

SHAKESPEARE SURVEY

68

Shakespeare, Origins and Originality

---

## ADVISORY BOARD

---

JONATHAN BATE  
 MARGRETA DE GRAZIA  
 JANETTE DILLON  
 MICHAEL DOBSON  
 ANDREW GURR  
 TON HOENSELAARS  
 ANDREAS HÖFELE  
 RUSSELL JACKSON  
 AKIKO KUSUNOKI

KATHLEEN E. MCLUSKIE  
 LENA COWEN ORLIN  
 SIMON PALFREY  
 RICHARD PROUDFOOT  
 EMMA SMITH  
 ANN THOMPSON  
 STANLEY WELLS  
 JOHN JOWETT

*Assistants to the Editor* ANDREW W. KLEIN AND HELEN OSBORNE

- |  |   |
|--|---|
| <p>(1) Shakespeare and his Stage<br/>           (2) Shakespearian Production<br/>           (3) The Man and the Writer<br/>           (4) Interpretation<br/>           (5) Textual Criticism<br/>           (6) The Histories<br/>           (7) Style and Language<br/>           (8) The Comedies<br/>           (9) <i>Hamlet</i><br/>           (10) The Roman Plays<br/>           (11) The Last Plays (with an index to <i>Surveys 1–10</i>)<br/>           (12) The Elizabethan Theatre<br/>           (13) <i>King Lear</i><br/>           (14) Shakespeare and his Contemporaries<br/>           (15) The Poems and Music<br/>           (16) Shakespeare in the Modern World<br/>           (17) Shakespeare in his Own Age<br/>           (18) Shakespeare Then Till Now<br/>           (19) <i>Macbeth</i><br/>           (20) Shakespearian and Other Tragedy<br/>           (21) <i>Othello</i> (with an index to <i>Surveys 11–20</i>)<br/>           (22) Aspects of Shakespearian Comedy<br/>           (23) Shakespeare's Language<br/>           (24) Shakespeare: Theatre Poet<br/>           (25) Shakespeare's Problem Plays<br/>           (26) Shakespeare's Jacobean Tragedies<br/>           (27) Shakespeare's Early Tragedies<br/>           (28) Shakespeare and the Ideas of his Time<br/>           (29) Shakespeare's Last Plays<br/>           (30) <i>Henry IV</i> to <i>Hamlet</i><br/>           (31) Shakespeare and the Classical World (with an index to <i>Surveys 21–30</i>)<br/>           (32) The Middle Comedies<br/>           (33) <i>King Lear</i><br/>           (34) Characterization in Shakespeare<br/>           (35) Shakespeare in the Nineteenth Century<br/>           (36) Shakespeare in the Twentieth Century</p> | <p>(37) Shakespeare's Earlier Comedies<br/>           (38) Shakespeare and History<br/>           (39) Shakespeare on Film and Television<br/>           (40) Current Approaches to Shakespeare through Language, Text and Theatre<br/>           (41) Shakespearian Stages and Staging (with an index to <i>Surveys 31–40</i>)<br/>           (42) Shakespeare and the Elizabethans<br/>           (43) <i>The Tempest</i> and After<br/>           (44) Shakespeare and Politics<br/>           (45) <i>Hamlet</i> and its Afterlife<br/>           (46) Shakespeare and Sexuality<br/>           (47) Playing Places for Shakespeare<br/>           (48) Shakespeare and Cultural Exchange<br/>           (49) <i>Romeo and Juliet</i> and its Afterlife<br/>           (50) Shakespeare and Language<br/>           (51) Shakespeare in the Eighteenth Century (with an index to <i>Surveys 41–50</i>)<br/>           (52) Shakespeare and the Globe<br/>           (53) Shakespeare and Narrative<br/>           (54) Shakespeare and Religions<br/>           (55) <i>King Lear</i> and its Afterlife<br/>           (56) Shakespeare and Comedy<br/>           (57) <i>Macbeth</i> and its Afterlife<br/>           (58) Writing About Shakespeare<br/>           (59) Editing Shakespeare<br/>           (60) Theatres for Shakespeare<br/>           (61) Shakespeare, Sound and Screen<br/> <i>Shakespeare Survey: A Sixty-Year Cumulative Index</i><br/>           (62) Close Encounters with Shakespeare's Text<br/>           (63) Shakespeare's English Histories and their Afterlives<br/>           (64) Shakespeare as Cultural Catalyst<br/>           (65) <i>A Midsummer Night's Dream</i><br/>           (66) Working with Shakespeare<br/>           (67) Shakespeare's Collaborative Work<br/>           (68) Shakespeare, Origins and Originality</p> |
|--|---|

Aspects of *Macbeth*

Aspects of *Othello*

Aspects of *Hamlet*

Aspects of *King Lear*

Aspects of Shakespeare's 'Problem Plays'

# SHAKESPEARE SURVEY

---

68

## Shakespeare, Origins and Originality

EDITED BY  
PETER HOLLAND



Cambridge University Press  
 978-1-107-10884-4 - Shakespeare Survey: 68 Shakespeare, Origins and Originality  
 Edited by Peter Holland  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

**CAMBRIDGE**  
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107108844](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107108844)

© Cambridge University Press 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data*

Shakespeare survey 68: volume 68 : Shakespeare, origins and originality / edited by Peter Holland.

pages cm. – (Shakespeare survey ; 68)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-10884-4 (hardback)

I. Shakespeare, William, 1564–1616 – Criticism and interpretation.

II. Holland, Peter, 1951– editor. III. Title: Shakespeare, origins and originality.

PR2976.S33843 2015

822.3'3 – dc23 2015012665

ISBN 978-1-107-10884-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## EDITOR'S NOTE

---

Volume 69, on 'Shakespeare and Rome' will be at press by the time this volume appears. The theme of Volume 70 will be 'Creating and Re-creating Shakespeare' and will consist only of papers given at the World Shakespeare Congress in 2016; the theme of Volume 71 will be 'Shakespeare and London'.

Submissions should be addressed to the Editor to arrive at the latest by 1 September 2017 for 71. Pressures on space are heavy and priority is given to articles related to the theme of a particular volume. Submissions may be made either as hard copy sent to the Editor at The Shakespeare Institute, Church Street, Stratford-upon-Avon CV37 6HP, or as an e-attachment to [pholland@nd.edu](mailto:pholland@nd.edu). All articles submitted are read by the Editor and at least one member of the Advisory Board, whose indispensable assistance the Editor gratefully acknowledges.

Unless otherwise indicated, Shakespeare quotations and references are keyed to *The Complete Works*, ed. Stanley Wells, Gary Taylor, John Jowett and William Montgomery, 2nd edition (Oxford, 2005).

Review copies should be addressed to the Editor as above. In attempting to survey the ever-increasing bulk of Shakespeare publications our reviewers inevitably have to exercise some selection. We are pleased to receive offprints of articles which help to draw our reviewers' attention to relevant material.

P.D.H.

## CONTRIBUTORS

---

ABDULHAMIT ARVAS, *Michigan State University*  
 CATHERINE BELSEY, *Swansea University*  
 BETTINA BOECKER, *University of Munich*  
 TOM CHEESMAN, *Swansea University*  
 JANET CLARE, *University of Hull*  
 NICHOLAS CRAWFORD, *University of Montevallo*  
 PÉTER DÁVIDHÁZI, *Institute of Literary Studies, Hungary*  
 MICHAEL DOBSON, *University of Birmingham*  
 MARGRETA DE GRAZIA, *University of Pennsylvania*  
 EWAN FERNIE, *University of Birmingham*  
 KATE FLAHERTY, *Australian National University*  
 LYNN FOREST-HILL, *University of Southampton*  
 ANDREW JAMES HARTLEY, *University of North Carolina, Charlotte*  
 JAMES HIRSH, *Georgia State University*  
 PETER HOLLAND, *University of Notre Dame*  
 RUSSELL JACKSON, *University of Birmingham*  
 FARAH KARIM-COOPER, *Shakespeare's Globe*  
 DAVID KATHMAN, *Independent Scholar*  
 PETER KIRWAN, *University of Nottingham*  
 BI-QI BEATRICE LEI, *National Taiwan University*  
 LAURIE MAGUIRE, *Magdalen College, Oxford*  
 JELENA MARELJ, *Queen's University, Kingston*  
 JEAN-CHRISTOPHE MAYER, *French National Centre for Scientific Research*  
 ALFREDO MICHEL MODENESSI, *Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México*  
 RUTH MORSE, *Université-Paris-Diderot*  
 ANDY MURPHY, *St Andrew's University*  
 JOHN V. NANCE, *Florida State University*  
 CAROL CHILLINGTON RUTTER, *University of Warwick*  
 CHARLOTTE SCOTT, *Goldsmiths, University of London*  
 ROBERT SHAUGHNESSY, *University of Kent*  
 JAMES SHAW, *Bodleian Libraries, University of Oxford*  
 JYOTSNA G. SINGH, *Michigan State University*  
 EMMA SMITH, *Hertford College, Oxford*  
 GARY TAYLOR, *Florida State University*  
 STANLEY WELLS, *Shakespeare Birthplace Trust*

## CONTENTS

---

<i>List of illustrations</i>	<i>page</i>
MARGRETA DE GRAZIA	Shakespeare's Anecdotal Character 1
LAURIE MAGUIRE AND EMMA SMITH	What is a Source? Or, How Shakespeare Read his Marlowe 15
GARY TAYLOR AND JOHN V. NANCE	Imitation or collaboration? Marlowe and the Early Shakespeare Canon 32
PÉTER DÁVIDHÁZI	'O Jephthah, judge of Israel': From Original to Accreted Meanings in Hamlet's Allusion 48
CATHERINE BELSEY	The Elephants' Graveyard Revisited: Shakespeare at Work in <i>Antony and Cleopatra</i> , <i>Romeo and Juliet</i> and <i>All's Well That Ends Well</i> 62
ALFREDO MICHEL MODENESSI	'Every like is not the same': Translating Shakespeare in Spanish Today 73
TOM CHEESMAN	Reading Originals by the Light of Translations 87
STANLEY WELLS	'My name is Will': Shakespeare's Sonnets and Autobiography 99
JANET CLARE	Tracings and Data in <i>The Tempest</i> : Author, World and Representation 109
FARAH KARIM-COOPER	Shakespearian Gesture: Narrative and Iconography 118
JAMES HIRSH	The Origin of the Late Renaissance Dramatic Convention of Self-Addressed Speech 131
JEAN-CHRISTOPHE MAYER	Reading in their Present: Early Readers and the Origins of Shakespearian Appropriation 146
RUTH MORSE	Shakespeare Out of Time (or, Hugo takes Dictation from the Beyond) 158
BI-QI BEATRICE LEI	Betrayal, Derail, or a Thin Veil: The Myth of Origin 168
JYOTSNA G. SINGH AND ABDULHAMIT ARVAS	Global Shakespeares, Affective Histories, Cultural Memories 183
PETER HOLLAND	Spinach and Tobacco: Making Shakespearian Unoriginals 197

## CONTENTS

ANDREW JAMES HARTLEY	Ren Fest Shakespeare: The Cosplay Bard	210
KATE FLAHERTY	'Dead as earth': Contemporary Topicality and Myths of Origin in <i>King Lear</i> and <i>The Shadow King</i>	221
MICHAEL DOBSON	Shakespeare and the Idea of National Theatres	234
DAVID KATHMAN	John Rice and the Boys of the Jacobean King's Men	247
ANDREW MURPHY	Shakespeare's Irish Lives: The Politics of Biography	267
BETTINA BOECKER	Shakespeare in Blockaded Berlin: The 1948 'Elizabethan Festival'	282
ROBERT SHAUGHNESSY	Connecting the Globe: Actors, Audience and Entrainment	294
EWAN FERNIE	'Freetown!': Shakespeare and Social Flourishing	306
NICHOLAS CRAWFORD	We'll Always Have Paris: The Third Household and the 'Bed of Death' in <i>Romeo and Juliet</i>	323
JELENA MARELJ	The 'serpent of old Nile': Cleopatra and the Pragmatics of Reported Speech	337
LYNN FOREST-HILL	'This insubstantial pageant faded': The Drama of Semiotic Anxiety in <i>The Tempest</i>	353
CAROL CHILLINGTON RUTTER	Shakespeare Performances in England 2014	368
JAMES SHAW	Professional Shakespeare Productions in the British Isles January-December 2013	408
The Year's Contribution to Shakespeare Studies		
1	Critical Studies <i>reviewed by</i> CHARLOTTE SCOTT	422
2	Shakespeare in Performance <i>reviewed by</i> RUSSELL JACKSON	438
3	Editions and Textual Studies <i>reviewed by</i> PETER KIRWAN	451
<i>Index to Volume 68</i>		463



## ILLUSTRATIONS

---

- |  |        |
|--|--------|
| 1. Gerard van der Gucht: Frontispiece to <i>The Works of Mr. William Shakspear</i> , ed. Nicholas Rowe (London, 1709). Folger Shakespeare Library.   | page 2 |
| 2. Guillaume Vallet, after Antoine Paillet: Frontispiece to <i>Oeuvres de Pierre Corneille</i> (Rouen, 1664). Private Collection/Bridgeman Images.   | 4      |
| 3. John Bulwer, <i>Chirologia</i> (1644), 959.a.14 (pp. 154–5) © The British Library Board.  | 119    |
| 4. Roman art: Ariadne Sleeping. © Vatican, Museo Pio-Clementino. Photo: Scala, Florence.   | 123    |
| 5. Harrowing of Hell (1240), Arundel 157 f.11 © The British Library Board.   | 128    |
| 6. Shiyuan and Princess Yulan discuss governing policies and defence strategies in <i>Betrayal</i> (Taipei, 2013) (courtesy of the Department of Chinese Drama, Chinese Culture University).   | 171    |
| 7. Wang Hai-ling as Xia Luo the Dashi moneylender in <i>Bond</i> (2009) (courtesy of Taiwan Bangzi Company).   | 174    |
| 8. ‘Dear Leader’ Mekhdekh with blood-stained hands in <i>Shakespeare Must Die</i> (2012).  | 178    |
| 9. Macbeth and Lady Macbeth conspiring, against the background of a large election campaign sign in <i>Macbeth: A Political Allegory</i> (2011). Photos by Manit Sriwanichpoom.  | 180    |
| 10. Haidar on left with street demonstrators. Screenshot, VB Films, <i>You Tube</i> Trailer.   | 188    |
| 11. Hamlet’s first appearance on stage. Screenshot from the Amsterdam premiere of the play, <i>You Tube</i> .  | 192    |
| 12. A scene of festivity set in Mir Hamlet’s court. Characters are dancing a Kurdish dance ( <i>Govend</i> ). Live musicians are present on the stage throughout the play, and Hamlet is in his Kurdish dress. Screenshot from the Amsterdam premiere of the play, <i>You Tube</i> .               | 193    |
| 13. Children as actors and their audience in the <i>King Lear</i> production at the vom Zaatari refugee camp for Syrian refugees in Jordan. Warrick Page for <i>The New York Times</i> . Screenshot, Slide Show <i>The New York Times</i> .  | 195    |
| 14. Nickel Shakespeare – Anna Gettles, Kacey Schedler, and Rebecca Blum – performing one of their ‘flippy’ scenes at the Carolina Renaissance Festival.  | 214    |
| 15. The Three Sisters. <a href="http://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Blue_mountains_-_three_sisters.jpg#mediaviewer/File:Blue_mountains_-_three_sisters.jpg">http://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Blue_mountains_-_three_sisters.jpg#mediaviewer/File:Blue_mountains_-_three_sisters.jpg</a> . | 223    |
| 16. Clockwise from left: Jada Alberts (Goneril), Tom E. Lewis (Lear), Natasha Wanganeen (Regan), Rarriwuy Hick (Cordelia). Photo: Jeff Busby, courtesy of Malthouse Theatre, Melbourne.  | 225    |
| 17. Kamahai Djordan King (Fool), Damion Hunter (Edgar). Photo: Jeff Busby, courtesy of Malthouse Theatre, Melbourne.   | 226    |

## LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

- |     |  |     |
|-----|--|-----|
| 18. | Jimi Bani (Edmund), Frances Djulibing (Gloucester). Photo: Jeff Busby, courtesy of Malthouse Theatre, Melbourne.   | 228 |
| 19. | A rosette made of the 'rainbow' ribbon worn at the Garrick Jubilee, c. 1769, SBT 1910–27, Shakespeare Centre Library and Archive, reproduced by permission of the Shakespeare Birthplace Trust.  | 311 |
| 20. | Ceramic figures of Garibaldi and Shakespeare, from D. Gordon Pugh, <i>Staffordshire Portrait Figures and Allied Subjects of the Victorian era including the Definitive Catalogue</i> , Plate 96 (London: Barrie & Jenkins Ltd, 1981).  | 315 |
| 21. | James Boswell Esqr from <i>The London Magazine</i> , September 1769, print made by Johann Sebastian Müller after Samuel Wale, British Museum Reg. No. Ee.4.130; PRN. PPA176530, © Trustees of the British Museum.  | 316 |
| 22. | <i>Henry IV Part 1</i> , 1.3. Royal Shakespeare Theatre, directed by Gregory Doran. Simon Thorp as Sir Walter Blunt, Elliot Barnes-Worrell as Prince John, Jasper Britton as King Henry IV, Nicholas Gerard-Martin as Sir Michael, Youssef Kerkour as Westmoreland. Photo by Kwame Lestrade © RSC. | 373 |
| 23. | <i>Henry IV Part 2</i> , 2.4. Royal Shakespeare Theatre, directed by Gregory Doran. Nia Gwynne as Doll Tearsheet, Paola Dionisotti as Mistress Quickly, Antony Sher as Falstaff. Photo by Kwame Lestrade © RSC.  | 375 |
| 24. | <i>Henry IV Part 2</i> , 3.2. Royal Shakespeare Theatre, directed by Gregory Doran. Jim Hooper as Justice Silence, Oliver Ford Davies as Justice Shallow. Photo by Kwame Lestrade © RSC.   | 376 |
| 25. | <i>Henry IV Part 1</i> , 1.3. Donmar Warehouse, directed by Phyllida Lloyd. Harriet Walter as King Henry IV. Photo by Helen Maybanks.  | 378 |
| 26. | <i>Henry IV Part 1</i> , 5.3. The Battle of Shrewsbury. Donmar Warehouse, directed by Phyllida Lloyd. Full company. Photo by Helen Maybanks.   | 379 |
| 27. | <i>The Two Gentlemen of Verona</i> , 1.1. Royal Shakespeare Theatre, directed by Simon Godwin. Full company. Photo Simon Annan © RSC.  | 382 |
| 28. | <i>Love's Labour's Lost</i> , 1.1. Royal Shakespeare Theatre, directed by Christopher Luscombe. Tunji Kasim as Dumaine, Edward Bennett as Berowne, William Belchambers as Longaville, and Sam Alexander as the King of Navarre. Photo by Manuel Harlan © RSC.                                      | 384 |
| 29. | <i>Love's Labour's Won (Much Ado About Nothing)</i> , 1.1. Royal Shakespeare Theatre, directed by Christopher Luscombe. Michelle Terry as Beatrice, Edward Bennett as Benedick. Photo by Manuel Harlan © RSC.  | 388 |
| 30. | <i>The Comedy of Errors</i> , 1.2. Globe Theatre, directed by Blanche McIntyre. Simon Harrison as Antipholus of Syracuse, Brodie Ross as Dromio of Syracuse. Photo by Marc Brenner.  | 389 |
| 31. | <i>Titus Andronicus</i> , 5.2. Globe Theatre, directed by Lucy Bailey. William Houston as Titus Andronicus, Brian Martin as Chiron, Flora Spencer-Longhurst as Lavinia, Samuel Edward-Cook as Demetrius. Photo by Simon Kane.  | 393 |
| 32. | <i>Coriolanus</i> , 1.4. Donmar Theatre, directed by Josie Rourke. Tom Hiddleston as Coriolanus. Photo by Johan Persson.   | 399 |
| 33. | <i>Hamlet</i> , 4.4. Royal Exchange Theatre, directed by Sarah Frankcom. Maxine Peake as Hamlet. Photo by Jonathan Keenan.   | 403 |
| 34. | <i>King Lear</i> , 1.1. National Theatre, directed by Sam Mendes. Simon Russell Beale as King Lear, Stanley Townsend as Kent. Photo by Mark Douet.   | 405 |