

PHYLOGENETIC INFERENCE, SELECTION THEORY,
AND HISTORY OF SCIENCE

Selected Papers of A.W.F. Edwards with Commentaries

A. W. F. Edwards is one of the most influential mathematical geneticists in the history of the discipline. One of the last students of R. A. Fisher, Edwards pioneered the statistical analysis of phylogeny in collaboration with L. L. Cavalli-Sforza, and helped establish Fisher's concept of likelihood as a standard of statistical and scientific inference. In this book, edited by philosopher of science Rasmus Grønfeldt Winther, Edwards's key papers are assembled alongside commentaries by leading scientists, discussing Edwards's influence on their own research and on thinking in their field overall. In an extensive set of interviews with Winther, Edwards offers his thoughts on his contributions, their legacy, and the context in which they emerged. This book is a resource both for anyone interested in the history and philosophy of genetics, statistics, and science, and for scientists seeking to develop new algorithmic and statistical methods for understanding the genetic relationships between and among species both extant and extinct.

A. W. F. EDWARDS, F.R.S., is a Fellow of Gonville and Caius College, Cambridge. In addition to some 250 scientific papers on a wide range of topics, he has published four books including *Likelihood* and *Foundations of Mathematical Genetics*, both with Cambridge University Press. Edwards has been interested in the history and philosophy of science for as long as he has been a contributor to science.

RASMUS GRØNFELDT WINTER is a philosopher of science, researcher, writer, educator, diver, seeker, and explorer. www.rgwinther.com

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-11172-1 — Phylogenetic Inference, Selection Theory, and History of Science

Edited by Rasmus Grønfeldt Winther

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)



PHYLOGENETIC INFERENCE,
SELECTION THEORY, AND HISTORY
OF SCIENCE

Selected Papers of A.W.F. Edwards with Commentaries

Edited by

RASMUS GRØNFELDT WINTHER



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-11172-1 – Phylogenetic Inference, Selection Theory, and History of Science
 Edited by Rasmus Grønfeldt Winther
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107111721
 DOI: 10.1017/9781316276259

© Cambridge University Press 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Edwards, A. W. F. (Anthony William Fairbank), 1935– author. | Winther, Rasmus, editor.

Title: Phylogenetic inference, selection theory, and history of science : selected papers of A.W.F. Edwards, with commentaries / edited by Rasmus Grønfeldt Winther

Description: Cambridge : Cambridge University Press, 2018. | Includes index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017055938 | ISBN 9781107111721

Subjects: LCSH: Edwards, A. W. F. (Anthony William Fairbank), 1935– | Population genetics – Mathematical models. | Genetics – Mathematical models. | Cladistic analysis.

Classification: LCC QH438.4.M3 E376 2018 | DDC 577.8/8–dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2017055938>

ISBN 978-1-107-11172-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

P. ii Photo of A. W. F. Edwards © Joe Felsenstein.

Contents

<i>Selected Featured Papers of A. W. F. Edwards</i>	page ix
<i>Contributors</i>	xi
Introduction	1
RASMUS GRØNFELDT WINTHER	
Part 1: Selected Papers of A. W. F. Edwards	13
The reconstruction of evolution (with L. L. Cavalli-Sforza) (1963) [25]	15
Reconstruction of evolutionary trees (with L. L. Cavalli-Sforza) (1964) [27]	17
Analysis of human evolution under random genetic drift (with L. L. Cavalli-Sforza and I. Barrai) (1964) [28]	28
Analysis of human evolution (with L. L. Cavalli-Sforza) (1965) [29]	41
A method for cluster analysis (with L. L. Cavalli-Sforza) (1965) [30]	53
Studying human evolution by computer (1966) [32]	68
Estimation procedures for evolutionary branching processes (with L. L. Cavalli-Sforza) (1966) [35]	72
Fundamental Theorem of Natural Selection (1967) [36]	79
Phylogenetic analysis: models and estimation procedures (with L. L. Cavalli-Sforza) (1967) [37]	82
Statistical methods in scientific inference (1969) [42]	104
Estimation of the branch points of a branching diffusion process (1970) [46]	110
	v

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
Review of <i>Evolution and the Genetics of Populations</i> , Volume 2, by S. Wright (1971) [49]		131
Affinity as revealed by differences in gene frequencies (with L. L. Cavalli-Sforza) (1972) [53]		139
Likelihood (1972) [56]		151
The history of likelihood (1974) [60]		155
Are Mendel's results really too close? (1986) [96]		163
Probability and likelihood in genetic counselling (1989) [117]		182
The Fundamental Theorem of Natural Selection (1994) [140]		191
Assessing molecular phylogenies (1995) [141]		225
The origin and early development of the method of minimum evolution for the reconstruction of phylogenetic trees (1996) [146]		227
Darwin and Mendel united: the contributions of Fisher, Haldane and Wright up to 1932 (2001) [173]		241
Human genetic diversity: Lewontin's fallacy (2003) [192]		249
Parsimony and computers (2004) [197]		254
Statistical methods for evolutionary trees (2009) [225]		265
Mathematizing Darwin (2011) [227]		274
Robert Heath Lock and his textbook of genetics, 1906 (2013) [235]		285
R. A. Fisher's gene-centred view of evolution and the Fundamental Theorem of Natural Selection (2014) [238]		295
Analysing nature's experiment: Fisher's inductive theorem of natural selection (2016) [248]		309
Part 2: Commentaries		315
Anthony Edwards's Seminal Contributions to Phylogenetics, Likelihood, and Understanding R. A. Fisher and the History of Genetics WALTER BODMER		317
Anthony Edwards, Luca Cavalli-Sforza, and Phylogenies JOSEPH FELSENSTEIN		325

<i>Contents</i>		vii
The Historic Split and Merger of Gene Trees and Species Trees		334
RASMUS NIELSEN		
Likelihood and the Comparative Method in Evolutionary Biology		343
MARK PAGEL		
Likelihood Inference in Models for the Genetic Diversity of Populations		347
ELIZABETH THOMPSON		
A. W. F. Edwards and the Origin of Bayesian Phylogenetics		352
ZIHENG YANG		
A Conversation about Fisher (1930, 1958)		363
WARREN J. EWENS		
Edwards on Fisher's Fundamental Theorem of Natural Selection		371
SAMIR OKASHA		
A. W. F. Edwards, R. A. Fisher, and <i>The Genetical Theory of Natural Selection</i>		376
MAURIZIO ESPOSITO		
Reading and Misreading Fisher: Anthony Edwards and the History of Population Genetics		386
JEAN-BAPTISTE GRODWOHL		
Variance-Partitioning and Classification in Human Population Genetics		399
NOAH A. ROSENBERG		
Part 3: Interviews with A. W. F. Edwards		405
Day 1: Selection Theory		407
Selection Theory and Mathematical Population Genetics		407
'Human Genetic Diversity: Lewontin's Fallacy'		418
Day 2: Phylogenetic Inference		428
Statistics and Phylogenetic Inference		428
Human Genetics and Phylogenetic Inference		440
Connections between Phylogenetic Inference and Population Genetics		447
Day 3: Edwards and Fisher		452
Edwards's Biography		452
Fisher Revisited		457

viii	<i>Contents</i>	
Part 4: A. W. F. Edwards		461
A. W. F. Edwards: Curriculum Vitae		463
A. W. F. Edwards: Scientific Publications		465
<i>Appendix 1: A Geometric Interpretation of [192]</i>		483
AMIR NAJMI		
<i>Appendix 2: The Genetic Reification of “Race”: A Story of Two Mathematical Methods</i>		488
RASMUS GRØNFELDT WINTER		
<i>Appendix 3: ‘My Fisher’</i>		509
A. W. F. EDWARDS		
<i>Appendix 4: 1963 Antonio’s Theorem</i>		521
<i>Index</i>		522

Selected Featured Papers of A. W. F. Edwards

Note that the paper number refers to the complete publication list starting on page 465.

- [25] (1963) The reconstruction of evolution. (Abstract) *Heredity* 18, 553, and *Annals of Human Genetics* 27, 104–105. (With L. L. Cavalli-Sforza)
- [27] (1964) Reconstruction of evolutionary trees. In *Phenetic and Phylogenetic Classification*, eds. V. H. Heywood and J. McNeill, The Systematics Association Publication No. 6, London: The Systematics Association, 67–76. (With L. L. Cavalli-Sforza) Reprinted in *Cladistic Theory and Methodology*, eds. T. Duncan and T. F. Stuessy, New York: Van Nostrand Reinhold (1985).
- [28] (1964) Analysis of human evolution under random genetic drift. *Cold Spring Harbor Symposia on Quantitative Biology* 29, 9–20. (With L. L. Cavalli-Sforza and I. Barrai)
- [29] (1965) Analysis of human evolution. Proceedings of the 11th International Congress of Genetics, The Hague 1963. *Genetics Today* 3, 923–933. (With L. L. Cavalli-Sforza)
- [30] (1965) A method for cluster analysis. *Biometrics* 21, 362–375. (With L. L. Cavalli-Sforza)
- [32] (1966) Studying human evolution by computer. *New Scientist* (19th May) 30, 438–440. Reprinted in *Evolution*, ed. M. Ridley, Oxford: Oxford University Press (1997).
- [35] (1966) Estimation procedures for evolutionary branching processes. *Bulletin of the International Statistical Institute* (Proceedings of the 35th session) 41, 803–808. (With L. L. Cavalli-Sforza)
- [36] (1967) Fundamental Theorem of Natural Selection. *Nature* 215, 537–538.
- [37] (1967) Phylogenetic analysis: models and estimation procedures. *Evolution* 21, 550–570. (With L. L. Cavalli-Sforza) Also in *American Journal of Human Genetics*, Supplement 19, 233–257.

- [42] (1969) Statistical methods in scientific inference. *Nature* 222, 1233–1237.
- [46] (1970) Estimation of the branch points of a branching diffusion process. *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society B* 32, 155–174.
- [49] (1971) Review of *Evolution and the Genetics of Populations*, Volume 2, by S. Wright. *Heredity* 26, 332–338.
- [53] (1972) Affinity as revealed by differences in gene frequencies. In *The Assessment of Population Affinities in Man*, eds. J. S. Weiner and J. Huizinga, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 37–47. (With L. L. Cavalli-Sforza)
- [56] (1972) Likelihood. *Bulletin of the Institute of Mathematics and its Applications* 8, 329–331.
- [60] (1974) The history of likelihood. *International Statistical Review* 42, 9–15. Reprinted in *Likelihood* (expanded edition), Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press (1992).
- [96] (1986) Are Mendel's results really too close? *Biological Reviews* 61, 295–312.
- [117] (1989) Probability and likelihood in genetic counselling. *Clinical Genetics* 36, 209–216.
- [140] (1994) The Fundamental Theorem of Natural Selection. *Biological Reviews* 69, 443–474.
- [141] (1995) Assessing molecular phylogenies. *Science* 267, 253.
- [146] (1996) The origin and early development of the method of minimum evolution for the reconstruction of phylogenetic trees. *Systematic Biology* 45, 79–91.
- [173] (2001) Darwin and Mendel united: the contributions of Fisher, Haldane and Wright up to 1932. In *Encyclopedia of Genetics*, ed. E. C. R. Reeve, London: Fitzroy Dearborn, 77–83.
- [192] (2003) Human genetic diversity: Lewontin's fallacy. *BioEssays* 25, 798–801.
- [197] (2004) Parsimony and computers. In *Milestones in Systematics*, eds. D. M. Williams and P. L. Forey, The Systematics Association Special Volume, Series 67, Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press, 181–190.
- [225] (2009) Statistical methods for evolutionary trees. *Genetics* 183, 5–12.
- [227] (2011) Mathematizing Darwin. *Behavioral Ecology and Sociobiology* 65, 421–430.
- [235] (2013) Robert Heath Lock and his textbook of genetics, 1906. *Genetics* 194, 529–537.
- [238] (2014) R. A. Fisher's gene-centred view of evolution and the Fundamental Theorem of Natural Selection. *Biological Reviews* 89, 135–147.
- [248] (2016) Analysing nature's experiment: Fisher's inductive theorem of natural selection. *Theoretical Population Biology* 109, 1–5.

Contributors

Walter Bodmer, Weatherall Institute of Molecular Medicine, University of Oxford, UK

Maurizio Esposito, Department of Philosophy, University of Santiago, Chile

Warren J. Ewens, Departments of Biology and Statistics, University of Pennsylvania, PA, USA

Joseph Felsenstein, Departments of Genome Sciences and Biology, University of Washington, WA, USA

Jean-Baptiste Grodwohl, Department of History and Philosophy of Science, University of Cambridge, UK

Rasmus Nielsen, Departments of Integrative Biology and Statistics, University of California, Berkeley, CA, USA

Samir Okasha, Department of Philosophy, University of Bristol, UK

Mark Pagel, School of Biological Sciences, University of Reading, UK

Noah A. Rosenberg, Department of Biology, Stanford University, CA, USA

Elizabeth Thompson, Department of Statistics, University of Washington, WA, USA

Ziheng Yang, Department of Genetics, Evolution and Environment, University College London, UK

Dedicated to

Luigi Luca Cavalli-Sforza
Pioneer of phylogenetic inference

We are grateful to Ian Hacking for his wonderfully thoughtful contributions
on the history and philosophy of statistics and science.

Rasmus Grønfeldt Winther and A. W. F. Edwards