

ANALOGICAL INVESTIGATIONS

Western philosophy and science are responsible for constructing some powerful tools of investigation, aiming at discovering the truth, delivering robust explanations, verifying conjectures, showing that inferences are sound and demonstrating results conclusively. By contrast, reasoning that depends on analogies has often been viewed with suspicion. Professor Lloyd first explores the origins of those Western ideals, criticises some of their excesses and redresses the balance in favour of looser, admittedly non-demonstrative analogical reasoning. For this, he takes examples from both ancient Greek and Chinese thought and from the materials of recent ethnography to show how different ancient and modern cultures have developed different styles of reasoning. He also develops two original but controversial ideas, that of semantic stretch (to cast doubt on the literal/metaphorical dichotomy) and the multidimensionality of reality (to bypass the realism versus relativism and nature versus nurture controversies).

G. E. R. LLOYD is Emeritus Professor of Ancient Philosophy and Science at the University of Cambridge, former Master of Darwin College, Cambridge, and Senior Scholar in Residence at the Needham Research Institute, Cambridge. He is the author of twenty-two books and editor of four, and was knighted for 'services to the history of thought' in 1997.





ANALOGICAL INVESTIGATIONS

Historical and Cross-cultural Perspectives on Human Reasoning

G. E. R. LLOYD





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107518377

© G. E. R. Lloyd 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-I-107-10784-7 Hardback ISBN 978-I-107-51837-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List of diagrams		<i>page</i> vi
	Introduction	I
I	On the very possibility of mutual intelligibility	IO
2	The multiple valences of comparatism	29
3	Analogies, images and models in ethics: some first-order and second-order observations on their use and evaluation in ancient Greece and China	43
4	Analogies as heuristic	58
5	Ontologies revisited	88
6	Conclusions	109
Glossary of Chinese terms		122
Notes on editions		124
Bibliography		125
Index		136



Diagrams

Ι	Euclid, <i>Elements</i> 1 5.	page 62
2	Alternative Proof of Euclid, 1 5.	63
3	Euclid, Elements 1 47.	64
4	Qu's reconstruction of <i>gou gu</i> diagram and of its construction.	65
5	Sam Loyd's puzzle.	66
6	Sam Loyd Junior's variation.	67
7	Kepler, Paralipomena to Witelo, ch. 4.	69
8	Hexagram 27 Yi.	76