

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09722-3 - NAFTA and Sustainable Development: History, Experience, and Prospects for Reform

Edited by Hoi L. Kong and L. Kinvin Wroth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

NAFTA AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

History, Experience, and Prospects for Reform

The North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) and its companion agreement, the North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation (NAAEC), provide important and often underappreciated protection for the environmental laws of the Party states: Canada, Mexico, and the United States. On the twentieth anniversary of NAFTA's ratification, this book assesses the current state of environmental protection under those agreements. Bringing together scholars, practitioners, and regulators from all three Party states, it outlines the scope and process of NAFTA and NAAEC, their impact on specific environmental issues, and paths to reform. It includes analyses of the impact of the agreements on such matters as bioengineered crops in Mexico, assessment of marine environmental effects, potential lessons for China, climate change, and indigenous rights.

Together, the chapters of this book represent an important contribution to the global conversation concerning international trade agreements and sustainable development.

Hoi L. Kong is an associate professor and Associate Dean Academic at McGill University's Faculty of Law. He has been a visiting professor at universities in the United States, Australia, Hong Kong, and Switzerland. From 2002 to 2003, he was law clerk to Justices Marie Deschamps and Claire L'Heureux Dubé at the Supreme Court of Canada.

L. Kinvin Wroth is a professor of law and former president and dean of Vermont Law School. He has taught land use law, marine law, procedure, legal history, and professional conduct. His coedited work, *Legal Papers of John Adams*, was awarded the American Historical Association's Littleton-Griswold prize. He received his LL.B. from Harvard University.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09722-3 - NAFTA and Sustainable Development: History, Experience, and Prospects
for Reform

Edited by Hoi L. Kong and L. Kinvin Wroth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09722-3 - NAFTA and Sustainable Development: History, Experience, and Prospects for Reform

Edited by Hoi L. Kong and L. Kinvin Wroth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

TREATY IMPLEMENTATION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

Over the past three decades, a series of international treaties has entered into force to address pressing global concerns – social and economic development and environmental protection. On climate change, biodiversity and biosafety, desertification, agriculture and seeds, trade, and investment liberalization, new regimes have been established to implement global commitments related to sustainable development, many with nearly universal membership.

Successful domestic implementation of these international treaty regimes is one of the most significant challenges facing international law today. While much has been written on the content and form of treaty law, there is relatively little that examines the transition from international legal theory and treaty texts to domestic regulation and practice.

This new series of books addresses this need and provides a serious contribution to ongoing global debates by conducting a detailed analysis of how myriad new treaty regimes that cover the future's most pressing concerns can be made to work in practice. It is dedicated to our mentor and first Chairman of the Board of Governors of the Centre for International Sustainable Development Law, The Honourable Mr. Justice Charles Doherty, Puisne judge on the Supreme Court of Canada from February 1, 1989, to August 1, 2003.

Series Editors:

Marie-Claire Cordonier Segger
Markus Wilhelm Gehring

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09722-3 - NAFTA and Sustainable Development: History, Experience, and Prospects
for Reform

Edited by Hoi L. Kong and L. Kinvin Wroth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09722-3 - NAFTA and Sustainable Development: History, Experience, and Prospects for Reform

Edited by Hoi L. Kong and L. Kinvin Wroth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

NAFTA and Sustainable Development

HISTORY, EXPERIENCE, AND
PROSPECTS FOR REFORM

Edited by

HOI L. KONG

McGill University

L. KINVIN WROTH

Vermont Law School



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-09722-3 - NAFTA and Sustainable Development: History, Experience, and Prospects
for Reform
Edited by Hoi L. Kong and L. Kinvin Wroth
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107097223

© Cambridge University Press 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Kong, Hoi L., author.
NAFTA and sustainable development : history, experience, and prospects for reform / Hoi L. Kong,
McGill University; L. Kinvin Wroth, University of Vermont School of Law.

pages cm
Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. North American Free Trade Agreement (December 1992, 17) 2. Free trade – North America.
3. Sustainable development – Law and legislation – North America. 4. Environmental law – North
America. I. Wroth, L. Kinvin, author. II. Title.

KDZ944.K66 2015
382'.971073–dc23 2015021270

ISBN 978-1-107-09722-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or
third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on
such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Editors and Contributors</i>	<i>page</i> xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xv
Introduction: NAFTA and Sustainable Development L. Kinvin Wroth and Hoi L. Kong	1
PART I. PROCESS: NAFTA AND NAAEC	
1 Forgotten Promises: Neglected Environmental Provisions of the NAFTA and the NAAEC Geoffrey Garver	15
2 Should Citizens Expect Procedural Justice in Nonadversarial Processes? Spotighting the Regression of the Citizen Submissions Process from NAAEC to CAFTA–DR Giselle Davidian	37
3 Choosing the Right Whistle: The Development of the Concept of Environmental Law under the Citizen Submissions Process Paolo Solano	75
4 Pending Proceedings in the New Guidelines for Submissions on Enforcement Matters: An Improved Regression? Montserrat Rovalo	97

5	Form over Substance: Procedural Hurdles to the NAAEC Citizen Submission Process Leslie Welts	123
PART II. SPECIFIC ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES UNDER NAFTA AND NAAEC		
6	Downward Harmonization: Mexico’s Industrial Livestock Revolution Pamela Vesilind	149
7	Agricultural Biotechnology and NAFTA: Analyzing the Impacts of U.S. and Canadian Policies on Mexico’s Environment and Agriculture Laurie J. Beyranevand	169
8	Assessing Assessments of NAFTA’s Marine Environment: The Commission for Environmental Cooperation Meets the World Ocean Assessment Betsy Baker	191
9	Sustainable Development, NAFTA, and Water Katia Opalka	204
10	Indigenous Peoples in North America: Bridging the Trade and Environment Gap to Ensure Sustainability under NAFTA and NAAEC Nicole Schabus	218
11	Climate Change, Sustainable Development, and NAFTA: Regional Policy Harmonization as a Basis for Sustainable Development Freedom-Kai Phillips	244
12	The Principle of Public Participation in NAFTA Chapter 11 Disputes Avidan Kent	267
13	Preventing Environmental Deterioration from International Trade and Investment: How China Can Learn from NAFTA’s Experience to Strengthen Domestic Environmental Governance and Ensure Sustainable Development Danni Liang and Jingjing Liu	302

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-09722-3 - NAFTA and Sustainable Development: History, Experience, and Prospects
for Reform
Edited by Hoi L. Kong and L. Kinvin Wroth
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Contents ix

PART III. PROPOSALS FOR REFORM AND LESSONS GOING FORWARD

14	Pathways of Influence in the NAFTA Regime and Their Implications for Domestic Environmental Policy Making in North America	329
	Sébastien Jodoin	
15	The Citizen Submissions Process in the NAAEC: Theory and Practice in Deliberative Democratic Institutional Design for Transnational Institutions	351
	Hoi L. Kong	
16	Assessing ENGO Influence in North American Environmental Politics: The Double Grid Framework	373
	Raul Pacheco-Vega	
	<i>Index</i>	391

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09722-3 - NAFTA and Sustainable Development: History, Experience, and Prospects
for Reform

Edited by Hoi L. Kong and L. Kinvin Wroth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09722-3 - NAFTA and Sustainable Development: History, Experience, and Prospects for Reform

Edited by Hoi L. Kong and L. Kinvin Wroth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

List of Editors and Contributors

Betsy Baker, Associate Professor and Senior Fellow for Oceans and Energy, Institute for Energy and the Environment at Vermont Law School, is on leave for 2014–2016 in Anchorage, Alaska, with the University of Washington School of Law, where she is Visiting Professor and Counsel to the Dean for Alaska Programs.

Laurie J. Beyranevand is Associate Professor of Law and Associate Director of the Center for Agriculture and Food Systems at Vermont Law School.

Giselle Davidian, B.C.L., LL.B (McGill), M.Env.Sc. and H.B.Sc. (University of Toronto), is a recent call to the bar of Ontario and recently completed her articles at Willms & Shier Environmental Lawyers LLP in Toronto, where she will return as an associate lawyer in September 2015.

Geoffrey Garver, formerly a member of the Joint Public Advisory Committee of the Commission for Environmental Cooperation and a former director of the CEC's citizen submissions process, is currently Program Coordinator of the project Economics for the Anthropocene, based at McGill. He holds a J.D. from Michigan and an LL.M. from McGill and is a Ph.D. candidate at the McGill School of Environment.

Sébastien Jodoin is an Assistant Professor in the McGill University Faculty of Law and a Faculty Associate of the Governance, Environment & Markets Initiative at Yale.

Avidan Kent holds a Ph.D. from Cambridge University and is Lecturer in Commercial/Trade Law at the University of East Anglia Law School, Norwich, U.K., and an Associate Fellow of the Centre for International Sustainable Development Law, Montreal.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09722-3 - NAFTA and Sustainable Development: History, Experience, and Prospects for Reform

Edited by Hoi L. Kong and L. Kinvin Wroth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Hoi L. Kong is Associate Professor and Hydro Québec Scholar of Sustainable Development Law and Associate Dean Academic at the McGill University Faculty of Law.

Danni Liang, a visiting scholar at Vermont Law School in 2008–2009, is Associate Professor of Law, Sun Yat-sen University School of Law, Guangzhou, China.

Jingjing Liu, formerly Assistant Professor of Law and Associate Director of Vermont Law School's US-China Partnership for Environmental Law, is a J.S.D. candidate and the Joseph V. Heffernan Fellow at Columbia Law School.

Katia Opalka, B.A., B.C.L., LL.B., McGill, and formerly a legal officer at the Commission for Environmental Cooperation, is an environmental lawyer in private practice in Montreal and an Adjunct Professor at the McGill University School of Environment.

Raul Pacheco-Vega, Ph.D., is Assistant Professor, Public Administration Division, Centro de Investigacion y Docencia Economicas, Campus Región Centro, Aguascalientes, Mexico, and affiliated faculty in the Department of Political Science and the Latin American Studies Program at the University of British Columbia.

Freedom-Kai Phillips is a principal consultant at Bionomos, Ltd., and a Research Fellow with the Biodiversity and Biosafety Law Research Program, Centre for International Sustainable Development Law, Montreal. He holds an LL.B. from Dalhousie and an M.A. from Seton Hall University.

Montserrat Rovalo is a 2013 graduate of the Universidad Autonoma Nacional de Mexico Facultad de Derecho, specializing in international and environmental law. She was an intern with the Commission for Environmental Cooperation, Montreal, and is currently pursuing a Master's degree in international law at the Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies in Geneva, Switzerland.

Nicole Schabus is a Law Professor at the Thompson Rivers University Faculty of Law, Kamloops, B.C., Canada, who has represented a number of First Nations bands in provincial, federal, and international forums.

Paolo Solano is Legal Officer for the Submissions on Enforcement Matters Unit of the Commission for Environmental Cooperation, Montreal, and previously practiced environmental law. He has a law degree from the Universidad Autonoma Nacional de Mexico and has studied at the Georgetown University Law Center.

Pamela Vesilind is a Fellow with the Vermont Law School Center for Agricultural and Food Systems and an Adjunct Instructor in the University of Arkansas School of Law LL.M. Program in Agricultural and Food Law.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09722-3 - NAFTA and Sustainable Development: History, Experience, and Prospects for Reform

Edited by Hoi L. Kong and L. Kinvin Wroth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

List of Editors and Contributors

xiii

Leslie Welts is Staff Attorney for the Vermont Department of Environmental Conservation. She holds a J.D. from Vermont Law School and an LL.M. from the McGill Faculty of Law and has been a consultant and extern at the Commission for Environmental Cooperation.

L. Kinvin Wroth is Professor of Law and former Dean and President at Vermont Law School.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09722-3 - NAFTA and Sustainable Development: History, Experience, and Prospects
for Reform

Edited by Hoi L. Kong and L. Kinvin Wroth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09722-3 - NAFTA and Sustainable Development: History, Experience, and Prospects for Reform

Edited by Hoi L. Kong and L. Kinvin Wroth

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

The editors, on behalf of all the authors, would like to express their gratitude and thanks to the following organizations and individuals without whose assistance and support this work would not have come into existence:

- The North American Commission on Environmental Cooperation – especially Irasema Coronado, Executive Director, and Paolo Solano, Legal Officer – for providing facilities and other support for the workshop at which most of the chapters in the present work were presented, and the North American Consortium on Legal Education, Vermont Law School, and the Faculty of Law of McGill University for also sponsoring and supporting the workshop.
- The Canadian Embassy’s Canadian Studies Grant Program and the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada for funding that supported various aspects of the program.
- Marie-Claire Cordonier Segger and Markus W. Gehring, editors of the Cambridge University Press series “Treaty Implementation for Sustainable Development,” in which this volume is published, for their continuing support of the project, and our anonymous peer reviewers for their very helpful comments.
- The following student research assistants, whose editorial assistance was essential: John Hutchings, Nicola Langille, Carolyn Poutiainen, Mark Phillips, and Olga Redko of the McGill University Faculty of Law and Katherine Hambley and Elizabeth Tisher of Vermont Law School.
- Ginny Burnham of Vermont Law School for her extensive and patient labor in putting together the final manuscript in proper form for submission to the publisher.