

Law and Lies

Law has a strangely complicated relationship to deception. Though it sometimes takes a hard line on behalf of truth – "the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth" – competing values often cause law to look the other way. How and why is lying alternately accepted, condemned, or prosecuted? What are the government's interests in allowing or disallowing lying?

Law and Lies is the first book to thematically address the role of lying in the American legal system. Undercover police agents are permitted to lie in the name of catching criminals, and government officials are permitted to lie in service of national security. In the case of the military's "Don't Ask, Don't Tell" policy, lying was not only permitted, but actively encouraged. A range of illuminating case studies reveal that the government's tolerance of deception is rarely as simple as the "whole truth."

Austin Sarat is William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Jurisprudence and Political Science and Associate Dean of the Faculty at Amherst College and Justice Hugo L. Black Senior Faculty Scholar at the University of Alabama School of Law. He is the author or editor of numerous books, including the recent A World without Privacy (2014); Civility, Legality, and the Limits of Justice (2014); and Re-imagining To Kill a Mockingbird: Family, Community, and the Possibility of Equal Justice under Law (2013). His book When Government Breaks the Law: Prosecuting the Bush Administration was named one of the best books of 2010 by the Huffington Post.





Law and Lies

Deception and Truth-Telling in the American Legal System

Edited by

AUSTIN SARAT

Amherst College





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107108783

© Cambridge University Press 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Law and lies: deception and truth-telling in the American legal system / edited by Austin Sarat.

pages cm

ISBN 978-1-107-10878-3 (hardback)

1. Deception – United States. 2. Fraud – United States. 3. Torts – United States. 4. Truthfulness and falsehood – United States. I. Sarat, Austin, editor. KF1271.L39 $\,$ 2015

346.7303-dc23 2015014021

ISBN 978-1-107-10878-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To Ben, with love





Contents

Control	ibutors	page ix
Ackno	wledgments	Xi
	Law and Lies: An Introduction Austin Sarat with Haley Cambra, Sarah Smith, and Olivia Truax	1
1	Where the Law Lies: Constitutional Fictions and Their Discontents Mary Anne Franks	s 32
2	The Artifice of Advocacy: Perjury and Participation in the American Adversary System Norman W. Spaulding	81
3	Lies to Manipulate, Misappropriate, and Ac Governmental Power Helen Norton	quire 143

vii



Contents

4	Lies, Rape, and Statutory Rape Stuart P. Green	194
5	Law and the Production of Deceit William N. Eskridge Jr.	254
	Afterword: Law, Lies, and Law Schools Montré D. Carodine	313
Index		321

viii



Contributors

Montré D. Carodine is Professor of Law at the University of Alabama.

William N. Eskridge Jr. is John A. Garver Professor of Jurisprudence at Yale Law School.

Mary Anne Franks is Professor of Law at the University of Miami.

Stuart P. Green is Professor of Law at Rutgers Law School–Newark

Helen Norton is Associate Dean and Associate Professor of Law at the University of Colorado.

Austin Sarat is Associate Dean of the Faculty and William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Jurisprudence and Political Science at Amherst College and Justice Hugo L. Black Visiting Senior Scholar at the School of Law at the University of Alabama.

Norman W. Spaulding is Nelson Bowman Sweitzer and Marie B. Sweitzer Professor of Law at Stanford Law School.

ix





Acknowledgments

This volume is the product of a symposium held at the University of Alabama, School of Law on October 10, 2014. I want to thank the colleagues, students, and staff who helped make it such a successful event. I am grateful for the financial support of the University of Alabama Law School Foundation and for the able research assistance of Haley Cambra, Sarah Smith, and Olivia Truax.

хi