

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09438-3 - Decentralization and Intrastate Struggles: Chechnya, Punjab, and Québec

Kristin M. Bakke

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Decentralization and Intrastate Struggles

There is no one-size-fits-all decentralized fix for deeply divided and conflict-ridden states. One of the hotly debated policy prescriptions for states facing self-determination demands is some form of decentralized governance – including regional autonomy arrangements and federalism – which grants minority groups a degree of self-rule. Yet the track record of existing decentralized states suggests that these have widely divergent capacities to contain conflicts within their borders. Through in-depth case studies of Chechnya, Punjab, and Québec, as well as a statistical cross-country analysis, this book argues that while policy, fiscal, and political decentralization can, indeed, be peace preserving at times, the effects of these institutions are conditioned by traits of the societies they (are meant to) govern. Decentralization may help preserve peace in one country or in one region, but it may have just the opposite effect in a country or region with different ethnic and economic characteristics.

Kristin M. Bakke is Senior Lecturer in Political Science at University College London. She has previously taught at Leiden University and been a postdoctoral Fellow at Harvard University. She holds a PhD from the University of Washington, Seattle. Her research, focusing on self-determination struggles and postwar states, has appeared in journals such as *International Security*, *International Studies Quarterly*, *Journal of Conflict Resolution*, *Journal of Peace Research*, *Perspectives on Politics*, and *World Politics*. She has received grants from the Economic and Social Research Council (UK), the National Science Foundation (US), and the Chr. Michelsen Institute (Norway). She is an associate editor of *Journal of Peace Research* and serves on the advisory board of *Nations and Nationalism*, the management committee of the European Network of Conflict Research, and the council of the British Conflict Research Society.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-09438-3 - Decentralization and Intrastate Struggles: Chechnya, Punjab, and Québec
Kristin M. Bakke
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09438-3 - Decentralization and Intrastate Struggles: Chechnya, Punjab, and Québec

Kristin M. Bakke

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Decentralization and Intrastate Struggles

Chechnya, Punjab, and Québec

KRISTIN M. BAKKE

University College London



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-09438-3 - Decentralization and Intrastate Struggles: Chechnya, Punjab, and Québec
Kristin M. Bakke
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107094383

© Kristin M. Bakke 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Bakke, Kristin M.

Decentralization and intrastate struggles : Chechnya, Punjab, and Québec / Kristin M. Bakke.
pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-09438-3 (hardback)

1. Decentralization in government—Case studies. 2. Decentralization in government—Russia (Federation)—Chechnya. 3. Decentralization in government—India—Punjab. 4. Decentralization in government—Québec (Province) 5. Chechnya (Russia)—History—Autonomy and independence movements. 6. Punjab (India)—History—Autonomy and independence movements. 7. Québec (Province)—History—Autonomy and independence movements. I. Title.

JS113.B347 2015

320.8—dc23 2014044222

ISBN 978-1-107-09438-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09438-3 - Decentralization and Intrastate Struggles: Chechnya, Punjab, and Québec

Kristin M. Bakke

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Til mamma og pappa

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-09438-3 - Decentralization and Intrastate Struggles: Chechnya, Punjab, and Québec
Kristin M. Bakke
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page viii</i>
<i>List of Maps</i>	<i>ix</i>
<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>x</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xi</i>
1 “Peace-Preserving” Decentralization?	I
2 Divisions and Diversity in Federal States	39
<i>Chapter 2 Appendix</i>	62
3 The First War in Chechnya	81
4 The Rise and Decline of the Punjab Crisis	131
<i>Chapter 4 Appendix</i>	182
5 Québec’s Sovereignty Movement	184
6 Conclusion: Comparative Perspectives	240
<i>References</i>	273
<i>Index</i>	311

Figures

1.1	From Decentralization to Peace Preservation	<i>page 29</i>
2.1	Average Level of Ethnic Demonstration and Violent Self-Determination Conflict in Federal States, 0–1 Scale	40
2.2	Average Level of Fiscal Decentralization in Federal States, 1978–2000	46
2.3	The Impact of Decentralized Education on Ethnic Demonstration, Conditional on Ethnic Concentration	56
2.4	The Impact of Fiscal Decentralization on Violent Conflict, Conditional on Interregional Inequality	57
2.5	The Impact of Copartisanship on Violent Conflict, Conditional on Ethnic Copartisanship	58
4.1	Violence in Punjab, 1981–1993	160
5.1	Public Opinion on Sovereignty and Independence in Québec	191
5.2	Vote Share for the Parti Québécois in National Assembly Elections	192

Maps

3.1	The Russian Federation (1993)	<i>page</i> 86
3.2	Chechnya	87
4.1	India	135
5.1	Canada	187

Tables

1.1	Expectations about Fiscal Autonomy and Regional Wealth	<i>page 23</i>
1.2	Self-Determination Conflicts in Chechnya, Punjab, and Québec	32
2.1	Explaining Self-Determination Conflict in Federal States	53
A.2.1	Ethnic Regions in Federal States, 1978–2000	72
A.2.2	Demonstrations and Violent Conflict in Federal States	75
A.2.3	Explaining Self-Determination Conflict in Federal States	79
3.1	Opposition Groups in Chechnya, 1992–1994	116
4.1	Discretionary Grants and Loans in Punjab and India	151
4.2	Economic and Political Demands of Punjabi Villagers, 1988	154
4.3	Militant and Akali Dal Factions in Punjab, 1978–1994	171
A.4.1	Akali Dal’s Electoral Performance	182
5.1	Socioeconomic Indicators for Québec and Canada	214

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09438-3 - Decentralization and Intrastate Struggles: Chechnya, Punjab, and Québec

Kristin M. Bakke

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

Every step of the process of writing this book has benefited from good colleagues, friends, family, and perfect strangers who kindly have offered me their advice, encouragement, criticism, and time. While in Russia, Canada, and India, I met with people who, without knowing me, graciously took the time to tell me about their thoughts on or involvement in the self-determination struggles at the heart of this book. Not only did these conversations teach me a lot; they also made me feel welcome.

The book began its life as a PhD dissertation in the Department of Political Science at the University of Washington in Seattle. Inspired by Karen Rasler and her course on political violence at Indiana University, Bloomington, I came to graduate school knowing that I wanted to write about civil wars. Beyond that, I knew little about what doing a PhD actually meant. Luckily, I got to work with the best. Joel Migdal and Erik Wibbels, who co-chaired my dissertation committee, gave me both the critical and kind comments I needed to complete the PhD, and they continue to be role models as scholars, teachers, and mentors. Joel's scholarship has taught me how to think about states and the people who live in them. He is an extraordinary mentor, who generously shares his time with his students, past and present. Among Joel's key pieces of advice was to listen to people's stories and not forget that the world is a puzzling place. I hope I have done those pieces of advice justice. Where Joel taught me not to lose sight of the puzzling bits of the world, Erik helped me think about those puzzling bits systematically. Through his research and seminars, he sparked my interest in topics that I might not otherwise have thought (or cared) much about. Erik is an academic superman, and by way of example, he showed me how to go about "doing" political science. Trying to be part of this profession would have been a lot more mysterious and a lot less fun without his guidance.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09438-3 - Decentralization and Intrastate Struggles: Chechnya, Punjab, and Québec

Kristin M. Bakke

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

I also benefited greatly from Steve Hanson's always enthusiastic input, careful attention to both small details and big theories, and ability to transform much of comparative politics into two-by-two tables. Beth Kier provided sharp comments that were critical in the initial stages of developing this project, emphasizing the importance of the "so what" question. I have also had the good fortune to work with Mike Ward, who patiently taught me statistical methods and offered valuable advice for how to improve and present my arguments. Never short of new and exciting ideas, he has included me in collaborative research projects – with John O'Loughlin, Gerard Toal, and Vladimir Kolossov – that have allowed me to further develop my interest in political violence, post-conflict states, and the former communist world.

My fellow grad students and friends – the broadly defined "cohort" – were an invaluable source of encouragement as I developed this project. Umut Aydin, Ceren Belge, Rose Ernst, and Erica Johnson have helped me think through my ideas and shared my achievements and setbacks, however (in)significant, making the achievements seem bigger and the setbacks smaller. Thanks to Joel and Marcy Migdal's hospitality, Joel's group of graduate students did, with regular intervals, meet to discuss our works in progress. I am grateful to Senem Aslan, Arda Ibikoglu, Isik Özel, Tilde Rosmer, and Yüksel Sezgin for their comments on the early drafts of this project and on the grant proposals that made field-work possible. I also benefited tremendously from my time at the Belfer Center at Harvard University, which provided a stimulating post-doc environment. Discussions with and comments from Zeynep Bulutgil, Erica Chenoweth, Rachel Gisselquist, Kelly Greenhill, Adria Lawrence, Omar McDoom, and Wendy Pearlman helped me sharpen some of the ideas in this project. I had a first go at turning the dissertation into a book while at Leiden University in Holland, where Jan Erk and Sergio Catignani were excellent sounding boards for thoughts on, respectively, decentralization and conflict.

I completed the book at the Department of Political Science at University College London, which since 2009 has been my academic home. It has been a very happy home, with extraordinary colleagues and great leadership by Richard Bellamy, David Coen, and Neil Mitchell. I enjoy the discussions about politics, research, and the big questions in life with my office mate, Christine Reh. I have a number of conflict-type colleagues both here at UCL – Rod Abouharb, Nils Metternich, Neil Mitchell, Sherrill Stroschein, and Julian Wucherpfennig – and elsewhere in the United Kingdom – Gov Clayton, Ismene Gizelis, and Kristian Gleditsch – whose work and company make life interesting. Slava Mikhaylov and Jeff Kucik have patiently been willing to be interrupted in their work to answer research-related questions, and Jeff's initiative in setting up our departmental research seminar continues to create a supportive and stimulating academic environment. My colleagues in the European Social and Political Studies Program at UCL, under Tom Stern's excellent leadership, contribute to the feeling that I really lucked out when I got this job.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09438-3 - Decentralization and Intrastate Struggles: Chechnya, Punjab, and Québec

Kristin M. Bakke

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgments*

xiii

I have had the privilege to work with some amazing students both here at UCL and at Leiden, whose enthusiasm for research often makes my day.

The fieldwork for this book was made possible thanks to grant funding from the Chr. Michelsen Institute, the National Science Foundation, and the University of Washington. In the field, I benefited greatly from the advice and assistance of Vladimir Kolossov at the Institute of Geography at the Russian Academy of Sciences, Valery Tishkov at the Institute of Ethnography and Anthropology at the Russian Academy of Sciences, Éric Bélanger and Steve Saideman at McGill University in Montréal, Harish Puri at Guru Nanak Dev University in Amritsar, and Pramod Kumar at the Institute for Development and Communication in Chandigarh.

I have received critical and constructive feedback on various parts of this project from participants at seminar presentations at Harvard University, Laval University, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, McGill University, and Yale University; at the annual meetings of the American Political Science Association and the International Studies Association; as well as at workshops organized by Oxford University, the Peace Research Institute in Oslo, and ETH Zürich/ the European Network of Conflict Research. My thinking and writing about decentralization and conflict have benefited from comments by Nancy Bermeo, Lars-Erik Cederman, Jeff Checkel, Scott Gates, Henry Hale, Simon Hug, Jason Lyall, Luca Mancini, Scott Radnitz, Nicholas Sambanis, Klaus Schlichte, Dan Slater, and Monica Duffy Toft. Paul Brass, Manjit Singh, and Steven Wilkinson offered practical advice before I went to India. I am grateful for the advice of Lew Bateman and his team at Cambridge University Press (and very excited that they are publishing my book), and I would like to thank the two anonymous reviewers for their constructive comments and close reading of my manuscript. Needless to say, none of my many “helpers” along the way bears any responsibility for the shortcomings of this book.

Earlier versions of parts of the material here have been published in Kristin M. Bakke and Erik Wibbels, “Diversity, Disparity, and Civil Conflict in Federal States,” *World Politics*, vol. 59, no. 1 (October 2006); “State, Society and Separatism in Punjab,” *Regional and Federal Studies*, vol. 19, no. 10 (May 2009); and “The Turn to Violence in Chechnya and Punjab: Self-Determination Struggles in Decentralized States,” in *Rethinking Violence: States and Non-State Actors in Conflict*, edited by Erica Chenoweth and Adria Lawrence (MIT Press, 2010). I acknowledge permission from the publishers to use the material. The maps were drawn by David Cox at Cox Cartographic.

One of the many exciting things about researching and writing this book was that it got me interested in questions I did not initially set out to study. In particular, the politics and struggles in Chechnya and Punjab highlighted the importance of considering the fragmented nature of self-determination movements, and I have explored these questions in collaborative works with Kathleen Cunningham and Lee Seymour. Working with them has been both

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-09438-3 - Decentralization and Intrastate Struggles: Chechnya, Punjab, and Québec

Kristin M. Bakke

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

intellectually rewarding and great fun, and our collaboration continues to shape and sharpen my thinking.

Let me also thank the people in my life who might not care all that much about the contents of this book but who will think it is exciting that it exists. I could not have done it without them. Umut Aydin, Ceren Belge, Rose Ernst, and Erica Johnson made life in Seattle a lot of fun. We hosted some unforgettable parties, made all the better by Arda Ibikoglu, Tuna Kuyucu, Isik Özel, and Rafael Vargas. Rose Ernst's mom, Bridget, deserves an award for some equally unforgettable Thanksgiving dinners. In Moscow, I had the pleasure of the always entertaining company of Melanie Getreuer, and I was happy that our paths crossed again in Cambridge, MA. Life in Leiden would not have been the same without Berna Güroğlu. Both in Seattle and London, Tilde Rosmer has been a great Norwegian "ally." Cathrine Seierstad makes London feel like home (and keeps me informed about news from Norway). Along with Maryam Aldossari, Grant Allen, Jeff Kucik, Nils Metternich, Lisa Milinkovic, Christine Reh, Stephanie Rickard, Natasha Slutskaia, and Lisa Vanhala, she has made my no-work-on-weekends policy more than worthwhile.

Last but not least, I must thank my family. My sister, Ingvild, is one of the most adventurous people I know, and if she thinks that what I do is even remotely interesting, I must be on to something. My brother, Knut-Harald, taking after our dad, asks the kinds of questions that make me wish I knew more about the world. My parents, Gerd and Knut, make me believe that there is nothing I cannot do, and regardless of what I do or where in the world I am, I know that they are cheering for me (and that my mom will be calling). I dedicate this book to them.