Rethinking Race in Modern Argentina

This book reconsiders the relationship between race and nation in Argentina during the twentieth and twenty-first centuries and places Argentina firmly in dialogue with the literature on race and nation in Latin America, from where it has long been excluded or marginalized as a purportedly white, European exception in a mixed-race region. The contributors, based both in North America and Argentina, hail from the fields of history, anthropology, and literary and cultural studies. Their chapters collectively destabilize widespread certainties about Argentina, showing that whiteness in that country has more in common with practices and ideologies of mestizaje and “racial democracy” elsewhere in the region than has typically been acknowledged. The chapters also situate Argentina within the well-established literature on race, nation, and whiteness in world regions beyond Latin America (particularly, other European “settler societies”). The collection thus contributes to rethinking race for other global contexts as well.

Paulina L. Alberto is Associate Professor of History and Romance Languages and Literatures at the University of Michigan.

Eduardo Elena is Associate Professor of History at the University of Miami.
Rethinking Race in Modern Argentina

PAULINA L. ALBERTO AND EDUARDO ELENA
Contents

List of figures vii
List of tables ix
Notes on the contributors xi
Preface xv

Introduction: The shades of the nation 1
Paulina L. Alberto and Eduardo Elena

PART I HISTORIES OF RACE IN THE TWENTIETH CENTURY

1 Insecure whiteness: Jews between civilization and barbarism, 1880s–1940s
Sandra McGee Deutsch 25

2 People as landscape: The representation of the criollo Interior in early tourist literature in Argentina, 1920–30
Oscar Chamosa 53

3 Black in Buenos Aires: The transnational career of Oscar Alemán
Matthew B. Karush 73

4 La cocina criolla: A history of food and race in twentieth-century Argentina
Rebekah E. Pite 99

5 “Invisible Indians,” “degenerate descendants”: Idiosyncrasies of mestizaje in Southern Patagonia
Mariela Eva Rodríguez 126

6 Race and class through the visual culture of Peronism
Ezequiel Adamovsky 155
vi

Contents

7 Argentina in black and white: Race, Peronism, and the color of politics, 1940s to the present 184
Eduardo Elena

PART II RACE AND NATION IN THE NEW CENTURY

8 African descent and whiteness in Buenos Aires: Impossible mestizajes in the white capital city 213
Lea Geler

9 The savage outside of White Argentina 241
Gastón Gordillo

10 Between foreigners and heroes: Asian-Argentines in a multicultural nation 268
Chisu Teresa Ko

11 Indias blancas, negros febriles: Racial stories and history-making in contemporary Argentine fiction 289
Paulina L. Alberto

Epilogue: Whiteness and its discontents 318
George Reid Andrews

Collective bibliography 327
Index 361
Figures

1 Tourists observing the local “types” in Tucumán. page 66
2 Argentine tourist visiting her country. 67
3 Argentine woman packing golf clubs in preparation for a trip to the Interior. 68
4 The Moreira Sextet, 1917. 75
5 “Les Loups” musical performers. 77
6 Oscar Alemán performing on stage. 83
7 Oscar Alemán with Josephine Baker. 85
8 Oscar Alemán with Horacio Salgán. 89
9 “Cocina Gaucha” (Gaucho Cuisine). 106
10 Chef Antonio Gonzaga. 109
11 Doña Petrona: Empanadas from Santiago del Estero. 117
12 The “average” family of Peronist Argentina. 164
13 Poster of “Juan Pueblo” for the First Five-Year Plan. 165
14 Fiesta Criolla pamphlet. 166
15 An elderly Afro-Argentine woman and family. 169
16 Juan D. Perón and Afro-Argentine boy. 171
17 The comic strip “Chispita y Grillito.” 172
18 Juan D. Perón and the Peronist coat of arms. 172
19 Rally in the Plaza de Mayo. 176
Table

1 Whites and *mestizos* in selected Latin American countries, as a percentage of total population, 2010  

*page 320*
Notes on the contributors

Paulina L. Alberto (Ph.D. University of Pennsylvania, 2005) is Associate Professor in the Departments of History and of Romance Languages and Literatures (Programs in Spanish and Portuguese) at the University of Michigan. She is the author of multiple articles on racial activism and racial ideologies in modern Brazil and Argentina, and of Terms of Inclusion: Black Intellectuals in Twentieth-Century Brazil (UNC Press, 2011), awarded the Warren Dean Memorial Prize by the Conference on Latin American History (2013) and the Roberto Reis Award by the Brazilian Studies Association (2012). Her current research on the (in)famous porteño street character Raúl Grigera (“El Negro Raúl”) explores the power of racial stories to construct “whiteness” and “blackness” in twentieth-century Argentina and to shape individual fates.

Eduardo Elena is Associate Professor of History and Research Director for Latin American Policy at the Miami Institute for the Americas at the University of Miami. He is the author of Dignifying Argentina: Peronism, Citizenship, and Mass Consumption (University of Pittsburgh Press, 2011), which was awarded the 2013 Book Prize in the Social Sciences by the Southern Cone Studies Section of the Latin American Studies Association. His work on the political, economic, and cultural history of Peronism and midcentury Latin America has appeared in numerous journals and edited volumes. Building from his research on consumption and the study of race and nation, he is currently investigating steam-age globalization in late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Argentina.

Sandra McGee Deutsch is Professor of History at the University of Texas at El Paso. She is the author of Counterrevolution in Argentina, 1900–1932: The Argentine Patriotic League (University of Nebraska Press, 1986); Las derechas: The Extreme Right in Argentina, Brazil, and Chile, 1890–1939 (Stanford University Press, 1999); and Crossing Borders, Claiming
Notes on the contributors

a Nation: A History of Argentine Jewish Women, 1880–1955 (Duke University Press, 2010). She has also written numerous articles on rightist movements, anti-Semitism, gender, and women in Latin America. Currently, she is researching the Junta de la Victoria, a women’s antifascist group in Argentina that sent aid to the Allies during World War II, at the regional, national, and transnational levels.

Oscar Chamosa is Associate Professor of History at the University of Georgia. He obtained his Ph.D. in History in 2003 from the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. He is the author of The Argentine Folklore Movement: Sugar Elites, Criollo Workers and the Politics of Cultural Nationalism, 1900–1955 (University of Arizona Press, 2010) and Breve historia del folklore argentino (Edhasa, 2012). He is coeditor, with Matthew Karush, of The New Cultural History of Peronism: Power and Identity in Mid-Twentieth-Century Argentina (Duke University Press, 2010). Chamosa has published several book chapters in English and Spanish, and his articles have appeared in the Hispanic American Historical Review and The Americas, among other journals. He is currently working on a project about neoliberalism and folklore in late-twentieth-century Argentina.

Matthew Karush is Professor of History at George Mason University. He is the author of Culture of Class: Radio and Cinema in the Making of a Divided Argentina, 1930–1946 (Duke University Press, 2012) and Workers or Citizens: Democracy and Identity in Rosario, Argentina (1912–1930) (University of New Mexico Press, 2002) and the coeditor, with Oscar Chamosa, of The New Cultural History of Peronism: Power and Identity in Mid-Twentieth Century Argentina (Duke University Press, 2010). With a fellowship from the National Endowment for the Humanities, he is currently working on a transnational history of Argentine popular music in the twentieth century.

Rebekah E. Pite is Associate Professor of History and Program Chair for Latin American and Caribbean Studies at Lafayette College. Her research focuses on histories of gender, food, consumption, and labor in Argentina in particular and in southern South America more broadly. Pite’s book, Creating a Common Table in Twentieth-Century Argentina: Doña Petrona, Women, and Food (University of North Carolina Press, 2013) won the Gourmand Prize for “Best Latin America Cuisine Book” published in the United States and the LASA Southern Cone Studies section prize for “Best Social Sciences Book.” She has also published articles in the Hispanic American Historical Review, Revista de Estudios Sociales, Apuntes, Estudios Interdisciplinarios de América Latina y el Caribe, Massachusetts Historical Review, and a number of edited volumes.

Mariela Eva Rodríguez received an MA in Romance Languages and Literature at the University of Notre Dame and a Ph.D. in Latin American Literature and
Cultural Studies at Georgetown University. She is Researcher at the National Council for Scientific and Technological Research (CONICET) of Argentina, and teaches Anthropology at the University of Buenos Aires (UBA) and at the Latin American Faculty of Social Sciences (FLACSO). Rodríguez is the recipient of several scholarships from Argentine and US institutions and is a member of various Argentine research teams. In her current research on Southern Patagonia, she employs an engaged ethnographic approach with Mapuche and Tehuelche people, analyzing relationships between past and present through orally transmitted memories and archival research. Rodríguez’s work is concerned with indigenous re-emergence, processes of patrimonialization, the recovery of indigenous land, human remains repatriations, interculturality, and Tehuelche language revitalization, among other topics. She has published numerous articles in national and international journals and edited volumes.

**Ezequiel Adamovsky** obtained his Ph.D. in History from University College, London and is Professor in the Department of History at the University of Buenos Aires and Researcher at the National Council for Scientific and Technological Research (CONICET), Argentina’s highest public institution for research. He was also Guest Researcher at the CNRS in Paris. Adamovsky’s academic work has been mainly in the field of social and intellectual history, with studies on Europe as well as on middle- and lower-class identities in Argentina. He is the author of *Euro-Orientalism* (Oxford University Press, 2006), *Historia de la clase media argentina* (Sudamericana, 2009), and *Historia de las clases populares en Argentina, de 1880 a 2003* (Sudamericana, 2012), among other books. He was awarded the James Alexander Robertson Memorial Prize in 2009 and the *Premio Nacional* (First prize in history) in 2013, the highest distinction of the Argentine state for arts and humanities.

**Lea Geler** is Researcher at Argentina’s National Council for Scientific and Technological Research (CONICET) and at the Interdisciplinary Gender Studies Institute (IIEGE) of the University of Buenos Aires. Using a historical-anthropological approach, her work focuses on Afro-descendants in Buenos Aires from the nineteenth century to the present, exploring questions of Afro-Argentine memory, of (self-)representation, and of race, nation, class, and gender in Argentina. Geler is the author of *Andares negros, caminos blancos. Afroporteños, Estado y Nación Argentina a fines del siglo XIX* (Prohistoria, 2010) and is coeditor (with Florencia Guzmán) of *Cartografías Afrolatinoamericanas. Perspectivas situadas para análisis transfronterizos* (Biblos, 2013). She has also published numerous articles in journals including *African and Black Diaspora, Horizontes Antropológicos, Tabula Rasa, Memoria Americana*, and *Boletín Americanista*, and in several edited volumes.

**Gastón Gordillo** is Professor in the Department of Anthropology at the University of British Columbia. He has conducted ethnographic research on space,
ruination, history, violence, memory, subjectivity, and indigeneity in several areas of northern Argentina since 1987. Born and raised in Buenos Aires, he obtained his Ph.D. from the University of Toronto (1999). He is a Guggenheim Scholar, was a visiting scholar at Harvard and Yale, and taught at Cornell. His most recent book is Rubble: The Afterlife of Destruction (Duke University Press, 2014). Based on ethnographic research in the region where the Argentine Andes give way to the Gran Chaco lowlands, the book proposes a theory of ruins as rubble by analyzing the everyday experience of people living in the vicinity of palimpsests of debris from multiple eras. His book Landscapes of Devils: Tensions of Place and Memory in the Argentinean Chaco (Duke University Press, 2004) won the American Ethnological Society Sharon Stephens Book Prize. He is also the author of En el Gran Chaco: Antropologías e historias (Prometeo, 2006) and Nosotros vamos a estar acá para siempre: Historias Tobas (Biblos, 2005). He blogs at Space and Politics.

Chisu Teresa Ko (Ph.D. in Spanish, Columbia University) is Assistant Professor of Spanish and Coordinator of Latin American Studies at Ursinus College. Her field of research includes Latin American cultural and literary studies, Asian-Latin American studies, and theories of race with a special focus on race, ethnicity, and multiculturalism in Argentina. She has written about Argentine multiculturalism in “From Whiteness to Diversity: Crossing the Racial Threshold in Bicentennial Argentina,” Ethnic and Racial Studies 37.14. Her work on the representation of Asians in contemporary Argentine novels, “‘Argentina te incluye’: Asians in Argentina’s Multicultural Novels” appeared in Symposium: A Quarterly Journal in Modern Literatures 69.1. Her current research considers from a theoretical and comparative perspective the position of Asian-Argentine Studies within the broader fields of Asian-Latin American or Asian-American Studies. Her book in progress, Making Identities Visible and Invisible: The Uses of Race in Argentine National Identity, examines Argentina’s changing racial discourses in a variety of cultural products from the founding of the nation to contemporary times.

Preface

This book is the outcome of many years of conversation among the editors, contributors, and various audiences and readers. Most of the chapters first took shape in a series of panel presentations delivered at the Latin American Studies Association conferences in Toronto (2010), San Francisco (2012), and Washington, D.C. (2013). The volume’s authors have also shared their research with colleagues in venues across Argentina as well as with students, activists, and wider publics there and elsewhere. Along the way, we encountered a spectrum of reactions to our project: from enthusiasm and encouragement, to thoughtful critiques, to skepticism and even hostility. Indeed, the range and intensity of these responses not only helped us sharpen our arguments and reframe our assumptions, but they also strengthened our conviction that questions of race and nation in twentieth- and twenty-first-century Argentina merit rethinking.

If the subjects treated in this volume touch a nerve for some readers, it is surely because the chapters reconsider the conventional wisdom about Argentine politics, culture, and society held by many commentators in Argentina and abroad. Raising questions about the racial dimensions of inequality, identity, and power in Argentina is itself controversial. And even among those who agree that those are crucial questions, disagreements persist over how best to pose and answer them. To pick one telling example, the very title of this book, Rethinking Race in Modern Argentina, may provoke some unease. In the United States, references to race as a social dilemma or as an academic area of inquiry are commonplace. Yet in contemporary Argentina, the term raza carries a strongly negative connotation and is thus far less frequently invoked: indeed, it is common for raza to be placed within quotation marks even in the writings of researchers who use the concept to expose problems of discrimination. This circumspect treatment of raza is intended to emphasize its socially constructed, rather than essential or biological, character (despite the fact that other social constructs like género [gender] and clase do not require this kind of
treatment), or to signal the concept’s status as archaic and somehow foreign to Argentina. The pages that follow devote considerable attention to unraveling the many languages of race in Argentina employed since the early twentieth century and assessing their political implications. But even as our title embraces the unquoted use of race common in the US academy, the volume takes as its premise the idea that Argentine conceptions of race should not be approached as exotic or benighted deviations from a norm (based, as so many other things, on US and Western European models).

Instead, our goal is to facilitate discussion across geographic borders and disciplinary or conceptual boundaries, generating a sharper understanding of how race-related ideas and practices – especially those surrounding the production of “whiteness” – have molded modern Argentina and other nations across the world. In keeping with this impulse, the volume not only reaches out to experts in the study of Argentina and Latin America but also to scholars of other world regions and to curious readers of all backgrounds and levels of expertise. This approach may occasionally lead us to explain things that seem obvious to Argentines or to experts on the region, but it has the virtue of bringing new participants into the discussion. As the lively community and the exchanges that defined this project come to a close (at least for now), we hope that the finished book will spark further debate, comparison, and questioning in the classroom and beyond.

The making of this edited volume was a collective endeavor in more ways than one. We are grateful for the support received from everyone at Cambridge University Press, first and foremost our editor Deborah Gershenowitz and her assistant Dana Bricken, whose encouragement and vision helped shape the book in important ways. The three anonymous readers selected by Cambridge University Press deserve special recognition for their close readings and their excellent recommendations for how the book might reach its fullest potential. Early in the production process, Kristin McGuire employed her copyediting prowess to ensure that the authors were all on the same page. And, of course, we thank all the contributors to this volume for their cooperation and for their good-tempered responses to our seemingly endless revisions and e-mail queries.

One of the pleasures of undertaking this project was the many opportunities it offered to expand our intellectual community, whether by meeting new people or having new conversations with colleagues and friends. Audience members at talks in Argentina and elsewhere provided invaluable feedback that guided this book to completion. The project also gave us the chance to exchange ideas with a number of researchers who took part in the original LASA panels or who were involved in early versions of the manuscript. Alejandro Frigerio, Valeria Manzano, John Charles Chasteen, Ana Vivaldi, and James Shrader deserve heartfelt recognition for their contributions to the realization of this book. We look forward to upcoming studies by these and other colleagues who will no doubt continue to expand the field in exciting ways. Given the number of people who generously gave their time to discuss and read our work,
we have incurred debts too numerous to be properly accounted, but we gratefully acknowledge the comments offered by Sueann Caulfi eld, Matthew Coun-
tryman, Mark Healey, Jesse Hoffnung-Garskof, and Ashli White.

Paulina Alberto wishes to thank Eduardo Elena for agreeing to embark on this exciting but laborious journey, and for cheerfully keeping us on course through some of its rough patches. We began this project just as I was fi nishing my monograph on Brazil, and though I had been looking over my shoulder to Argentina for quite some time, the idea of retraining myself as a historian of Argentina seemed daunting. I can imagine no better guide through the peculiar landscape of Argentine historiography than Eduardo. Working closely with Eduardo and the volume’s contributors over the past fi ve years and exchanging ideas and arguments has been an incredible education. I cannot thank these colleagues enough for their generosity of spirit. I am also grateful to the friends and colleagues who wished me well in my (only partial) change of course and helped me think through the connections between projects old and new: George Reid Andrews, Rebecca Scott, Sueann Caulfi eld, Barbara Weinstein, Jeff Lesser, Jerry Dávila, Marc Hertzman, Keila Grinberg, and James Green. Warm thanks go to Mariela Rodríguez and Lea Geler for their invitation to team teach the seminar “Nación, ‘Raza’, y Mestizaje en América Latina” at the University of Buenos Aires in 2014, and to the undergraduate and graduate students who made it such a lively place to work through many of the ideas that animate this volume. The departments of History and of Romance Languages and Literatures as well as the College of Literature, Science, and Arts at the University of Michigan provided important funding for this project and made my extended stay in Argentina possible. My friends and family, for their part, made that time a delight: Julieta Pereira, Zulma Alberto, Fernando Skiarski, the whole Rafaela crew, my parents Néstor and Ana Berta de Alberto, my sisters Cristina and Mariana, as well as Matías Salmoiraghi and the inimitable Luca. My deepest love and gratitude go to my husband Jesse Hoffnung-Garskof for his seemingly unending stores of wisdom and patience, and to little Lalo and Pía, for making any place we go together feel like home.

Eduardo Elena wishes to thank the volume’s contributors for making this project so intellectually stimulating. I have learned a great deal from you all. Paulina Alberto in particular has helped steer me through unfamiliar waters, and without her expertise and bighearted guidance I would have surely lost my way. I began this process with a mixture of curiosity and ignorance about the study of race in twentieth- and twenty-ﬁrst-century Argentina – and, truth be told, a healthy skepticism, born from frustration with how some in the US academy use race to constrict and “orientalize” the study of Latin America and the Caribbean. Thanks to my fellow contributors I now see more clearly how to transcend these limitations, while also gaining in the process a richer understanding of Argentina’s past and present. I am grateful to have received the backing, financial and otherwise, from the University of Miami, above all from my wonderful colleagues in the History Department and Center for Latin
American Studies (now the Miami Institute for the Americas). I wish to recognize Hugo Ratier, Lila Caimari, and Nicolás Quiroga for their insights as specialists and for the opportunities to share my work. Mil gracias to the family and friends who have always been at my side, including those in Argentina and Uruguay who hosted me and challenged my thinking: Jorge Elena, Elena Milla de Elena, Victoria Basulado, Vania Markarian, Juan Santarcangelo, Leandro Delgado, and Fanny Cassinoni. Final thanks are reserved, as always, for Ashli White and my daughter Paulina for being constant sources of ideas and inspiration.