An Introduction to the Philosophy of Logic

Philosophy of logic is a fundamental part of philosophical study, and one which is increasingly recognized as being immensely important in relation to many issues in metaphysics, metametaphysics, epistemology, philosophy of mathematics, and philosophy of language. This textbook provides a comprehensive and accessible introduction to topics including the objectivity of logical inference rules and its relevance in discussions of epistemological relativism, the revived interest in logical pluralism, the question of logic’s metaphysical neutrality, and the demarcation between logic and mathematics. Chapters in the book cover the state of the art in contemporary philosophy of logic, and allow students to understand the philosophical relevance of these debates without having to contend with complex technical arguments. This will be a major new resource for students working on logic as well as for readers seeking a better understanding of philosophy of logic in its wider context.

Daniel Cohnitz is Professor of Theoretical Philosophy at Utrecht University. He has published widely on metaphilosophy, epistemology and the philosophy of language and logic.

Luis Estrada-González is an associate researcher at the Institute for Philosophical Research at the National Autonomous University of Mexico. His research focuses on logic and its philosophy.
An Introduction to the Philosophy of Logic

DANIEL COHNITZ
Utrecht University, the Netherlands

LUIS ESTRADA-GONZÁLEZ
National Autonomous University of Mexico
Contents

List of Figures  page vi
List of Tables     vii
Preface and Acknowledgements  viii

Introduction  1

1 The Nature and Tools of Logic  10
2 The Standard Story and Its Rivals  35
3 Is Second-Order Logic Proper Logic?  65
4 Logical Constants  88
5 The Metaphysics of Logic  113
6 The Epistemology of Logic  136
7 Logical Pluralism  162
8 Logic, Reasoning and Rationality  182
9 Beyond Truth-Preservation  203
10 The Place of Logic in Science  221

Bibliography  248
Index     261
Figures

6.1  The justification of modus ponens (Boghossian, 2000, 230)  page 155
6.2  The justification of modus ponens continued (Boghossian, 2000, 236)  156
10.1 Compositional semantics (adapted from Löbner, 2013)  223
10.2 Formal semantics (adapted from Löbner, 2013)  225
10.3 Wason Selection Task (from Stenning and van Lambalgen, 2008)  227
Tables

1.1 Logic as a non-pure theory page 14
1.2 Example of a typical truth-table for classical conjunction 24
2.1 What should a three-valued truth-table for the conditional look like? 55
6.1 Kleene table for the conditional 160
8.1 MacFarlane’s bridge principles (from MacFarlane, 2004) 189
10.1 Typical results for the Wason Selection Task (from Stenning and van Lambalgen, 2008, 46) 227
Preface and Acknowledgements

A lonely ship on the open ocean, as on the cover of this book, serves in several ways as metaphor in the philosophy of logic. Carnap, in his *The Logical Syntax of Language*, speaks of the “ship of logic” sailing on the “boundless ocean of unlimited possibilities” when introducing his pluralist conception of logic (Carnap, 1937), and Otto Neurath compared scientists in their attempts to revise their theories to “sailors who on the open sea must reconstruct their ship but are never able to start afresh from the bottom” (Neurath, 1973), a metaphor that is particularly apt when revisions of logic are concerned.

But the metaphor also holds in other ways. With the exception of Susan Haack’s classic *Philosophy of Logics* (Haack, 1978), the philosophy of logic is largely uncharted open waters with many areas still labelled ‘here be monsters’. We tried to provide a map for the fearless seafarer but we admit that we sometimes felt ourselves quite disoriented on this vast, deep ocean. We were glad that we could count on the help of various trawlers, shipmates, divers, pirates and other sailors whenever we felt lost. In alphabetical order, these were Francesco Berto, Rosalie Iemhoff, Annemarie Kalis, Johannes Korbmacher, Menno Lievers, Janneke van Lith, Niels van Miltenburg, Jesse Mulder, Carlo Nicolai, Juho Ritola, Marcus Rossberg, Erik Stei, Florian Gib Steinberger, Thomas Sturm, Albert Visser, the students of our course at the University of Tartu in 2013 and the research master students of Utrecht University in my course in 2016. When Luis wasn’t available for completing the final stage of the book, we were glad that Shay Logan was ready to step in. He helped with Chapters 1 and 9 and did almost all the work for Chapter 2. We are very grateful for his help.