

Wittgenstein and Davidson on Language, Thought, and Action

Wittgenstein and Davidson are two of the most influential and controversial figures of twentieth-century philosophy. However, whereas Wittgenstein is often regarded as a deflationary philosopher, Davidson is considered to be a theory builder and systematic philosopher par excellence. Consequently, little work has been devoted to comparing their philosophies with each other. In this volume of new essays, leading scholars show that in fact there is much that the two share. By focusing on the similarities between Wittgenstein and Davidson, their essays present compelling defences of their views and develop more coherent and convincing approaches than either philosopher was able to propose on his own. They show how philosophically fruitful and constructive reflection on Wittgenstein and Davidson continues to be, and how relevant the writings of both philosophers are to current debates in philosophy of mind, language, and action.

CLAUDINE VERHEGGEN is Professor in the Department of Philosophy at York University in Toronto. She has published numerous articles on issues in mind and language, and she is co-author of *Donald Davidson's Triangulation Argument: A Philosophical Inquiry* (2016).



Wittgenstein and Davidson on Language, Thought, and Action

Edited by

Claudine Verheggen

York University, Toronto





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107093768

DOI: 10.1017/9781316145364

© Cambridge University Press 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

 $\label{lem:analytication} A\ catalogue\ record\ for\ this\ publication\ is\ available\ from\ the\ British\ Library.$

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Verheggen, Claudine, editor.

Title: Wittgenstein and Davidson on language, thought, and action / edited by

Claudine Verheggen, York University, Toronto.

Description: New York: Cambridge University Press, 2017. Identifiers: LCCN 2017028185 | ISBN 9781107093768

Subjects: LCSH: Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 1889–1951. | Davidson, Donald, 1917–2003. | Language and languages – Philosophy. | Thought and

thinking. | Act (Philosophy)

Classification: LCC B3376.W564 W521345 2017 | DDC 192-dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2017028185

ISBN 978-1-107-09376-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



In memory of Sue Larson



Contents

List of Contributors Acknowledgements		page ix
	Introduction CLAUDINE VERHEGGEN	1
1	Holism in Action ROBERT H. MYERS	8
2	Davidson's Wittgensteinian View of Meaning PAUL HORWICH	28
3	Davidson and Wittgenstein A Homeric Struggle? ÅSA WIKFORSS	46
4	Rule-Following and Charity Wittgenstein and Davidson on Meaning Determination KATHRIN GLÜER	69
5	Davidson's Treatment of Wittgenstein's Rule-Following Paradox CLAUDINE VERHEGGEN	97
6	Davidson and Wittgenstein on Meaning and Understanding BARRY STROUD	123
7	The Search for "The Essence of Human Language" in Wittgenstein and Davidson JASON BRIDGES	139
8	Wittgenstein and Davidson on Animal Minds HANS-JOHANN GLOCK	159
9	Wittgenstein and Davidson on First-Person Authority and the Univocality of Mental Terms WILLIAM CHILD	186

vii



viii	Contents	
10	The Harmony of Thought and Reality Wittgenstein and Davidson vs McDowell TIM THORNTON	205
11	Davidson, Russell, and Wittgenstein on the Problem of Predication JOSÉ L. ZALABARDO	226
Index		250



Contributors

Jason Bridges University of Chicago
William Child University of Oxford
Hans-Johann Glock University of Zürich
Kathrin Glüer Stockholm University
Paul Horwich New York University
Robert H. Myers York University, Toronto
Barry Stroud University of California, Berkeley
Tim Thornton University of Central Lancashire
Claudine Verheggen York University, Toronto
Åsa Wikforss Stockholm University
José L. Zalabardo University College London



Acknowledgements

I am very grateful to all the authors of this book for their contributions. I also want to thank the participants in a workshop on Wittgenstein and Davidson, which I organized in Toronto in March 2015, and York University for sponsoring it. Preparation of the volume was made possible in part by a research fellowship from the York University Faculty Association. Thanks are also due to my editor, Hilary Gaskin, for her support of the project and her patience in seeing it realized. Finally, I am very grateful to Olivia Sultanescu for her help at every stage of the project, from the initial review of the chapters to the preparation of the index.

I dedicate this book to the memory of Sue Larson, who first made me realize, through the numerous conversations I had with her in the 1990s, how much Wittgenstein and Davidson had in common, and who thus was the first inspiration for this book.