2	Equivalent income with identical values (left) and different	
	values (right)	314
16.3	Distribution of income	320
16.4	Distribution of subjective well-being	321
16.5	Distribution of the SISBEN index	322
16.6	Distribution of the Colombian Multidimensional Poverty Index	323
16.7	Distribution of equivalent incomes	326
16.8	Overlap between the individuals identified as worst-off	327
18.1	The Equality Measurement Framework	349
18.2	Distribution of learning and of health functionings	362
19.1	A disparity curve	373
19.2	The disparity curve revisited	384
19.3	Flattening the disparity curve	386
23.1	Path diagram of an SEM	463
23.2	Parametric approach to anchoring	469
24.1	The PAR cube	482
24.2	The PARC cube	484
26.1	Capability approach framework and the concept of evolving	
	capabilities	531
30.1	Decomposing changes in the average adjusted labour income	
	share between the periods 1990-1994 and 2000-2004 in	
	(a) developed and (b) developing countries	610
30.2	Income inequality and globalization across the world, 1992-200	5 611
30.3	Gini indices of wealth and income distribution in selected	
	countries, mid-2000s	614
30.4	The degree of redistribution in the early 1990s by income group	616
30.5	The degree of redistribution in the late 2000s by income group	616
30.6	Changes in the distribution of primary, secondary and tertiary	
	income in various Latin American countries (around 2008)	618

хi



# **Tables**

7.1	Characteristics of the two main resourcists' theories	page 132
7.2	Characteristics of resourcism and capabilitarianism	139
16.1	Summary statistics	319
16.2	Life satisfaction regression	325
16.3	Pairwise rank correlation coefficients between the well-being	
	measures	327
16.4	Portrait of the worst-off	328
18.1	Autonomy: conceptual scheme	350
18.2	Distribution of learning and health functionings for the	
	hypothetical populations of Stretchstan and Equaliden	361
19.1	Group-related data on adult illiteracy rates: Bihar	
	and Kerala, 1981	376
19.2	Group-related data on infant mortality rates: Uttar Pradesh	
	and Kerala, 1981	377
19.3	Group-related data on poverty headcount ratios: Bihar	
	and Punjab, 1983	377
19.4	Hypothetical group data on child mortality and child survival	
	rates	380
19.5	Alternative inequality measures and their values	
	for the distributions in Table 19.4	382
20.1	Multidimensional inequality measures, relevant social evaluation	
	functions and the order of aggregation	407
22.1	Comparison of household and individual-based multidimensional	
	poverty indicators constructed using dual cut-off approach (k=33%)	<b>%</b> )
	by age-sex categories	447
24.1	Key characteristics of PAR	481
24.2	Core values of human development	483
24.3	Focus of research activities	486
30.1	Main drivers and various types of income distribution	604



#### **Contributors**

SABINA ALKIRE, Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative (OPHI), University of Oxford

RICHARD ARNESON, Distinguished Professor, Department of Philosophy, UC San Diego. Holder of Valtz Family Chair in Philosophy

JEREMY BENDIK-KEYMER, Beamer-Schneider Professor in Ethics and Associate Professor of Philosophy, Case Western Reserve University

MARIO BIGGERI, Associate Professor of Economics, University of Florence, and Scientific Director of the research centre ARCO (Action Research for CO-development)

ALEJANDRA BONI, Professor and Deputy Director, INGENIO, CSIC-Universitat Politècnica de València

LUIGINO BRUNI, Professor of Political Economy, LUMSA University, Rome

TANIA BURCHARDT, Director, Centre for Analysis of Social Exclusion, London School of Economics and Political Science

RUTGER CLAASSEN, Professor of Political Philosophy and Economic Ethics, Department of Philosophy & Religious Studies, Utrecht University

ADEL DAOUD, Bell Fellow, Center for Population and Development Studies, Harvard T. H. Chan School of Public Health, Harvard University

KOEN DECANCO, Centre for Social Policy, University of Antwerp

séverine deneulin, Associate Professor in International Development, University of Bath

JAY DRYDYK, Professor of Philosophy, Carleton University, Ottawa

ALEXANDRE APSAN FREDIANI, Principal researcher at the Human Settlements Research Group of the International Institute for Environment and Development (IIED)

xiii



xiv LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

DES GASPER, Professor (Emeritus) of Human Development, Development Ethics and Public Policy, International Institute of Social Studies (Erasmus University Rotterdam), The Hague

KATHARINE GELBER, Professor of Politics and Public Policy, School of Political Science and International Studies, University of Queensland

SOLAVA IBRAHIM, Senior Lecturer, Anglia Ruskin University, Affiliated Lecturer, Centre of Development Studies, University of Cambridge

RAVI KANBUR, T. H. Lee Professor of World Affairs, International Professor of Applied Economics and Management, Professor of Economics, Cornell University

STEPHAN KLASEN, Professor of Development Economics, University of Göttingen

JAYA KRISHNAKUMAR, Professor of Econometrics, University of Geneva

PETER J. LAMBERT, Department of Economics, University of Oregon

DAVID LEOPOLD, Associate Professor of Political Theory, University of Oxford, John Milton Fellow, Mansfield College, Oxford

MARTHA C. NUSSBAUM, Ernst Freund Distinguished Service Professor at the University of Chicago, appointed in the Law School and the Philosophy Department

ILSE OOSTERLAKEN, Postdoctoral researcher, Faculty of Humanities, Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam

PRASANTA K. PATTANAIK, Emeritus Professor of Economics, Department of Economics, University of California, Riverside

SANJAY G. REDDY, Associate Professor of Economics, The New School for Social Research, New York

HENRY S. RICHARDSON, Professor of Philosophy, Georgetown University

MAURICE SALLES, Professor of Economics Emeritus, CREM-CNRS and University of Caen-Normandy, Honorary Research Associate, CPNSS, London School of Economics, Murat Sertel Center for Advanced Economic Studies, Istanbul Bilgi University

MARIA EMMA SANTOS, Assistant Professor, Department of Economics, Universidad Nacional del Sur (UNS), Researcher of Instituto de Investigaciones Económicas y Sociales del Sur (IIESS), UNS-CONICET, Bahia Blanca, Argentina, Research Associate of Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative (OPHI), University of Oxford

ERIK SCHOKKAERT, Department of Economics, University of Leuven



LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

XV

SUMAN SETH, Lecturer, Economics Division, Leeds University Business School, University of Leeds, Research Associate, Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative (OPHI), University of Oxford

S. SUBRAMANIAN, Independent researcher (formerly National Fellow of the Indian Council of Social Science Research, Professor, Madras Institute of Development Studies)

L. W. SUMNER, University Professor Emeritus, Department of Philosophy, University of Toronto

KOTARO SUZUMURA<sup>†</sup>, formerly Professor Emeritus and Honorary Fellow, School of Political Science and Economics, Waseda University, Professor Emeritus, Institute of Economic Research, Hitotsubashi University, Member of the Japan Academy

LORELLA TERZI, Professor of the Philosophy of Education, School of Education, University of Roehampton, London

ROLPH VAN DER HOEVEN, Professor (Emeritus), Employment and Development Economics, International Institute of Social Studies (ISS) at Erasmus University (EUR), The Hague

MARTIN VAN HEES, Professor of Ethics, Department of Philosophy, VU Amsterdam

POLLY VIZARD, Associate Professorial Research Fellow and Associate Director, Centre for Analysis of Social Exclusion, London School of Economics

MELANIE WALKER, South African Research Chair in Higher Education and Human Development and Distinguished Professor at the University of the Free State

D. WEINSTEIN, Professor Emeritus, Wake Forest University, Honorary Professor, Institut für Philosophie, University of Oldenburg

JONATHAN WOLFF, Alfred Landecker Professor of Values and Public Policy, Blavatnik Professor of Public Policy, Blavatnik School of Government, University of Oxford

YONGSHENG XU, Professor of Economics, Department of Economics, Andrew Young School of Policy Studies, Georgia State University

AUGUSTO ZAMPINI-DAVIES, Director of Development and Faith, Vatican Dicastery for Promoting Integral Human Development

BLANCA ZULUAGA, Department of Economics, Icesi University





### **Foreword**

#### Amartya Sen

I am honoured to be asked to write a foreword to this extremely interesting Handbook, which can be seen – and admired – from many different perspectives. It is, at one level, a celebratory product, reflecting the fact that there is a good deal to applaud in the excellent work that has been done over the last four decades by a group of highly talented and innovative researchers on the reach and use of the capability approach. Each chapter has interesting things to say, while also reporting on the work that has been going on in this new – and very active – field.

If there are doubts about the sufficiency of the capability perspective in understanding the nature and contents of human welfare (I must confess that I do share some of the doubts about sufficiency as opposed to necessity), it is hard to deny the need for the capability perspective in making sense of our well-being and the importance of human freedom. The enormous contributions made by the capability perspective towards the discernment of human well-being and freedom have been well brought out by the papers in this Handbook. To appreciate their importance we do not need to champion any conviction that there is absolutely nothing more to say. The capability approach is a contribution to our understanding, not an attempt to annihilate all other insights that might come from elsewhere.

If celebration is a part of what the Handbook presents, what it offers as a guide and as a reference book is surely another. The nature, contents and relevance of different kinds of capabilities and their integration constitute a vast field of research, and it is very useful to have a monograph that can help the reader to understand the underlying ideas behind particular concerns (including providing references to writings on those ideas).

If these are uncomplicated contributions of the Handbook, we surely have reason to be interested in less simple virtues as well. To note a disagreement is not just the knowledge that there is an absence of an agreed position, it is also an opportunity to understand the respective reasoning behind conflicting positions that can be held on a particular question. Disagreements are important not merely because, as Publilius Syrus noted in conflict-ridden Rome in the first century BC, 'Agreement is made more precious by disagreement', but also because the survival of differing views can sometimes present alternative perspectives that may each offer some durable understanding of a complex issue.

For example, an insistence on a unique, canonical list of capabilities may be useful (for example, it can help in the fight for certain specific human rights,

xvii



xviii

FOREWORD

ignoring other claims), and yet reserving certain choices for democratic decision (for example, in choosing priorities in policy-making) can give voice to all (even to the least advantaged), with reflective participation being seen as having importance of its own. The Handbook contains many examples of productive disagreement. It is important to appreciate that the persistence of disagreement is not just a reflection of the fact that the capability approach is a new field of research that calls for more work (that too, but not just that); it may indicate much more, for example the fact that the continuation of divergent resolutions may be entirely reasonable in a valuational subject – old and new.

I can also point to some other contributions that the Handbook makes, including identifying the need for more research in some established fields, as well as pointing to the case for opening up new areas of investigation which deserve to be brought into the enterprise of knowledge (to borrow a telling description from Isaac Levi). As we read the highly informative contributions included in the Handbook, we cannot miss the fact that some of the areas of capability research are splendidly incomplete. The Handbook is, thus, both a report on past work and an invitation to do fresh things, and that surely is also something to celebrate.



## Acknowledgements

For extraordinarily helpful editorial work and support, efficiency, patience and commitment, we express our enormous gratitude to Sara Benjamin. While we are grateful to all the authors for their contributions, we would especially like to express our gratitude to Professor Stephan Klasen and to the late Professor Kotaro Suzumura for completing their contributions in exemplary fashion in spite of the challenges they faced in the later stages of this project. For helpful advice, we thank David Clark and Roger Crisp. Ian Carter and Ingrid Robeyns provided extremely helpful editorial guidance throughout the project, and we thank them for this. We also express our gratitude to Martha Nussbaum and Amartya Sen, who have been very generous in their guidance, support and enthusiasm from the inception of this project. We thank our editor at Cambridge University Press, Phil Good, for very helpful and thoughtful advice throughout this project. We also thank Adam Hooper, Tobias Ginsberg, James Gregory and Karen Oakes at Cambridge University Press. Finally, for their support and patience throughout the long gestation of this project, we thank our families.

For their helpful and careful work, we also thank all those who commented on the submissions to this volume (aside from the editors who also played the role of commentators for some of the papers):

Paul Anand
Prathivadi Bhayankaram (P. B.) Anand
Elizabeth Anderson
Jessica Begon
Constanze Binder
Alejandra Boni
Stephanie Bridges
Ian Carter
Clare Chambers
Rutger Claassen
Conchita D'Ambrosio
Koen Decancq
Maria Dimova-Cookson
Jean Drèze

xix



XX ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Lucio Esposito

Shailaja Fennell

Alexandre Apsan Frediani

Sakiko Fukuda-Parr

Reiko Gotoh

Lori Keleher

Erin Kelly

Serene Khader

Jeni Klugman

Maria Ana Lugo

Gay Meeks

Sophie Mitra

Zina Nimeh

Prasanta Pattanaik

Eugenio Peluso

Angela Pepper

Iñaki Permanyer Ugartemendia

Fabienne Peter

Henry Richardson

Maria Emma Santos

Sean Sayers

Francesco Scervini

Erik Schokkaert

Joshua W. Schulz

Stephanie Seguino

Amartya Sen

Frances Stewart

Robert Sugden

Lorella Terzi

Miriam Teschl

Martin van Hees

Thomas Wells

Merridy Wilson-Strydom

Jonathan Wolff

Yongsheng Xu







School of Athens by Raphael - stock illustration. Engraved illustrations of Italian Painting of the Renaissance from Iconographic Encyclopaedia of Science, Literature and Art, Published in 1851. Copyright has expired on this artwork. Digitally restored. bauhaus1000 / DigitalVision Vectors / Getty Images.